

# WORKING RELATIONALLY IN AND ACROSS PRACTICES

Three core ideas are at the heart of this book: relational expertise, the capacity to interpret problems with others; common knowledge, which consists of knowing what matters for professionals in other practices; and relational agency, using that common knowledge to take action with others. These ideas are based in cultural-historical approaches to learning and change and give coherence to the arguments presented. This is not a recipe book; the ideas are offered as resources for reflecting on and developing professional and research practices and the conditions in which they occur.

Anne Edwards writes extensively on cultural-historical theory and professional learning. Joining the Oxford Department of Education after chairs at Leeds and Birmingham, she co-founded the Centre for Socio-cultural and Activity Theory Research. She holds honorary doctorates from Helsinki and Oslo for her work on relational expertise. She has been President of the British Educational Research Association and Editor of the British Educational Research Journal. She also co-edited Mind Culture and Activity and is a founding editor of Learning, Culture and Social Interaction. She is currently researching social inclusion in Chile, South Africa and the United Kingdom.



# Working Relationally in and across Practices

A CULTURAL-HISTORICAL APPROACH TO
COLLABORATION

Edited by

Anne Edwards

Oxford University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107527386

DOI: 10.1017/9781316275184

© Anne Edwards 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2017 First paperback edition 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Edwards, Anne, editor.

TITLE: Working relationally in and across practices: a cultural-historical approach to collaboration / edited by Anne Edwards.

DESCRIPTION: 1 Edition. | New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2016019919 | ISBN 9781107110373 (Hardback)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Social interaction. | Awareness. | Expertise. | Specialists-Professional relationships. | Problem solving.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HM1111 .W675 2016 | DDC 302–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016019919

ISBN 978-1-107-11037-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-52738-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



# Contents

Notes on Contributors	page ix
1 Revealing Relational Work  Anne Edwards	1
PART I WORKING RELATIONALLY IN THE PROFESSIONS	
2 Expertise, Learning and Agency in Partnership Practices in Services for Families with Young Children Nick Hopwood	25
3 Learning and Deploying Relational Agency in the Negotiation of Interprofessional Hierarchies in a UK Hospital <i>Joce Nuttall</i>	on 43
4 Relational Agency, Double Stimulation, and the Object of Activity: An Intervention Study in a Primary School Annalisa Sannino and Yrjö Engeström	58
5 An Analysis of the Use of Relational Expertise, Relational Agency, and Common Knowledge among Newly Appointed Principals in Chile's Public Schools  Carmen Montecinos, Maria Verónica Leiva, Fabián Campos, L. Ahumada, and Sergio Galdames	78
6 Building and Using Common Knowledge for Developing School–Community Links Prabhat Chandra Rai	96



vi

# Table of Contents

7	Building Common Knowledge: Negotiating New Pedagogies in Higher Education in South Africa Shirley Walters, Freda Daniels, and Vernon Weitz	113
	ART II WORKING RELATIONALLY IN NETWORKS  Networked Expertise, Relational Agency, and  Collective Creativity  Kai Hakkarainen, Kaisa Hytönen, Jenna Vekkaila, and  Tuire Palonen	133
9	Relational Agency and the Development of Tools in Service Networks Laura Seppänen and Hanna Toiviainen	153
10	Creating a System of Distributed Expertise: The Oxford Education Deanery Narrative  Nigel Fancourt	172
11	Common Knowledge: The Missing Link in Hybrid Value Chains? Marc Thompson, Catherine Dolan, Colin Mayer, Kate Roll, and Ruth Yeoman	191
12	The Relational Agency Framework as a Tool for Supporting the Establishment, Maintenance, and Development of Multidisciplinary Networks of Professionals Marilyn Fleer, Iris Duhn, and Linda J. Harrison	209
PA	RT III WORKING RELATIONALLY IN RESEARCH	
13	Research as Relational Agency: Expert Ethnographers and the Cultural Force of Technologies  Cathrine Hasse	229
14	When Daycare Professionals' Values for Transition to School Do Not Align with the Educational Demands from Society and School: A Practice Developing Research Project for Daycare Professionals' Support to Children's Transition to School Mariane Hedegaard	247
15	Relational Approaches to Knowledge Exchange in Social Science Research	265



Table of Contents	vii
16 Designing the Epistemic Architecture for Galaxy Zoo: The Case Study of Relational Expertise in Citizen Scien Bipana Bantawa	nce 283
EPILOGUE	
17 Using and Refining the Relational Concepts Anne Edwards	299
Index	311



# Notes on Contributors

#### LUIS AHUMADA

Professor Ahumada is at the School of Psychology, Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, Chile, and is an Associate Researcher at the Center for Advanced Research in Education (CIAE–Universidad de Chile). Recent coauthored publications include 'Targets, Threats and (Dis)trust: The Managerial Troika for Public School Principals in Chile' (*Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 2015); and 'A Scale of Organizational Learning in Schools' (*Psicothema*, 2012).

