

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispytationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

M. TVLLI CICERONIS  
TVSCVLANARVM DISPYTATIONVM  
LIBER PRIMVS.

I. 1. CVM defensionum laboribus senatoriisque muneribus aut omnino aut magna ex parte essem aliquando liberatus, rettuli me, Brute, te hortante maxime, ad ea studia, quae retenta animo, remissa temporibus, longo interuallo intermissa reuocau,

I. § 1, 3. rettuli W 12 L 46 O 6. re tuli O 5 *altero t eraso.* retuli B 3.  
retuli R V G 1-4 B 12 K P S D II J O 1-4 7-12. || animo retenta W 1.

The words *De contemnenda morte*, found in most early editions after the title of the book, are not in the best MSS and do not belong to Cic., but have been introduced into inferior MSS from Diu. ii 1, 2 'totidem subsecuti libri "Tusculanarum disputationum" ... primus enim est de contemnenda morte, secundus de tolerando dolore...'

I. § 1. *defensionum*: most of Cicero's extant speeches were delivered for the defence. He appeared in the law-courts on the side of the prosecution in the case of Verres; cf. Or. 29, 103 (and Sandys' note) 'in accusationis septem libris.' The interrogation of Vatinius arose out of the defence of Sestius. The invective against Piso and most of those against Catiline and M. Antonius were delivered before the Senate, the rest before the people.

*aut...aut*, 'either...or at all events.' 46, 110 'aut summum bonum aut... nullum malum'; v 30, 84 'nihil bonum, nisi naturae primis bonis aut omnibus aut maximis frui.' See Hand, *Tursell.* i p. 532.

*magna ex parte*: between the outbreak of the Civil War and the publication of the Tusculan Disputations the only speeches delivered by Cic. were *pro M. Marcello* and *pro Q. Ligario* in 46 B.C., and *pro rege Deiotaro* in 45 B.C.

D.

*cum essem*: subj. because the order of succession in time is also the order of cause and effect. Cf. *Madv.* § 358.

*aliquando*, 'at last,' implying that the time of release was all too long in coming. Cf. 44, 105 'aliquando sapiens Achilles.' So *tandem aliquando* and *tandem*.

*Brute*: see *Introd.* end of section 1.

*retenta animo*: Cicero's attention had been early directed to philosophy. By the year 88 B.C. he had studied under the Epicurean Phaedrus, Diodotus the Stoic, and Philo of Larissa. See *Reid's Introd.* to the *Academics*, pp. 1, 2. [Compare *inclusa habebam* *Ac.* i 3, 11.]

*remissa temporibus*: abl. of cause, 'less vigorously prosecuted owing to circumstances.' *tempora* is often applied to circumstances of difficulty or danger. Cicero's poem *de Temporibus Meis* dealt with the circumstances of his exile and recall. Cf. *pro Plancio* i, 1 'meorum temporum'; cf. also the use of *tempus* in p. *Sest.* 6, 14; 58, 123. Here the reference is probably wider and covers the period of Cicero's tenure of state office and subsequent activity at the bar.

*intermissa*: between 52 B.C. and 46 B.C., the interruption being due to his administration of Cilicia and to the Civil War, cf. *Teuffel, Rom. Lit.* i § 173 subsec. 2, 1.

[*longo interuallo intermissa*: practi-

I

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlnarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

## 2 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [1.1]

- et cum omnium artium, quae ad rectam uiuendi uiam pertinerent, ratio et disciplina studio sapientiae, quae philosophia dicitur, contineretur, hoc mihi Latinis litteris inlustrandum putavi, non quia philosophia Graecis et litteris et doctoribus percipi non posset, sed meum semper iudicium fuit omnia nostros aut inuenisse per se sapientius quam Graecos aut accepta ab illis fecisse meliora, quae quidem digna statuissent, in quibus elaborarent.
2. nam mores et instituta uitae resque domesticas ac familiares

cally a restatement of *remissa temporibus* acc. to Cic.'s frequent custom which has led so often to the unnecessary assumption of glosses.]

**pertinerent...contineretur**: we might have expected *pertineant* and *contineatur* (subj. due to *cum* causal). *contineretur* takes its time from *putavi* (cf. Madv. § 383) and brings in *pertinerent* by attraction. For attraction of tense and mood see Draeger, *Hist. Synt.* I § 153, especially subsec. 4.

Küh., here and in *Gram.* II § 181, p. 778, notes that in subordinate clauses, even though, as here, the reflection may be general, a preceding perfect is usually followed by a secondary sequence. Cf. 4, 7 'iudicaui...posset.'

**ratio et disciplina**, 'systematic method.' Küh., on 4, 12, explains that in *ἐν διὰ δυνάμιν* of this kind one of the two substantives does the work of an adjective which the language lacks; cf. iii 1, 2 'rationem et doctrinam.' Cf. also Naegelsbach, *Stil.* 73. 2.

**studio...quae philosophia dicitur**: for this attraction of the rel. to the gender of the following substantive see Madv. § 316.

**quae philosophia dicitur**: for the indicative in an explanatory clause, which may be omitted without prejudice to the leading idea, see Madv. § 369. These words do not form part of the thought which he had at the time referred to. FAW. thinks that the explanatory clause indicates that the word *philosophia* had not yet been established in common use when Cic. wrote this passage.

**[philosophia]**: this passage does not, I think, shew that *philosophia* was unusual. It could hardly so be, when Plaut. and later writers have *philosophus*, Enn. *philosophari* (also *sophia*). Plin. xiii § 84 shews that the word was in one of the oldest annalists (Cassius Hemina). Here Cic. only means to put forward *studium sapientiae* as a very clear Latin representation of *φιλοσοφία*. Cf. Leg.

i § 58 'cuius (sapientiae) amore Graeco uerbo philosophia nomen inuenit'; see also Off. ii § 5. The word *sapientius* is used with definite point below = *φιλοσοφικώτερον*.]

