

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvttationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

M. TVLLI CICERONIS TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTTATIONVM LIBER TERTIVS

I. 1. Quidnam esse, Brute, causae putem, cur, cum constemus ex animo et corpore, corporis curandi tuendique causa quaesita sit ars atque eius utilitas deorum immortalium inuentioni consecrata, animi autem medicina nec tam desiderata sit, ante quam inuenta, nec tam culta, posteaquam cognita est, nec tam multis grata et probata, pluribus etiam suspecta et inuisa? an quod corporis grauitatem et dolorem animo iudicamus, animi morbum corpore non sentimus? ita fit ut animus de se ipse tum iudicet, cum id ipsum quo iudicatur aegrotet.

I. § 1, 3. ars eius atque R 1 6 7 17 V P 1-3 G B 1 3 K 2 S E 1-3 L 1-6 W 1 2 M 1 2 D C II J O 1-3 7 ed. H. ^{+ei} ar'eius atque K 1 (i.e. arei *in* ars et *mut. nigriore atr. et ei cod. atr. superscr.*) ars eius sit atque O 8. ars atque eius *corr.* Manutius. || immortalium R V P G S K. immortalium L. 4. inuentione L. || desiderata R (*sic*). desiderata^{ta} V (*manu ant. superscr.*) desiderata G desiderata B 1 K 1 2 L 1 W 1 2 D C II O 1-3. 9. quo iudicatur R 1 7 17 V P 1-3 B 1 3 K 1 2 S L 1 W 2 M 1 2 D C Gr. || quod R 6 E 2 W 1 II O 1 7. quidē J (i.e. quidem *in* quod idem *mut.*) || iudicatus G (*sed t expunx. et m superscr. alt. man.*) iudicat ed. H.

I. § 1. **quaesita**: the word implies that the want was *felt*, cf. *desiderata* below. Contrast *inuenta* below for which see i 47, 114 n.

atque eius utilitas, 'and deemed so useful that it has had the honour of being ascribed to immortal gods as its discoverers.' So Anon. in Olivet 'Ars medendi propter suam utilitatem diis assignata fuit tanquam inuentoribus.' For this opinion Dav. compares Pliny, H.N. xxix 1 (medicina) 'diis primum inuentiones suos adsignauit et caelo dicauit.'

deorum... inuentioni = *dis inuentoribus*, cf. Naegelsbach, *op. cit.* § 74, who quotes Or. ii 58, 237 'parcendum maxime est caritati hominum' = *hominibus caris*.

deorum: especially Apollo and Aesculapius.

consecrata = *cum huius artis consecratione tributa*, Naegelsbach, *Stil.* § 102. Cf. p. Sest. 68, 143 'hanc opinionem si in illo sanctissimo Hercule consecratam uidemus'; N.D. iii 24, 61

'quarum rerum utilitatem uideo, uideo etiam consecrata simulacra.'

animi... medicina: sc. *philosophia*.

tam... tam... tam...: sc. *quam corporis medicina*.

pluribus: sc. *quam grata est*.

an: ii 18, 42 n.

corporis grauitatem: an oppressed feeling is denoted. The expression is not found elsewhere in classical Latin. Dav. quotes it from Celsus i pref. *ad fin.*; i 10; ii 7, p. 65; and the similar use of βαρύτης, Porphyrius, de Abstn. i ch. 51; Plutarch, de Sanit. Tuenda ii p. 127 D; p. 128 B βαρύτητα καὶ πλησμονὴν σώματος [cf. also *grauedo*, καρηβαρία ad Att. x, 16, 6, Catullus xlv, 13]. Editors are wrong in referring to Fin. iv 12, 31. There Madv. rightly adopts Bentley's emendation *grauitate membrorum*. Lucr. iii 478 has 'grauitas membrorum.' *grauis* is a common epithet of *morbus*, cf. 'grauitatem morbi' N.D. iii 31, 76.

ita fit ut, 'whence it follows that...,' ii 6, 16 n. Dav. compares Plut. Animine

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

2 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [1. 2

- 10 2. quodsi talis nos natura genuisset, ut eam ipsam intueri et perspicere eademque optima duce cursum uitae conficere possemus, haud erat sane quod quisquam rationem ac doctrinam requireret. nunc paruulos nobis dedit igniculos, quos celeriter malis moribus opinionibusque deprauati sic restinguimus, ut nusquam naturae
15 lumen appareat. sunt enim ingeniis nostris semina innata uirtutum, quae si adolescere liceret, ipsa nos ad beatam uitam natura perduceret. nunc autem, simul atque editi in lucem et suscepti sumus, in omni continuo prauitate et in summa opinionum peruersitate uersamur, ut paene cum lacte nutricis errorem suxisse

