

# THE DEVELOPMENT OF LIABILITY IN RELATION TO TECHNOLOGICAL CHANGE

Technological developments posed a challenge to the established law, especially tort law, at approximately the same time across Europe. This book focuses on the similarity and diversity of responses to such developments in different jurisdictions. Three examples have been studied in depth: the escape of sparks from steam engines in the middle of the nineteenth century; exploding boilers in the latter part of the nineteenth century; and asbestos-related industrial disease in the middle and late twentieth century. The book shows how the rules of tort law were used and adapted and demonstrates how other systems of regulation and compensation were introduced to prevent injuries or to provide compensation to victims outside tort law. The relatively marginal role of tort law in these areas reveals much about legal development in general.

MIQUEL MARTÍN-CASALS is Professor of Civil Law at the University of Girona.



# COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE LAW OF TORTS IN EUROPE

Series editors John Bell and David Ibbetson



# THE DEVELOPMENT OF LIABILITY IN RELATION TO TECHNOLOGICAL CHANGE

Volume 4

Edited by MIQUEL MARTÍN-CASALS





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521199537

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010 First paperback edition 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The development of liability in relation to technological change / edited by

Miquel Martín-Casals.

p. cm. – (European legal development series) Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-521-11679-4 (hardback) 1. Liability (Law)-Europe.

- 2. Technological innovations-Law and legislation-Europe.
  - 3. Technological innovations. 4. Technology and law.
  - I. Martín-Casals, M. (Miquel) II. Title. III. Series.

KJC1663.D48 2010 346.403-dc22 2009026028

ISBN 978-0-521-11679-4 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-47580-9 Paperback

Hardback only available as: ISBN 978-0-521-19953-7 6-volume set

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### CONTENTS

Series Editors' Preface page vii List of Abbreviations x

- Technological Change and the Development of Liability for Fault: A General Introduction 1
   MIQUEL MARTÍN-CASALS
- 2 Technological Change and the Development of Liability for Fault in England and Wales 40 JONATHAN MORGAN
- Technological Change and the Development of Liability for Fault in France
   YVONNE SALMON
- 4 Technological Change and the Development of Liability for Fault in Germany 134 JENS M. SCHERPE
- Technological Change and the Development of Liability for Fault in Italy 185
   CHIARA FAVILLI
- 6 Technological Change and the Development of Liability for Fault in Spain 227 MIQUEL MARTÍN-CASALS AND JORDI RIBOT

Appendix: Main Code Provisions Cited 264 Index 271

# CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-47580-9 - The Development Of Liability In Relation To Technological Change: Volume 4 Edited by Miquel Martín-casals Frontmatter More information



## SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

The European Legal Development series has arisen from a project funded by the AHRC from January 2005 until February 2008.

The aim of the project as a whole is to examine the nature of legal development in Western Europe since 1850, focusing sharply on liability for fault. Behind this there is a more abstract purpose, to attempt to cast some light on the factors which have influenced the way in which the law has changed over this period. Legal historians have looked at the general question, usually focusing on the rather facile distinction between the English common law and continental European legal systems. Though rooted in the sources, these works have been marred by a somewhat unsophisticated methodology and an inevitably selective use of evidence. Comparative lawyers have developed far more sophisticated methodologies, but their theoretical perspectives have too often borne little relation to empirical data. Over the last twenty years, tort lawyers have looked at the same types of question; but their analysis has invariably been at a high level of generality and has rarely looked at the historical components. By bringing together experts with different disciplinary backgrounds – comparative lawyers and legal historians, all with an understanding of modern tort law in their own systems - and getting them to work collaboratively, we have aimed to produce a more nuanced comparative legal history, and one which is theoretically better informed.

The topic of legal development is broad and, to make it manageable, we have undertaken a programme of work which has built up from a number of case studies and has moved towards a more general analysis and conclusions. Although we have been concerned with the development of the law, and although many of those involved in the project have been lawyers, we have also been concerned to include and benefit from the insights of historians and scholars in other disciplines.