**contineretur** with the simple abl. = 'depends upon'; cf. Wilkins on Or. i 2, 8.

**non quia...non posset**: subj. of reported reason; the reason that another gives, or might give, rejected. Küh. notes that *non quo*, *non quod* is more usual in Cicero.

**litteris et doctoribus**: ablatives of means: *doctoribus* would scarcely have been placed in this construction if *litteris* had not preceded.

**non quia...sed...fuit**: usually *sed quod* (*sed quia*) follows in a dependent clause, cf. Madv. § 357 b. For the transition to a main clause cf. ii 26, 64; iii 22, 54.

**[meum semper iud.]**: in this collocation *semper* has almost the force of an adj.]

**[iud. fuit with constr. of iudicare.]**

**omnia...sapientius quam Graecos**: for this exaggerated estimate of the intellectual powers of his countrymen cf. Or. i 4, 15 'ingenia uero, ut multis rebus possumus iudicare, nostrorum hominum multum ceteris hominibus omnium gentium praestiterunt.' For its cause cf. Küh.: 'Hanc Cic. sententiam nimio patriae amore obcaecatus et fortasse eo consilio uidetur protulisse, ut Romano animos ad litterarum studium persequendum exhortaretur.'

**quae quidem...statuissent**: the subj. is in or. obl., but even in direct discourse the verb with the rel. introducing a limitation would here be in the subjunctive, since the reference is to a class and not to particular instances. Cf. Roby §§ 1692, 1693; Madv. § 364, obs. 2.

**elaborarent**: subj. of purpose, Madv. § 363; Roby § 1632.

§ 2. **et...que...ac**: *et* simply connects; *que* tacks on *res domesticas ac familiares*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlararvm Dispytationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

## —1. 3]

## LIBER PRIMVS

3

nos profecto et melius tuemur et lautius, rem uero publicam nostri maiores certe melioribus temperauerunt et institutis et  
 15 legibus. quid loquar de re militari? in qua cum uirtute nostri multum ualuerunt, tum plus etiam disciplina. iam illa, quae natura, non litteris adsecuti sunt, neque cum Graecia neque ulla cum gente sunt conferenda. quae enim tanta grauitas, quae tanta constantia, magnitudo animi, probitas, fides, quae tam  
 20 excellens in omni genere uirtus in ullis fuit, ut sit cum maioribus nostris comparanda? 3. doctrina Graecia nos et omni litterarum genere superabat; in quo erat facile uincere non repugnantes. nam cum apud Graecos antiquissimum e doctis genus sit poeta-

§ 2, 13. lautius G 1-3 B 1-3 K S L 14 6 O 1-5 7-12 O 6 (marg.). <sup>u</sup>latius R.  
 § 3, 23. e doctis G 12 W 1 B 23 L 3 O 23 59 10. edoctis R 12 10 V  
 B K P W 2 M 12 L 4 O 6 12. edoctum G 3 D O 7. e doctis S marg.  
 al. atram. educatū. educatum G 4 O 1. et doctissimum O 8. edoctos O 11.  
 e docte O 4 (? *conpendium pro -is*).

to *mores et inst. uitae* as it is in these to a great extent that the *mores* and *institutula* are displayed; *ac* is used in the sense of *et* for the sake of clearness. Cf. 40, 95 n. and Madv. § 433.

*res domesticas ac familiares*, 'affairs of the family and of the household.'

*lautius*, 'with greater elegance.' Neidius (in Küh.) pointed out that *lautius* refers to *res dom. ac fam.*, *melius* to *mores et inst. uitae*; for the non-distribution of these terms cf. 25, 62 n.; 30, 74 'saepe multis'; Tac. Ann. xv 11, 1 'ui ac minis alares exterruit, legionarios obtruiuit.'

*temperauerunt*, 'have organized'; cf. 10, 21 n.

*quid loquar*: a formula *praeteritionis*, by which the writer affects to pass over a point as self-evident. TS. notes that none the less a rel. clause regularly follows (as here *in qua* etc.) to indicate the line of thought.

*de re militari*: for the sentiment Mo. compares p. Mur. 9, 22; Corn. Nep. xxiii 1, 1.

*iam illa*: *iam*, as often, indicates that he has now reached a striking instance. 'But when we take those advantages which they owe to native power...'; for this meaning of *natura* cf. Virg. Geo. ii 49 'quippe solo natura subest.'

*cum Graecia*: the *comparatio compendiarum*, compressed for *cum eis quae Graecia...adsecuta est*. Similarly below 'ut sit cum maioribus nostris comparanda,' i.e. *cum uirtute maiorum nostrorum*. Küh. gives several exx. of this

constr., which is very common in all languages.

[*cum Graecia*: this form of *comparatio* avoids the awkward gen. which late writers use freely: e.g. de Or. i § 23 'si cum Lycurgo et Dracone nostras leges conferre uolueritis': a late writer would be very apt to put *Lycurgi* and *Draconis*.]

*neque...conferenda*: here, as usually in Cic., the gerundive denotes necessity or fitness, not possibility; see Madv. § 420 obs., and n. on Fin. i 2, 6. [Madv. only quotes two exceptions, and even these, I think, do not hold good. If so, 'usually' should be 'always' in above n.]

*grauitas*, 'dignity,' 'weight of character'; for the opposite quality cf. 'leues ac nummarii iudices,' p. Cluent. 28, 75.

*constantia* and *magnitudo animi* form a pair, connected in meaning; similarly *probitas* and *fides*. For this see Naegelsbach, *Stil.* § 173, 5.