§ 2, 10. talis R V P G B K E L W 2 D. tales S J alii. tales W 1 (e ex i mut. ut uid.) 11. optima R V G B K. 12. haud W 1 ^haut V (h manu ant. superscr.) ^haub (sic) K 1 (i.e. aut in haub man. rec. mut.) aut R G L. || rationem R 6 O 1 2 rōnē J. rationē V (fort. ead. man.) rationē S (linea super e leuiter impressa et a recent. glossatore ut uid. addita). ratione R 1 17 P 1-3 G B K 1 E 1 L 1 M 2 C II O 3. ratioē O 7. ratioē O 8. rōne R 7 B 3 E 2 W 2 D Gr. rōe K 2 W 1 M 1. rāoē J E 3 (at m alio atr. add.) || ac R 1 6 7 17 V P 1 3 B 1 3 K S E 2 L 1 W 2 M II J O 1 7 ed. H. hac G (h. expunx. et conf. man. ant.) ad O 2. et P 2 E 1 W 1 D O 3 Gr. aut O 8. || doctrinam R 6 O 1 2. doctrinā E 3 J. doctrina R 1 7 17 V P 1-3 G B 1 3 K S E L 1 W M D C II O 3 7 8 Gr. doctrinam ac rationem O 1. || requiret G (at re superscr.) 13. paruulos R V G K L. 14. deprauati B 1. deprauatis V. deprauati^f E 1 (eod. atr. superscr.) deprauatis R 1 6 7 10 P B 3 K 1 S E 2 L 1 2 5 6 W 2 M 1 II O 2 3 7 8. depratis G (at ua superscr.) ^adeprauatis K 2. deprauatos R 17 P 2 3 W 1 M 2 D C J O. ⁱdeprauatos E 3 (al. atr.) ⁱdepuat^r R 16. || restringimus II. || unusquam G (at t alt. man. superscr.) 15. appareat R V P G K S E L. || semita G. 16. adolescere G (h conf. alt. man.). 19. poene G. || nutricis G (s punctis not. alt. man.). || suxisse R 1 alio atr.

an corp. affect. s. p. p. 500 F τῶν μὲν γὰρ περὶ τὸ σῶμα νοσημάτων ἐρρωμένους ὁ λογισμὸς αἰσθάνεται, τοῖς δὲ τῆς ψυχῆς συννοσῶν αὐτὸς οὐκ ἔχει κρίσιν ἐν οἷς πάσχει, πάσχει γὰρ ᾧ κρίνει.

When the body is ill the mind, which studies it, is well, but when the mind is ailing, it, though ailing, has to study itself.

§ 2. ut eam ipsam: i.e. ut naturam ipsam. For eam see Küh. Gr. ii § 117 ann. 1 p. 437; Gild. and Lodge § 309 n. 1; Madv. 490 (c) obs. 3. The argument is from the point of view of the Stoics who made the chief good consist in living in harmony with nature, cf. v 28, 82 'Stoicorum...qui...finem bonorum esse senserint congruere naturae cumque ea conuenienter uiuere.'

erat: Madv. 348e.

rationem ac doctrinam, 'systematic instruction,' cf. i 1, 1 n.

nunc, 'but as it is.' This contrasted use of nunc is very common. So nunc autem (as below), nunc uero and in Gk. νῦν, νῦν δέ.

paruulos...igniculos, 'only tiny rays of light,' cf. ii 18, 42 n. on contortulis conclusiunculis.

deprauati: the nominative, proposed by Lamb., is supported by V² B¹ and by in...peruersitate uersamur below, which = deprauamur as Mo. notes, and it is intrinsically preferable to deprauatis.

lumen, 'a glimpse,' ii 24, 58 n.

semina innata uirtutum: cf. Fin. iv 7, 18 'his initiis et, ut ante dixi, seminibus a natura datis...omnis honestas perfecte absoluta est'; v 7, 18 'quorum similia sunt prima in animis, quasi uirtutum igniculi et semina'; 15, 43 'in pueris uirtutum quasi scintillas uidemus.'

editi: sc. a matre.

suscepti: cf. Att. xi 9, 3 'utinam susceptus non essem.' For the custom implied in this word see Ramsay, Rom. Ant. p. 475.

[Nutricis: Old Roman custom seemed to have expected that the mother should nurse her own child: Cato's wife did so (Plut. Cato 20); but the custom seems to

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

—2. 3]

LIBER TERTIVS

3

20 uideamur. cum uero parentibus redditi, dein magistris traditi sumus, tum ita uariis inbuimur erroribus, ut uanitati ueritas et opinioni confirmatae natura ipsa cedat.

II. 3. Accedunt etiam poëtae, qui cum magnam speciem doctrinae sapientiaeque prae se tulerunt, audiuntur, leguntur, ediscuntur et inhaerescunt penitus in mentibus; cum uero eodem quasi maximus quidam magister populus accessit atque omnis undique

20. redditi dein V. deinde R 6 B 3 O 8. dein M 1. demum B 1 S E 1 2. demū D C II. reddit idem G. redditedem R (eod. atr. superscr.) idem P al. atr. redditi idē W 2. redditi id est P 3 K 2 M 2 O 2. redditi id ē L 1 J. redditi iisdem O 3. redditi & W 1. redditi uel O 1. 21. inbuimur V G B S. inbuimur R P K E. inbuamur L. 22. opinio G at ni superscr.

alt. man. || confirmatae M 2. confirmata V al. atr. suppl. confirmata R 1 6 7 G B 1 K S E 1 L 1 5 M 1 D C II O 2 8. confirmate W 1. confirmate R 1 7 B 3 O 1 E 3 (at ē in ras. alio atr.) confirmare O 3. conformata O 7 om. W 2.

II. § 3, 2. tulerunt R V P 3 G B 1 3 K S E L M D C II O 1-3 7. tulerē P 1. tulunt W 2. tulerūt J. tulerint R 6 W 1 O 8 (i ex u ras. mut.) 3. inherescunt punitus G (pun. in pen. alt. man. corr.) || accedit eodem M 1 2. accedit eodem E 2 O 7 E 3 (habet alt. atr. suppl.) eodem accedit D C.

