

ASEAN AS AN ACTOR IN INTERNATIONAL FOR A

ASEAN as an Actor in International Fora addresses a blind spot in ASEAN research and in comparative regionalism studies by assessing why, how, when and to what extent ASEAN member governments achieve a collective presence in global fora. Written for academic researchers and practitioners working in areas such as international relations, political science and international law, it examines ASEAN's negotiating behavior with a novel four-point cohesion typology. The authors argue that ASEAN's "cognitive prior" and its repository of cooperation norms have affected ASEAN's negotiation capacities, formats, strategies and cohesion in international fora. Using two case studies - one on ASEAN's cohesion in the WTO agricultural negotiations and one on UN negotiations on forced labor in Myanmar - they examine ASEAN's collective actions at different stages of negotiation, in different issue areas and in different negotiating fora. The book concludes by providing recommendations for strengthening ASEAN's international negotiation capacities.

PARUEDEE NGUITRAGOOL is a lecturer at the School of International Affairs, Faculty of Political Science and Public Administration, Chiang Mai University (CMU), Thailand. Before joining CMU, she was a research associate at the Department of Political Science, University of Freiburg, Germany, and a guest researcher at many institutions in Southeast Asia, including



Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) in Singapore, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS) and University of Indonesia (UI) in Jakarta, Indonesia. Her main research interests include the images of the West in Indonesia, and environmental politics and international relations in Southeast Asia.

JÜRGEN RÜLAND is Professor of Political Science in the Department of Political Science at the University of Freiburg, Germany. He is also the Chairman of the university's Southeast Asia Program and Chairman of the Academic Advisory Board of the GIGA German Institute for Global and Area Studies, Hamburg (2006–2014). Professor Rüland has published extensively on Southeast Asia and, in 2007, *Pacific Affairs* awarded him and Christl Kessler the William L. Holland Prize for the best article in 2006. He was the Stanford University/National University of Singapore Distinguished Fellow for Contemporary Southeast Asia 2010 and fellow at the Freiburg Institute of Advanced Studies (FRIAS History) 2010/2011 and 2014/2015.



INTEGRATION THROUGH LAW

The Role of Law and the Rule of Law in ASEAN Integration

General Editors

J. H. H. Weiler, European University Institute Tan Hsien-Li, National University of Singapore Michael Ewing-Chow, National University of Singapore

The Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN), comprising the ten member states of Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Malaysia, Myanmar, Philippines, Singapore, Thailand and Vietnam, has undertaken intensified integration into the ASEAN Community through the Rule of Law and Institutions in its 2007 Charter. This innovative book series evaluates the community-building processes of ASEAN to date and offers a conceptual and policy toolkit for broader Asian thinking and planning of different legal and institutional models of economic and political regional integration in the region. Participating scholars have been divided up into six separate thematic strands. The books combine a mix of Asian and Western scholars.

Centre for International Law, National University of Singapore (CIL-NUS)

The Centre for International Law (CIL) was established in 2009 at the National University of Singapore's Bukit Timah Campus in response to the growing need for international law expertise and capacity building in the Asia-Pacific region. CIL is a university-wide research centre that focuses on multidisciplinary research and works with other NUS or external centres of research and academic excellence. In particular, CIL collaborates very closely with the NUS Faculty of Law.





INTEGRATION THROUGH LAW
The Role of Law and the Rule of Law in ASEAN Integration
General Editors: J. H. H. Weiler, Tan Hsien-Li and Michael Ewing-Chow

ASEAN AS AN ACTOR IN INTERNATIONAL FORA

Reality, Potential and Constraints

PARUEDEE NGUITRAGOOL AND JÜRGEN RÜLAND





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107503885

© Centre for International Law 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library
ISBN 978-1-107-50388-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of tables page ix General editors' preface xi Acknowledgements xvii List of abbreviations xx

