## THE DEVELOPMENT AND MAKING OF LEGAL DOCTRINE

This detailed description and comparative analysis of the development of tort law in Europe over the last 150 years is based on national reports that are structured by a basic questionnaire. The national reports are complemented by a comparative analysis of the parallel, though often diverging, developments in the different legal systems. It can clearly be seen that different groups in the legal systems, such as judges and scholars, often had diverging views on tort law that were translated into more specific doctrinal and evaluative statements. Accompanied by a general expansion of liability due to changing perceptions of the risks of accidents, the former Roman law of delict and the medieval law of torts have been transformed into modern rules of extra-contractual liability that are deeply entrenched in the social security and insurance systems.

PROFESSOR NILS JANSEN currently serves on the Law Faculty of the University of Münster, Germany, where he holds the Chair for Roman Law, Legal History, German and European Private Law.

#### COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE LAW OF TORTS IN EUROPE

*Series editors* John Bell and David Ibbetson Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-47579-3 - The Development and Making of Legal Doctrine: Volume 6 Nils Jansen Frontmatter More information

# THE DEVELOPMENT AND MAKING OF LEGAL DOCTRINE

Volume 6

NILS JANSEN



#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521199537

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

> First published 2010 First paperback edition 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-19412-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-47579-3 Paperback

Hardback only available as: ISBN 978-0-521-19953-7 6-volume set

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

### CONTENTS

Series editors' preface	page vii
Preface x	
List of abbreviations	xi

- 1 The development of legal doctrine in Europe: extracontractual liability for fault 1 NILS JANSEN
- 2 The tort of negligence in England 46 DAVID IBBETSON
- 3 French doctrinal writing 73 JEAN-LOUIS HALPÉRIN
- 4 Developing legal doctrine: fault in the German law of delict 96 NILS JANSEN
- Liability for fault in Italian law: the development of legal doctrine from 1865 to the end of the twentieth century 126
  MICHELE GRAZIADEI
- 6 Fault in legal doctrine in the Netherlands 164 ANTOINE HOL
- 7 The development of legal doctrine on fault in Spanish tort law 183 MIQUEL MARTÍN-CASALS AND ALBERT RUDA

vi

#### CONTENTS

 8 Scandinavian exceptionalism: the development of modern Swedish tort law 212
KJELL Å MODÉER

Appendix: main code provisions cited223Index229

## SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

The European Legal Development series has arisen from a project funded by the AHRC from January 2005 until February 2008.

The aim of the project as a whole was to examine the nature of legal development in western Europe since 1850, focusing sharply on liability for fault. Behind this there is a more abstract purpose, to attempt to cast some light on the factors which have influenced the way in which the law has changed over this period. Legal historians have looked at the general question, usually focusing on the rather facile distinction between the English common law and continental European legal systems. Though rooted in the sources, these works have been marred by a somewhat unsophisticated methodology and an inevitably selective use of evidence. Comparative lawyers have developed far more sophisticated methodologies, but their theoretical perspectives have too often borne little relation to empirical data. Over the last twenty years, tort lawyers have looked at the same types of question, but their analysis has invariably been at a high level of generality and has rarely looked at the historical component. By bringing together experts with different disciplinary backgrounds comparative lawyers and legal historians, all with an understanding of modern tort law in their own systems - and getting them to work collaboratively, we have aimed to produce a more nuanced comparative legal history, and one which is theoretically better informed.

The topic of legal development is broad and, to make it manageable, we have undertaken a programme of work which has built up from a number of case studies and has moved towards a more general analysis and conclusions. Although we have been concerned with the development of the law, and although many of those involved in the project have been lawyers, we have also been concerned to include and benefit from the insights of historians and scholars in other disciplines.

Liability for fault between the years 1850 and 2000 has been our major area of study. Around 1850, there were many similarities in approaches to liability for fault across the legal systems of western Europe. But since then, viii

#### SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

there has been significant divergence. Our method has first been to chart the changes and then to seek explanations for what happened. Although there have been many changes in tort and delict laws over the period, the idea of liability for fault remains central to private law approaches to the compensation of victims of harms caused by the actions of others.

As a first stage, the project worked on six case studies which illustrate the general theme of liability for fault and its development within the period:

product liability, legal doctrine, medical liability, relations between neighbours, technological change and traffic and railways.