4. maxumus R V G. maximus P (u in i ras. mut.) maximus K (atr. nigr. superscr.) || accessit V al. man. superscr. accedit R 6 7 S II. accedit P 3 B 3 O 2 3 om. R 1 17 P 1 G B 1 K E L W M J O 1 7.

have died out at least among the rich and the well-to-do. Plutarch (de lib. educ. 5) has some good remarks on the question; his own daughter had a *πρωτῆ* (Consol. ad ux. 2 p. 608 D), but not his eldest son (ib. p. 609 E). See Marquardt, *das Privatleben d. Röm.* p. 56. Inscr. show the esteem and affection which often prevailed between nurses and their charges, v. Orelli-Henzen 6260, 6291, 6484.]

cum uero parentibus redditi: the parents are apt to set a bad example, Juv. xiv *passim*; Sen. de ira ii 21 9—10 ‘nutricum et paedagogorum...patrem...’: Leg. i 17, 47 ‘nam sensus nostros non parens, non nutrix, non magister, non poeta, non scaena deprauat, non multitudinis consensus abducit a uero. animis omnes tenduntur insidiae, uel ab eis, quos modo enumeravi, qui teneros et rudes cum acceperunt inficiunt et flectunt, ut uolunt; uel ab ea, quae penitus in omni sensu implicata insidet, imitatrix boni, uoluptas.’

magistris: e.g. *paedagogis*. These men were often ignorant and vicious. Cf. Tac. dial. 29; Pseudo-Plut. de educ. 7, Mayor on Juv. vii 218.

uanitatis, ‘falsehood.’ Cf. N.D. ii 21, 56 and Mayor’s n.; Nonius, p. 416.

opinionum confirmatae, ‘rooted prejudice.’ Cf. ii 26, 63 n. on *opinio*.

II. § 3. For this view of the influence of the poets cf. ii. 11, 27 and notes there.

et inhaerescunt, ‘and as a result take root...’ *inhaerescunt* is not a fourth member to the asyndetic series but gives the result of the series. Cf. v 5, 12.

cum uero eodem.....multitudo: Galen says (de Hipp. et Plat. Plac. v p. 459) that Posidonius censured Chrysippus for holding that men are born with a tendency to the good alone, *ᾧκειώσθαι πρὸς μόνον τὸ καλόν*, that Chrysippus had a difficulty in explaining why children go wrong and that he referred their doing so (p. 462) to two causes, *ἐτέραν μὲν ἐκ κατηχήσεως τῶν πολλῶν ἀνθρώπων ἐγγυνομένην, ἐτέραν δὲ ἐξ αὐτῆς τῶν πραγμάτων τῆς φύσεως*. The former of the two causes we have here in almost so many words ‘quasi maximus quidam magister populus atque omnis undique ad uitia consensiens multitudo.’

quidam: i 12, 27 n.

accessit: the verb, though absent from all the best MSS except V², cannot be omitted. The tense must be perfect and the mood indicative, cf. ii 11, 27 ‘ad malam domesticam disciplinam...cum accesserunt etiam poetae’ and ii 2, 5 n. on *occurrit*. For the sentiment cf. Seneca, Ep. 115, 11—12 ‘admiracionem nobis parentes auri...fecerunt...deinde totus

I—2

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

4 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [2. 3]

5 ad uitia consentiens multitudo, tum plane inficimur opinionum
 prauitate a naturaque desciscimus, ut nobis optime naturae uim
 uidisse uideantur, qui nihil melius homini, nihil magis expe-
 tendum, nihil praestantius honoribus, imperiis, populari gloria
 iudicauerunt. ad quam fertur optimus quisque ueramque illam
 10 honestatem expetens, quam una natura maxime anquirat, in

6. optime R V P G K L. optimam W 1. || naturam R 1 6 17 V P G B 1
 K 1 E 2 L 1 4-6 M D C II O 1 3 8 Gr. naturā B 3 S J. natām K 2.
 nām E 3 W O 2 7. nā R 7 E 1 om. charta pertusa. 7. inuidisse R 1 6 7 17
 V P G B 1 3 K S E 2 3 L 1 5 6 W M D C II J O 2 3. i uidisse L 2
 ididisse
 O 7. inuiuisse O 1. in iudice O 8 (al. atr. suppl.) E 1 om. charta pertusa.
 naturae uim uidisse corr. *Maduigi*us. 9. optumus R V K. obtumus G.
 optimus L. 10. una R 1 6 7 17 V P G B K S E L 1 3-6 W 1 M II J O 1 2 7 8 Gr.
 unam C. unā D. nām W 2 om. L 2. || maxime R V G L. || inquirat J.
 R 1 6 7 17 V P G B K S E L 1-6 W M D C II O 1-3 7 8. inquirat J.
 anquirat corr. Moser.

populus...in hoc conuenit...accedunt
 deinde *carmina poetarum*.'

opinionum prauitate: stronger than
opinionibus prauis. The corruption ex-
 tends to *all* our opinions.

optime naturae uim uidisse, 'to have
 best perceived the true meaning of nature.'
 This emendation of Madv. in his n. on
 'uis naturae perspicui potest' Fin. iii 19,
 62 has driven out Bentley's *optimam*
magistram inuidisse which was accepted
 by Dav. Mo. and others. The conjecture
 of Keil *optime naturam ii uidisse* is clever
 but *uidisse naturam* is not quite the
 expression required.

honoribus, imperiis, 'civil and military
 preeminence.' So long as office and com-
 mand were bestowed by vote of the people
popularis gloria conduced to and resulted
 from the attainment of both. *populari*
gloria therefore sums up the effect of
honoribus imperiis and *ad quam* refers
 only to it, not, as Küh. holds, to the
 other two words as well.

ad quam fertur: Trans. 'at this the
 best men among us aim and, though they
 desire the truly honourable, the search
 for which preeminently belongs to nature,
 they are occupied with the veriest un-
 realities and pursue no well-defined form
 of virtue but merely a shadowy semblance
 of glory.'

optimus quisque: from the social, not
 from the moral, point of view.

ueramque...expetens: by reason of
 the *paruulos igniculos*, the *ingeniis nos-
 tris semina innata uirtutum* of § 2.
 Cf. Seneca, Ep. 121, 14; Fin. iii 7, 23
 and Madvig's n. They miss their aim,
 being *deprauati* by the *populus*.