- 1. Introduction 1
- Analytical framework: a cognitive approach of externalization 8
 - 2.1 Externalization and international negotiations 8
 - 2.2 Regional organizations in international fora: a typology of cohesion 14
 - 2.3 Capacities, stages and strategies in international negotiations 20
 - 2.4 Methodology 30
- ASEAN's cognitive prior and negotiating capacities 38
 - 3.1 Cognitive and institutional dimensions of ASEAN's actorness 39
 - 3.2 Negotiation capacities 59
- ASEAN as a negotiator in global fora: stages of negotiation 92
 - 4.1 Phase 1 identifying problems, defining issues and agenda-setting93
 - 4.2 Phase 2 setting principles, norms, rules and procedures of negotiation and international cooperation 105
 - 4.3 Phase 3 concluding the negotiations: voting and compliance 119

vii



CONTENTS

- 5. ASEAN as an actor in global fora: negotiation strategies 134
 - 5.1 Competing for executive and leadership positions 134
 - 5.2 Framing 169
 - 5.3 Coalition-building 184
 - 5.4 Forum shopping 191
 - 5.5 Image projection and creation of "soft power" 195
- 6. Case studies 200
 - 6.1 Case 1 ASEAN and GATT/WTO negotiations on agricultural and tropical products 201
 - 6.2 Case 2 forced labor in Myanmar and ASEAN's multiple negotiation agenda 223
- 7. Conclusions and future options 249
 - 7.1 Strengthening cohesiveness, but how? 257
 - 7.2 Reforming ASEAN 261
 - 7.3 Upgrading the process of knowledge generation 263
 - 7.4 Better coordination of multi-level governance 264
 - 7.5 Reforming the ASEAN Secretariat 265
 - 7.6 Future research directions 270

Executive summary 273 References 280 Index 312

viii



TABLES

Table 2.1	Typology of actor conesion	page 15
Table 3.1	Diplomatic and expert staff of Permanent	
	Missions at the United Nations, New York	k
	and Geneva, 2012	66
Table 3.2	Operational budget of the ASEAN Secreta	riat 85
Table 4.1	Statements of ASEAN Delegations in the	
	United Nations General Assembly, 65th,	
	66th and 67th UNGA	100
Table 4.2	Resolutions sponsored or co-sponsored b	y
	ASEAN countries	101
Table 4.3	ASEAN voting behavior in the United	
	Nations General Assembly, 2002/2003-	
	2011/2012	122
Table 4.4	ASEAN split votes in the United Nations	
	General Assembly with one member	
	defecting through abstention or absence	123
Table 4.5	ASEAN, split voting, defections from	
	ASEAN majority, by member country	124
Table 4.6	ASEAN voting behavior in the United	
	Nations General Assembly, by issue area	127
Table 4.7	Major non-Western regional organizations	s
	and WTO dispute settlement	130
Table 4.8	ASEAN members in the WTO dispute	
	settlement mechanism	131

ix



LIST OF TABLES

Table 5.1	Non-permanent memberships in the UN	
	Security Council, by members of selected	
	regional organizations	139
Table 5.2	UN Security Council memberships, since	
	1967	140
Table 5.3	Presidencies of UN General Assembly, by	
	members of selected regional organizations	141
Table 5.4	Presidencies of UN Security Council, by	
	members of selected regional organizations	142
Table 5.5	WTO leadership positions and leadership	
	quotient, six major regional organizations,	
	1995-2010	158
Table 5.6	ASEAN members occupying leadership	
	positions in the WTO	159
Table 6.1	ASEAN countries and their alliances in the	
	agricultural negotiations	220



GENERAL EDITORS' PREFACE

This monograph is published within the context of a wideranging research project entitled, Integration Through Law: The Role of Law and the Rule of Law in ASEAN Integration (ITL), undertaken by the Centre for International Law at the National University of Singapore and directed by J. H. H. Weiler, Michael Ewing-Chow and Tan Hsien-Li.