Liability for fault between 1850 to 2000 has been our major area of study. Around 1850, there were many similarities in approaches to liability for fault across the legal systems of Western Europe. But since then, there

vii



More information

## viii SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

has been significant divergence. Our method has been first to chart the changes and then to seek the explanations for what happened. Although there have been many changes in tort and delict laws over the period, the idea of liability for fault remains central to private law approaches to the compensation of victims of harms caused by the actions of others.

As a first stage, the project worked on six case studies which illustrate the general theme of liability for fault and its development within the period:

- product liability;
- legal doctrine;
- · medical liability;
- relations between neighbours;
- technological change;
- traffic and railways.

This research involved scholars from a range of countries, in particular, England and Scotland, Spain, the Netherlands, Germany, France, Sweden, Austria and Italy. Each working group drew on the expertise of both senior and more junior scholars familiar with different European legal systems, and contained a mixture of comparative lawyers and legal historians.

A second stage has involved further groups examining a number of salient factors in legal development. The topics covered in this stage are:

- institutions and professions;
- social and political ideas;
- the economy (including the impact of insurance).

A final strand to the work is an overview book.

This book, edited by Miquel Martín-Casals, provides us with a good example of the benefits of this approach. We gain a clear insight into the way in which established principles of tort engaged with the problems thrown up by new technologies. We see the way in which regulatory law, private insurance and state-run compensation schemes developed to deal with the issues the law now confronted. Regulatory law and inspections by officials and private insurers and associations dealt with many of the issues of preventing accidents. Compensation systems outside tort offered remedies to many of the victims of accidents. In this matrix of legal interventions, we can see that the place of tort law and of fault in particular changes. We become aware of its limitations. The factors for legal



## SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

ix

development identified in this book are ones which will be developed in later volumes.

Particularly in relation to this book, the editors are grateful to the contribution of Matthew Dyson McGrath, Ph.D student on the AHRC project, who made a significant contribution to the formulation, discussion and execution of this part of the project. His own work on the relationship of criminal and civil fault will be published separately and will complement significantly the understanding of this area presented in this book.

> John Bell David Ibbetson



Frontmatter More information

## ABBREVIATIONS

AcP Archiv für die civilistische Praxis

AiB Arbeitsrecht im Betrieb

AJDA Actualité Juridique Droit Administratif

App. Corte di appello (Italy)

Arch. Circolaz. Archivio giuridico della circolazione e dei sinistri stradali

ARP Aranzadi Penal AS Aranzadi Social

BGB Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch BGBl. Bundesgesetzblatt

BGHZ Entscheidungen des Bundesgerichtshofes in Zivilsachen

BOCG Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales

BOE Boletín Oficial del Estado

Bull. Civ. Bulletin de la Cour de cassation, civil

BVerfG Bundesverfassungsgericht
Cass. (Fr.) Cour de cassation
Cass. (It.) Corte di cassazione

Cass. civ Cour de cassation, chambre civile
Cass. com. Cour de cassation, chambre commerciale
Cass. Pen. Corte di cassazione, sezione penale
Cass. Unica Corte di cassazione, sezione unica

CC Código Civil
c.c. Codice civile
C civ. Code civil

C.E. (Ass.) Conseil d'Etat (Assemblé plénière)

chr. Chronique

Cons. Stato
Consiglio dello Stato
Corte cost.
CP
Codigo Penal
c.p.
Codice penale

CPA Comité permanent amiante C séc. soc. Code de la sécurité sociale

D. Receuil Dalloz



Cambridge University Press

Danno e resp. D.A.

D.C.

D.P.

978-1-107-47580-9 - The Development Of Liability In Relation To Technological Change: Volume 4 Edited by Miguel Martín-casals

Frontmatter

More information

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Danno e responsabilità Receuil Dalloz Analytique Receuil Dalloz Critique

D.H. Receuil Dalloz Hebdomadaire Dig. It. Novissimo Digesto Italiano D. Lgs. Decreto legislativo D.M. Decreto Ministeriale

Receuil Dalloz Périodique D.P.R. Decreto Presidente della Repubblica **EGBGB** Einführungsgesetz zum BGB Enc. Dir. Enciclopedia del Diritto Enc. Giur Enciclopedia Giuridica Treccani ERPLEuropean Review of Private Law

