

Generations of Feeling

Generations of Feeling is the first book to provide a comprehensive history of emotions in pre- and early-modern Western Europe. Charting the varieties, transformations, and constants of human sentiments over the course of eleven centuries, Barbara H. Rosenwein explores the feelings expressed in a wide range of "emotional communities," as well as the theories that served to inform and reflect their times. Focusing particularly on groups within England and France, chapters address communities as diverse as the monastery of Rievaulx in twelfth-century England and the ducal court of fifteenth-century Burgundy, assessing the ways in which emotional norms and modes of expression respond to, and in turn create, their social, religious, ideological, and cultural environments. Contemplating emotions experienced "on the ground" as well as those theorized in the treatises of Alcuin, Thomas Aquinas, Jean Gerson, and Thomas Hobbes, this insightful study offers a profound new narrative of emotional life in the West.

Barbara H. Rosenwein is Professor Emerita, Department of History, Loyola University Chicago.



Generations of Feeling

A History of Emotions, 600–1700

Barbara H. Rosenwein

Loyola University Chicago





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107480841

© Barbara H. Rosenwein 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Rosenwein, Barbara H., author.

Generations of feeling : a history of emotions, 600–1700 / Barbara H. Rosenwein. pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-09704-9

Emotions – History.
 Emotions (Philosophy) – History.
 Title. BF531.R6825 2016
 152.409–dc23

2015014696

ISBN 978-1-107-48084-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Tom



The human world provides a spectacle convulsive with opposing desires and contending wills.

Geoffrey O'Brien, "Balzac on the Brink"



Contents

	List of plates	page viii
	List of figures	ix
	List of maps and genealogies	X
	List of tables	xi
	Prefatory note	xiii
	Acknowledgments	xiv
	List of abbreviations	xvi
	Introduction	1
1	Ancient theories	16
2	Attachment and detachment	35
3	Alcuin's therapy	67
4	Love and treachery	88
5	Thomas' passions	144
6	Theatricality and sobriety	169
7	Gerson's music	227
8	Despair and happiness	248
9	Hobbes' motions	288
	Conclusion	314
	Bibliography	322
	Index	359

vii



Plates

1.1 An early icon of friendship in Christ	<i>page</i> 26
3.1 A Carolingian image of wisdom	77
6.1 Wauquelin's "piteous words"	180
6.2 Jean de la Huerta's mourner	188
6.3 and 6.4 Christ's Passion at Norwich	208
7.1 and 7.2 Gerson's canticordum as a cross	240
9.1 Leviathan title page, sketch for Charles II	296
9.2 Leviathan frontispiece (1651)	302

viii



Figures

4.1	Aelred's two forms of amor	page 96
5.1	Aquinas' body-soul composite	148
5.2	Aquinas' sequence of the concupiscible passions	153
5.3	Aquinas' sequence of the concupiscible and irascible	
	passions	154
7.1	The hexachord system	237
7.2	Gerson's hand of the passions	238
7.3	Gerson's cross of the passions	239



Maps and genealogies

Maps

2.1 Early medieval Francia	page 36		
4.1 England and France in the twelfth and thirteenth			
centuries	92		
6.1 France, England, and Burgundy in the fifteenth			
century	171		
Genealogical Tables			
2.1 The Merovingians (simplified)	50		
6.1 The Pastons	212		