It is well-known that the Stoics taught
 that every living thing tends to preserve
 its own nature; that nothing can be in
 harmony with the nature of any individual
 unless it be in harmony with the course
 of the universe (cf. Diog. L. vii 88 ἀκο-
 λούθως τῇ φύσει ζῆν); that a rational life
 in agreement with the general course of
 the world is the highest good, or virtue;
 that virtue alone is good. See Zeller,
Stoics, etc. c. x pp. 214-6.

quam una natura maxime anquirat :
 Küh. thinks *natura* here = *ii homines qui*,
naturam secuti, recta uel absoluta ratione
instructi sunt. But that meaning would
 be very obscurely expressed and *natura*
 here is certainly the same as *natura* in
 §§ 2 and 3. *natura* is animate, since 'the
 terms Soul of the world, Reason of the
 world, Nature, Universal Law, Provi-
 dence, Destiny—all mean the same thing'
 Zeller, *Stoics*, etc., c. vi p. 145. 'Nature
 seeks out the honourable' I take to mean
 (in more prosaic form) that the honourable
 is essential to harmony with nature or
 conformity to universal law.

una intensifies *maxime*, cf. Fin. ii 13,
 42 'uoluptas quam unam uirtus minimi
 facit.' Trans. 'which nature preeminently
 seeks out.'

unam is read by Man. Lamb. and most
 modern editors except Mo. Kl. and Küh.
 The meaning with *unam* would be 'which
 is preeminently the thing that nature
 seeks out.' The objection of Küh. that
 this is the *only* thing that *natura* seeks
 out seems insuperable though he does not
 take *natura* in the same sense as I do.
 Virtue or the *honestum* is the only good;
natura demands this alone, not this pre-

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlararvm Dispvttationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

—2.4]

LIBER TERTIVS

5

summa inanitate uersatur consecraturque nullam eminentem effigiem uirtutis, sed adumbratam imaginem gloriae. est enim gloria solida quaedam res et expressa, non adumbrata; ea est consentiens laus bonorum, incorrupta uox bene iudicantium de
 15 excellenti uirtute, ea uirtuti resonat tamquam imago. quae quia recte factorum plerumque comes est, non est bonis uiris repudianda. 4. illa autem, quae se eius imitatricem esse uult, temeraria atque inconsiderata et plerumque peccatorum uitiorumque laudatrix, fama popularis, simulatione honestatis formam eius
 20 pulchritudinemque corrumpit. qua caecitate homines, cum quaedam etiam praeclara cuperent eaque nescirent nec ubi nec

12. uirtutis *om.* O 1. 14. bonorum & incorrupta V *al. atr. superscr.* 15. excellenti DC O 1 excellenti V (i.e. e *in i mut.*) eccellente R P G B K S E L W M II J O 2 3 7 8. excelente B 3. || gloriae *post imago habent* R 1 6 7 17 V G B K S E W M D C II J O 1 7 8. *non habent* P B 3 M 2 O 2 3. 16. rectae G. || repudianda R G B S L W D *alii.* repudianda K *at a ex e eod. atr. mut.* repudianda V *eod. atr. superscr.* E *alio atr. superscr.* repudianda K 2.

§ 4, 17. uult V G K. uult R *eod. atr.* uult R 10 16 L. 19. forme G *at e puncto not. et à alt. man. superscr.*

eminently. *una* of the MSS seems to give a good sense as taken above. *natura* or universal law is not alone in demanding this; men who are in harmony with nature also seek it out.

anquirit: *inquiri* of the MSS, 'inquires into,' gives an unsuitable meaning. For *anquiro* see ii 10, 25 n.; iv 21, 47; v 4, 10. In all three places inferior MSS have the more familiar *inquirere* as a variant.

eminentem effigiem: in these words and in *solida* and *expressa* below we have metaphors from sculpture; in *adumbratam* a metaphor primarily from painting. *eminentem*, 'filled out,' 'substantial,' nearly = *expressam*, 'clearly defined,' for which see Reid on p. Arch. 12, 30; Wilkins on Hor. A.P. 32. The latter word is used of clear bringing out of details. *adumbratam* (= *εἰκονογραφημένην*) is used of a mere sketch in outline, cf. N.D. i 27, 75 'species quaedam deorum, quae nihil concreti habeat, nihil solidi, nihil expressi, nihil eminentis...cedo mihi istorum adumbratorum deorum liniamenta atque formas'; p. Caelio 5, 12; Fin. v 22, 61-2; Off. iii 17, 69; p. Planc. 12, 29 and Holden's n.

effigiem uirtutis: some have omitted *uirtutis* but the word is required to correspond to *ueram honestatem* above, to which *gloriae* could not correspond since *gloria*, even when it is *solida*, is not *uera honestas* but only the concomitant of the latter.

est: emphatic by its position, cf. 3, 6 'est profecto animi medicina.'

solida: the opposite of *inanis*.

bene = *recte*.

excellenti: it seems better, with most editors, to follow V² against the majority of the MSS and give the usual ablative form of the participle used as an adjective. Dav. Küh. Mo. Schiche read *excellente*.

tamquam imago: sc. *uocis*. 'This responds to virtue as its echo.' Cf. Virg. Geo. iv 50; Hor. Odes i 12, 4; i 20, 8.