*ullis*: substantival, as *quisquam* is not used in the plural. Cf. *nullis* 39, 94.

§ 3. *doctis*: of skill in poetry; cf. *σοφός* and *σοφία* often in Pindar; e.g. Olymp. ii 155 where the *σοφός*, who is naturally inspired, is contrasted with *μαθόντες*. As applied to Latin poets *doctus* usually denotes a man inspired by study of Greek, especially Alexandrine models. In Pindar *σοφός* = 'clever': in Cic. here *doctus* scarcely has that sense, but as Roman poets who studied Greek poets were

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlnarvm Dispytationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

## 4 TVSCVLANARVM DISPYTATIONVM [1. 3]

rum; si quidem Homerus fuit et Hesiodus ante Romam conditam,  
 25 Archilochus regnante Romulo, serius poeticam nos accepimus.  
 annis fere DX post Romam conditam Liuius fabulam dedit  
 C. Claudio, Caeci filio, M. Tuditano consulibus anno ante natum  
 Ennium. [qui fuit maior natu quam Plautus et Naeuius.]

II. Sero igitur a nostris poetae uel cogniti uel recepti.  
 quamquam est in Originibus solitos esse in epulis canere con-

25. archilocus V. archilocus G. 26. annis fere V G 14 K P W 12 M 1 C  
 O 2-5 11. O 6 marg. eni. annis enim fere B 13 M 2 G 3 D O 17-10.  
 annis iam fere O 12. || ccccx K O 9. ccccx R 126 B 13 S M 12  
 O 347. ccccxviii O 11. quadringentis decem W 1 M 1 B 2 O 1256.  
 ccccx<sup>is</sup> V marg. al. quingentis. ccccx<sup>us</sup> G. quadringentis X<sup>em</sup> O 8 10.  
 quatringentis decem O 12. et octo G 4 B 3. et octo marg. W 1.

*docti*, much more might the Gr. models be so styled. The subj. is due to *cum* causal.

**si quidem**, 'at all events if,' almost = 'since.' These words are often thus used in putting forward, as ground for a preceding statement, something assumed to be admitted as a fact. Cf. Brutus 10, 40 '(Homeri) etsi incerta sunt tempora, tamen annis multis fuit ante Romulum; si quidem non infra Lycurgum fuit'; p. Mur. 11, 24.

[Archilochus: Nepos, in Gell. xvii 21, says in time of Tullus Hostilius.]

**annis**: abl. of measure (instrumental): cf. Roby § 1204, and note.

**fere**: to mark an approximation, because the nearest round number is taken.

**DX**: strictly 514 years, from 754 to 240 B.C., the year of the consulship of C. Claudius Cento and M. Sempronius Tuditanus: see Brut. 18, 72, quoted below, and Cato M. 14, 50.

**fabulam dedit**, sc. *populo*; more usually 'fabulam docere,' sc. *histriones*. Cf. Cato M. 14, 50; Brut. 18, 72 'atque hic (Liuius) primus fabulam C. Claudio Caeci filio et M. Tuditano consulibus *docuit* anno ipso ante quam natus est Ennius, post Romam conditam autem quarto decimo et quingentesimo,' but in the next section 'Liuius ... qui primus fabulam *dedit*.' *dare fabulam* also occurs several times in prologues of Terence.

**qui fuit maior natu quam Plautus et Naeuius**. If these words are sound *qui* must refer to Liuius, not to Ennius, but though Or. and (following Wes. *Em.* 11, p. 1) Sff. thought this order of words justified, where there could be no ambiguity, by the notoriety of the fact that Ennius was later than Plautus and Nae-

uius, this seems impossible. In 31, 75 the reference in the pronoun is more obvious. Rath placed this clause immediately after *Liuius*. Dav. thinks that Cic. has committed a *σφάλμα μνημονικόν*, but in Brut. 18, 73, written two years earlier, Cic. shews that he knows that Ennius was junior to Plautus and Naeuius. Küh. is pretty certainly right in holding that the words *qui... Naeuius* are due to a *glossator*, who, remembering the passage in the Brutus, copied these words into the margin in order to fix Liuius' period, and that from the margin they got into the text. Tr. Sch. TS. eject: Ern. Hei. Küh. Ml. Schiche bracket. FAW. ejected *et Naeuius* (omitted in some MSS) and bracketed the rest. Ennius lived 239-169 B.C. Plautus died in 184 B.C., and Cic. Cato M. 14, 50 refers to the Pseudolus (acted 191 B.C.) as a work of his old age. Naeuius died at an advanced age in 202 B.C.; he is said to have served in the first Punic war, upon which he wrote. Naeuius was therefore certainly, and Plautus probably, earlier than Ennius. Ter. And. prol. 18 probably gives the historical order *Naeuium, Plautum, Ennium*.

II. **recepti**: because the earliest poets were not Roman citizens. Liuius was a Greek from Tarentum, Naeuius was from Campania, Plautus from Umbria, Ennius from Calabria.