X



Tables

1.1	Cicero's genera of perturbationes animi	page 18
1.2	Cicero's constantiae	18
1.3	Cicero's aegritudines	19
1.4	Cicero's perturbationes (apart from the aegritudines)	20
1.5	Cicero's "good" emotions	23
1.6	Augustine's emotion words	33
3.1	Alcuin's emotion words	82
3.2	Alcuin's emotion words enhanced	84
4.1	Old Occitan words associated with cor	121
4.2	Old Occitan emotional vocabulary at the Toulouse court	122
4.3	Emotion words in the acta	126
5.1	Aquinas' concupiscible and irascible passions	150
5.2	Aquinas' passiones animae	156
5.3	The moral virtues that regulate Aquinas' passions and	
	affections	166
6.1	Emotions associated with the heart in Monstrelet, Chronique	176
6.2	Enhanced list of emotions associated with the heart in	
	Monstrelet, Chronique	186
6.3	Margery's heart-felt terms and those associated with them	196
6.4	Margery's typical emotional sequence	205
6.5	Paston emotion words	216
7.1	The Stoic emotional grid	230
7.2	Gerson's terms of pain and sorrow	231
7.3	Gerson's list of the passions of animals and men	235
7.4	Names of the voices of Gerson's canticordum	244
8.1	Bright's "primitive" and "derivative" emotions	257
8.2	Burton's emotions	262
	General sequence of emotions in Spirituall Experiences	268
8.4	Emotions valued and devalued by Walker	274
8.5	A Leveller list of vices	278
9.1	Hobbes' motions in the Leviathan	294
9.2	Hobbes' passions in "life's race to get ahead"	305

xi



Prefatory note

I have regularized the use of i/j and u/v in Latin quotations in accordance with the guidelines of H. A. Kelly, "Uniformity and Sense in Editing and Medieval Texts," in *Medieval Academy News* (Spring 2004), 8: I use the i and u for the vowel sound and j and v for the consonant sound. However, I have not regularized other orthography, nor have I changed the punctuation of the editions that I use.

In note citations I normally leave out p. (standing for page number) unless the citation involves a series of numbers (chapter, section, and so on), in which case the p. is used.

I do not ordinarily cite the full original Latin of Latin-language sources in my notes. However, I include relevant Latin terms in my translations. I do give the original texts of Moyen français, Old Occitan, and Middle English in the notes. All translations are my own unless otherwise noted, but I have taken into account (and herewith express my gratitude for) numerous modern translations.

xiii



Acknowledgments

I began this project nearly ten years ago. My debts range from chance meetings, emails, and papers as much as they do from solicited advice, invitations, and critical readings. In short, this book owes so much to so many people that it is impossible for me to name and thank them all. Some of those who helped me will find their names in fitting places in chapter footnotes. I hope that others will forgive me if I have left out their names. Although their names are perhaps omitted, their impact remains very real and very much appreciated.

Here I will limit myself to thanking four people who have sustained me in ways more than I can say throughout the long process of writing this book.

My first debt is to Riccardo Cristiani. I first met him when he was a doctoral student at the University of Bologna. He eventually became my research assistant. In the course of our work together, he has become a collaborator. He has an amazing knack for seeing problems in argument and exposition, for doubting (and being right to doubt) the accuracy or the completeness of a point, and for critiquing weak translations and paraphrasing. He identified new and essential bibliography for me to read. Via email and Skype and even more intensely when we got together in person, we discussed the emotional consequences of mankind's Fall from Paradise; hammered out the differences between one theorist and another; disagreed (until we agreed) about the contents of chapter introductions; and worried about the suitability of words, phrases, and formulations. Together we wrote the first half of Chapter 4 on Aelred and all of Chapter 5 on Thomas Aquinas. Together we laughed and anguished over passages of reading and writing. In addition to all of that, Riccardo did the essential "little things" that make or break a book: proofreading, preparing the genealogies, maps, figures, bibliography, and index - even checking to be sure that my commas and periods were in the right places. Rather than thank him separately in each chapter, which might seem merely repetitive, I want here to say that there is nothing in this book that does not bear witness to his incisive input.

xiv



Acknowledgments

ΧV

Lester K. Little has been my mentor and colleague throughout my career. Indeed, he inspired that career. It was Lester who first made clear to me that one could talk about feelings in history without being anachronistic: as an undergraduate, I sat enthralled in his classroom as he talked about how medieval Christians projected their anxieties onto Jews. We have collaborated often both formally and informally, and the latter is the case for this book, of which Lester read and critiqued a near-final draft. I am deeply indebted to him.