Varro, R.R. iii 16 12 (of bees) 'primum secundum uillam, potissimum ubi non resonent imagines.' Val. Flacc. Argon. iii 597; Statius Silu. i 3, 18. Gronovius proposed to read and punctuate thus—*imago; gloriaque, quia recte factorum...* but Dav. rightly rejects this as a patch devoid of Ciceronian colour. *gloriae*, of most MSS, came in by dittography from *gloriae* above or else as a marginal gloss.

comes: cf. i 45, 109 'gloria...uirtutem tamquam umbra sequitur.'

§ 4. **corrumpit**, 'caricatures.' Hei.

qua caecitate, 'by the blinding influence of which' = *cuius rei caecitate*. Hei. after Schlenger quite unnecessarily reads *qua caecati*.

cum: concessive.

etiam: with *praeclara*.

eaque: for *que* see i 29, 71 n. Translate 'though they aimed at objects which were even noble, yet, understanding neither

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlnarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

6 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [2. 4

qualia essent, funditus alii euerterunt suas ciuitates, alii ipsi occiderunt. atque hi quidem optima petentes non tam uoluntate quam cursu errore falluntur. quid? qui pecuniae cupiditate, 25 qui uoluptatum libidine feruntur, quorumque ita perturbantur animi, ut non multum absint ab insania, [quod insipientibus contingit omnibus], his nullane est adhibenda curatio? utrum quod minus noceant animi aegrotationes quam corporis, an quod corpora curari possint, animorum medicina nulla sit?

III. 5. At et morbi perniciosiores pluresque sunt animi quam corporis; hoc enim ipso odiosi sunt, quod ad animum

22. euerterunt B E W M D C II J O 3 7 8. euerterent R V P K. euerterent G L. euertunt O 1. 23. adque G at d in t mut. alt. man. || hi R V P G B 3 K W M J O 1 2 7 hii K 2 D C II O 8 ii S at littera ante ii erasa. ii M 2 O 3. i E in fi al. atr. mut. hęc L 1. alii ed. H. || optuma R B K. 24. quid qui R 10 16 P E. quidque R al. atr. superscr. quidq; V. quidq; G L. 27. contingit R V B K S E L W M D C II O 2 3 7 8. contigit P J O 1 G at n alt. man. superscr. 28. an...corporis O 7. hii S C D O 8. iis S. || nulla G at ne superscr. alt. man. 28. an...corporis om. G in marg. infer. add. alt. man.

III. § 5, 2. hi enim ipsi R 1 6 7 V G B K 1 S E 1 L 6 W M J O 1 2 7 hii K 2 E 3 L 3-5 D C II O 8 L 2 (om. ipsi). ii M 2 E 2 O 3 (om. ipsi). ei P 3. hi enim odiosi P 1 L 1. hoc enim ipso corr. Bakius.

where these were to be found nor what they really were....'

alii...alii: Cicero is thinking of Caesar and Pompey, as Hei. notes.

atque...quidem, 'moreover,' 'and indeed.' Cicero passes from the case of ambition to the still stronger cases of avarice, etc. The formula *atque...quidem*...is suited to such transitions. See Küh. here and Hand *Tursell*. I p. 492 foll. A personal or, as here, a demonstrative pronoun often follows to mark the correspondence of clauses. *hi* is alone right; the logical pronoun *ei* would not suit for this purpose. 'And while such men with the best of aims go wrong,... though not wilfully it is true but through a mistake with regard to the course, what of those who are carried away by avarice...?'

cursus: gen. of indirect object. See Naegelsbach, *Stil*. § 120.

uoluptatum libidine: cf. Sen. 12, 39 uoluptatis auidae libidines'; 40 'libido uoluptatis.'

quod insipientibus contingit omnibus: this Stoic commonplace comes in most ineptly here and is rightly bracketed by Bake, whom Bai. and Hei. follow. Ml. and others retain the words. T.S. would make the inaccuracy Cicero's own and Küh. thinks that in these hastily written

books we must not be too critical. But though Cicero is often betrayed by haste into inaccuracies of construction it is hardly likely that so great an orator would thus destroy his climax. The clause seems evidently a mere gloss upon the word *insania*.

III. § 5. at et: the clause *at et morbi perniciosiores pluresque sunt animi quam corporis* answers the question *utrum quod minus noceant animi aegrotationes quam corporis*. We ought therefore to have a second *et*-clause to answer the second part of the preceding double question *an...animorum medicina nulla est*, such clause running somewhat as follows—*et animi medicina certe est*, but the intervention of the explanation why the diseases of the mind are more harmful than those of the body *hoc enim ipso...graviore* has caused the construction to be broken off and the *an*-clause is answered in a new sentence *qui uero probari potest...leaving et pendens*.

hoc enim ipso: the correction of Bake for *hi enim ipsi* of the MSS is accepted by most editors except Sff. The argument is 'diseases of the mind are more harmful (and more numerous) than those of the body. They are troublesome from the very fact that it is the mind which they affect and disturb; and the ailing mind

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlararvm Dispvlationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

—3. 6]

LIBER TERTIVS

7

pertinent eumque sollicitant, 'animusque aeger,' ut ait Ennius, 'semper errat neque pati neque perpeti potest, cupere numquam desinit.' quibus duobus morbis, ut omittam alios, aegritudine et cupiditate, qui tandem possunt in corpore esse grauiore? qui uero probari potest ut sibi mederi animus non possit, cum ipsam medicinam corporis animus inuenerit, cumque ad corporum sanationem multum ipsa corpora et natura ualeat nec omnes, qui curari se passi sint, continuo etiam conualescant, animi autem, qui se sanari uoluerint praeceptisque sapientium paruerint, sine ulla dubitatione sanentur? 6. est profecto animi medicina, philosophia; cuius auxilium non ut in corporis morbis petendum est foris, omnibusque opibus uiribus ut nosmet ipsi

