

INDEX

- abortion and wrongful life/wrongful birth, 147, 154, 155
- Ackner, Lord, 154
- Action for Victims of Medical Accidents (AVMA), UK, 56
- Acute Care Trusts in Scotland, 55
- ADEPA (Association for the Defence of the Patient), Spain, 169
- administrative law
 - in France, 72, 80–2, 89–92
 - in Spain, 160, 164, 169, 181
- aléa thérapeutique* cases in France, 90–1, 95, 99
- Alonso Pérez, Mariano, 167
- alternative dispute resolution
 - arbitration, in the Netherlands, 149
 - conciliation
 - in Austria, 115, 131
 - in France, 73, 76, 88, 95, 97, 98
 - grievance committees in the Netherlands, 140
 - mediation
 - in England and Wales, 51
 - in Scotland, 57
 - ombudsman arrangements in Austria, 115, 131
- America. *See* United States
- arbitration, in the Netherlands, 149
- Association for the Defence of the Patient (ADEPA), Spain, 169
- Ataz López, Joaquín, 167
- Australia
 - Cottanach v. Melchior*, 39
 - informed consent in, 48
 - legislative proposals to manage medical liability in, 9
- Austria, 108–9
 - causation in, 123–6
 - Civil Code
 - on damages, 128
 - on fault, 121–3
 - on tortious and contractual liability, 113
 - on vicarious liability, 127, 128
 - codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies, 110, 114
 - compensation funds, 116–17
 - conciliation panels, 115, 131
 - contract law in, 112, 113
 - criminal liability in, 118
 - damages in, 126, 128
 - documentation, importance of, 124
 - exemption clauses in, 129
 - fault liability in, 121–3, 128
 - German influence on, 108
 - historical background to medical liability in, 8, 108–9
 - hospitals and clinics in, 109, 112, 116–17
 - increased number of claims in, 111, 129
 - informed consent in, 118–21, 125
 - medical liability insurance in, 111
 - Nordic patient insurance scheme, interest in, 21
 - ombudsman arrangements, 115, 131
 - ordinary courts, public and private health care dealt with by, 5
 - patients' rights in, 114–16, 129
 - personal liability in, 126–7
 - predisposition or precondition in patient, 126
 - private health insurance in, 111

- Austria (*cont.*)
 proof of medical liability in, 123–6
 public and private health systems in,
 4, 109–13
 reasons for development of medical
 liability in, 109, 130–1
 responsible parties in, 126–8
 splitting liability in, 125–6
 tort law in, 113
 vicarious liability in, 113, 126–8
 wrongfulness in, 117–18
 Austrian Medical Chamber, 110,
 111–12
 Austrian statute law
 1806 decree excluding tort law
 actions against civil servants
 performing duties of their
 office, 112
Ärztegesetz (*ÄrzteG*), 114, 124, 128
Krankenanstaltengesetz (*KAG*), 114
Reichs-sanitätsgesetz, 110
Versicherungsvertragsgesetz
 (*VersVG*), 111
 autonomy, 40, 50, 104, 183
 AVMA (Action for Victims of Medical
 Accidents), UK, 56
- Belgian interest in Nordic patient
 insurance scheme, 21
 Benzo Cano, Eduardo, 165
 Bingham, Lord, 48
 Bolam principle, 12, 42–6, 61, 64, 102,
 143
 Bolkestein directive on services, 22, 185
 breach of contract. *See* contract law
 breach of duty. *See* duty of care/breach
 of duty; standard of care
 Bridge of Harwich, Lord, 11, 14, 44, 49
 Britain. *See* England and Wales;
 Scotland
 Brooke LJ, 40
 Brougham, Lord, 59
 Browne-Wilkinson, Lord, 44
 burden of proof. *See* proof of medical
 liability
 ‘but for’ test (*conditio sine qua non*), 15,
 47, 179
 Bydlinski, Franz, 125
- Care Trusts in UK, 30–1, 55
 causation, 15
 in Austria, 123–6
 ‘but for’ test (*conditio sine qua non*),
 15, 47, 179
 in England and Wales, 47–50, 53
 in France, 83, 84, 104
 in the Netherlands, 154
 in Scotland, 65
 in Spain, 164, 178–80, 186
 Clyde, Lord President, 60
 codes of conduct and disciplinary
 bodies, 7
 in Austria, 110, 114
 in England and Wales, 31–4
 in France, 7, 75–6
 licensing of physicians, 33
 in the Netherlands, 136, 140
 in Scotland, 56–7
 in Spain, 171
 comparative law
 on damages for wrongful life/
 wrongful birth, 16–18
 on standard of care, 13, 144
 compensation funds. *See* no-fault
 compensation schemes
 conciliation
 in Austria, 115, 131
 in France, 73, 76, 88, 95, 97, 98
conditio sine qua non (‘but for’ test),
 15, 47, 179
 conduct codes. *See* codes of conduct
 and disciplinary bodies
 confidentiality, patient right of
 in the Netherlands, 140
 in Spain, 173
 constitutional law, role of, 5, 87–8
 contract law, 6–7
 in Austria, 112, 113
 in England and Wales, 6, 7, 35
 in France, 6, 71, 73, 80
 in the Netherlands, 6, 25, 134–6,
 137–8, 146–56
 in Scotland, 6, 58
 in Spain, 162, 170, 173–4, 176, 181,
 187
 tort law versus, 6–7, 51
 in United States, 51

