

# THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO WITTGENSTEIN

Second Edition

Each volume of this series of companions to major philosophers contains specially commissioned essays by an international team of scholars, together with a substantial bibliography, and will serve as a reference work for students and non-specialists. One aim of the series is to dispel the intimidation such readers often feel when faced with the work of a difficult and challenging thinker.

Ludwig Wittgenstein (1889–1951) is one of the most important and influential philosophers in modern times, but he is also one of the least accessible. In this volume, leading experts chart the development of his work and clarify the connections between its different stages. The essays, which are both expository and original, address central themes in Wittgenstein's writing on a wide range of topics, particularly his thinking about the mind, language, logic, and mathematics. The contributors illuminate the character of the whole body of work by focusing on key topics: the style of the philosophy, the conception of grammar contained in it, rule-following, convention, logical necessity, the self, and what Wittgenstein called, in a famous phrase, "forms of life." This revised edition includes a new introduction, five new essays - on Tractarian ethics, Wittgenstein's development, aspects, the mind, and time and history and a fully updated comprehensive bibliography.

New readers will find this the most convenient and accessible guide to Wittgenstein currently available. Advanced students and specialists will find a conspectus of recent developments in the interpretation of Wittgenstein.

Hans Sluga is the William and Trudy Ausfahl Professor of Philosophy at the University of California at Berkeley.

David G. Stern is a Professor of Philosophy and a Collegiate Fellow in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at the University of Iowa.



OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

ABELARD *Edited by* Jeffrey E. Brower *and* Kevin Guilfoy

ADORNO Edited by Thomas Huhn

ANCIENT SCEPTICISM Edited by RICHARD BETT

ANSELM Edited by Brian Davies and Brian Leftow

AQUINAS Edited by Norman Kretzmann and Eleonore Stump

ARABIC PHILOSOPHY Edited by Peter Adamson and Richard C. Taylor

HANNAH ARENDT Edited by Dana VILLA

ARISTOTLE Edited by Jonathan Barnes

ARISTOTLE'S POLITICS Edited by MARGUERITE
DESIAURIERS and PAUL DESTRÉE

ATHEISM Edited by Michael Martin

AUGUSTINE 2nd EDITION Edited by DAVID MECONI and ELEONORE STUMP

BACON Edited by Markku Peltonen

BERKELEY Edited by Kenneth P. Winkler

BOETHIUS Edited by John Marenbon

BRENTANO Edited by Dale Jacquette

CARNAP Edited by Michael Friedman and Richard Creath

THE COMMUNIST MANIFESTO Edited by TERRELL CARVER and JAMES FARR

CONSTANT Edited by Helena Rosenblatt

CRITICAL THEORY Edited by Fred Rush

DARWIN 2nd EDITION Edited by Jonathan Hodge and Gregory Radick

SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR Edited by Claudia Card

DELEUZE Edited by Daniel W. Smith and Henry Somers-Hall

DESCARTES Edited by John Cottingham

DESCARTES' MEDITATIONS Edited by DAVID CUNNING

DEWEY Edited by Molly Cochran

DUNS SCOTUS Edited by Thomas Williams

CONTINUED AT THE BACK OF THE BOOK



# The Cambridge Companion to WITTGENSTEIN

SECOND EDITION

Edited by

Hans Sluga
University of California at Berkeley
and

David G. Stern *University of Iowa* 





# CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107120259

DOI: 10.1017/9781316341285

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Sluga, Hans D., editor. | Stern, David G., editor.

TITLE: The Cambridge companion to Wittgenstein / edited by Hans Sluga, University of California at Berkeley and David G. Stern, University of Iowa.

DESCRIPTION: Second [edition]. | New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Series: Cambridge companions | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017029495 | ISBN 9781107120259 (Hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781107545946 (pbk. : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889-1951.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B3376.W564 C345 2017 | DDC 192-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017029495

ISBN 978-1-107-12025-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-54594-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## **CONTENTS**

	List of Contributors	page v11
	List of Abbreviations	X
	Preface to the second edition	xiii
	Introduction: Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Man, the Life, and the Work HANS SLUGA	I
Ι	Wittgenstein's Critique of Philosophy ROBERT J. FOGELIN	28
2	Pictures, Logic, and the Limits of Sense in Wittgenstein's <i>Tractatus</i> THOMAS RICKETTS	54
3	Tractarian Ethics KEVIN CAHILL	96
4	Wittgenstein in the 1930s DAVID G. STERN	126
5	A Philosophy of Mathematics Between Two Camsteven Gerrard	nps 152
6	Necessity and Normativity HANS-JOHANN GLOCK	180
7	Wittgenstein, Mathematics, and Ethics: Resisting the Attractions of Realism CORA DIAMOND	g 209