**quamquam est in**: Sff. followed by TS. inserted *enim*, against the MSS and wrongly. The *quamquam* clause introduces a fact apparently inconsistent with the statement just made; this fact is explained away by the *tamen* clause. Many editors, and recently TS., have merely a comma after *uirtutibus*; wrongly,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlararvm Dispytationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

—2. 4]

## LIBER PRIMVS

5

uiuas ad tibicinem de clarorum hominum uirtutibus; honorem tamen huic generi non fuisse declarat oratio Catonis, in qua  
 5 obiecit ut probrum M. Nobiliori, quod is in prouinciam poetas duxisset; duxerat autem consul ille in Aetoliam, ut scimus, Ennium. quo minus igitur honoris erat poetis, eo minora studia fuerunt, nec tamen, si qui magnis ingeniis in eo genere exstiterunt, non satis Graecorum gloriae responderunt. 4. an censemus, si  
 10 Fabio, nobilissimo homini, laudi datum esset, quod pingeret, non

II. 5. marco RVG B1-3 KS W2 M12 II O3. marchio G3 W1 M1. 8. sic qui R12 V G13 KPL O7. si qui S W12 M12 B3 O2-68 10-12. si qui B at fuerat sic qui. si quis O9. non habet O1.  
 § 4, 9. an censemus V G14 S W2 M12 O3. an censemus R KP.

for this would make *quamquam* here = 'although,' whereas it means 'and yet.'

**Origines:** M. Porcius Cato the Censor (died 149 B.C.) wrote under this title a work on history in seven books, of which many fragments survive. The second and third books dealt with the origin of the several Italian cities, hence the title of the whole; cf. Nepos, Cato iii.

**in epulis canere:** for reference to this practice Dav. compares iv 2, 3; Brutus 19, 75; Val. Max. ii 1, 10; Varro apud Nonium in *assa*; Leg. ii 24, 62; Quint. i (10, 20). Küh. adds Hor. Odes iv 15, 29; Cic. Or. iii 51, 197, where see Wilkins for ref. to criticisms of the value of these songs.

**ad tibicinem** = *ad tibicinis cantum*; *ad tibiam* is more usual, cf. iv 2, 3. TS. compares de Leg. Agr. ii 34, 93 'hostiae ad praeconem et ad tibicinem immolabuntur.'

**huic generi**, sc. *poeticae*; cf. *in eo genere* below.

**oratio Catonis:** for Cato's speeches, of which over 150 survived into Cicero's time (cf. Brut. 17, 65) and many into the 4th cent. A.D., see Teuffel, *Rom. Lit.* i § 108. For the statement cf. Cato in Gellius xi 2, 5 'poeticae artis honos non erat; si qui in ea re studebat...grassator uocabatur.' Muretus (in Mo.) notes 'suspicio eam orationem fuisse qua Ser. Galbam oppugnauit: eum enim Fuluii defendebant.' For this speech cf. Brut. 23, 89.

**declarat...obiecit:** for the pres. *declarat* cf. 18, 42, n. on *uult*. Bent. wished to alter *obiecit* into *obicit*, which Cic. might have written, but the text is sound: *in qua obiecit* = 'in which (when delivering it) he reproached'; *in qua obicit* would have meant 'in which (as we have it) he reproaches.'

**M. Fulvius Nobilior** who, as consul, in 189 B.C. took Ambracia.

**poetas:** the plural is invidiously used. Cf. p. Sest. 36, 78 'magistratus (one only referred to) templo deicias?' in Pis. 10, 23 'cum equites Romani relegarentur'; Persius iii 79 'aerumnosique Solones,' and Conington on Pers. i 34.

**duxerat autem:** *autem*, as *δέ* often in Greek, here adds an explanatory fact as a new and *coordinate* statement, whereas *duxerat enim* would have been merely explanatory and nothing more. See Küh. here and in *Gr.* ii § 165, 7, p. 702. For the fact cf. Brut. 20, 79; p. Arch. 11, 27.

**nec tamen si qui:** some of the best MSS read *nec tamen sic qui*, which Bent. approved: 'Recte nec tamen sic: in eorum statu; licet in nullo honore tum essent poetae.' But Küh. follows FAW. and finds *nec tamen si qui* 'elegantissimum et plane Ciceronianum,' while *nec tamen sic* i.e. *tamen ne sic quidem* 'a Ciceroniana consuetudine prorsus abhorere uidetur.' And this view, which seems right, is now followed by editors generally. Sff. points out that *c* final in MSS. is often added or omitted, e.g. with *nec* and *ne*, *si* and *sic*, etc.

§ 4. **an censemus**, 'pray do we suppose...?' For *an* introducing a question apparently simple see Roby § 2255; also Madv. § 453. *an* is often rhetorical in this use or expresses surprise. Instead of a *utrum* clause a statement may precede which is rhetorically refuted by the *an* clause; cf. 36, 87; Madv. on Fin. i 8, 28.

**Fabio:** Q. Fabius Pictor (grandfather of the historian) painted the temple of Salus 304 B.C. The painting lasted until the temple was burned down in the reign of Claudius. Cf. Pliny, N.H. xxxv 4, 7.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

## 6 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [2. 4]

multos etiam apud nos futuros Polyclitos et Parrhasios fuisse?  
honos alit artes, omnesque incenduntur ad studia gloria, iacentque  
ea semper, quae apud quosque inprobantur. summam erudi-  
tionem Graeci sitam censebant in neruorum uocumque cantibus;  
15 igitur et Epaminondas, princeps meo iudicio Graeciae, fidibus  
praeclare cecinisse dicitur, Themistoclesque aliquot ante annos,

11. Polyclitos R V G B. Polycleto K *γ ex u alio atram. mut.* Polycleto S W 12 G 4 B 23 II J O 2-4. 12. incenduntur R V G B 1-3 P S W 12 M 12 *plerique.* incendimur G 4. 15. graeciae R 6 O 2. *græciæ V W I L 4. græciæ R 4 O 3 10. græciæ L 4 II O 4-6 9. græciæ O 11 at e post i mut. uid. graecis R 13 G B 12 M 1. graecis P R 2-10 G 2-4 D J O 17 8.*  
16. annos V G 14 K S M 12 D O 3 4 6 11.