This research involved scholars from a range of countries, particularly England and Scotland, Spain, the Netherlands, Germany, France, Sweden, Austria and Italy. Each working group drew on the expertise of both senior and more junior scholars familiar with different European legal systems, and contained a mixture of comparative lawyers and legal historians.

A second stage has involved further groups examining a number of salient factors in legal development. The topics covered in this stage are:

institutions and professions, social and political ideas and the economy (including the impact of insurance). A final strand to the work is an overview book.

This book, edited by Nils Jansen, constitutes the essential backbone to the project. Although the primary assumption on which the project is based is that legal change cannot be properly understood simply by examining doctrinal developments in a vacuum, it is a reasonable supposition that legal ideas, whether evidenced by scholarly writing or by judicial decisions, do have a part to play in the orchestration of the wider changes which are being examined. The book builds on previous work on the subject, some of it by contributors to this volume, but is shaped by the initial questionnaire produced by the editor so as sharply to point up the abstractions underlying the doctrinal changes. However, although addressing the top-ics in the questionnaire, contributors were given latitude to do so in the ways which seemed to them more appropriate to their own legal systems.

#### SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

ix

The editors are grateful for the contribution of Matthew Dyson and Colm McGrath, PhD students on the AHRC project, who made many contributions to the discussion and execution of the project.

> John Bell David Ibbetson

#### PREFACE

Writing a preface to a book is often a difficult task because usually many people helped, none of whom must be forgotten. In this case, however, the task is rather easy. I wish to express my gratitude first of all to David Ibbetson. Together with John Bell, he initiated the overall Legal Development Project; he was also a formidable host for all the splendid conferences at the University of Cambridge that led to this volume. There, the contributors to this volume were given the opportunity to discuss the comparative approach, the list of questions and important matters of substance in a very constructive and stimulating way. These were great occasions, where we all learned a great deal.

Moreover, together with his assistants, David Ibbetson assumed most of the editorial work. Thus, all the contributions have been languagechecked in Cambridge. In Münster, Lea Faissner, Lukas Kämper, Lukas Rademacher, Kristin Vorbeck and Sarah Woyciechowski provided invaluable assistance. I am extremely grateful for all their support and help.

Nils Jansen

## ABBREVIATIONS

ABGB	Allgemeines Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch
AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases
AcP	Archiv für die civilistische Praxis
Ad & El	Adolphus & Ellis' Reports
ADC	Anuario de Derecho Civil
ALR	Allgemeines Landrecht für die Preußischen Staaten
App Cas	Appeal Cases
B & S	Best & Smith's Reports
BayVBl	Bayerische Verwaltungsblätter
BGB	Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch
BGHZ	Entscheidungen des Bundesgerichtshofes in Zivilsachen
Bing (NC)	Bingham's New Cases, Common Pleas
BJA	Boletín Jurídico-Administrativo, Apéndice al Diccionario
	de la Administratión Español
BOE	Boletín del Estado
BVerfGE	Entscheidungen des Bundesverfassungsgerichts
C & P	Carrington & Payne's Reports
cap.	caput
Cass.(civ.)	Cour de cassation (chambre civile); Corte di cassazione
	(sezione civile)
Cass.ass.plén.	Cour de cassation, assemblée plénière
Cass.crim.	Cour de cassation, chambre criminelle
Cass.ch.réun.	Cour de cassation, chambres réunites
Cass.ch.mixte	Cour de cassation, chambre mixte
Cass.Pen.	Corte di Cassazione Penale
Cass.Sez.Un.	Corte di Cassazione, Sezioni Unite
CBNS	Common Bench Reports, New Series
CC	Code civil; Codice civile; Código Civil
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports
Col. Leg.	Colección Legislativa de España, Jurisprudencia Civil
Corte Cost.	Corte Costituzionale
СР	Law Reports, Common Pleas
CPD	Law Reports, Common Pleas Division