The Preamble to the ASEAN Charter concludes with a single decision: "We, the Peoples of the Member States of the Association of Southeast Asian Nations ... [h]ereby decide to establish, through this Charter, the legal and institutional framework for ASEAN." For the first time in its history of over four decades, the Legal and the Institutional were brought to the forefront of ASEAN discourse.

The gravitas of the medium, a Charter: the substantive ambition of its content, the creation of three interlocking Communities, and the turn to law and institutions as instruments for realization provide ample justification for this wideranging project, to which this monograph is one contribution, examining ASEAN in a comparative context.

That same substantive and, indeed, political ambition means that any single study, illuminating as it may be, will cover but a fraction of the phenomena. Our modus operandi in this project was to create teams of researchers from Asia and elsewhere who would contribute individual monographs within an overall framework which we had designed. The

хi



GENERAL EDITORS' PREFACE

project framework, involving several thematic clusters within each monograph, is thus determined by the framework and the place of each monograph within it.

As regards the specific content, however, the authors were free, indeed encouraged, to define their own understanding of the problem and their own methodology and reach their own conclusions. The thematic structure of the entire project may be found at the end of this Preface.

The project as a whole, and each monograph within it, display several methodological sensibilities.

First, law, in our view, can only be understood and evaluated when situated in its political and economic context. Thus, the first studies in the overall project design are intended to provide the political, economic, cultural and historical context against which one must understand ASEAN and are written by specialists in these respective disciplines. This context, to a greater or lesser degree, also informs the sensibility of each monograph. There are no "black letter law" studies to be found in this project and, indeed, even in the most technical of areas we encouraged our authors to make their writing accessible to readers of diverse disciplines.

Comparative experience suggests that the success of achieving some of the more ambitious objectives outlined in Article 1 of the Charter will depend in no small measure on the effectiveness of legal principles, legal rules and legal institutions. This is particularly true as regards the success of establishing "an ASEAN Community comprising the ASEAN Security Community, the ASEAN Economic Community and the ASEAN Socio-Cultural Community as

xii



GENERAL EDITORS' PREFACE

provided for in the Bali Declaration of ASEAN Concord II". Article 2(2)(n) stipulates the commitment of ASEAN Member States to act in accordance with the principle of "adherence to multilateral trade rules and ASEAN's rules-based regimes for effective implementation of economic commitments and progressive reduction towards elimination of all barriers to regional economic integration." The ASEAN Member States therefore envisage that rules of law and the Rule of Law will become a major feature in the future of ASEAN.

Although, as seen, the Charter understands itself as providing an institutional and legal framework for ASEAN, the question of the "role of law and the rule of law" is not advocacy but a genuine enquiry in the various substantive areas of the project as to:

- the substantive legal principles and substantive rules of the various ASEAN communities:
- the procedural legal principles and rules governing institutional structures and decision-making processes;
- implementation, enforcement and dispute settlement.

One should not expect a mechanical application of this scheme in each study; rather, a sensibility that refuses to content itself with legal enactments as such and looks to a "living" notion of law and institutions is ubiquitous in all the studies. Likewise, the project is sensitive to "non Law." It variously attempts to locate the appropriate province of the law in this experience. That is, not only the role of law, but also the areas that are and should remain outside the reach of legal institutionalization with due sensitivity to ASEAN and Asian particularism and political and cultural identities.

xiii



GENERAL EDITORS' PREFACE

The project, and the monographs of which it is made, are not normatively thick. They do not advocate. They are designed, for the most part, to offer reflection, discuss the pros and cons, and in this way enrich public awareness, deepen understanding of different options and in that respect contribute indirectly to policymaking.

This decisive development of ASEAN has been accompanied by a growing Asian interest in various legal and institutional forms of transnational economic and political cooperation, notably the various voices discussing and showing an interest in an East Asia Integration project. The number of Free Trade Agreements (FTAs) and Regional Trade Agreements (RTAs) has increased from six in 1991 to 166 in 2013, with a further 62 in various stages of negotiations.