3. sollicitant B K L W 2. ¹ sollicitant R V G (alt. man.) sollicitat W. sollicitent S unius litt. spatio post l rel. 4 erra t V litt. eras. || pati R 1 6 7 17 V P 1-4 G B K S E L W M D C J O 1-3 7 8. parci E 2 II. || neque perpeti om. O 7. 5. obmittam G at b conf. alt. man. 9. ualeat R 1 6 7 V G B K S E L W 2 M J O 1-3 7 8. ualeat P al. atr. ualeant W D C II. ualeat E 2. 10. omnes V i n e ut uid. mut. omnis R G. omis E L W 2. omis S W. || passi sunt R 1 6 7 10 17 V P 3 G B K S E L W M D C II J O 1-3 7 8. st P R 16. f K 2. passi sint corr. Tragder. || conualescant G u exp. et a superscr. alt. man. 11. qui se R 1 6 V P G B K S E L W M II J O 1-3 7 8. se om. D C.

§ 6, 14. opibus uiribus R P G B L W 2 C O 3. opibus & uiribus V al. man. opibus et uiribus W J O 8. opibus iuribusque R 6 7 B 3 M D O 2. opibus iuribusq; E al. atr. suppl. operibus et uiribus O 1. uiribus om. E 2 II O 7 Gr.

is ever wrong, a prey to annoyance and desire, two evils than which, not to mention any others, no ills of body can be more grievous.' Cicero does not offer any proof here that *morbi animi* are *plures* for *plures* was only rhetorically tacked on to *pernicioses*, the latter being the only word necessary to take up the words *quod minus noceant*. Cicero's reason for considering them to be *plures* is seen from v 1, 3.

Sff. reading *hi enim ipsi* thinks that these words refer to *morbi corporis* and that the argument is 'even these affect the mind and are on that account *odiosi*. Hence we infer that the diseases of the mind are *plures*, while the *animus aeger* shows that they are also *pernicioses*.'

Ennius: *Fragm. Scen.* 392 (ed. Vahlen): the play from which the words are quoted is unknown. [Ribbeck, *Scaen. Rom. Poes. Frag.* i² 68, regards the lines as troch. tetrameters: for *pati* he reads *poti* (from *potior*) and *potis est* for *potest*, supposing some word or words to have been lost between *potis est* and *cupere*.]

pati: in *pati...perpeti* we have a gradation 'endure...hold out.' The allitera-

tive repetition is characteristic of old Latin. [See Vahlen's n. *Enn. Poesis Rell.* p. 194.] Sff. and Küh. follow Ribbeck in altering to *poti=potiri*, comparing 18, 41 *ut natura eis potiens dolore caret*.

qui...probari potest: *probari*, when negated (*qui probari potest? = non probari potest*), lends itself to the construction of result since the proposition is only a mental conception: 'how can a view be established which would make it out that the mind...' Küh. In Fin. ii 33, 108 we may have the same construction but Madv. and Ml. there read *qui id probari potest*. Küh. compares *non uerisimile est* with *ut* and subj. and *uerisimile est* with acc. and inf. See Madv. on Fin. ii 3, 6 'hoc uero optimum, ut is...' and *Gram.* § 374 obs. 2.

corpora et natura: the two words are looked upon as forming a single whole, *natura* being the more important, 'the constitution of the body'; the predicate *ualeat* can therefore be in the singular. Küh. *Gram.* II p. 32.

§ 6. **omnibusque:** for *que* see i 29, 71 n. **opibus uiribus,** 'resources and forces,' 'might and main.' This reads like a

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlararvm Dispvttationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

8 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTTATIONVM [3. 6

15 nobis mederi possumus elaborandum est. quamquam de uniursa
 philosophia, quanto opere et expetenda esset et colenda, satis,
 ut arbitror, dictum est in Hortensio. de maximis autem rebus
 nihil fere intermisimus postea nec disputare nec scribere. his
 autem libris exposita sunt ea, quae a nobis cum familiaribus
 20 nostris in Tusculano erant disputata. sed quoniam duobus
 superioribus de morte et de dolore dictum est, tertius dies
 disputationis hoc tertium uolumen efficiet. 7. ut enim in Acade-
 miam nostram descendimus inclinato iam in posmeridianum
 tempus die, poposci eorum aliquem, qui aderant, causam dis-
 25 serendi. tum res acta sic est:

IV. A. Videtur mihi cadere in sapientem aegritudo.

M. Num reliquae quoque perturbationes animi, formidines,

16. quanto opere R V P G B K S E L D O 3 Gr. 17. maxumis R V G B.
 maxūmis P. maximis K *atr. nigr.* maximis L. 19. eaq G.