v



T71	Contents
V1	COHECHES

8	Notes and Afterthoughts On the Opening of Wittgenstein's <i>Investigations</i> STANLEY CAVELL	245
9	Mind, Meaning, and Practice BARRY STROUD	281
10	Body and Soul JOACHIM SCHULTE	305
ΙΙ	The Question of Linguistic Idealism Revisited DAVID BLOOR	332
12	Aspects of Aspects JULIET FLOYD	361
13	Forms of Life: Mapping the Rough Ground NAOMI SCHEMAN	389
14	Time and History in Wittgenstein HANS SLUGA	417
15	Certainties of a World Picture: The Epistemological Investigations of <i>On Certainty</i> MICHAEL KOBER	441
	Select Bibliography	479
	Index	507



#### CONTRIBUTORS

DAVID BLOOR is Emeritus Professor in the Science Studies Unit at the University of Edinburgh. He is the author of *Knowledge and Social Imagery* (1976), *Wittgenstein: A Social Theory of Knowledge* (1983), *Wittgenstein: Rules and Institutions* (1997), and *The Enigma of the Aerofoil: Rival Theories in Aerodynamics*, 1909–1930 (2011), and a co-author of *Scientific Knowledge: A Sociological Analysis* (1996).

KEVIN CAHILL is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Bergen, Norway. He is the author of *The Fate of Wonder: Wittgenstein's Critique of Metaphysics and Modernity* (2011) and a co-editor of Considering Class: Essays on The Discourse of the American Dream (2007), Finite but Unbounded: New Essays in Philosophical Anthropology (2017), and Wittgenstein and Naturalism (forthcoming).

STANLEY CAVELL is Walter M. Cabot Professor of Aesthetics and the General Theory of Value, Emeritus, at Harvard. He is the author of eighteen books, including Must We Mean What We Say? (1969), The Claim of Reason: Wittgenstein, Skepticism, Morality, and Tragedy (1979), Philosophical Passages: Wittgenstein, Emerson, Austin, Derrida (1995), Cities of Words (2004), and Little Did I Know (2010).

CORA DIAMOND is Kenan Professor of Philosophy Emerita at the University of Virginia. She is the author of *The Realistic Spirit: Wittgenstein, Philosophy, and the Mind* (1991), a co-author of *Philosophy and Animal Life* (2009), the editor of *Wittgenstein's Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics, Cambridge, 1939* (1976) and co-editor of *Intention and Intentionality* (1979).

vii



#### viii Contributors

JULIET FLOYD is Professor of Philosophy at Boston University. She has authored over fifty articles and book chapters, and co-edited Future Pasts: The Place of the Analytic Tradition in 20th Century Philosophy with Sanford Shieh (2001); Philosophy of Emerging Media: Understanding, Appreciation, Application with James E. Katz (2015); and Philosophical Explorations of the Legacy of Alan Turing: Turing 100 with Alisa Bukolich (2017). Wittgenstein on the Real Numbers: Annotations to Hardy's A Course of Pure Mathematics, co-authored with Felix Mühlhölzer, will appear in 2018.

ROBERT J. FOGELIN, who died in October 2016, was Emeritus Sherman Fairchild Professor in the Humanities at Dartmouth College. He was the author of numerous books including Wittgenstein (1976), Hume's Skepticism (1985), Philosophical Interpretations (1992), and Pyrrhonian Reflections on Knowledge and Justification (1994).

STEVEN GERRARD is Professor of Philosophy at Williams College. He is the author of a number of articles on Wittgenstein, ethics, and the history of early analytic philosophy.

HANS-JOHANN GLOCK is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Zurich. He is the author of *A Wittgenstein Dictionary* (1996), *Quine and Davidson on Language, Thought and Reality* (2003), and *What is Analytic Philosophy*? (2008).

MICHAEL KOBER is Adjunct Professor of Philosophy at the University of Freiburg. He is the author of *Gewissheit als Norm: Wittgensteins erkenntnistheoretische Untersuchungen in "Über Gewissheit"* (1993), Bedeutung und Verstehen, Grundzüge einer allgemeinen Theorie sprachlicher Kommunikation (2002), the editor of Deepening Our Understanding of Wittgenstein (2006), and John Searle (2011).

THOMAS RICKETTS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. He has published extensively on the development of analytic philosophy, especially Frege, Russell, Wittgenstein, Carnap, and Quine, and co-edited *The Cambridge Companion to Frege* with Michael Potter (2010).



Contributors

NAOMI SCHEMAN is Professor Emerita of Philosophy and Gender, Women, and Sexuality Studies at the University of Minnesota in Minneapolis. She is the author of Engenderings: Constructions of Knowledge, Authority, and Privilege (1993), and Shifting Ground: Knowledge & Reality, Transgression & Trustworthiness (2011), and a co-editor of Feminist Interpretations of Ludwig Wittgenstein (2002).