Methodologically, the project and many of the monographs are comparative in their orientation. Comparative law is one of the few real-life laboratories that we have in which to assess and understand the operation of different legal and institutional models designed to tackle similar objectives and problems. One should not need to put one's own hand in the fire to learn that it scorches. With that in mind a couple of monographs offer both conceptual reflection and pragmatic "tool boxing" on some of the key elements featuring in all regional integration systems.

Comparative law is in part about divergence: it is a potent tool and means to understand one's own uniqueness. One understands better the uniqueness of Apples by comparing them to Oranges. You understand better the specialness of a Toyota by comparing it to a Ford.

xiv



GENERAL EDITORS' PREFACE

Comparative law is also about convergence: it is a potent tool and means to understand how what are seemingly different phenomena are part of a broader trend, an insight which may enhance both self-understanding and policy potentialities.

Although many studies in the project could have almost immediate policy implications, as would the project as a whole, this is not its only or even principal purpose. There is a rich theory of federalism which covers many countries around the world. There is an equally rich theory of European integration, which has been associated with the advent Union. There is also considerable learning on Free Trade Areas and the like.

To date, the study of the legal aspects of ASEAN specifically and other forms of Asian legal integration has been derivative of, and dependent on, theoretical and conceptual insight which were developed in different contexts.

One principal objective of ITL and these monographs will be to put in place the building blocks for an authentic body of ASEAN and Asian integration theory developed in, and with sensitivity to, the particularities and peculiarities of the region and continent. A theory and conceptual framework of Asian legal integration will signal the coming of age of research of and in the region itself.

Although the monographs form part of an overarching project, we asked our authors to write each as a "standalone" – not assuming that their readers would have consulted any of the other titles. Indeed, the project is rich and few will read all monographs. We encourage readers to pick and

XV



GENERAL EDITORS' PREFACE

choose from the various monographs and design their own menu. There is, on occasion, some overlap in providing, for example, background information on ASEAN in different studies. That is not only inevitable but desirable in a project of this amplitude.

The world is increasingly witnessing a phenomenon of interlocking regional organization where the experience of one feeds on the others. In some way, the intellectual, disciplinary and comparative sensibility of this project is a microcosm of the world it describes.

The range of topics covered in this series comprises:

The General Architecture and Aspirations of ASEAN
The Governance and Management of ASEAN: Instruments,
Institutions, Monitoring, Compliance and Dispute
Resolution

Legal Regimes in ASEAN
The ASEAN Economic Community
ASEAN and the World
The Substantive Law of ASEAN

xvi



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book, which explores thus far largely uncharted waters of the meanwhile voluminous research on the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN), could not have been completed without the great support of many institutions and individuals. Foremost of those to whom we owe great gratitude is the Centre for International Law (CIL) of the National University of Singapore. The study is part of a large and pioneering research project entitled "Integration through Law" (ITL) conducted by the Centre, in which about seventy scholars have been involved. At the center of the project is the comprehensive study of all principal legal issues associated with the process of regional integration in Southeast Asia, including the pertinent institutional context to which our study contributes. The project leaders, Professor J. H. H. Weiler (European University Institute, Florence), Professor Michael Ewing-Chow and Dr. Tan Hsien-Li, have not only provided us with the highly valued opportunity to participate in this challenging endeavor; we also greatly benefited from their excellent guidance and the inspiring research atmosphere they created. All this is greatly appreciated as well as the Centre's financial institutional support, which enabled us to carry out fieldwork in Europe and Southeast Asia.