§ 7, 22. incademiam G *alt. man. superscr.* 23. postmeridianum R 1 6 7 17 V
 P 1-4 G B K S E L W M D C II J O 1-3 7 8. 24. aliquid G *in aliquē alt.*
man. corr. || quid adherant G *sed d et h conf. alt. man.*

IV. *Litteras A et M ignorant* R 1 2 10 16 V B 1 K 1 O 7. *habent* R 6 7
 G B 3 W 1 O 3. *B et M habet* R 17. *D et T habet* II. *D et M habet* D.
Di et M habet O 1. *B et T habet* O 8. *Atti et Mar. habet* O 2.

proverbial expression, cf. *equis uiris; uentis remis*. The asyndeton might also be justified by the close connexion between the two ideas, cf. i 14, 31 n. It is retained by Küh. Hei. T.S. Ml. Writers are not limited to the proverbial form; thus in iii 11, 25 we have 'omnibus uiribus atque opibus repugnandum est.' For this Klotz compares Ter. Heaut. 904 'dictum factum' with Ter. And. 381 'dictum ac factum.' Dav. reads *et* before *uiribus*; Bent. Wes. Bai. (in Tauchnitz text) *atque*; Schiche *ac*; Tregder and Baiter-Orelli bracket *uiribus*.

de uniursa philosophia: ii 1, 4 n. on 'uniuersam.'

esset: for the preference of the secondary sequence after a perfect see i 1, 1 n.

in Hortensio: see ii 2, 4 n.

scribere: after the Hortensius Cic. wrote the *Academica* and the *de Finibus*. See *Introd.* to Vol. I p. xv.

§ 7. in *Academiam*: ii 3, 9 n.

posmeridianum is read by T.S. This and not *pomeridianum*, which Orelli reads in his Oxford edition, is the form which Cic. in Or. 47, 157 professes to prefer. Most editors retain the reading of the mss.

causam disserendi: 'a subject for discussion.' For *causa* in this sense cf. Or. ii 36, 153 'istorum omnium sum-

matim causas et genera...gustauit.' The subject of discussion here is a general question (*θέσις, quaestio infinita*); the term *causa* is more usually applied to a particular question (*ὑπόθεσις, quaestio finita*); cf. *Topica* 21, 79; de Inu. i 6, 8.

IV. *reliquae*: The Stoics divided irrational emotions (*perturbationes, πάθη*) into four classes viz. λύπη, φόβος, ἐπιθυμία, ἡδονή or *aegritudo, metus, libido, laetitia gestiens*, cf. iv 4, 8; Fin. iii 10, 35; Zeller, *Stoics, etc.* p. 233. Each of these main divisions has several subordinate varieties and *iracundia (ira)* is a subdivision of *libido*, see iv 7, 16. Thus instead of enumerating the remaining three Cicero only mentions two and a subordinate species of one of the two. Hence emendations have been attempted, e.g. Fr. Fabricius proposed *iucunditates*. But an accurate enumeration is not necessary to Cicero's purpose in this book, where he deals only with *aegritudo*, as it is in book iv, where he deals with the remaining three emotions. Cf. *haec* and *fere* below and the plurals *formidines*, etc. 'fits of terror,' etc. Cicero is more rhetorical and less precise here. Similarly in iii 5, 11 he first co-ordinates *libido* and *iracundia* and then admits that *iracundia libidinis pars est*. Dav. cites other in-

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlararvm Dispvlationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

—4. 8]

LIBER TERTIVS

9

libidines, iracundiae? haec enim fere sunt eius modi quae Graeci *πάθη* appellant; ego poteram morbos, et id uerbum
 5 esset e uerbo, sed in consuetudinem nostram non caderet. nam misereri, inuidere, gestire, laetari, haec omnia morbos Graeci appellant, motus animi rationi non obtemperantis, nos autem hos eosdem motus concitati animi recte, ut opinor, perturbationes dixerimus, morbos autem non satis usitate, nisi quid
 10 aliud tibi uidetur.

8. A. Mihi uero isto modo.

M. Haecine igitur cadere in sapientem putas?

A. Prorsus existimo.

M. Ne ista gloriosa sapientia non magno aestimanda est,
 15 siquidem non multum differt ab insania.

A. Quid? tibi omnisne animi commotio uidetur insania?

M. Non mihi quidem soli, sed, id quod admirari saepe soleo, maioribus quoque nostris hoc ita uisum intellego multis saeculis

3. libidines R V G K S E L. || ^{l'hu} eiusmodi V *al. man. superscr.* 4. *πάθη* W. pathe G *alii.* 7. obtemperantis V P G K L W 2 M 2 J O. optemperantis B 1. obtemperantis R *cod. atr. suppl.* obtemperantes P 2 B 3 S E 2 W M D C II O 2 3 7 8. optemperantes E.

§ 8. 12. haecine G K. hecine V. haecine R *alio atr. suppl.* hec E *alio atr. suppl.* h'cine O 7. haecine M 2 hecine W (*t an c incert.*) heccine B 3 S E 2 L W 2 M D C II J O 1-3. hecing B. hecne O 8. 14. ne R V P G B K S E L W 2 M D C II J O 1-3 8. nae W. nec O 7. || magno R V P G B K S E L W D C II O 2 3 7 8. magna O. 17. admirari K L W. ^d amirari R *cod. atr.* amirari V O 7. ammirari G. 18. intellego R V G K. intelligo R 10 16 S E L.

stances—Off. i 20, 69 'uacandum autem omni est animi perturbatione, cum cupiditate et metu, tum etiam aegritudine et uoluptate nimia et iracundia'; i 29, 102 'licet ora ipsa cernere iratorum aut eorum qui aut libidine aliqua aut metu commoti sunt aut uoluptate nimia gestiunt.'

haec: for the comprehensive use of the neuter cf. ii 26, 62 n.

ego poteram morbos: cf. Fin. iii 10, 35 'perturbationes animorum...quas Graeci *πάθη* appellant, poteram ego uerbum ipsum interpretans morbos appellare, sed non conueniret ad omnia.'

poteram: Madv. 348 (e) obs. 1.

morbos: here as elsewhere Cic. is incorrect in his moralising upon the shortcomings of the Greek language. *morbos* translates *vōros* not *πάθος*. Cf. his identification of *πρόος* with *labor* in ii 15, 35.

uerbum...e uerbo: sc. *exprimere* or

expressum. For similar phrases see Reid on Ac. ii 6, 17.

in consuetudinem nostram = *in cons. nostri sermonis*.

obtemperantis: accusative.

dixerimus: perf. subj. Küh. *Gram.* II p. 133, cf. iv 6, 12 n. on 'appellemus.'