**Polyclitus** the elder, born at Sicyon, flourished at Argos in the time of Pericles, and as he was a sculptor, not a painter, Man., Lamb. and others have held that *Polygnotus* should be read, a view approved by Bent., who compared Anthol. Epig. iii 14; and also iv 8, where Πολυκλείτου Θασίου is an error for Πολυγνώτου Θασίου. Muretus (in Mo.) noted 'aut Polygnotus legendum, aut Cicero memoria lapsus est.' The theory that Cic. had confused the two is held also by Sff. who compares v 16, 46 Anticlea for Euryclea. TS. follows Sff.

Dav. thinks that Polyclitus was a painter as well as a sculptor; he relies upon Aelian V.H. xiv 8 (where Or. considers the words ὁ ζωγράφος to be a gloss) and on Tzetzes, *Chil.* viii 320. The best view however is that of Neidius and FAW., accepted by Küh., Hei. and others, that Cic. takes an example from a closely connected art.

Polyclitus' most famous works were the *Δορυφόρος* (for which see Sandys on Or. 2, 5) and the chryselephantine statue of the Argive Hera.

**Parrhasius** of Ephesus flourished as a painter about 400 B.C.

**honos alit artes**: Dav. compares Sen. Ep. 102 'antiquus poeta ait: *Laus alit artes*'; Plat. Rep. viii, p. 551a ἀσκεῖται δὴ τὸ αἰὲ τιμώμενον, ἀμελεῖται δὲ τὸ ἀτίμαζόμενον.

**incenduntur**: *incendimur* was approved by Bent. as more elegant, and by FAW. Aug. Ciu. Dei v 13 in quoting this passage has 'omnesque *accenduntur*.' All three readings being good Latin the MSS must decide.

**iacent**=*negleguntur*, cf. 3, 5 'philosophia iacuit.'

**iacentque**: Küh. points out that *que* here, and often after negatives, seems to have an adversative force but really only introduces a continuation and enlarge-

ment of the clause to which it is attached (here *honos alit artes*). Cf. 29, 71 'adhibuitque,' where see note; Madv. § 433.

**igitur**: this word rarely stands first in its clause. Usually where it does so it introduces the conclusion of a syllogism as in 6, 11 where see Küh. Cf. Madv. on Fin. i 18, 61. Küh. *Gr.* ii § 174, p. 734. With its use here cf. Lael. 11, 39 'igitur ne suspicari quidem possumus' etc., where see Reid's n.

**et Epaminondas ... Themistoclesque**: wherever two clauses are connected by *et* and *que* there is an anacolouthon. The writer had intended to use a second *et* but forgot the first one or found, on reaching the second clause, that it was of less importance than the first. Cf. Küh. here: Madv. on Fin. v 22, 64; Reid on Ac. i 12, 43.

**fidibus praeclare** etc.: cf. Corn. Nepos, Epam. ii 1.

**aliquot ante annos**: so most editors. *annis* read by Bai. Sff. TS. may be right. If *annos* be wrong, *ante*, mistaken for a preposition, may account for the error. The abl. of measure is the usual constr. with *ante* and *post* and is common in Cic.: cf. 1, 3 n.; 13, 29 'multis post annis'; Madv. § 270; Roby §§ 1204 and 1207. *ante* is in any case adverbial. The acc., if sound, is due to the idea of going back (in thought) over a number of years. Ciceronian instances are very rare:—In p. Rosc. Am. 44, 128 quoted in Küh. *Gr.* ii § 81 p. 297, 'aliquot post menses et homo occisus est et bona uenisse dicuntur,' the fact that two events are mentioned which would occur at different points of time may perhaps account for the inaccuracy; Phil. v 19, 52 'ut L. Egnatuleio triennium ante legitimus tempus magistratus petere liceat.' In Or. ii 67, 273 'aliquot post annos' Wilkins reads the abl. In Cato M. 6, 16 'septem et decem annos post



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlararvm Dispytationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

—3. 5]

## LIBER PRIMVS

7

cum in epulis recusaret lyram, est habitus indoctior. ergo in Graecia musici floruerunt, discebantque id omnes, nec, qui nesciebat, satis excultus doctrina putabatur. 5. in summo  
 20 apud illos honore geometria fuit, itaque nihil mathematicis inlustrius; at nos metiendi ratiocinandique utilitate huius artis terminauimus modum.

III. At contra oratorem celeriter complexi sumus, nec eum primo eruditum, aptum tamen ad dicendum, post autem eruditum. nam Galbam, Africanum, Laelium doctos fuisse

17. recusaret R1210 V G124 B12 KPS W1 M2 II O1-4781112.  
 recusa<sup>f</sup>et V eod. atram. superscr. recusasset W2 M1 R6 G3 L46 J O56910.  
 recusasset L3 at in litura; fuerat fort. recusaset. <sup>ss</sup>recusaret B3. 19. nescieba t  
 V litt. n erasa. nesciebāt O7. || excultos V.

alterum consulatum,' Reid reads *annis*. See this subject discussed in Hand, *Turs.* 1 370 foll. [The principal support for *annos* lies in the construction of *abhinc* with *annos*, probably the only Ciceronian constr. with *abhinc*.]

**allquot**: as usual=a good number, 'many years earlier'; Themistocles flourished more than 100 years earlier than Epaminondas (Salamis 480 B.C., Leuctra 371 B.C.). Cf. ii 27, 66 n. *aliquanto*.

**cum recusaret...est habitus**: Küh., against Ern. and FAW. who thought the plup. required, holds that the imperf. is correct where the time referred to in the subord. (*cum*) clause is contemporaneous with that referred to in the main clause, comparing 35, 86; ii 25, 60; v 37, 108. But those passages do not seem parallel and we should certainly have expected the pluperfect here if some definite occasion is referred to. V has *recusaset* corrected *manu secunda* to *recusasset*. But Dr Reid in a note to me suggests that the imperf. *recusaret* may indicate that it was his *custom*. As this view gives a natural force to the word it is better to retain the received reading.