We received excellent feedback in two workshops in Singapore and Jakarta at different stages of the project.

xvii



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The workshops brought together an impressive array of leading scholars of regionalism and numerous high-caliber government practitioners from all over the ASEAN region. In particular, we would like to thank Professor Pascal Vennesson, Mr. Peter Govindasamy, Mr. Termsak Chalermpalanupap and many other - unnamed - participants of the Integration through Law project for their thoughtful comments and suggestions on the first, then still incomplete, draft version of this book. We would likewise thank two anonymous reviewers of the completed manuscript for their meticulous reading of the text, their encouragement, but also their candid critique of some of our conceptual choices. We took their advice very seriously and we sincerely hope that the revised manuscript comes as close as possible to their high-quality standards. The University of Freiburg's Southeast Asia program, sponsored by the German Federal University of Education and Research (BMBF), was an invaluable pool of expertise from which we greatly benefited through innumerable informal conversations and discussions.

Without the help of our interviewees in Singapore, Jakarta, Bangkok, Manila, New York, Geneva, Brussels and Berlin it would have been impossible for us to understand how ASEAN members interact inside and outside the negotiation rooms of global forums. We greatly appreciate that they shared with us their precious time, information, knowledge and experience. In addition, we would like warmly to express our sincere thanks to our able research assistants at the Department of Political Science and the Southeast Asian Studies program of the University of Freiburg, namely Jan-Simon Dörflinger, Felix Idelberger, Vanessa Guinan-Bank,

xviii



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Verena Lais, Anna Leiber, Mareike Well and Lukas Müller for their dedicated support. Jan-Simon Dörflinger, Felix Idelberger and Lukas Müller have compiled and pre-reviewed numerous resolutions of the United Nations General Assembly and have traced ASEAN's voting behavior in this UN body. Berenike Feldhoff has helped us in searching for ASEAN's joint statements in the WTO. Without their competent assistance, we would have spent much more time on data collection and some mistakes would most likely have gone undetected.

In Singapore Renee Chan Lai Sang has eased our administrative and logistical burdens with great competence, reliability and efficiency. Last but not least we thank Alec Crutchley for his careful proofreading of the final versions of this manuscript. Yet, while we are very grateful for all the great support we have received, any errors that remain are the sole responsibility of the authors.

xix



ABBREVIATIONS

3G Global Governance Group **ABAC** ASEAN Business Advisory Council ABC **ASEAN Business Club** ACD Asian Cooperation Dialogue ASEAN-China Free Trade Area **ACFTA ACSC ASEAN Civil Society Conference** ACT Accountability, Coherence and Transparence Asian Developing Member **ADM AECF** Asia-Europe Cooperation Framework American Federation of Labor and AFL-CIO Congress of Industrial Organizations **AFTA** ASEAN Free Trade Area Australian Fair Trade and Investment **AFTINET** Network **AIPMC** ASEAN Inter-Parliamentary Myanmar Caucus **ALMM** ASEAN Labor Ministers Meeting **AMAF** ASEAN Ministers on Agriculture and Forestry **AMF** Asian Monetary Fund **AMM ASEAN Ministerial Meeting AMRO** ASEAN+3 Monetary Research Office APA ASEAN People's Assembly

Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation

ASEAN People's Forum

XX

APEC

APF



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

APN Asia-Pacific Network

APRIS ASEAN Project for Regional Integration

Support

APT ASEAN Plus Three
ARF ASEAN Regional Forum

ASA Association of Southeast Asia

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations
ASEAN-5 ASEAN founding members (Indonesia,
Malaysia, the Phillippings, Singapore and

Malaysia, the Philippines, Singapore and

Thailand)

ASEAN-CCI ASEAN Chamber of Commerce and

Industries

ASEM Asia-Europe Meeting

AUN ASEAN University Network
BDF Bali Democracy Forum

BIMSTEC Bay of Bengal Initiative for Multi-Sectoral

Technical and Economic Cooperation

BRICS Brazil, Russia, India, China, South Africa

CAP Common Agricultural Policy
CAS Comparative Area Studies
CIL Centre for International Law