Dominique Iogna-Prat has been my intellectual companion since I began work, years ago, on the monastery of Cluny. He and I subsequently changed our focus almost simultaneously, he looking at social and ecclesial theory across the medieval and early modern divide, I doing much the same for emotions. After reading the entire manuscript of this book in draft, Dominique offered numerous observations and suggestions. Extraordinarily attuned to continuities and transformations, he saw connections and gaps that had never occurred to me. I am very grateful.

Finally, I thank my husband, Tom. For years he has lived with this book in the process of becoming and a wife eternally at her desk. He has been unfailingly supportive in every way. In the interstices of his own busy law practice, he has done the laundry, washed the dishes, and purchased the groceries. He has listened to me complain, gush with enthusiasm, and wallow in misery about theorists, courts, and churchmen. When the manuscript was finished in draft, he read it, offering me both feedback and encouragement. I dedicate the book to him.

Let me end with some institutions and people who helped me continuously with this project: Loyola University Chicago, its library (above all Interlibrary Loan Librarian Jennifer Stegen), and its Department of History (above all chairmen Timothy Gilfoyle and Robert Bucholz); and Cambridge University Press (especially Elizabeth Friend-Smith, Amanda George, Katherine Law, and Rebecca Taylor).

To all, my grateful thanks.



Abbreviations

Aelred of Rievaulx Aelred, BSDe bello standardii, ed. J.-P. Migne Gen. Genealogia Regis Anglie Henrici iunioris, ed. J.-P. Migne Inclus. institutione inclusarum, in 637-682 Eulogium Davidis regis Scotorum, in Lament Pinkerton's Lives of the Scottish Saints, ed. William M. Metcalfe 00 Aelredi Rievallensis. Opera Omnia, 1: Opera ascetica ed. Anselme Hoste and Charles H. Talbot SA De spiritali amicitia, in OO, 287-350 Spec. car. De speculo caritatis, in OO, 3–161 Aimeric de Belenoi Aimeric de Belenoi, Le Poesie, ed. and trans. Andrea Poli Alcuin of York Alcuin, DRDisputatio de rhetorica et de virtutibus sapientissimi Regis Caroli et Albini magistri, in The Rhetoric of Alcuin and Charlemagne, ed. and trans. Wilbur Samuel Howell DVVDe virtutibus et vitiis liber ad Widonem comitem, ed. J.-P. Migne Eρ. Epistolae, ed. Ernst Dümmler Aquinas, Thomas Aquinas ST Summa theologiae, in Corpus Thomisticum, ed. Enrique Alarcón

xvi

Super Sent.

Scriptum super Sententiis, in Corpus Thomisticum, ed. Enrique Alarcón



List of abbreviations xvii

Augustine, Augustine of Hippo

Civ. dei De civitate dei, ed. Bernard Dombart and

Alphonse Kalb

Conf. Confessions, ed. and trans. Pierre de

Labriolle

Lib. arb. De libero arbitrio, in Il "De Libero Arbitrio"

di S. Agostino, ed. and trans. Franco

De Capitani

Tractatus Commentaire de la première épître de S.

Jean, ed. and trans. Paul Agaësse

Bernart The Songs of Bernart de Ventadorn, ed.

and trans. Stephen G. Nichols, Jr. et

aı.

BMK The Book of Margery Kempe, ed. Sanford

Brown Meech and Hope Emily Allen

Cadenet Les Poésies du troubadour Cadenet, ed. and

trans. Josef Zemp

Cat. Rai. Catalogues raimondins (1112–1229).

Actes des comtes de Toulouse, ducs de Narbonne et marquis de Provence, ed.