- corrective justice, 50
- Council of Europe, 21, 158
- criminal liability, 5
- in Austria, 117–18
 - England and Wales, negligent manslaughter in, 36
 - in France, 5, 11, 73–5, 79
 - in the Netherlands, 149
 - in Spain, 5, 11, 161, 163, 167, 170
 - standard of care, 11
- damages, 16–18
- in Austria, 126, 128
 - in England and Wales, 18, 66–9
 - in France, 17
 - legislative proposals to manage, 9
 - in the Netherlands, 16–17, 146
 - in Scotland, 17, 66–9
 - in Spain, 181–4
 - wrongful life/wrongful birth, 16–18, 146–56
- Denmark
- Act on Patient Safety, 10
 - claim rate, 3
 - patient insurance in (*See* Nordic patient insurance scheme)
 - reporting requirements, 10
- Denning, Lord, 15, 27, 38, 46, 47
- DES (diethylstilbestrol) cases, 148–53
- Dickson, Robert, 66
- diethylstilbestrol (DES) cases, 148–53
- dignity, human, 154–6
- disabled persons, wrongful life/birth cases involving. *See* wrongful life/wrongful birth
- disciplinary bodies. *See* codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies
- discovery in United States, 14
- disproportionate harm, doctrine of, in Spain, 177, 179, 186
- distributive justice, 40
- documentation, importance of
- in Austria, 124
 - in the Netherlands, 140
 - in Spain, 173
- Dutch Association of Surgeons, 143
- Dutch law. *See* Netherlands
- duty of care/breach of duty. *See also* standard of care
- in England and Wales, 12, 37–47
 - in Scotland, 63
- duty to warn. *See* informed consent
- dynamic distribution of the proof, Spanish doctrine of, 178, 186
- ECHR (European Convention on Human Rights), 21
- economic change and medical liability, 24
- ELD (European Legal Development) Project, 1, 2, 23, 146
- Ellenborough, Lord, 36
- England and Wales, 27–9
- Bolam principle, 12, 42–6, 61, 64, 102, 143
 - causation, 47–50, 53
 - claim rate, 3
 - codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies, 31–4
 - contract law in, 6, 7, 35
 - costs/number of claims compared to Scotland, 66–9
 - criminal manslaughter charges, 36
 - damages, measure of, 18, 66–9
 - duty of care/breach of duty in, 12, 37–47
 - expert witnesses in, 11, 37, 43, 45–6, 47
 - fault liability in, 37, 38
 - France compared, 101–2
 - future of medical liability in, 50–3
 - historical background to medical liability in, 8
 - informed consent in, 44, 48–9, 50, 138
 - legislative proposals to manage medical liability in, 9
 - Making Amends* (Chief Medical Officer report, UK), 51–3
 - negligence, 6, 36–7
 - NHSLO (National Health Service Litigation Office), 3

- England and Wales (*cont.*)
 no-fault compensation scheme
 proposals, 51–3
 Nordic patient insurance scheme,
 interest in, 21
 patients' rights in, 10, 11, 31–4
 private health care in, 31
 proof of medical liability in, 14
 public health system (NHS or
 National Health Service) in, 4,
 30–1
 public policy issues in, 39, 50
 reporting requirements, 10
res ipsa loquitur (prima facie
 negligence), 14, 47
 responsible parties in, 16
 rise in medical liability claims in,
 27–9
 Scotland and, cross-border
 assimilation between, 61–2,
 63–4
 standard of care in, 11, 34–47
 tort law in, 6, 7, 37
 vicarious liability in, 37–8
 wrongful life/wrongful birth, 18,
 38–42
- English and Welsh case law
*Allen v. Bloomsbury Health
 Authority*, 39
*Allied Marples Group Ltd v.
 Simmons & Simmons*, 49
Anns v. Merton LBC, 50
Arthur JS Hall & Co. v. Simons, 29
*Barnett v. Chelsea and Kensington
 Hospital Management
 Committee*, 47
Benarr v. Kettering Health Authority,
 39
Blyth v. Birmingham Waterworks, 42
*Bolam v. Friern Hospital
 Management Committee*, 12,
 42–6, 61, 64, 102, 143
*Bolitho v. City and Hackney Health
 Authority*, 42, 43, 44–5, 61, 63,
 102
Bonham's Case, 33
Bull v. Devon Area Health Authority,
 38
Caparo Industries Plc v. Dickman, 50
Cassidy v. Ministry of Health, 38, 47,
 64, 65
Chappel v. Hart, 48
Chester v. Afshar, 2, 48–9, 50
*Collins v. Hertfordshire County
 Council*, 38
*D v. South Tyneside Health Care
 NHS Trust*, 45
Donoghue v. Stevenson, 137
Doughty v. General Dental Council,
 34
*Edward Wong Finance Co. Ltd v.
 Johnson, Stokes and Masters*, 43
*Emeh v. Kensington and Chelsea
 and Westminster Area Health
 Authority*, 39
Evans v. Liverpool Corporation, 38
Eyre v. Measday, 35
*Fairchild v. Glenhaven Funeral
 Services Ltd*, 47, 48, 49, 65
Fish v. Wilcox, 39
Freitas v. O'Brien, 44
Goevelt v. Burnell, 33
Gold v. Essex County Council, 38
Gold v. Haringey Health Authority,
 39, 43
*Goodwill v. British Pregnancy
 Advisory Service*, 39
*Greaves & Co. (Contractors) Ltd v.
 Baynham Meikle & Partners*, 35
Greenfield v. Irwin, 35, 40
Gregg v. Scott, 37, 50, 64
Grenville v. College of Physicians, 33
Hardman v. Amin, 41
Harnett v. Fisher, 8
Hatcher v. Black, 27
*Heath v. West Berkshire Health
 Authority*, 143
Hills v. Potter, 44
*Hillyer v. The Governors of St
 Bartholomew's Hospital*, 38, 64
*Hotson v. East Berkshire Health
 Authority*, 35, 49
Hucks v. Cole, 43
Hunt v. NHS Litigation Authority, 45
*Jones v. Berkshire Area Health
 Authority*, 39

