

## INDEX

- abnormal disturbance or use  
 in French law, 71  
 in German law, 91–4  
 Scotland  
   conduct causing special risk of  
   abnormal damage, 151  
   non-natural/dangerous users in,  
   145–8  
 in Spanish law, 186–7
- abnormal sensitivity on part of  
 claimant  
 in English and Welsh law, 36  
 in French law, 74
- abuse of rights  
*abus de droit* in France (*See under*  
 France)  
 in Dutch law, 110, 112–14, 129  
 Scottish nuisance as, 157, 171  
 in Spain, 185–6, 193
- actio negatoria*  
 in Catalan law, 197  
 in German law  
   abnormal/unusual use of land,  
   91–4, 187–8  
   administrative rules and, 94–100  
   concept of, 89–91, 106  
 in Spain, 188, 193–5, 197, 202
- administrative law  
 England and Wales, public land  
   use regulation in (*See under*  
   England and Wales)  
 France, public land use regulation in  
   (*See under* France)  
 in Germany, 88, 94–100, 105  
 Netherlands, industrial licensing  
   in (*See under* Netherlands,  
   nuisance law in)
- in Scotland, 27, 161–70, 171  
 in Spain, 198–200
- aemulatio vicini*, 16, 135–6, 138, 170,  
 184–5
- Alfonso X the Wise, 177
- animals  
   Dutch law on noise caused by, 121  
   Scottish law on trespass usually  
   involving, 160
- Aquinas, Thomas, 5
- Aristo, 2, 89, 106
- Aristotle, 5–6, 173
- Assize of *novel disseisin* (England and  
 Wales), 31
- Assize of Nuisance (England and  
 Wales), 31
- Atkin, Lord, 38, 39
- Aubry, C., 69, 70
- Baldus de Ubaldis, 4, 184
- Bartolus of Saxoferato, 4, 8, 9, 89–90,  
 184
- Beckwith, Silas, 19
- Bell, S., 50, 52, 156, 157
- Blackburn J, 37
- Blackburn, Lord, 22, 33, 62
- Blackhall, J. Cameron, 58
- Blackstone, W., 3, 137
- Bonfante, P., 188
- Broun, J. C. C., 142, 144, 158
- Brugi, 188
- Buckley, R. A., 49
- Caepolla, Bartolomeo, 90
- Cairns, Lord, 22, 37
- Cameron, Gordon, 16, 132
- Carbonnier, Jean, 69

- case law (*See also* entries for individual countries, e.g. Scottish case law, for specific cases)  
*abus de droit* and *troubles de voisinage* in France as judge-made case law, 68, 69–71  
 Civil Code on nuisance in Spain supplemented by commentators and case law, 181, 201  
 Castro, Federico de, 200  
 Catalan law on nuisance, 183, 188, 196–7  
 Cerellius Vitalis, 2  
*Cino dei Sinibuldi*, 184  
 Civil Code. *See also under* France; Netherlands, nuisance law in; Spain, nuisance law in  
 Germany, French influence on, 7, 92  
 collective actions in Netherlands, 123, 129–31  
 commutative justice underlying Roman law on fault, 6  
 compensation. *See* remedies  
 conceptualist approach to law, eventual abandonment of, 70, 71  
 constitution in Germany allowing public land use regulation, 26  
 Continental law on neighbour liability in France (*See* France)  
 in Germany (*See* Germany)  
 historical background, pre-19th century, 2–7  
 medieval and early modern explications of Roman law, 3–5  
 in Netherlands (*See* Netherlands; nuisance law in)  
 Roman law (*See* Roman law)  
 in Spain (*See* Spain; nuisance law in)  
 Cooke, Lord, 46  
 Cooper, Lord President, 15, 139, 147, 155  
 court cases. *See* case law, and entries for specific countries, e.g. Scottish case law  
*abus de droit* and *troubles de voisinage* in France as judge-made case law, 68, 69–71  
 Civil Code on nuisance in Spain supplemented by commentators and case law, 181, 201  
 cultural basis for legal differences, 1, 24–5, 28  
 Dalrymple, James, Viscount Stair, 152, 159  
