

An Introduction to the Philosophy of Logic

Philosophy of logic is a fundamental part of philosophical study, and one which is increasingly recognized as being immensely important in relation to many issues in metaphysics, metametaphysics, epistemology, philosophy of mathematics, and philosophy of language. This textbook provides a comprehensive and accessible introduction to topics including the objectivity of logical inference rules and its relevance in discussions of epistemological relativism, the revived interest in logical pluralism, the question of logic's metaphysical neutrality, and the demarcation between logic and mathematics. Chapters in the book cover the state of the art in contemporary philosophy of logic, and allow students to understand the philosophical relevance of these debates without having to contend with complex technical arguments. This will be a major new resource for students working on logic as well as for readers seeking a better understanding of philosophy of logic in its wider context.

DANIEL COHNITZ is Professor of Theoretical Philosophy at Utrecht University. He has published widely on metaphilosophy, epistemology and the philosophy of language and logic.

LUIS ESTRADA-GONZÁLEZ is an associate researcher at the Institute for Philosophical Research at the National Autonomous University of Mexico. His research focuses on logic and its philosophy.



An Introduction to the Philosophy of Logic

DANIEL COHNITZ

Utrecht University, the Netherlands

LUIS ESTRADA-GONZÁLEZ

National Autonomous University of Mexico







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107527720

DOI: 10.1017/9781316275573

© Daniel Cohnitz and Luis Estrada-González 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2019

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Cohnitz, Daniel, 1974– author. | Estrada-González, Luis, – author. Title: An introduction to the philosophy of logic / Daniel Cohnitz, Utrecht University, the Netherlands, Luis Estrada-Gonzalez, National Autonomous University of Mexico. Description: 1 [edition]. | New York: Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018059147 | ISBN 9781107110939 (alk. paper) Subjects: LCSH: Logic. Classification: LCC BC108 .C675 2019 | DDC 160–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018059147

ISBN 978-1-107-11093-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-52772-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Figures		page vi
List of Tables		vii
Pre	Preface and Acknowledgements	
Int	roduction	1
1	The Nature and Tools of Logic	10
2	The Standard Story and Its Rivals	35
3	Is Second-Order Logic Proper Logic?	65
4	Logical Constants	88
5	The Metaphysics of Logic	113
6	The Epistemology of Logic	136
7	Logical Pluralism	162
8	Logic, Reasoning and Rationality	182
9	Beyond Truth-Preservation	203
10	The Place of Logic in Science	221
Bibliography		248
Index		261



Figures

6.1	The justification of modus ponens (Boghossian, 2000, 230) page	e 155
6.2	The justification of modus ponens continued (Boghossian,	
	2000, 236)	156
10.1	Compositional semantics (adapted from Löbner, 2013)	223
10.2	Formal semantics (adapted from Löbner, 2013)	225
10.3	Wason Selection Task (from Stenning and van Lambalgen,	
	2008)	227



Tables

1.1	Logic as a non-pure theory	page 14
1.2	Example of a typical truth-table for classical conjunction	
2.1	What should a three-valued truth-table for the conditional	
	look like?	55
6.1	Kleene table for the conditional	160
8.1	MacFarlane's bridge principles (from MacFarlane, 2004)	189
10.1	Typical results for the Wason Selection Task (from Stenning	
	and van Lambalgen, 2008, 46)	227



Preface and Acknowledgements

A lonely ship on the open ocean, as on the cover of this book, serves in several ways as metaphor in the philosophy of logic. Carnap, in his *The Logical Syntax of Language*, speaks of the "ship of logic" sailing on the "boundless ocean of unlimited possibilities" when introducing his pluralist conception of logic (Carnap, 1937), and Otto Neurath compared scientists in their attempts to revise their theories to "sailors who on the open sea must reconstruct their ship but are never able to start afresh from the bottom" (Neurath, 1973), a metaphor that is particularly apt when revisions of logic are concerned.

But the metaphor also holds in other ways. With the exception of Susan Haack's classic Philosophy of Logics (Haack, 1978), the philosophy of logic is largely uncharted open waters with many areas still labelled 'here be monsters'. We tried to provide a map for the fearless seafarer but we admit that we sometimes felt ourselves quite disoriented on this vast, deep ocean. We were glad that we could count on the help of various trawlers, shipmates, divers, pirates and other sailors whenever we felt lost. In alphabetical order, these were Francesco Berto, Rosalie Iemhoff, Annemarie Kalis, Johannes Korbmacher, Menno Lievers, Janneke van Lith, Niels van Miltenburg, Jesse Mulder, Carlo Nicolai, Juho Ritola, Marcus Rossberg, Erik Stei, Florian Gib Steinberger, Thomas Sturm, Albert Visser, the students of our course at the University of Tartu in 2013 and the research master students of Utrecht University in my course in 2016. When Luis wasn't available for completing the final stage of the book, we were glad that Shay Logan was ready to step in. He helped with Chapters 1 and 9 and did almost all the work for Chapter 2. We are very grateful for his help.

viii