- Jones v. Randall*, 39
Knight v. West Kent Health Authority, 45
Lanphier v. Phipos, 37
Lee v. Taunton and Somerset NHS Trust, 41
Lloyds Bank v. Savory & Co, 43
Luxmoore-May v. Messenger May Baverstock, 43
M v. Blackpool Victoria Hospital NHS Trust, 45
MacDonald v. Glasgow Western Hospital Board of Management and Another, 38
Marriott v. West Midlands Health Authority, 45
Marshall v. Lindsey County Council, 38, 43
Maynard v. West Midlands Regional Health Authority, 44, 62
McFarlane v. Tayside Health Board (Scottish case applied in English law), 17, 35, 39–41, 64
McKay v. Essex Area Health Authority, 18, 154
Morris v. West Hartlepool Steam Navigation Co., 62
Nettleship v. Weston, 42
Newell and Newell v. Goldberg, 43
Parkinson v. St James and Seacroft Hospital NHS Trust, 40, 41
Pearce v. United Bristol Healthcare NHS Trust, 45
Pepper v. Hart, 150
Pittman Estate v. Bain, 35
R v. Adomako, 36
Rand v. East Dorset Health Authority, 41
Ratcliffe v. Plymouth and Torbay Health Authority, 47
Rees v. Darlington Memorial NHS Trust, 35, 40, 41
Reynolds v. Health First Medical Group, 35
Reynolds v. North Tyneside Health Authority, 45
Rich v. Pierpont, 37
Richardson v. Mellish, 39
Riebl v. Hughes, 63
Robertson v. Nottingham Health Authority, 38
Robinson v. Salford Health Authority, 39
Roe v. Minister of Health, 16, 38, 64
Rogers v. Whittaker, 63
Rondel v. Worsley, 29
Roylance v. GMC, 34
Ruscillo v. Council for Regulation of Health Care Professionals, 34
Salih v. Enfield Health Authority, 39
Searle v. Prentice, 36
Shakoor v. Situ, 45
Sidaway v. Board of Governors of the Royal Bethlem Hospital, 11, 44, 63
Skyrne v. Butolf, 36
Smith v. Martin and the Corporation of Kingston-upon-Hull, 38
Strangeways-Lesmere v. Clayton, 38
Stratton v. Swanlord, 36
Thake v. Maurice, 35, 36, 39
Townsend v. Worcester District Health Authority, 46
Udale v. Bloomsbury Area Health Authority, 39
Walkin v. South Manchester Health Authority, 39
Watson v. British Boxing Board of Control, 37
White v. Chief Constable of South Yorkshire, 40
Whitehouse v. Jordan, 34–47
Wilsher v. Essex Health Authority, 14, 42, 47, 49, 65
X v. Bedfordshire County Council, 38
 English and Welsh statute law
 Chiropractors Act 1994, 33
 Congenital Disabilities (Civil Liability) Act 1976, 18
 Dentists Act 1984, 33
 Human Rights Act 1998, 33
 Medical Act 1858 and 1983, 33
 Nurses, Midwives and Health Visitors Act 1997, 33
 Nursing and Midwifery Order 2001, 33

- English and Welsh statute law (*cont.*)
 Opticians Act 1989, 33
 Osteopaths Act 1993, 33
 Pharmacy Act 1954, 33
 Unfair Contract Terms Act 1977, 35
 Erle CJ, 37, 42
 error versus fault, in France, 101
 ethical codes. *See* codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies
 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), 21
 European Court of Justice, 23
 European Legal Development (ELD) Project, 1, 2, 23, 146
 European Social Agenda, 2005 to 2010, 23
 European Union (EU)
 harmonisation of medical liability law across, 21–3, 25–6, 158, 185
 informed consent in, 11
 Nordic patient insurance scheme, EU interest in, 21, 157
 proof of medical liability in, 14
 services liability in, 14, 22
 euthanasia in the Netherlands, 139
 evidence of medical liability. *See* proof of medical liability
 exemption/exclusion clauses, 18–19
 in Austria, 18–19
 in Germany, 132, 134, 138, 157
 in the Netherlands, 18, 156–7
 in Spain, 184
 expert witnesses, 7, 24
 in England and Wales, 11, 37, 43, 45–6, 47
 in France, 102
 in Scotland, 62–3
 Farwell LJ, 38
 fault liability
 in Austria, 121–3, 128
 in England and Wales, 37, 38
 error versus fault, in France, 101
 in France (*See under* France)
 gross fault (*faute lourde*) versus ordinary fault, 5, 11, 24
 proof of fault generally required for finding of liability, 14
 in Spain, 162, 164, 170, 176–8, 186
 standard of care, 11
 Faure, Michael, 2
 Ferguson, Quintana, 165
 Fernández Costales, Javier, 167
 Fernández Hierro, José Manuel, 167
 Finland, 1
 claim rate, 3
 patient insurance in, 19–20.
 (*See also* Nordic patient insurance scheme)
 patients' rights in, 158
 France, 70
 administrative law in, 72, 80–2, 89–92
 aléa thérapeutique cases, 90–1, 95, 99
 American litigation culture, critique of, 92
 bacterial infections contracted on medical premises, strict liability for, 93–4, 99
 causation, 83, 84, 104
 Civil Code
 on contract law, 71
 on informed consent, 103
 on liability limitations, 71
 on negligence, 78
 on product liability, 100
 strict liability for damage by objects or things in, 84
 on tort law, 71, 78, 79
 claim rate, 3
 codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies in, 7, 75–6
 conciliation service, 73, 76, 88, 95, 97, 98
 contract law in, 6, 71, 73, 80
 criminal versus civil liability in, 5, 11, 73–5, 79
 damages, measure of, 17
 England and Wales compared, 101–2
 error versus fault, 101
 expert witnesses in, 102
 fault liability in, 70
 administrative law, 80–2
 criminal cases, 74
 current role of, 98–101