CAMBRIDGE

xii	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
D	Receuil Dalloz
 D.	Digesta
Dalloz, <i>Répertoire</i>	D. Dalloz, Répertoire méthodique et alphabétique de
,	législation, de doctrine et de jurisprudence (Paris: Bureau
	de la Jurisprudence générale du royaume, 1858)
disp.	disputatio
Dods	Dodson's Admiralty Reports
DOGC	Diari Oficial de la Generalitat de Catalunya
DP	Receuil Dalloz Périodique
dub.	dubitatio
East	East's Term Reports, King's Bench
El & Bl	Ellis & Blackburn's Queen's Bench Reports
ER	The English Reports
Enc. Dir.	Enciclopedia del Diritto
Ex	Law Reports Exchequer
Ex D	Exchequer Division
exerc.	exercitatio
F & F	Foster & Finlayson's Reports
García Goyena	F. García Goyena, Concordancias, Motivos y
	Comentarios del Código Civil Español (Madrid: Imprenta
	de la Sociedad Tipográfico-Editorial, 1852), quoted
	from the edition directed by J.L. Lacruz Berdejo
	(Zaragoza: Universidad de Zaragoza, Cátedra de Derecho
	Civil, 1974).
GrünhZ	Zeitschrift für das Privat- und Öffentliche Recht der
	Gegenwart
H & C	Hurlstone & Coltman's Exchequer Reports
H & N	Hurlstone & Norman's Exchequer Reports
HKK	Historisch-Kritischer Kommentar zum BGB
	(Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2003/07)
HL	House of Lords
HLC	Clarke's House of Lords Cases
Hob	Hobart's Common Pleas Reports
HR	Hoge Raad
Inst.	Institutiones Iustiniani
Int. R. Law & Ec.	International Review of Law and Economics
Jansen, Haftungsrecht	N. Jansen, Die Struktur des Haftungsrechts
_	(Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2003)
JBl	Juristische Blätter
JhJb	Jahrbücher für die Dogmatik des Heutigen Römischen und
	Deutschen Rechts (Jhering-Jahrbuch)

CAMBRIDGE

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

			٠
Y	1	1	1
Λ.	L	r	T

JZ	Juristenzeitung
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench
Larenz/Canaris	K. Larenz and CW. Canaris, Lehrbuch des Schuldrechts, 13th ed
	(Munich: Beck, 1994)
LG	Landesgericht
lib.	liber
liv.	livre
LQR	Law Quarterly Review
LR	Law Reports
K & J	Kay & Johnson's Vice Chancellor's Reports
M & W	Meeson & Welsby's Exchequer Reports
Macq	Macqueen's Scotch Appeal Cases
MDR	Monatsschrift für deutsches Recht
МӥКо	Münchener Kommentar zum BGB, 3rd ed. (Munich: Beck,
	1993 ff.); 4th ed. (Munich: Beck, 2001 ff.)
n.	number; margin number; note
N & M	Nott & M'Cord's Reports
NJ	Nederlandse Jurisprudentie
NJB	Nederlands Juristenblad
NJW	Neue Juristische Wochenschrift
OLG	Oberlandesgericht
OJLS	Oxford Journal of Legal Studies
Р.	Las Siete Partidas
PD	Probate Division
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench
QBD	Queen's Bench Division
R	Rettie's Session Cases
RabelsZ	Rabels Zeitschrift für ausländisches und internationales
	Privatrecht
RDM	Revista de Derecho Mercantil
RDP	Revista de Derecho Privado
Req.	Cour de cassation, chambre des requêtes
RGD	Revista General de Derecho
RGLJ	Revista General de Legislación y Jurisprudencia
RGRK	Reichsgerichtsräte-Kommentar BGB, 12th ed. (Berlin:
	De Gruyter, 1976 ff.)
RGZ	Entscheidungen des Reichsgerichts in Zivilsachen
RJ	Repertorio de Jurisprudencia Aranzadi
RM	Rechtsgeleerd Magazijn
<i>S</i> .	Recueil Sirey
SC	Session Cases

CAMBRIDGE

xiv	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
sect.	sectio
SeuffA	M. J. A. Seuffert's Archiv für Entscheidungen der ober-
	sten Gerichte in den deutschen Staaten
SFS	Svensk Författningssamling
SSTS	Sentencias del Tribunal Supremo
STS	Sentencia del Tribunal Supremo
tit.	titulus
TR	Dunford & East's Term Reports, King's Bench
tract.	tractatus
US	United States Reports
VersR	Versicherungsrecht
W	Weekblad van het Recht
WLR	Weekly Law Reports
WPNR	Weekblad voor Privatrecht, Notariaat en Registratie
Zimmermann, Obligations	R. Zimmermann, The Law of Obligations:
	Roman Foundations of the Civilian Tradition
	(Cape Town: Juta, 1990)
ZSS (germ.)	Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte
	(germanistische Abteilung)
ZSS (rom.)	Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte
	(romanistische Abteilung)
ZVersWiss	Zeitschrift für die Gesamte Versicherungswissenschaft