Laurent Macé

CCCM Corpus Christianorum. Continuatio

Mediaevalis

CCSL Corpus Cristianorum. Series Latina

Chanson de la Croisade albigeoise, ed. and

trans. Eugène Martin-Chabot

Cicero, Marcus Tullius Cicero

DA Laelius: de Amicitia, trans. William

Armistead Falconer

TD M. Tulli Ciceronis Tusculanae

Disputationes, ed. Michaelangelus

Giusta

CSEL Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum

Latinorum

DLFMA Dictionnaire des lettres françaises: Le

Moyen Age



xviii List of abbreviations

DNB Oxford Dictionary of National Biography

EEBO Early English Books Online

FQ Edmund Spenser, The Faerie Queene, ed.

A. C. Hamilton, 2d rev. ed. Hiroshi Yamashita and Toshiyuki Suzuki

Gaucelm Faidit Les poèmes de Gaucelm Faidit. Troubadour

du XIIe siècle, ed. and trans. Jean

Mouzat

George, A Latin Poet Judith W. George. Venantius Fortunatus:

A Latin Poet in Merovingian Gaul

Gerson, Jean Gerson

CP Canticordum au pélerin, in La doctrine du

chant du Coeur de Jean Gerson, ed. and

trans. Isabelle Fabre

DP long De passionibus animae, in OC, 9:1-25 DP short De passionibus animae, in OC, 9:155-57

EP Enumeratio peccatorum ab Alberto posita,

in OC, 9:160–66

OC Oeuvres complètes, ed. Palémon Glorieux TC Tractatus de canticis, in La doctrine du

chant du Coeur de Jean Gerson, ed.

and trans. Isabelle Fabre

Greg. Tur., Gregory of Tours

Historiarum libri X, ed. Bruno Krusch

and Wilhelm Levison

VP Liber vitae patrum, ed. Bruno Krusch

Hobbes, Thomas Hobbes

Lev. Leviathan, ed. J. C. A. Gaskin

OL Thomas Hobbes Malmesburiensis opera

philosophica quae latine scripsit, omnia in unum corpus nunc primum collecta,

ed. William Molesworth

La Marche Olivier de La Marche, Mémoires, ed.

Henri Beaune and Jean

d'Arbaumont

LB The Holy Bible ... made from the Latin

Vulgate by John Wycliffe and his



List of abbreviations

xix

Followers, ed. Josiah Forshall and

Frederic Madden

Lefèvre Jean Lefèvre, Chronique, ed. François

Morand

Loeb, "Le relations thesis" Ariane Loeb, "Les relations entre les

troubadours et les comtes de Toulouse (1112–1229)." M.A. Thesis

MGH Monumenta Germaniae Historica

AA Auctores antiquissimi

SRM Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum

SS Scriptores (in Folio)

Monstrelet, Chronique, ed.

L. Douët-D'Arcq

Paston Paston Letters and Papers of the Fifteenth

Century, pts. 1 and 2, ed. Norman Davis, pt. 3, ed. Richard Beadle and

Colin Richmond

Peire Vidal Peire Vidal, Poesie, ed. Silvio Avalle d'Arco

PL Patrologia Latina, ed. J.-P. Migne

Raimon de Miraval Les poésies du troubadour Raimon de

Miraval, ed. and trans. L. T. Topsfield

RB The Rule of Saint Benedict, ed. and trans.

Bruce L. Venarde

SC Sources chrétiennes

SE Spirituall experiences, of sundry beleevers.

Held forth by them at severall solemne meetings, and Conferences to that end. With the recommendation of the sound, spiritual, and savoury worth of them, to the sober and spirituall Reader, By Vavasor Powel, Minister

of the Gospel

Staley The Book of Margery Kempe, trans. Lynn

Staley



xx List of abbreviations

VA Walter Daniel, The Life of Ailred of

Rievaulx, ed. and trans. Frederick M.

Powicke

WW The Writings of William Walwyn, ed. Jack

R. McMichael and Barbara Taft