 damages. *See* remedies  
*damnum iniuria datum*, 152  
 dangerous activities. *See* unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious activities, laws banning  
 defences  
 England and Wales, defence of statutory authority to permit common-law nuisances in, 29, 30, 61–3  
 Netherlands, licensing of industrial projects in (*See under* Netherlands, nuisance law in)  
 Scotland, public good defence against nuisance in, 140  
 Spain, licensing in, 199  
 delict law *See also* tort and neighbour liability  
 in Germany, 87–8, 103–4  
 in Netherlands, 110  
 in Scotland, 158–60  
 Demolombe, C., 70  
 denial damages in Germany, 88, 90, 100  
 Denning, Lord, 32, 49  
 disturbances between neighbours. *See* neighbour liability  
 Domat, Jean, 68, 69, 85  
 Dutch Indies (Indonesia), 128  
 Dutch law. *See* Netherlands, nuisance law in  
 Duxbury, R. M. C., 55  
 EC (European Community) directives, impact on English and Welsh law, 52, 54  
*Eingriff*, 187–8  
 England and Wales, 29–31, 63–4

- England and Wales (*cont.*)  
 abnormal sensitivity on part of claimant, 36  
 defence of statutory authority to permit common-law nuisances, 29, 30, 61–3  
 EC directives, impact of, 52, 54  
 escapes, doctrine of, 22–3, 29, 36–8  
 fault-based liability in tort, 29–30  
 assessment of current status, 44–6  
 concept of fault, 20–3  
 malice, relevance of, 35  
 movement towards, 38–44  
 natural rights in land, interference with, 46–50  
 nuisance and trespass not dependent on, 32–3  
 Industrial Revolution, effects of, 29–30, 47, 60  
 malice, relevance of, 35  
 natural rights in land, interference with, 46–50  
 negligence  
 introduction into nuisance claims, 38–44  
 natural rights to land, interference with, 47  
 not strictly required for nuisance or trespass claims, 33–5  
 nuisance  
 concept of, 14, 17–23  
 defence of statutory authority to permit common-law nuisances, 29, 30, 61–3  
 fault-based concerns, integration of, 38–44  
 foreseeability of, 43  
 private nuisance, 31–8  
 public nuisance, 46–50  
 Scottish law influenced by, 133, 137–8, 145, 148, 154, 170  
 statutory, 50–4  
 public land use regulation, 27, 54–61  
 Industrial Revolution, effects of, 60  
 by local administration, 56–9  
 local development plans, preparation of, 59–61  
 statute law on (*See under* English and Welsh statute law)  
 statutory regulation of nuisances, 29, 30, 50–4 (*See also* English and Welsh statute law, for specific statutes)  
 defence of statutory authority to permit common-law nuisances, 29, 30, 61–3  
 movement towards, 63–4  
 strict liability in, 14, 17–23, 24, 32–3  
 trespass, 31–8  
 types of tort remedies, 31–8  
 unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious activities, laws banning, 26, 29, 50–4  
 English and Welsh case law  
*Allan v. Gulf Oil Refining Ltd*, 62  
*Attorney-General v. PYA Quarries*, 49  
*Bliss v. Hall*, 34  
*Bradford (Mayor of) v. Pickles*, 19  
*Cambridge Water Co. v. Eastern Counties Leather plc*, 22, 39, 43, 44, 64  
*Charing Cross Electricity Supply Co. v. Hydraulic Power Co.*, 63  
*Christie v. Davey*, 19, 35  
*Dalton v. Henry Angus & Co.*, 47  
*Donoghue v. Stevenson*, 29, 38, 39, 47  
*Dunne v. North Western Gas Board*, 63  
*Geddis v. Proprietors of Bann Reservoir*, 62  
*Goldman v. Hargrave*, 41–2, 48  
*Green v. Chelsea Waterworks Co.*, 37  
*Holbeck Hall Hotel Ltd v. Scarborough BC*, 48  
*Hollywood Silver Fox Farm Ltd v. Emmett*, 19, 35  