§ 8. **ne**: i 30, 74 n.

magno: this abl. is found with *aestimare* in Cic. as well as *magni*. For *magno* cf. Verr. iv 7, 13; Fin. iii 3, 11; v 30, 90; and perhaps Parad. vi 3, 51; also *nihilo* Fin. iv 23, 62. For *magni* cf. T.D. v 7, 20; Fin. iii 13, 43; p. Cluent. 58, 159 'maximi aestimare conscientiam mentis suae' but MSS *maxime*; p. Mur. 37, 79 'magni interest...esse Kal. Ian. in r. p. duo consulēs.'

a quo...manauit: cf. Reid on Ac. i 4, 15—16 and reff. cited there; Zeller, *Socrates* p. 39 E.T.² 'The pre-Socratic philosophy was simply and solely a

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-49762-7 - M. Tvlli Ciceronis Tvscvlanarvm Dispvtationvm Libri Qvinque: A Revised Text with Introduction and Commentary and a Collation of Numerous Mss.: Volume II: Containing Books III-V

Thomas Wilson Dougan and Robert Mitchell Henry

Excerpt

[More information](#)

10 TVSCVLANARVM DISPVTATIONVM [4. 8

ante Socraten, a quo haec omnis, quae est de uita et de moribus,
20 philosophia manauit.

A. Quonam tandem modo?

M. Quia nomen insaniae significat mentis aegrotationem et morbum [, id est insanitatem et aegrotum animum, quam appellarunt insaniam. 9. omnis autem perturbationes animi

19. socraten R P K S. socratem V P 2 3 B 1 K 2 E 2 L M C O 1-3. socratē B 3 W D II O 7 8. socraten^m E 1. socrantem G *sed n expunx. et conf. alt. man.* || et de moribus R V P G B K S E L M II J O 2 7 8. de omi. W D C O 1 3. moribus omi. W 2. 23. et aegrotum animum R V P G B K S E L W 2 D C II O 1-3 7 8 Gr. et egrotum animum M. et aegritudinem ai W. 24. appellarunt G K. appellauerunt W.

§ 9. omnis V. omnis R *eod. atr.* omis K E L W 2. omnes G. omis S.

philosophy of nature; the transitional philosophy of the Sophists was the first to leave nature for ethical and dialectical questions. After Socrates the dialectical tendency is supreme. His own attention was exclusively occupied with determining conceptions, and enquiries respecting virtue.'

For the triple division of philosophy cf. Ac. i 5, 19 'fuit ergo...philosophandi ratio triplex: una de uita et moribus, altera de natura et rebus occultis, tertia de disserendo et quid uerum sit, quid falsum, quid rectum in oratione prauumue, quid consentiens, quid repugnans iudicando,' and Reid's n.

de uita et de moribus = περὶ τῶν ἠθικῶν.

For the double translation of a Greek term see ii 21, 47 n. on *emeruatum quodam modo et languidum*. The repetition of the preposition is strange, and unusual in such translations. It is probably intrusive.

mentis: the ruling portion of the *animus*, cf. § 11 'mentis cui regnum totius animi a natura tributum est' and N.D. ii 11, 29 quoted on i 10, 20 n.

id est insanitatem...insaniunt: this passage is open to much suspicion. The *id est* clause introduces an unnecessary explanation and an absurd repetition. The rest of the passage gives us the views of philosophers in a hackneyed Stoic syllogism to show that all non-philosophers are mad, though the point to be proved is not this but that the early Romans held mental disturbance to be identical with madness, and a view is thus attributed to philosophers which is limited to Stoic philosophers. Then with a change from present to past time and a meaningless *enim* we have the sentence *sanitatem...non posset* tacked on, with *philosophi*

instead of the required *maiores nostri* as its only possible subject, a construction which would leave us quite without explanation of the views of the early Romans.

Sff. emends and reads *id est insanitatem ex aegroto animo...nostri sanitatem animorum*...comparing for *ex*) (et the variants (inter alia) on i 39, 93 and accounting for the loss of *nostri* by the abbreviation *nr* and for the intrusion of *enim* by assuming dittography from the preceding *em*. But the *id est* clause would still be unsatisfactory and the comparison which he finds between the view of the Stoics and that of the early Romans to shew that both arrived at the same conclusion would not be clearly expressed.

Bentley, followed by Dav. and others, declared the clause *id est...insaniam* to be spurious. Bake bracketed the whole passage *id est...insaniunt*, and the theory of a double gloss has found many adherents, among them Wes. Bai. Hei. T.S. Ml. Schiche.

Nissen Or. and Mo. retained the whole passage. Or. notes 'haec etymologica sunt, addita in eum finem ut, cur iam Romani antiqui diu ante Socratem rectum nomen illi animi commotioni indidissent, manifestius appareret.'

It seems best to suppose that the unconvincing nature of Cicero's argument has led to the fabrication of glosses to eke out his meaning, these glosses being compiled from §§ 9 and 10.

Hei. notes that the Stoic tendency to support argument by appeal to the popular consciousness often leads to strained interpretations. Of course Cic. did not find in his Greek sources a ref. to the views of the early Romans but he may have adapted an argument drawn from the views of the early Greeks.