EVBl. Evidenzblatt der Rechtsmittelentscheidung

Ferrovie Italiane Ferr. Ital

Fonds d'indemnisation des victimes de l'amiante **FIVA** 

Foro it. Foro italiano Foro sic. Foro siciliano

FS Azierda Autonoma delle Ferrovie dello Stato

Gaz. Pal. Gazette du Palais Gaz. Trib. Gazette des Tribunaux GewO Gewerbeordnung

Giur. Cost. Giurisprudenza costituzionale Giur. It. Giurisprudenza italiana Giur. Sic. Giurisprudenza siciliana

Giustizia civile Giust. Civ. Harvard Law Review Harv. LR

**HVBG** Hauptverband der gewerblichen Berufsgenossenschaften

> with C. Drechsel-Schlund, M. Butz, G.Drexel, W. Plinske and H.-P. Francks, Asbestverursachte Berufskrankheiten in Deutschland - Entstehung und Prognose (Sankt Augustin,

2003)

**INAIL** National Institute of Insurance for Occupational Accidents

and Disease

**INSERM** Institut national de la santé et de la recherche médicale **JCP** Juris-Classeur Périodique, la Semaine Juridique

I Econ. Hist. Journal of Economic History

Journal Officiel J.O.

J.O. (Doc.) Journal Officiel (Documents)

JUR Jurisprudencia

Lav. giuri. Lavoro giurisprudenziale

Leb. Receuil Lebon хi



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-47580-9 - The Development Of Liability In Relation To Technological Change: Volume 4 Edited by Miquel Martín-casals

Frontmatter

More information

XII LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

MDR Monatschrift für Deutsches Recht

Monit. Trib. Monitore dei Tribunali

MSUA Manchester Steam Users' Association
NJW Neue Juristische Wochenschrift

NJWE-MietR Neue Juristische Wochenschrift - Entscheidungen

Mietrecht

OAG oberappellationsgericht

OHofG Oberhofgericht

O.J. Official Journal of the European Communities

OLG Oberlandesgericht

Or. Giur. Lav. Orientamenti della giurisprudenza del lavoro

Parl. Deb. Hansard, Parliamentary Debates

PGE Preußisches Gesetz über die Eisenbahnunternehmungen

Pret. Pretore (tribunale del)
Rass. dir. civ., Rassegna di diritto civile

R.D. Reale Decreto

Rec. pér. assur.Recueil périodique des assurancesRENFERed nacional de ferrocarriles españolesReq.Cour de cassation, chambre des requêtes

Resp. civ. et assur.Responsabilité civile et assurancesResp. Civ. Prev.Responsabilità civile e previdenzaRev. trim.Revue trimestrielle de droit civil

RGBl. Reichsgesetzblatt

RGEE Reichsgericht, Eisenbahn- und Verkehrsrechtliche

Entscheidungen und Abhandlungen

RGZ Entscheidungen des Reichsgerichts in Zivilsachen

RHPflG Reichhaftpflichtgesetz

Riv. Crit. Dir. lav. Rivistà critica

Riv. Dir. Lav. Rivistà del diritto del lavoro Riv. Dir. Pubb. Rivistà del diritto pubblico

Riv. Inf. Mal. Prof. Rivistà degli infortuni e delle malattie professionali Riv. It. Dir. Proc. Pen Rivistà italiana del diritto e della procedura penale

RJ Repertorio de Jurisprudencia

ROGE Reichs-Oberhandelsgericht, Entscheidungen des Reichs-

Oberhandelsgerichts

S. Recueil Sirey

SAP Sentencias Audiencias Provinciales

sez. Sezione somm. sommaire

STS Sentencias Tribunal Supremo

STSJ Sentencias Tribunales Superiores de Justicia SU Sezioni uniti (of the Corte di cassazione)



Frontmatter More information

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xiii

TA Tribunal administratif

Temi rom.Temi romaniTrib.TribunaleTrib. civ.Tribunal civil

Trib. com. Tribunal commercial
UVG Unfallversicherungsgesetz
VersR Versicherungsrecht

WuM Wohnungswirtschaft und Mietrecht

ZMR Zeitschrift Mietrecht