*Hunter v. Canary Wharf Ltd*, 31, 45, 54, 55, 57  
*League Against Cruel Sports v. Scott*, 33  
*Leakey v. National Trust for Places of Historic Interest or Natural Beauty*, 40–2, 48

- Lippiatt v. South Gloucestershire CC*, 41
- Page Motors Ltd v. Epsom and Ewell BC*, 41
- Rapier v. London Tramways Co.*, 18, 34
- Ray v. Fairway Motors (Barnstaple) Ltd*, 47
- Read v. J. Lyons & Co. Ltd*, 22, 37, 154
- River Wear Commissioners v. Adamson*, 33
- Robinson v. Kilvert*, 36
- Rylands v. Fletcher*, 22–3, 29, 36–8, 39, 44–5, 61, 145, 148, 154
- Sedleigh-Denfield v. O’Callaghan*, 37, 39–43
- Southport Corp. v. Esso Petroleum Co. Ltd*, 49
- Southwark LBC v. Williams*, 32
- Transco plc v. Stockport MBC*, 44, 63
- The Wagon Mound (No. 2)*, 39, 43
- Weaver v. Ward*, 21
- English and Welsh statute law
- Alkali Act 1863, 52
  - Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003, 53
  - Clean Air Acts (1956, 1968, 1993), 30
  - Coal Mining Subsidence Act 1991, 53
  - Control of Pollution Act 1974, 52
  - Environment Act 1990, 64
  - Environment Act 1995, 52
  - Environmental Pollution Act 1990, 52
  - Government of Wales Acts 1998 and 2006, 59
  - Greater London Authority Act 1999, 59
  - Housing, Town Planning etc Act 1909, 27, 54, 59
  - Human Rights Act 1998, 30, 46
  - Noise Act 1996, 53
  - Nuisance Removal Acts 1855 and 1860, 29
  - Nuisance Removal and Disease Prevention Act 1848, 54
  - Party Wall etc Act 1996, 53
  - Planning and Compensation Act 1991, 60
  - Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004, 59
  - Public Health Acts (1848, 1875, 1936, 1990), 29, 51, 52, 54
  - Sanitary Act 1866, 52
  - Town and Country Planning Act 1947, 52, 55, 56, 58, 60
  - Town and Country Planning Act 1986, 60
  - Town and Country Planning Act 1990, 55, 56
  - Town and Country Planning Act 2004, 61
- escapes, doctrine of (*Rylands v. Fletcher*), 22–3, 29, 36–8
- European Community (EC) directives, impact on English and Welsh law, 52, 54
- European Convention on Human Rights, 84
- European Court of Human Rights, 203
- fault (*See also* malice; negligence)
- in Dutch law, 107
  - in English and Welsh law (*See under* England and Wales)
  - in French law, 65, 66
  - in German law, 87–8, 102, 103–4
  - lex Aquilia*, 2, 6, 7, 152, 193–5
  - non-negligent, nonintentional interference versus (*See* strict liability)
  - in Scottish law (*See under* Scotland, nuisance law in)
  - in Spanish law, 189–93, 201
- Fifoot, C. H. S., 20, 21
- foreseeability of nuisance
- in Dutch law, 112
  - in English and Welsh law, 43
- France, 65–6, 84–6
- abus de droit* and *troubles de voisinage*, 85
  - abnormal sensitivity on part of claimant, 74
  - Civil Code and, 66–8
  - current general rule on, 71–3
  - as judge-made case law in 19th century, 68, 69–71

- France (*cont.*)
- priority of interference in time, 74–5
  - public land use regulation
    - compared, 78–84
  - Spanish nuisance law influenced by, 185
  - types of interference for which relief is available, 73
  - unusual nature of disturbance, 71
  - will theory of property and, 69–71
- Civil Code
- abus de droit* and *troubles de voisinage* under, 66–8
  - Dutch Code and, 108
  - German Code and, 7
  - inadequacy for dealing with neighbour liability cases, 65–6
  - on servitudes, 77, 78
  - Spain influenced by, 175, 180, 181
  - strict liability under, 66–8
- conceptualist approach to law, eventual abandonment of, 70, 71