- error versus fault, 101
- historical development of, 78, 106–7
- public versus private health systems, 71
- reasons for evolution of, 84–9
- shift towards strict liability, 82
- significant developments in 1990s, 89–92
- statutory compensation scheme and, 73, 93, 95, 98–101
- wrongful life/wrongful birth, 106
- historical background to medical liability in, 8, 77–98
- immunity claims in, 77
- increase in number of claims in, 86, 92
- industrial accident liability compared to medical liability in, 84
- informed consent in, 79, 100, 102
- limitations periods, 71, 96
- loss of chance doctrine, 83, 103–4
- medical liability insurance
 - availability of, 85
 - bacterial infections, strict liability for, 94
 - private practitioners required to have, 94, 95
 - public hospitals required to obtain, 81
 - statutory insurance scheme, responsibilities under, 95, 96
- negligence, 77–80, 83, 101–2
- Netherlands influenced by, 132, 134
- ONIAM (*Office National d'indemnisation des accidents médicaux, des affections iatrogènes et des infections nosocomiales*), 3
- patients' rights in, 5, 87–8, 158
- personal liability in, 72–3
- product liability in, 94, 99–100
- public versus private health systems in, 4, 70–2
- res ipsa loquitur* (prima facie negligence), 101
- responsible parties in, 16, 72–3
- Spain, influence on, 174
- standard of care in, 11, 13
- statutory compensation scheme, 73, 93–101
 - availability of insurance and development of, 85
 - claims made under, 96–7
 - effect on compensation of victims, 97–8
 - fault liability and, 73, 93, 95, 98–101
 - insurers' responsibilities under, 95, 96
 - legislation establishing, 93
 - procedure for obtaining compensation under, 95–6
 - serious medical accidents, guarantee of compensation for, 93–5
- strict liability
 - bacterial infections contracted on medical premises, 93–4, 99
 - reasons for evolution towards, 84–9
 - shift towards, 82
 - significant developments in 1990s, 89–92
 - statutory compensation scheme, effect of, 99
- tort law in, 6, 71, 73, 78, 79
- vicarious liability in, 72–3
- wrongful life/wrongful birth, 17, 21, 104
- Fraser, Lord, 35
- French case law
 - Bailly* case, 90
 - Bianchi* case, 91
 - Cohen* case, 90
 - Mercier* case, 6, 8, 71, 80
 - Perruche* case, 17, 25, 92, 105–6, 148, 154
- French statute law
 - Law of 9 April 1898, 84
 - Law of 5 April 1928, 86
 - Law of 13 July 1930, 85
 - Law of 21 December 1941, 86
 - Law of 31 December 1970, 88

- French statute law (*cont.*)
 French Product Liability Act 1988, 94
 Law of 19 May 1998, 94
 Law of 10 July 2000, 74
 Law of 4 March 2002, 2, 25, 70, 71, 73, 75, 88, 93, 103, 104, 105
 Law of 30 December 2002, 73, 94
 Law of 13 August 2004, 76
- Gaius, 58
- García Rubio, María Paz, 160
- General Medical Council (GMC), UK, 33, 57
- General Medical Service (GMS) agreements in UK, 31
- Germany
 claim rate, 3
 criminal versus civil liability, 5, 11
 damages for wrongful life/wrongful birth, 17
 exemption/exclusion clauses, 19, 132, 134, 138, 157
 informed consent in, 138
 Netherlands influenced by, 132, 134, 138, 157
 Nordic patient insurance scheme, interest in, 21
 personality rights in constitutional law, 5
 standard of care in, 11, 13
- Glegg, A. T., 59
- global harmonisation of medical liability, 23
- GMC (General Medical Council), UK, 33, 57
- GMS (General Medical Service) agreements in UK, 31
- González Morán, Luis, 167, 168
- Great Britain. *See* England and Wales; Scotland
- grievance committees in the Netherlands, 140
- gross negligence. *See* negligence
- Guthrie, Lord, 60
- Hale, Baroness, 49
- Hale LJ, 40
- harmonisation of medical liability law across Europe, 21–3, 25–6, 158, 185
- Hartkamp, Dutch Advocate-General, 149
- Harvard Medical Practice Study, 2
- Haute Autorité de Santé*, France, 76
- historical background to medical liability, 8–10
- Hoffmann, Lord, 48
- Holland. *See* Netherlands
- Hondius, Ewoud, 1, 132, 161
- Hope, Lord, 41, 49
- hospitals
 in Austria, 109, 112, 116–17
 France, fault in administrative law in, 80–2
 in the Netherlands, 138, 144, 146
 in Spain, 4, 164, 168, 181
 standard of care, institutional, 13, 144
 vicarious liability of (*See* vicarious liability)
- human dignity, 154–6
- ICAS (Independent Complaints and Advocacy Service), UK, 32, 56
- immunity claims, in France, 77
- Independent Complaints and Advocacy Service (ICAS), UK, 32, 56
- Independent Healthcare Association, UK, 57
- informed consent, 11–12
 in Austria, 118–21, 125
 in England and Wales, 44, 48–9, 50, 138
 in France, 79, 100, 102
 in the Netherlands, 138–9, 143, 147
 in Spain, 163, 166, 167, 175, 177, 179–80, 182–3, 186
- insurance
 institutional standard of care for, 144
 medical liability insurance
 in Austria, 111
 in France (*See under* France)
 in Spain, 184–5

