

Is Killing People Right?

‘Great cases’ are those judicial decisions around which the common law pivots. In a sequel to the instant classic *Is Eating People Wrong?*, this book presents eight new great cases from the United Kingdom, the United States and Australia. Written in a highly accessible yet rigorous style, it explores the social circumstances, institutions (lawyers, judges and courts) and ordinary people whose stories shaped the law. Across the courts’ diverse and uncoordinated attempts to adapt to changing conditions and shifting demands, it shows the law as the living, breathing and down-the-street experience it really is. Including seminal cases in end of life, abortion and equal rights, this is an ideal introduction for students to legal history and jurisprudence.

Allan C. Hutchinson is a distinguished research professor at Osgoode Hall Law School, York University, and an internationally recognised legal theorist. He is the author or editor of twenty books, including *Evolution and the Common Law* (2005), *The Province of Jurisprudence Democratized* (2008) and *Is Eating People Wrong?* (2010).

Is Killing People Right?

*More Great Cases That Shaped the
Legal World*

ALLAN C. HUTCHINSON

Osgoode Hall Law School, York University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-56088-8 — Is Killing People Right?
 Allan C. Hutchinson
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107560888

© Allan C. Hutchinson 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Hutchinson, Allan C., 1951– author.

Is killing people right : more great cases that shaped the legal world /

Allan C. Hutchinson, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-12386-1 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-56088-8

(Paperback)

1. Sociological jurisprudence. 2. Law–Social aspects. 3. Common law.

I. Title.

K370.H883 2016

340'.115–dc23 2015036201

ISBN 978-1-107-12386-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-56088-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-56088-8 — Is Killing People Right?
Allan C. Hutchinson
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

$$A_2J^2$$

CONTENTS

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Preface</i>	xi
1 Introduction: on the road (again)	I
2 Is killing people right?: law and the end of life	10
3 Oil on troubled waters: the consequences of civil liability	27
4 The politics of law: cats, pigeons and old chestnuts	42
5 The companies we keep: the moralities of business	60
6 Fifty shades of <i>Brown</i> : consent and the criminal law	80
7 Putting up a defence: sex, murder and videotapes	95
8 <i>Wade</i> -ing into controversy: a case of accidental activism	114
9 Playing a different tune: fairness in deal making	132
10 Conclusion: surfing the tides	148
<i>Sources</i>	153
<i>Index</i>	159

FIGURES

2.1. Tony Bland	<i>page</i> 11
2.2. Lepping Lane End at Hillsborough Stadium during the disaster	13
2.3. Banner at Liverpool F.C. match, in remembrance of Tony Bland and the other victims	23
3.1. Mort’s Dock, 1941	30
3.2. The <i>S.S. Wagon Mound</i>	31
3.3. Mort Bay Park, Balmain in 2013, site of Mort’s Dock	40
4.1. William Marbury Jr	47
4.2. James Madison	49
4.3. The Court’s opinion, bearing the marks of the Capitol fire of 1898	53
5.1. Whitechapel High Street, 1880s	62
5.2. Edmund Broderip	66
5.3. Lord Macnaghten	75
6.1. The Old Bailey, London	84
6.2. Wandsworth Prison, London	85
6.3. Roland Jaggard, Ian Gurnhill of the Spanner Trust and Tony Brown	93
7.1. House shared by Paul Bernardo and Karla Homolka at 57 Bayview Drive, Port Dalhousie, Ontario	99
7.2. John Rosen	102
	ix

x	<i>List of figures</i>	
7.3.	Ken Murray	106
8.1.	Sarah Weddington	116
8.2.	Pro-choice protester at the U.S. Supreme Court in 2012	127
8.3.	Norma McCorvey speaking at the Dublin Rally for Life in 2009	130
9.1.	The 1908 cover of the sheet music to <i>Take Me out to the Ball Game</i> by Albert Von Tilzer, published by the York Music Company of Tin Pan Alley	133
9.2.	Plaque at Tin Pan Alley	135
9.3.	A Musicor Records release, 1973	136

PREFACE

As always, I have incurred a lot of debts in writing this book. I gave lectures and seminars at a number of law schools and conferences; the feedback was most helpful and constructive. As well, I have been teaching a seminar over the past few years at Osgoode Hall, titled ‘Great Cases’. I am grateful to all the students in that course for pushing me on my ideas and giving me the opportunity to refine them. Special thanks to Ian Langlois.

Most importantly, I benefitted greatly from conversations with and contributions by Adam Dodek, Trevor Farrow, Caroline Garrod, Tiffany Herbert-Ramsubick, Cynthia Hill, Jennifer Leitch, Derek Morgan, Hannah Ordman, Ronnie Tator and Emanuel Tucsá. Their critical assistance and intellectual support was invaluable. A particular thanks must go to Ian Langlois and Chris MacCormack whose industry and insight went above the call.

Finally, in researching and completing this project, I received research support from Osgoode Hall Law School.