- fault, liability for, 65, 66
- German law, influence on, 7, 92
- nuisance
- Civil Code applied to, 67
  - Civil Code's lack of provision for, 65
  - types of *Immissionen/immissioni* for which relief is available, 73
- Pothier's theories incorporated into Civil Code, 7, 90
- public land use regulation, 27, 85
- abus de droit* and *troubles de voisinage* compared, 78–84
  - advantages of, 78
  - definiteness/indefiniteness problem, 80
  - local laws on, 76
  - national laws on, 76
  - origins of, 75
  - priority of interference in time, 75
  - servitudes for public utility and planning servitudes, 76–8, 82–4
  - servitudes, law of, 65, 76–8, 82–4
  - Spanish nuisance law influenced by
    - abnormal use or disturbance, 186
    - abuse of rights theory, 185
    - Civil Code, 175, 180, 181
    - strict liability in, 9, 24, 65, 66–8, 85
    - unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious activities, laws banning, 26, 75
- Fraser, Lord, 148–9, 153
- French statute law
- Buildings and Dwellings Code, 75, 80
  - Cornudet law (1919), 27, 75
  - Forest Code, 77
  - Imperial decree on dangerous or unhealthy activities (1810), 75
  - Law Concerning Liability (1898), 66
  - Mining Code, 77
  - Planning Code, 77, 83
  - public health law (1902), 75
  - Rural Code, 77
  - safe water supply, decree-law on (1852), 75
- Friedmann, W., 38
- Gabba, 188
- German statute law
- on air traffic, 96
  - building code (1987), 96
  - on environmental damages (*Umwelthaftungsgesetz*), 104, 105
  - federal law for protection against emissions (1974), 96
  - on gene technology, 96
  - Industrial Code for the North German Federation (1869), 95
  - on nuclear power plants, 96
  - Prussian General Land Law, 100
  - on traffic corporations, 96
- Germany, 87–9, 105–6
- actio negatoria*
    - abnormal/unusual use of land, 91–4, 187–8
    - administrative rules and, 94–100

- concept of, 89–91, 106  
 administrative law in, 88, 94–100, 105  
 Baldus de Ubaldis, popularity of, 4  
 Catalan law influenced by, 197  
 delict law in, 87–8, 103–4  
 denial damages, 88, 90, 100  
*Eingriff*, 187–8  
 fault liability in, 87–8, 102, 103–4  
 French influence on, 7, 92  
 health protections, 105  
*Immissionen* (nuisance) in  
   *actio negatoria*, concept of, 89–91  
   administrative law and, 97  
   ideal emissions, 105  
   usual/unusual *Immissionen*, 91–4  
 industrialisation in, 91–4, 106  
*ius commune*, concept of *actio negatoria* in, 89–91  
 privacy protections, 105  
 property basis of neighbour law in, 87–8, 106  
 public land use regulation, 26, 97  
 Roman law, influence of, 7–8, 89  
 strict liability in, 7–8, 24, 87, 106
- Giliker, Paula, 19, 29  
 Glück, Ch. F., 89  
 Goff, Lord, 43, 44, 54, 64  
 Gordley, James, 1, 65  
 Great London Exhibition (1851), 128  
 Grotius, Hugo, 6  
 Guthrie-Smith, 157
- harmful activities. *See* unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious activities, laws banning  
 health, dangers to. *See* unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious activities, laws banning  
 Hoffmann, Lord, 55  
 honour, *iniuria* viewed as protecting, 6  
 Hope, Lord President, 151, 154, 172  
 human rights  
   European Convention on Human Rights, 84  
   European Court of Human Rights, 203
- Human Rights Act 1998 (England and Wales), 30, 46  
 privacy protections  
   in Germany, 105  
   in Netherlands, 121  
 Spain, human rights approach to nuisance in, 202–3  