- Nordic scheme (*See* Nordic patient insurance scheme)
- private health insurance
- in Austria, 111
 - in England and Wales, 31
 - Netherlands, compulsory private insurance in, 4, 133
 - in Scotland, 55, 57
- Izquierdo Tolsada, Mariano, 167
- Japan's interest in Nordic patient insurance scheme, 157
- joint liability
- in the Netherlands, 146
 - in Spain, 181
- jurisdictional conflicts. *See*
- administrative law; criminal liability; public versus private health systems and legal coverage
- Justinian, Institutes, 58
- Koch, Bernhard A., 2, 108
- Koninklijke Nederlandse Maatschappij voor de Geneeskunst*, 141, 142
- Koziol, Helmut, 2
- Landelijke Patinten/Consumenten Platform*, Netherlands, 142
- Leenen, Hank, 11, 25, 137
- lex artis ad hoc*, 174, 175, 177
- licensing of physicians, 33
- limitations periods, in France, 71, 96
- living wills in the Netherlands, 139
- Llamas Pombo, Eugenio, 167
- loss of chance doctrine
- in France, 83, 103–4
 - in the Netherlands, 158
 - in Spain, 182
- Luxembourg Declaration on Patient Safety, 22
- Making Amends* (Chief Medical Officer report, UK), 51–3
- manslaughter in England and Wales, 36
- Marañón, Gregorio, 165
- market share liability, concept of, 149
- Mas Oliver, Dr, 162
- McCall Smith, A., 46
- McNair J, 42–4, 61
- MDDUS (Medical and Dental Defence Union of Scotland), 55, 66
- measure of damages. *See* damages
- mediation
- in England and Wales, 51
 - in Scotland, 57
- Medical and Dental Defence Union of Scotland (MDDUS), 55, 66
- medical devices left in patients' bodies after surgery, 15, 82, 145
- medical liability, 1–3
- causation (*See* causation)
 - claims data and rates, 3
 - codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies, 7
 - constitutional law, role of, 5
 - contract law on (*See* contract law)
 - countries selected for study of, 1
 - See also* (Austria; England and Wales; France; Netherlands; Scotland; Spain)
 - criminal versus civil liability, 5
 - damages for (*See* damages)
 - EU, across (*See* European Union)
 - evidence of (*See* proof of medical liability)
 - exclusion of/exemption from (*See* exemption/exclusion clauses)
 - global harmonisation of, 23
 - historical background, 8–10
 - insurance against (*See under* insurance)
 - legislative proposals to manage, 9
 - patient insurance for (*See* Nordic patient insurance scheme)
 - patients' rights (*See* patients' rights)
 - proof of (*See* proof of medical liability)
 - public versus private (*See* public versus private health systems and legal coverage)
 - purpose or aim of, controversy regarding, 10
 - reasons for changes and developments in, 23–5
 - reporting requirements, 10

- medical liability (*cont.*)
 responsible parties, 15–16
 scope of present study, 2
 standard of care (*See* standard of care)
 tort law on (*See* tort law)
- medical recordkeeping, importance of
 in Austria, 124
 in Netherlands, 140
 in Spain, 173
- Merry, A., 46
- Millett, Lord, 39, 41
- misconduct, sanctioning. *See* codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies
- Montaner, Dr, 162
- Montel, A., 166
- Nathan, Lord, 28
- National Health Service (NHS),
 England and Wales, 4, 30–1
- National Health Service in Scotland (NHSiS), 4, 54–6
- National Health Service Litigation Office (NHSLO), England, 3
- National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE), UK, 32, 56
- negligence
 Austria, concept of wrongfulness in, 117–18
 in England and Wales, 6, 36–7
 in France, 77–80, 83, 101–2
 prima facie (*See res ipsa loquitur*)
 in Scotland, 6, 57–62
 in Spain, 161, 164
- Netherlands, 132–3
 arbitration in, 149
 causation in, 154
 Civil Code
 of 1838, 132, 134
 of 1992, 132, 135–6
 exclusion clauses, invalidity of, 18
 on exemption/exclusion clauses, 156
 French influence on, 132, 134
 German influence on, 132, 134, 157
- informed consent in, 143
 joint liability in, 146
 patients' rights in, 158
 responsible parties under, 16
 standard of care in, 12, 143
 wrongful life/wrongful birth, 148, 149, 152, 155
- codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies in, 136, 140
- contract law in, 6, 25, 134–6, 137–8, 146–56
- criminal liability in, 149
- damages, measure of, 16–17, 146
- documentation, importance of, 140
- euthanasia in, 139
- exemption/exclusion clauses, 18, 156–7
- French influence on, 132, 134
- German influence on, 132, 134, 138, 157
- grievance committees, 140
- historical background to medical liability in, 8, 136
- hospitals in, 138, 144, 146
- informed consent in, 138–9, 143, 147
- joint liability in, 146
- living wills in, 139
- loss of chance doctrine, 158
- Nordic patient insurance scheme, interest in, 21
- ordinary courts, public and private health care dealt with by, 5
- patients' rights in, 11, 25, 133, 137–41
- personality rights in constitutional law, 5
- privacy/confidentiality, patient right of, 140
- private health insurance in, 4, 133
- product liability in, 152
- proof of medical liability in, 15, 145
- public policy issues in, 152
- responsible parties in, 16, 145, 151
- standard of care in, 12, 13, 141–5
- tort law in, 6, 25, 134–6, 137
- wrongful life/wrongful birth, 16–17, 22, 146–56
- Netherlands case law