The reason for the *mood* is the same as in *cum essem* 1, 1 n.

**ergo**, 'hence,' i.e. owing to the high importance attached to music.

**floruerunt, discebant**: Küh. *Gr.* 11 § 33, 8 n. 2 p. 100 points out that the perf. does not differ from the imperf. as momentary from continuous, but that an event of very brief duration is expressed by the imperf. where the action is *represented in its progress*, while an event even of very long duration is expressed by the

historic perf. (Gk aor.) where the *mere fact of its occurrence* is put forward. He further observes that the perf. is consequently suitable for the expression of the *main fact*, the imperf. for the expression of *accompanying circumstances* of an explanatory or descriptive character. Cf. 30, 72 '*censebat*...disseruit.'

**discebantque**: *que* introduces details, cf. note on *iacentique*, above.

**id**: *musica* implied in *musici*, cf. ii 27, 66 n. *in eo persequendo*.

**§ 5. mathematicis**: e.g. Pythagoras and Plato.

**metiendi...modum**: 'but we have restricted this science to the practical purposes of mensuration and calculation.'

III. **oratorem**: metonymy, = *eloquentiam*; but the orator whom we encouraged is contrasted with the poet, painter, etc., whom we did not encourage. Moreover, Latin tends to bring the person into prominence.

**eruditum**: in the same sense as *doctos* below, trained in the theory of the art (by Greek teachers and on Greek models) as contrasted with *aptum ad dicendum*, possessing a natural aptitude for speaking. Similarly Roman poets, especially those who followed Alexandrine models, were called *docti*, cf. Hor. Sat. i 9, 7 'noris nos, docti sumus.' See 1, 3 n.

**Galbam**: Seruius Sulpicius Galba, consul 144 B.C. For his importance in the history of Roman oratory and for the technical resources of which he was the first Roman to make use cf. Brut. 31, 82; for the characteristics of Laelius and Africanus *ibid.* § 83.

For the cruelty and treachery of Galba

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvllii Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

## 8 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [3. 5]

traditum est, studiosum autem eum, qui his aetate anteibat, Catonem, post uero Lepidum, Carbonem, Gracchos, inde ita magnos nostram ad aetatem, ut non multum aut nihil omnino Graecis cederetur. philosophia iacuit usque ad hanc aetatem nec ullum habuit lumen litterarum Latinarum; quae inlustranda et excitanda nobis est, ut, si occupati profuimus aliquid ciuibus

III. § 5, 4. qui his R 12 G 13 B 13 K P W 2 J O 59 11. qui his G 2 B 2 O 8. qui iis R 6. qui eis O 34. qui eos G 4. qui hos W 1 M 2 D 11. hos V at o colore mutato. hos S at fortasse mutatum est. 5. carbonem V at alio atram. et solito maioribus litteris scriptum. catom S. catonem R 12 10 G B 12 K P W 12 O 1-79-11. om. O 12.

when praetor in Lusitania and his famous prosecution by Cato (touched upon in note on 2, 3) cf. Brut. 23, 89-90.

**Africanum**: P. Cornelius Scipio Africanus Minor, son of L. Aemilius Paulus, adopted by P. Corn. Scipio son of Scipio Africanus Maior in 150 B.C. Cf. Off. i 32, 116 'eloquentia cumulauit bellicam gloriam'; Quint. xii 10, 39 'in eloquendo uelut Atticum Romanorum.'

**studiosum**: cf. Cato M. i, 3 'attribuito Graecis litteris quarum constat eum perstudiosum fuisse in senectute' (see also Reid's Introd. p. 22); Ac. ii 2, 5. 'Studiosi dicuntur tirones artis qui adhuc discunt' Küh., who compares de opt. gen. dic. 5, 13 'putauit mihi suscipiendum laborem, utilem studiosis, mihi quidem ipsi non necessarium' studiosum, etc., and all clauses down to *cederetur* depend upon *traditum est*, the clause *inde ita magnos...* by a slight zeugma, where, as Küh. points out, we should rather have expected 'inde ita magni nostram ad aetatem existerent oratores, ut,' etc.

**eum...Catonem**: for the pronoun preceding with the subst. in explanatory apposition Küh. compares 13, 29 'qui nondum ea, quae...physica didicissent'; 24, 59 'quanta is, qui a Pyrrho legatus ad senatum est missus, Cineas.'

**qui his**: as between *his* and *eis* the testimony of the MSS is of little value; thus in 28, 70 the best MSS have *his* for *eis*; 30, 72 *his* twice for *eis*; 30, 73 *quo his* for *quod eis*; 31, 75 *ut hi* for *ut ei*; but here where *his* (sc. 'quos modo dixi' Mo.) gives a good sense there is no reason to reject it. See also Mayor on N.D. Introd. p. lx, ad med.

**anteire aliquem** is the usual constr. For the dat. cf. Off. ii 10, 37 'anteire ceteris uirtute'; Fin. v 31, 93 'nos...qui...praestantiam animi omnibus bonis corporis anteire dicamus.'

**M. Aemilius Lepidus Porcina**: a younger contemporary of Galba. Cic. in

Brut. 25, 96 says that he seems to have been the first to introduce Greek smoothness and the structure of the period.