CINAPS Centre for Indonesian National Policy

Studies

CLMV Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar and Vietnam

CMI Chiang Mai Initiative

CMIM Chiang Mai Initiative (Multilateralized)
CPR Committee of Permanent Representatives

CSIS Center for Strategic and International

Studies

D8 Developing 8

xxi



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

DNPI Dewan Nasional Perubahan Iklim (National Council on Climate Change)

EAEG East Asian Economic Group

EAS East Asian Summit
EC European Community

ECOSOC Economic and Social Council

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African

States

EEC European Economic Community

EEZ Exclusive Economic Zone
EPG Eminent Persons Group

ERIA Economic Research Institute for ASEAN

and East Asia

EU European Union

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization FLACSO Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias

Sociales (Latin American Faculty of Social

Sciences)

FLC Forced Labor Convention
FOSS Forum of Small States
FSB Financial Stability Board
FTA Free Trade Agreement

G7/8 Group of 7/8
G15 Group of 15
G20 Group of 20
G33 Group of 33
G77 Group of 77

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GDP gross domestic product

GMM Global Movement of Moderates
GSP Generalized System of Preferences

xxii



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

HIV/AIDS Human Immunodeficiency Virus/

Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome

HLT [International Labor

Organization]High-Level Team

HLTF High-Level Task Force

ICTSD International Centre for Trade and

Sustainable Development

ICWA Indonesian Council of World Affairs
IFI international financial institution
IFPRI International Food Policy Research

Institute

ILC International Labor Conference
 ILO International Labor Organization
 IMF International Monetary Fund
 IPU Inter-Parliamentary Union

ISEAS Institute of Southeast Asian Studies
ISIS Institutes of International and Strategic

Studies

ITD Italian-Thai Development Public

Company Limited

ITL Integration through Law
JIM Jakarta Informal Meeting
KFG Kolleg-Forschergruppe

KNLA Karen National Liberation Army

LDC least-developed country
LFS labor force survey

LIPI Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia

(Indonesian Institute of Sciences)

MAI Multilateral Agreement on Investment Maphilindo Malaya, the Philippines and Indonesia

MDG Millennium Development Goal

xxiii



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Mercosur	Mercado Común del Sur (Common Market of the South)
MTID	Markets, Trade and Institutions Division
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NAM	Non-Alignment Movement
NePAD	New Partnership for Africa's Development
NGO	non-governmental organization
NIEO	New International Economic Order
NLD	National League for Democracy
NPR	nominal protection rate
NTU	Nanyang Technological University
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OIC	Organization of Islamic Cooperation
P5	Five Permanent Members of the UN Security Council (USA, Russia, China, France and United Kingdom)
PECC	Pacific Economic Cooperation Council
R ₂ P	Responsibility to Protect
RAM	recently acceded member
RM	Malaysian ringgit
RSIS	Rajaratnam School of International Studies
S ₅	Small Five Group
SAARC	South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAPA	Solidarity for Asian People's Advocacy
SARS	severe acute respiratory syndrome
SCO	Shanghai Cooperation Organization

xxiv



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

SDT special and differential treatment (for

Developing Countries)

SEANWFZ Southeast Asian Nuclear-Weapon-Free

Zone

SIIA Singapore Institute of International Affairs

SOM Senior Officials' Meeting

SP special product

SPDC State Peace and Development Council

SSM special safeguard mechanism SVE small, vulnerable economy

TAC Treaty of Amity and Cooperation [in

Southeast Asia]

TF-WAR Task Force on Agreement on Agriculture

(Re)negotiations

UN United Nations

UNBISNET United Nations Bibliographic Information

System

UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and

Development

UNDP United Nations Development Program
UNGA United Nations General Assembly

UNPA United Nations Parliamentary Assembly

UNSC United Nations Security Council

USDP Union Solidarity and Development Party

WHO World Health Organization
WTO World Trade Organization

ZOPFAN Zone of Peace, Freedom and Neutrality

XXV