- DES* case, 148–53
Flierman v. Stichting Katholieke Universiteit, 147
Kelly case (*Leids Universitair Medisch Centrum v. Kelly Molenaar*), 17, 22, 133, 147–8, 153–6
Lindenbaum v. Cohen, 132, 137
 Missing IUD case, 148
Nuboer case (*Aarts v. Nuboer*), 145
Schepers v. De Bruijn, 145
Speeckaert v. Gradener, 141
Timmer v. Deutman, 145
 Netherlands statute law
 Act on Medical Services, 137–41, 146
 NHS (National Health Service), England and Wales, 4, 30–1
 NHS Quality Improvement Scotland (NHS QIS), 56
 NHSiS (National Health Service in Scotland), 4, 54–6
 NHSLO (National Health Service Litigation Office), England, 3
 NICE (National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence), UK, 32, 56
 Nichols, Lord, 49
 no-fault compensation schemes
 Austria
 compensation funds, 116–17
 splitting liability in, 125–6
 England and Wales, proposals in, 51–3
 France, statutory compensation scheme in (*See under* France)
 Scotland, proposals in, 69
 Spanish compensation fund, 184–5, 187
 Nordic patient insurance scheme, 19–21
 claim rate, 3
 European interest in, 21, 157
 as major shift in practice, 2, 24
 use of references to, 1
 Norway
 damages in wrongful life/wrongful birth, 17
 patient insurance in (*See* Nordic patient insurance scheme)
Office National d'indemnisation des accidents médicaux, des affections iathrogènes et des infections nosocomiaux (ONIAM), France, 3, 96, 97, 98
 ombudsman arrangements in Austria, 115, 131
 ONIAM (*Office National d'indemnisation des accidents médicaux, des affections iathrogènes et des infections nosocomiaux*), France, 3, 96, 97, 98
Ordre des médecins, France, 7, 75
 Oviedo Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, 21, 154–6, 158, 172
 Patient Advocacy Liaison Services (PALS), UK, 32
 patient insurance. *See* Nordic patient insurance scheme
 patient ombudsman arrangements in Austria, 115, 131
 Patients' Association, UK, 10, 32, 56
 patients' rights, 10–1
 in Austria, 114–16, 129
 in England and Wales, 10, 11, 31–4
 in France, 5, 87–8, 158
 in the Netherlands, 11, 25, 133, 137–41
 personality rights in constitutional law, 5, 87–8
 in Scotland, 10
 in Spain, 172–3
 PCTs (Primary Care Trusts) in UK, 30–1, 32, 55
 Pearson Committee, 51
 Penneau, J., 82, 84, 85
 Pennsylvania Project on Medical Liability, 2
 personal liability
 in Austria, 126–7
 in France, 72–3
 in Spain, 181

- Personal Medical Services (PMS)
 agreements in UK, 31
 personality rights, 5, 87–8
 PMS (Personal Medical Services)
 agreements in UK, 31
 predisposition or precondition in
 patient, in Austria, 126
 prima facie negligence. *See res ipsa loquitur*
 Primary Care Trusts (PCTs) in UK,
 30–1, 32, 55
 privacy, patient right of
 in the Netherlands, 140
 in Spain, 173
 private systems. *See* public versus
 private health systems and
 legal coverage, and under
 insurance
 Proculus, 58
 product liability
 in France, 94, 99–100
 in the Netherlands, 152
 professional bodies. *See* codes of
 conduct and disciplinary
 bodies
 Project on Medical Liability,
 Pennsylvania, 2
 proof of medical liability, 14
 in Austria, 123–6
 in England and Wales, 14
 fault (*See* fault liability)
 negligence (*See* negligence)
 in the Netherlands, 15, 145
 res ipsa loquitur (prima facie
 negligence) (*See res ipsa loquitur*)
 reversal of burden of, 14–15, 64–5,
 145, 176–8, 186
 in Scotland, 64–5
 in Spain, 14, 176–8, 186
 public policy issues
 in England and Wales, 39, 50
 in the Netherlands, 152
 wrongful life/wrongful birth, 39
 public versus private health systems
 and legal coverage, 1–3. *See*
 also subhead ‘private health
 insurance’, under insurance
 in Austria, 4, 109–13
 in England and Wales, 4, 30–1
 in France, 4, 70–2
 Netherlands, compulsory private
 insurance in, 4, 133
 in Scotland, 4, 54–6
 in Spain, 4, 5, 160, 164, 168, 169–70
 Rang, Jaap, 11, 25, 137
 record-keeping, importance of
 in Austria, 124
 in the Netherlands, 140
 in Spain, 173
 Regional Conciliation and
 Compensation Commissions,
 France, 95–6
 regulation of medical profession.
 See codes of conduct and
 disciplinary bodies
 Reid, Lord, 47
 reporting requirements, 10
res ipsa loquitur (prima facie
 negligence), 14, 15
 in England and Wales, 14, 47
 in France, 101
 in Scotland, 65
 Spain influenced by, 186
 responsible parties, 15–16. *See also*
 joint liability; personal liability;
 vicarious liability
 in Austria, 126–8
 in England and Wales, 16
 in France, 16, 72–3
 in the Netherlands, 16, 145, 151
 in Spain, 180–1
 reversal of burden of proof, 14–15,
 64–5, 145, 176–8, 186
 risks, duty to inform patient of.
 See informed consent
 Roca Juan, J., 166
 Roman law, 58
 Ross Report, Scotland, 66, 67, 68, 69