**Carbonem**: most MSS *catonem*; Beroaldus' correction. Papirius Carbo when tribune 131 B.C. and for some years afterwards was a partisan of Ti. Gracchus, but subsequently he went over to the optimates and as consul in 120 B.C. defended L. Opimius when the latter was tried for his action against the partisans of C. Gracchus. This *leuitas* (cf. Brut. 27, 103) made him so unpopular that L. Licinius Crassus commenced his career in 119 B.C. by prosecuting Carbo, who committed suicide to avoid condemnation. For his oratory cf. Brutus 27, 104-6. For the Gracchi, see Or. i 9, 38; for Tiberius, Brut. 27, 103-4; for Gaius, Brut. 33, 125-6; Quint. i 10, 27 'C. Gracchi, praecipui suorum temporum oratoris.'

**inde ita magnos nostram ad aetatem**: especially L. Licinius Crassus, M. Antonius, P. Sulpicius Rufus, C. Aurelius Cotta, for whom see Wilkins' Introd. to Cic. de Oratore i.

**cederetur**: for the imperf. after *traditum est*, where we should use a present, cf. 4, 7 note on *dedimus...auderemus*.

**iacuit**: 2, 4 n.

**iacuit...lumen**: cf. p. Arch. 6, 14 'sed pleni sunt omnes libri, plenae sapientiae uoces, plena exemplorum uetustas: quae iacerent in tenebris omnia nisi litterarum lumen accederet.'

**lumen** is taken up by *inlustranda* and **iacuit** by *excitanda*, in chiasmic order, cf. 25, 62 n. 'inuenta...sonorum.'

**litterarum**: subjective genitive. Roby § 1278.

**excitanda**: cf. p. Sest. i 1 'qui...rem publicam adflicta excitant'; Or. ii 28, 124 'non dubitauit excitare reum consularem'; similarly Livy xxix 18 'ad aliquantum altitudinis excitata erant moenia,' and 'excitare turres' in Caes. B.G. iii 14, 4; v 40, 2; B.C. i 25 ad fin.



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlarvrm Dispytationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

## —3. 6]

## LIBER PRIMVS

9

10 nostris, prosimus etiam, si possumus, otiosi. 6. in quo eo magis nobis est elaborandum, quod multi iam esse libri Latini dicuntur scripti inconsiderate ab optimis illis quidem uiris, sed non satis eruditis. fieri autem potest, ut recte quis sentiat et id, quod sentit, polite eloqui non possit; sed mandare quemquam litteris  
 15 cogitationes suas, qui eas nec disponere nec inlustrare possit nec delectatione aliqua allicere lectorem, hominis est intemperanter abutentis et otio et litteris. itaque suos libros ipsi legunt cum suis, nec quisquam attingit praeter eos, qui eandem licentiam scribendi sibi permitti uolunt. quare si aliquid oratoriae laudis

10. possumus R 16 V B K P S W 2 M 2 G 3 O 1-5 7-10 12. possumus W 1

M 1 B 2 3 O 6 11. possumus G eod. atram. corr.

§ 6, 11. libri latini R V G B 1 2 K S W 1 2 M 1 2 O 1 3-10 12. latini omittit G 3. latini libri O 2 11. 19. laudis R 1 2 3 10 G 1-4 B 1-3 K P L 1 4-6 W 2 M 1 D C J O 1-8 10-12. laudi W 1 M 2 R 6 7 L 2 3 II O 9. laudi V at fuerat laudis.

**possumus**: Ern. with some MSS *possumus*, a reading which Mo. and Küh. incorrectly attribute to G, in which *possumus* is corrected with the same ink into *possumus*. Küh. compares ii 2, 6 'sed eos, si possumus, excitemus.'

§ 6. **ab optimis illis quidem uiris** sed: Cic. refers to the works of the Epicurean prose-writers Amfinius, Rabirius and Catus the Insubrian, for whom cf. iv 3, 6; Ac. i 3, 5; Fam. xv 16 and 19. For their style (*inconsiderate* here) cf. ii 3, 7; Fin. i 3, 8; iii 12, 40; and Reid, *Introd.* to *Academics* p. 21. Also Zeller, *Stoics, etc.* c. xvi § 2, pp. 396-8.

**optimis**: the expression *uir optimus* (*bonus uir*) often carries with it a suggestion of limited intellect (cf. 'worthy' sometimes with us). Cic. often applies this term to the Epicureans, whom he did not like. Küh. refers to ii 19, 44; iii 21, 50; Fin. i 7, 25; Or. iii 17, 64. Also *bonus uir* in comic writers, e.g. Ter. And. iii 5, 10; v 2, 5. For 'illis quidem...sed' cf. Fin. iv 16, 43 'hi autem ponunt illi quidem prima naturae sed ea seiungunt a finibus et summa bonorum,' and Madv. there. Also Madv. *Gr.* § 489 b. In this idiom where something is conceded and some opposed circumstance added (= μέν...δέ) *quidem* has a concessive force (= 'it is true'); and a pronoun is regularly inserted before the particle to support it. Cf. ii 6, 15 *malum illud quidem (equidem)*, however, is thus used, not *ego quidem*.

**et id**: we should say 'and yet cannot...'

but the Latins leave the antithesis to be detected by the reader or hearer, cf. Or. i 23, 86 'magister hic Samnitium summa iam senectute est et cotidie commentatur'; Iuu. i 74 'probitas laudatur et alget.' See also 29, 71 n.

**quemquam**: the idea at the bottom of this word seems to be that of universality, an idea which reduplication seems fitted to express. But as universal negations are more frequently made than universal affirmations the former are the rule with this word and the latter the exception. Here we have an instance of the exception; another occurs in 7, 13; cf. Cat. i 2, 6 'quamdiu quisquam erit, qui te defendere audeat, uiues.' The cognate words *usquam*, *umquam*, are similarly used, cf. Aen. vii 311 'quod si mea numina non sunt magna satis dubitem haud equidem inplorare quod usquam est'; Sen. ep. vii 1, 15 'hodie fieri potest, quidquid umquam potest.' See Madv. Exc. vi to de Finibus, p. 835, and *Gram.* § 494 a.