JOACHIM SCHULTE retired recently from teaching philosophy at the University of Zurich. His publications include numerous articles and four books on Wittgenstein as well as critical editions of his main works; with P. M. S. Hacker, he edited and translated the revised fourth edition of Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations* (2009).

HANS SLUGA is William and Trudy Ausfahl Professor of Philosophy at the University of California at Berkeley. He is the author of Gottlob Frege (1980), Heidegger's Crisis: Philosophy and Politics in Nazi Germany (1993), Wittgenstein (2011), and Politics and the Search for the Common Good (2014).

DAVID G. STERN is Professor of Philosophy and Collegiate Fellow in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at the University of Iowa. He is the co-editor, with Brian Rogers and Gabriel Citron, of Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1933, From the Notes of G. E. Moore (2016) and the author of Wittgenstein on Mind and Language (1995), and Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction (2004).

BARRY STROUD is Willis S. and Marion Slusser Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at the University of California at Berkeley. He is the author of many books, including *Hume* (1977), *The Significance of Philosophical Scepticism* (1984), *The Quest for Reality: Subjectivism and the Metaphysics of Colour* (1999), and *Engagement and Metaphysical Dissatisfaction: Modality and Value* (2011).



## **ABBREVIATIONS**

**AWL** Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge 1932-1935, ed. A. Ambrose BLBK The Blue Book BRBK The Brown Book BTThe Big Typescript  $CV^{I}$ Culture and Value LC Lectures and Conversations LFM Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics LWI Last Writings on the Philosophy of Psychology, Last Writings on the Philosophy of Psychology, LWII LWL Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1932, ed. D. Lee MS Manuscript NB Notebooks 1914-1916 NL Notes on Logic OC On Certainty PG Philosophical Grammar

X

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> References to *Culture and Value* are cited from both the 1980 English translation edition and the 1998 revised 2nd edition; e.g., the 1930 "Sketch for a Foreword" is cited as CV (1980: 6–8; 1998: 8–11).



Abbreviations xi

PI<sup>2</sup> Philosophical Investigations PO Philosophical Occasions

PPF Philosophy of Psychology: A Fragment (previously

known as PI, Part II)

PR Philosophical Remarks

PT Prototractatus RC Remarks on Colour

RFM Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics
RPPI Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology, vol. I
RPPII Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology, vol. II

TLP Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus

TS Typescript

WWK Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle

Z Zettel

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> References to what has long been known as "Part II" of *Philosophical Investigations* are cited from the 2nd edition as PI, followed by section and page number; and from the revised 4th edition as "Philosophy of Psychology: A Fragment," as PPF, followed by section and remark number. For instance, the sentences "If a lion could talk, we could not understand him" and "If a lion could talk, we wouldn't be able to understand it" would both be cited as (PI, xi, p. 223; PPF, xi, 327).



#### PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION

This volume is about the life, work, and intellectual legacy of Ludwig Wittgenstein. Our aim in putting it together was to provide an accessible and up-to-date guide to Wittgenstein and his influence. In tune with the intentions of the *Cambridge Companion* series, the chapters focus on Wittgenstein as a philosopher and on Wittgensteinian themes within philosophy.

While we have retained ten of the fourteen chapters of the first edition, we have endeavored to enrich this second edition with a number of contributions opening up new perspectives on Wittgenstein's thought. In addition to a new Introduction, written by Hans Sluga, the new chapters are: "Tractarian Ethics" by Kevin Cahill; "Wittgenstein in the 1930s" by David Stern; "Aspects of Aspects" by Juliet Floyd; "Body and Soul" by Joachim Schulte; and "Time and History in Wittgenstein" by Hans Sluga. In addition, Michael Kober has taken the opportunity to add a substantial new opening and conclusion to his chapter. The comprehensive bibliography has also been fully updated.

We are immensely grateful to Terry Moore, for having invited us to edit the first edition of this book in the early days of the *Cambridge Companion* series, and to Hilary Gaskin, for her forbearance, expertise, and wisdom as editor of this second edition. We also greatly appreciate the work of the entire production team at Cambridge at every stage in the preparation of this volume. We also want to thank Phillip Ricks for his careful and capable transformation of the source files into a coherent manuscript, and Derek Gottlieb for his expertise and efficiency in providing the index. Thanks are due also to Jim Hutchinson who assisted in the compilation of the new

xiii



#### xiv Preface

bibliography, to the University of Iowa Office of the Vice President for Research and the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences, whose book subvention supported the initial manuscript editing, and to William and Trudy Ausfahl whose research fund supported the indexing of the volume.

> Hans Sluga University of California at Berkeley David G. Stern University of Iowa