 Saleilles, R., 84
 Savatier, R., 87
 Scarman, Lord, 12, 44
 Scotland, 54–6
 causation in, 65

- codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies in, 56–7
 contract law in, 6, 58
 costs/number of claims compared to England and Wales, 66–9
 damages, measure of, 17, 66–9
 duty of care/breach of duty, 63
 England and Wales, cross-border assimilation with, 61–2, 63–4
 expert witnesses in, 62–3
 future of medical liability in, 69
 historical background to medical liability in, 57–61
 increase in number of claims, 66–7
 mediation in, 57
 negligence, 6, 57–62
 no-fault compensation scheme proposals, 69
 Nordic patient insurance scheme, interest in, 21
 patients' rights in, 10
 private health care in, 55, 57
 proof of medical liability, 64–5
 public health system (NHSIS or National Health Service in Scotland) in, 4, 54–6
res ipsa loquitur (prima facie negligence), 65
 Ross Report, 66, 67, 68, 69
 standard of care in, 12, 61–3
 tort law in, 57–62
 vicarious liability of hospitals, 64
 wrongful life/wrongful birth, 17, 64
 Scottish case law
 Aird v. Ramsay, 65
 Beasley v. Fife Health Board, 63
 Castell v. De Greef, 63
 Clark v. McLennan, 65
 Craig v. Glasgow Victoria and Leverdale Hospitals Board of Management, 65
 Crawford v. Campbell, 59
 Devaney v. Glasgow Health Board, 65
 Devlin v. Ghosh, 64
 Dickson v. Hygienic Institute, 59, 63
 Dougan v. Lanarkshire Acute Hospitals NHS Trust, 61, 63
 Duffy v. Lanarkshire Health Board, 63
 Edgar v. Lamont, 59
 Fallone v. Lanarkshire Acute Hospitals NHS Trust, 64
 Farquhar v. Murray, 59
 Foote v. Greenock Hospital, 64
 Fox v. Glasgow South Western Hospitals Board, 64
 Gardner v. Ferguson, 58
 Gerrard v. Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh NHS Trust, 60, 62, 63
 Gillespie v. Grampian Health Board, 65
 Goorkani v. Tayside Health Board, 62
 Gordon v. Wilson, 63
 Hayward v. Edinburgh Royal Infirmary Board of Management, 64
 Honisz v. Lothian Health Board, 62, 63
 Hunter v. Hanley, 12, 42, 60–2, 64, 66, 143
 Kay's Tutor v. Ayrshire and Arran Health Board, 64
 Kelly v. Sir Frank Mears and Partners, 65
 Kenyon v. Bell, 60, 64
 Lavelle v. Glasgow Royal Infirmary, 38, 64
 Littlejohn v. Ayrshire and Arran Health Board, 65
 Macdonald v. Glasgow Western Hospitals Board of Management, 64
 McFarlane v. Tayside Health Board (Scottish case applied in English law), 17, 35, 39–41, 64
 McGhee v. National Coal Board, 47, 48, 64, 65
 Morris v. Caithness Hospitals, 64
 Moyes v. Lothian Health Board, 61, 62
 Muir v. Grampian Health Board, 61, 62
 Murray v. Lanarkshire Acute Hospitals NHS Trust, 64