**intemperanter**, 'extravagantly,' 'unrestrainedly.' Küh. compares Ac. i 1, 2 'intemperantis enim esse arbitror scribere quod occultari uelit.'

**cum suis**: if *ipsi* are the members of the school *suis* must refer to persons similarly minded outside of the school, but *ipsi* may well refer to the writers, some of whom were still alive, and *suis* to the members of the school.

**oratoriae laudis**: Bent. thought that *attulimus* must have a dat. expressed, but Hand on Wopkens' *Lect. Tull.* p. 69

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49763-4 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Quivqve: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous MSS.

Thomas Wilson Dougan

Excerpt

[More information](#)

## 10 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [3. 6

no nostra attulimus industria, multo studiosius philosophiae fontes aperiemus, e quibus etiam illa manabant.

IV. 7. Sed ut Aristoteles, uir summo ingenio, scientia,

IV. § 7, 1. scientiae R 16 G W 1 M 2. scientia V at a colore mutato. scientię B K P R 29 10 G 4 L 134 O 34 12. omittit O 2. scientie S W 2 M 1 R 78 G 23 B 23 L 6 D II J O 15-11 ed. H.

compared for *adferre* used absolutely p. Mil. 28, 77 'non queo, uetera illa populi Romani gaudia quanta fuerint, iudicare; multas tamen iam summorum imperatorum clarissimas uictorias aetas nostra uidit, quarum nulla neque tam diuturnam attulit laetitiam nec tantam.' Mo. thinks (with Hand) that '*adfertur aliquid laudis* ubi nulla erat antea laus, *adfertur aliquid laudi* quando ea augeatur'; but Cicero may claim to have contributed to the nation some renown for oratory without implying that it had none until he did so. *oratorius* as an adj. occurs several times. Bent. (*not. inedit.*) compared Or. i 28, 130; Brut. 30, 116; similarly Ac. ii 1, 2 'laus imperatoria.'

**attulimus**: sc. *ciuibus nostris*, cf. § 5 'ut si...profuimus aliquid ciuibus nostris proximus etiam,' etc.

**illa**: sc. *quae in oratoria laude ciuibus attulimus*; the plur. because *aliquid*, something substantial, implies many successful speeches.

IV. § 7. **summo ingenio, scientia, copia**: most MSS *scientiae copia*; the correction was made by Lambinus, whom most edd. follow. Dav. and Bent. thought that *et* lurked in the *e* of *scientiae*, but *et* there would be very doubtful Latin (cf. Madv. § 434 obs. 1). Morgenstern (in Mo.) observes that Cic. would have written *doctrinae* or *eruditionis copia* not *scientiae copia*; that Cic. Or. i, 5 ascribes to Arist. 'admirabilem quandam scientiam et copiam'; and that the MS reading gives us an asyndeton for which there is no justification here. For asyndeton with only two terms see Madv. § 434 and Küh. here; for a fuller treatment Küh. Gr. II § 177 pp. 747 foll. Asyndeton with three terms is common. Or. well remarks 'tria omnino sunt: *ingenium* a natura Aristoteli datum: *scientia* ab ipso comparata, *copia* siue eloquentia.'

**scientia** refers to A.'s multifarious learning and **copia** to his *flumen orationis aureum*; cf. Ac. ii 38, 119. **summo** refers to all three nouns; Dav. compares Ter.

And. 844 'commodiorem hominem, aduentum, tempus'; Verr. ii, iv 58, 131 'summo ingenio hominem ac disciplina.' Küh. adds p. Mur. 17, 36 'L. Philippum summo ingenio, opera, gratia, nobilitate.'

**cum motus esset Isocratis rhetoris gloria**: Isocrates, born 436 B.C., committed suicide in 338 B.C. after the battle of Chaeronea. Aristotle, born 384 B.C., was a pupil of Plato for 20 years at Athens, which city he quitted in 348 B.C. He did not return until 335 B.C. when he founded the Peripatetic school. Therefore (as Hei. notes) any rivalry that subsisted between Arist. and Isocrates must belong to the period before 348 B.C. Cic. in Or. iii 35, 141 makes the same assertion which we have here: 'Aristoteles cum florere Isocraten nobilitate discipulorum uideret, quod suas disputationes a causis forensibus et ciuilibus ad inanem sermonis elegantiam transtulisset, mutauit repente totam formam prope disciplinae suae uersumque quendam Philoctetae paulo secus dixit: ille enim turpe sibi ait esse tacere, cum barbaros, hic autem, cum Isocraten pateretur dicere; itaque ornauit et inlustrauit doctrinam illam omnem, rerumque cognitionem cum orationis exercitatione coniunxit.'

For the verse referred to cf. Dind. *Poet. Scen. Graec.*, Eurip. Frag. 784 (Philoctetes). The same verse is quoted by Quint. iii 1. 14 in connection with Isocrates, but Diog. L. v 1, 3 quotes it thus: *Αλοχρὸν σιωπᾶν ἑεροκάρην δ' εἶν λέγειν*. Cope, Introd. to the Rhet. of Arist. pp. 39 foll., holds that a mutual jealousy is proved by the crowd of ancient witnesses who testify to it. But he refers this ill-feeling to A.'s early period, and the Rhetoric, in which he finds no trace of such feeling, to A.'s later period.

In any case the composition of the Rhetoric cannot have been due to rivalry with Isocr., as that work is an integral part of A.'s system; cf. Zeller, *Ph. d. Gr.* 11<sup>2</sup> pp. 180-1 and pp. 754 foll.