## BIPANA BANTAWA

Bipana Bantawa recently completed her DPhil from Oxford University. Her thesis followed the knowledge production structures and processes within Galaxy Zoo, a large-scale online Big Data citizen science initiative based at Oxford. The DPhil research drew on cultural-historical theory to examine how the work and expertise of scientists evolved in these new practices, while in her earlier MSc thesis she used activity theory to identify key challenges in integrating the One Laptop Per Child programme in class-rooms in Nepal.

## FABIAN CAMPOS

Fabian Campos is Department Coordinator for Field Experiences and Student Teaching in the School of Psychology at the Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaiso, where he is also undertaking a PhD. Recent coauthored publications include 'Excellence in School Principal Preparation' (*Perspectiva Educacional*, 2014); 'Stories of Learning and Training of Eight School Principals' (*Recherches en Education*, 2013); and 'Development of Educational Leadership' (*Revista Iberoamericana sobre Calidad, Eficacia y Cambio en Educación*, 2012).



x

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-107-52738-6 — Working Relationally in and across Practices Edited by Anne Edwards Frontmatter More Information

Notes on Contributors

# FREDA DANIELS

Freda Daniels is Senior Lecturer in the Division for Lifelong Learning at the University of the Western Cape, where she is the university's Continuing Education Programme Coordinator. Freda is also undertaking a PhD focusing on a critical analysis of continuing professional development (CPD) in the public health sector. Using a cultural-historical lens, the study investigates the relationship between public health practitioners' motives for CPD participation and the development of relational agency.

# CATHERINE DOLAN

Dr Catherine Dolan is Reader in Anthropology at SOAS, University of London, and a Visiting Scholar at Saïd Business School at the University of Oxford. As an anthropologist, she specialises in the social and political economy of development, primarily in Africa, and over the past fifteen years has directed and researched interdisciplinary programmes on poverty, globalisation, commodity chains, rural livelihoods, corporate social responsibility and gender. Her work is concentrated in three main areas: changing relationship between the public and private sectors in international development; corporate governance of global value chains; and sustainability.

# IRIS DUHN

Iris Duhn is a Senior Lecturer at Monash, where she leads the early years course. Her research interests focus on the globalisation and professionalisation of early childhood and on education for sustainability.

# ANNE EDWARDS

Anne is Professor Emerita at the University of Oxford Department of Education and a Fellow of St Hilda's College. She holds Doctorates *honoris causa* from the Universities of Helsinki and Oslo and has been President of the British Educational Research Association. She was cofounder of the Oxford Centre for Sociocultural and Activity Theory Research and draws on cultural-historical approaches in her work on learning in the professions, a topic on which she has published extensively.

# YRJÖ ENGESTRÖM

Yrjö Engeström is Professor of Adult Education and Director of the Center for Research on Activity, Development and Learning (CRADLE) at the University of Helsinki. He is known for his work on cultural-historical activity theory and the theory of expansive learning. In his research, he uses the methodology of formative interventions, particularly the Change Laboratory, to facilitate expansive learning in organisations, communities and social movements.



#### Notes on Contributors

хi

#### NIGEL FANCOURT

Dr Nigel Fancourt is a Lecturer at Oxford University's Department of Education and is a member of the Oxford Centre for Sociocultural and Activity Theory Research (OSAT). He researches organisational epistemologies and values in education, both in relation to schools and religions, and more recently in terms of schools, universities and research.

#### MARILYN FLEER

Professor Marilyn Fleer holds the Foundation Chair of Early Childhood Education at Monash University, Australia, and is the immediate past President of the International Society for Cultural Activity Research (ISCAR). Her research interests focus on early years learning and development, with special attention on pedagogy, play, culture, science and design and technology.