- Scottish case law (*cont.*)
- Phillips v. Grampian Health Board*, 62
 - Purves v. Landell*, 59
 - Reidford v. Magistrates of Aberdeen*, 38
 - Simpson v. Allan*, 59
 - Toner v. McLeod*, 64
 - Urquhart v. Grigor*, 59
 - Wardlaw v. Bonnington Castings Ltd*, 64
- Scottish statute law
- National Health Service (Scotland) Act 1947, 54
 - National Health Service (Scotland) Act 1978, 54
 - Scotland Act 1998, 54
- self-regulation of medical profession.
- See* codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies
- services liability in EU, 14, 22
- Shifts in Compensation project, 2–3
- Sieburgh, C. H., 154–6
- social security regimes
- in Austria, 110–11
 - England and Wales, NHS (National Health Service) in, 4, 30–1
 - Scotland, NHSIS (National Health Service in Scotland) in, 4, 54–6
- Sorn, Lord, 59
- Spain, 160–1
- administrative law in, 160, 164, 169, 181
 - causation in, 164, 178–80, 186
 - Civil Code
 - private health system cases governed by contract law of, 170
 - responsible parties in, 181
 - vicarious liability in, 164
 - codes of conduct and disciplinary bodies in, 171
 - contract law in, 162, 170, 173–4, 176, 181, 187
 - criminal liability in, 5, 11, 161, 163, 167, 170
 - damages in, 181–4
 - disproportionate harm, doctrine of, 177, 179, 186
 - documentation, importance of, 173
 - dynamic distribution of the proof, doctrine of, 178, 186
 - exemption/exclusion clauses in, 184
 - fault liability in, 162, 164, 170, 176–8, 186
 - French influence in, 174
 - historical background to medical liability in, 8, 161–8
 - case law, 161–5, 185
 - legal literature, 165–8, 185
 - hospitals in, 4, 164, 168, 181
 - increase in medical liability claims in, 160, 164, 169, 186
 - informed consent in, 163, 166, 167, 175, 177, 179–80, 182–3, 186
 - joint liability in, 181
 - loss of chance doctrine in, 182
 - medical liability insurance in, 184–5
 - negligence in, 161, 164
 - no-fault compensation fund in, 184–5, 187
 - patients' rights in, 172–3
 - personal liability in, 181
 - privacy/confidentiality, patient right of, 173
 - proof of medical liability in, 14, 176–8, 186
 - public versus private health systems and legal coverage in, 4, 5, 160, 164, 168, 169–70
 - res ipsa loquitur* (prima facie negligence), influence of, 186
 - responsible parties in, 180–1
 - standard of care in, 11, 174–5, 186
 - statistical information regarding, 168–9
 - strict liability in, 170, 176, 178, 181, 186
 - tort law in, 161, 170, 173–4, 176, 178, 181, 187
 - vicarious liability in, 164, 169, 181
 - wrongful life/wrongful birth, 169, 179, 183

- Spanish statute law
Ley 50/1980 (Insurance Contract Act), 184
Ley 14/1986 (General Law of Health), 171, 172
Ley 30/1992 (Administrative Law), 165, 169, 181
Ley 9/1993, 184
Ley 29/1998, 170
Ley 4/1999, 169
Ley 41/2002, 172–3
Ley 44/2003 (Regulation of Health Professionals), 171, 184
 Civil Procedure Law, 174, 178
 General Consumers Protection Act, 170, 178
- Spier, Jaap, 9
- splitting liability in Austria, 125–6
- standard of care, 11–14
 comparative law on, 13, 144
 in England and Wales, 11, 34–47
 evolution of, 25
 in France, 11, 13
 institutional, 13, 37–8
 in Netherlands, 12, 13, 141–5
 in Scotland, 12, 61–3
 small jurisdictions and, 12–13, 143–4
 in Spain, 11, 174–5, 186
- Starck, B., 85
- Steyn, Lord, 40, 41
- Strategic Health Authorities in UK, 30–1, 32
- strict liability
 in France (*See under* France)
 in Spain, 170, 176, 178, 181, 186
- Swain, Warren, 27
- Sweden
 claim rate, 3
 patient insurance in (*See* Nordic patient insurance scheme)
- Switzerland, institutional standard of care in, 14, 145
- Taylor, Simon, 70
- technological change and medical liability, 23
- Tindal CJ, 37
- tort law, 6–7
 in Austria, 113
 in England and Wales, 6, 7, 37
 in France, 6, 71, 73, 78, 79
 in Netherlands, 6, 25, 134–6, 137
 in Scotland, 57–62
 in Spain, 161, 170, 173–4, 176, 178, 181, 187
- Trigo García, Belén, 160
- Ulpian, 58
- United Kingdom. *See* England and Wales; Scotland
- United States
 contract versus tort law, 51
 discovery in, 14
 early development of medical negligence law in, 1, 8
 English rise in medical liability claims compared to, 28
 French critique of litigation culture of, 92
 informed consent, American origins of, 138
 legislative proposals to manage medical liability in, 9
 licensing of physicians in, 33
 market share liability, concept of, 149
 Netherlands not influenced by, 136
 Patient Safety and Quality Improvement Act of 2004, 10
 reporting requirements in, 10
Sindell v. Abbott Laboratories, 149
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1948, 87
- Van Gerven, Walter, 17, 148
- vicarious liability
 in Austria, 113, 126–8
 in England and Wales, 37–8
 in France, 72–3
 in Scotland, 64
 in Spain, 164, 169, 181
- Viney, Geneviève, 6, 85
- virtual fault, 82

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-47582-3 - The Development Of Medical Liability: Volume 3

Edited by Ewoud Hondius

Index

[More information](#)

220

INDEX

- Whitty, Niall R., 54
 WHO (World Health Organization),
 23
 Willcock, John, 37
 Winiger, B., 2
 Wissink, M. H., 154
 Woolf, Lord, 28, 29, 45
 World Health Organization (WHO), 23
 wrongful life/wrongful birth
 abortion and, 147, 154, 155
 changes wrought to medical liability
 concepts by, 25
 damages in, 16–18, 146–56
 DES (diethylstilbestrol) cases,
 148–53
 in England and Wales, 18, 38–42
 EU harmonisation, feasibility of,
 21–2
 in France, 17, 21, 104
 in the Netherlands, 16–17, 22,
 146–56
 Oviedo Convention on Human
 Rights and Biomedicine, 154–6
 public policy issues, 39
 in Scotland, 64
 in Spain, 169, 179, 183
 wrongfulness as medical liability
 concept in Austria, 117–18
 Zimmermann, R., 2