#### SERGIO GALDAMES

Sergio Galdames is currently a doctoral student at University College London (UCL), Institute of Education. Coauthored publications include 'The Local Administrator as a Change Agent' (*Revista de Investigación Educacional Latinoamericana*, in press); and 'School Principals at Their Lonely Work' (*Computers & Education*, 2012).

## KAI HAKKARAINEN

Dr Kai Hakkarainen is Professor of Education at the Institute of Behavioral Sciences, University of Helsinki. With his colleagues, he has, for twenty years, investigated personal and collaborative learning processes at all levels, from elementary to higher education. Many investigations have included a strong theoretical component and have addressed how learning and human intellectual resources can be expanded using collaborative technologies based on the information and communication technologies. During recent years, Hakkarainen's research activity has expanded towards investigating personal and collective learning processes taking place in knowledge-intensive organisations, including innovative private corporations and academic research communities.

# CATHRINE HASSE

Professor Cathrine Hasse is Leader of the Program for Future Technology, Culture and Learning at the Department of Education (DPU), University of Aarhus, Denmark. She is also author of *An Anthropology of Learning*, in which she discusses cultural learning as an ethnographic research methodology.



xii

#### Notes on Contributors

#### MARIANE HEDEGAARD

Mariane Hedegaard is Professor in developmental psychology at the University of Copenhagen; has a Senior Research Fellowship at Department of Education, Oxford University; and holds a Doctorate *honoris causa* from the University of Pablo Olavide, Seville. Her research interests include children's activities across different institutional practices, and she has authored and coedited twenty-five books, eleven in English, including, with M. Fleer, *Learning, Play and Children's Development: Everyday Life in Families and Transition to School* (2013).

#### NICK HOPWOOD

Dr Nick Hopwood is a Senior Lecturer at the University of Technology Sydney, School of Education. He draws on cultural-historical and sociomaterial theories in studies of learning in a range of contexts, including schools, universities and health settings. Nick is author of several books as well as numerous book chapters and journal articles on substantive, theoretical and methodological topics.

# KAISA HYTÖNEN

Kaisa Hytönen, MEd, is a PhD student pursuing her dissertation at the Department of Teacher Education, University of Turku, Finland. In her study, she examines expert networks as learning environments in the context of bridging working life and academic expertise. Her special interests are professional learning, expertise studies and social expert networks. She is currently working as a project coordinator in a project called Early Stage Researchers at the Human Resources, University of Turku.

# MARÍA VERÓNICA LEIVA

Dr Leiva is an Associate Professor in the School of Pedagogy, Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaiso, Chile. Recent coauthored publications include 'Terms of Institutional Development in Schools in Chile' (*Redie*, 2014) and 'Reflections on the School's Role in Inter-ethnical Relations from Chilean State Ethnopolicies' (*Actualidades Investigativas en Educación*, 2014).

# COLIN MAYER

Colin Mayer is the Peter Moores Professor of Management Studies at the Saïd Business School at the University of Oxford. He is a Professorial Fellow of Wadham College, Oxford, and an Honorary Fellow of Oriel College, Oxford, and St Anne's College, Oxford. He is a Fellow of the British Academy, the European Corporate Governance Institute and the Royal Society of Arts. He is a member of the UK Competition Appeal Tribunal and the UK government Natural Capital Committee.



#### Notes on Contributors

xiii

#### CARMEN MONTECINOS

Professor Montecinos is at the School of Psychology, Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, and is a Senior Researcher at the Center for Advanced Research in Education (CIAE–Universidad de Chile). Her most recent coauthored publications include 'School Administrators and University Practicum Supervisors as Boundary Brokers for Initial Teacher Education in Chile' (*Teaching and Teacher Education*, 2015); and 'How Do School Administrators in Chile Understand and Manage Perceived Weaknesses in the School-Based Component of Initial Teacher Education?' (*International Journal of Educational Development*, 2015).

# JOCE NUTTALL

Dr Nuttall leads the Early Childhood Futures research program in the Learning Sciences Institute Australia at Australian Catholic University. Her research focuses on teacher professional learning, particularly in early years settings, from a cultural-historical activity theory perspective.

#### TUIRE PALONEN

Dr Tuire Palonen is Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Learning Research and Teacher Education at the University of Turku, Finland. She is also Adjunct Professor at the University of Jyväskylä. During her career, she has been interested in expertise research and social network analysis, focusing on the investigation of workplace learning and communication inside work organisations.

# PRABHAT CHANDRA RAI

Dr Rai is Assistant Professor at Ambedkar University Delhi. In the past he has been associated as Senior Fellow (Research) with the Royal Academy, Paro, Bhutan, and Professor and Assistant Director in the Academic Unit of Central Board of Secondary Education, Delhi. His PhD at the Oxford University Department of Education in 2014 investigated the role of building and using of common knowledge to inform pedagogical practices in primary school classrooms. His research draws largely upon cultural-historical activity theory.

# KATE ROLL

Dr Kate Roll a Research Fellow at the Saïd Business School, University of Oxford. She is also a Research Associate at the Centre for International Studies and a Lecturer in Empirical Politics for Somerville College, University of Oxford. Kate's research is divided into two main streams, reflecting both her background in international development and interest in postconflict recovery. While distinct, both areas look to transitions: the mechanics and politics of how people move out of poverty or rebuild their lives following war. Her research shares an analytical focus on power, resources, social networks and identity.



xiv

#### Notes on Contributors

#### ANNALISA SANNINO

Dr Annalisa Sannino is University Lecturer at the Center for Research on Activity, Development and Learning (CRADLE) in the Institute of Behavioural Sciences at the University of Helsinki. Her research is primarily focused on understanding the emergence of transformative agency as a dialectical process of mastering historical contradictions and related conflicts of motives. Her work aims at showing how this form of agency can be discursively identified, supported and enhanced in formative interventions.

# LAURA SEPPÄNEN

Dr Laura Seppänen is a Senior Research Scientist at the Finnish Institute of Occupational Health. Her research interests include activity theory–based developmental interventions, the dynamic relation between collective work and individuals, client understanding in service networks and relational work in collaboration. She is a docent (Agroecology) at the University of Helsinki, Finland.

#### ELENI STAMOU

Eleni Stamou has a background in Educational Studies and holds an MA and a PhD in the sociology of education. She has worked in academia, the public sector and the voluntary sector and has undertaken consultancy work for the Greek Ministry of Education and other agencies. She has held academic research posts at the UCL–Institute of Education and at the University of Oxford. Her research interests include the analysis of education policy in practice, inclusion and the prevention of social exclusion, youth identities and educ ational pathways.

## MARC THOMPSON

Dr Marc Thompson is an Official Fellow of Green Templeton College and a Senior Research Fellow at Said Business School, University of Oxford. His research has focused on changes in work organisation and systems, particularly in technology sectors and more recently in health, education and social care. He is coediting a forthcoming Oxford University Press *Handbook on Meaningful Work* and directs the Future of Work Programme at Green Templeton College. He also teaches on and directs the Oxford-HEC master's programme on consulting and coaching for change.

# HANNA TOIVIAINEN

Dr Hanna Toiviainen is Associate Professor of adult education at the University of Tampere in Finland, having been a Senior Researcher at the Center for Research on Activity, Development and Learning (CRADLE), University of Helsinki. Her special areas are the cultural-historical activity theory and



#### Notes on Contributors

research on working and learning in interorganisational networks in times of globalisation, multiprofessionality and digitalisation. Her current studies deal with customer-orientation and learning in service networks and in a digital printing network.

## JENNA VEKKAILA

Dr Jenna Vekkaila is a Senior Lecturer in university pedagogy, Faculty of Theology, University of Helsinki, Finland. Her research interests include postgraduate education, doctoral student engagement and the scholarly community.

#### SHIRLEY WALTERS

Shirley Walters is Professor Emerita of the Institute for Post-School Studies, University of Western Cape, where she has been Professor of Adult and Continuing Education for thirty years. She is founding director of the Division for Lifelong Learning, former Chair of the South African Qualifications Authority and currently a Member of the Ministerial Oversight Committee on Transformation of Public Higher Education and Deputy President for Africa of the International Council for Adult Education.

# VERNON WEITZ

Vernon Weitz has recently retired from the Division of Lifelong Learning at the University of the Western Cape in Cape Town, where he was involved in studying and supporting the participation of students in lifelong learning.

# RUTH YEOMAN

Dr Ruth Yeoman is an Associate Fellow at the Said Business School at the University of Oxford. She researches meaningful work and democratic work-places and advises public and private sector organisations on the governance and organisational effectiveness of mutuals. Her particular interest is the mutualisation of public services – what culture, values and leadership behaviours are required to establish new public service mutuals, and how to use the principles and values of mutuality to create new governance mechanisms at a whole council or whole sector level.

 $\mathbf{x}\mathbf{v}$