 Hume, Baron David, 14, 134–5  
 Hume, David (philosopher), 135
- Iacobus de Ravanis, 4  
 Ihering, Rudolph von, 8, 91, 187  
 illegality or unlawfulness  
   in Netherlands (*See under* Netherlands, nuisance law in)  
   nuisance in Scotland, 138, 141, 146  
*Immissionen* or *immissioni*. *See also* nuisance  
   in Germany (*See under* Germany)  
   *immissio* principle  
     in Scotland, 135–6, 170  
     in Spain, 187
- Indonesia (Dutch Indies), 128  
 industrialisation and urbanisation, 1, 24–5  
   in England and Wales, 29–30, 47, 60  
   in Germany, 91–4, 106  
   Netherlands, licensing rules in (*See under* Netherlands, nuisance law in)  
   public land use regulation and rise of, 27–8  
   in Scotland, 132–3, 161–2, 170  
   in Spain, 174–5, 180, 193, 204
- inferred fault in Scotland, 145, 148, 153  
 inhibitory actions in Spain, 194–5  
*iniuria*, 2, 6, 7, 152  
 injunctions  
   in Netherlands, 122–3  
   Spain, *interdictos* in, 195  
 intentional fault. *See* fault; malice  
 interdict  
   Scotland, as remedy for nuisance in, 140–1  
   Spain, *interdictos* in, 195  
 interference with neighbours. *See* neighbour liability

- Johnston, D., 135  
 Jolowicz, J. A., 19  
 Josserand, Louis, 72–3  
 judicial discretion theory of nuisance  
   law in Spain, 188–93  
 Justinian, 176
- Kames, Henry Home, Lord, 14, 134–5,  
 156
- Labeo, 3  
 landlord and tenant law  
   title to sue for nuisance in Scotland,  
   142  
   tortfeasors in Netherlands, 116–17  
 late scholastics, 5–6  
 Laurent, F., 69, 70  
*lex Aquilia*, 2, 6, 7, 152, 193–5  
 liability between neighbours. *See*  
   neighbour liability
- licensing  
   Netherlands, industrial projects  
     in (*See under* Netherlands,  
     nuisance law in)  
   in Spain, 199
- Lindley LJ, 37  
 Lloyd, Lord, 31
- local governments  
   England and Wales, public land use  
     regulation in, 56–9, 59–61  
   France, public land use regulation  
     in, 76  
   Scotland, evolution in, 132, 161–70,  
     171  
   in Spain, 200
- MacNaghten J, 19, 35  
 malice (*See also* fault)  
   *abus de droit* in France (*See under*  
     France)  
   in English and Welsh law, 35  
   non-negligent, nonintentional  
     interference versus (*See* strict  
     liability)  
   in Roman law, 5–7  
   Scottish law, intention in, 150–1
- Masferrer, Aniceto, 13, 173  
 McCluskey, Lord, 149
- McGillivray, D., 50, 52  
 McLaren, J. P. S., 30  
 Megaw LJ, 40–2  
 Meijers, E. M., 112, 114, 117  
 Milsom, S. F. C., 20
- mining  
   in English and Welsh law, 46–50, 53  
   French Mining Code, 77
- Mitchell, W., 146  
 Moore, V., 59  
 Morand-Deville, Jacqueline, 75
- Napoleonic Code. *See* subhead ‘Civil  
 Code’, under France
- natural rights in land, interference  
   with, in English and Welsh law,  
   46–50
- Navarre, nuisance law in, 189, 197
- negative interferences, 54
- negligence (*See also* fault)  
   in Dutch law (*See under*  
     Netherlands, nuisance law in)  
   in England and Wales  
     introduction into nuisance  
       claims, 38–44  
     natural rights to land,  
       interference with, 47  
     not strictly required for nuisance  
       or trespass claims, 33–5
- non-negligent, nonintentional  
   interference versus (*See* strict  
   liability)  
   in Roman law, 5–7  
   in Scottish law, 146, 148, 150–1, 156
- neighbour liability, 1, 23–5  
   Continental law (*See* Continental  
     law on neighbour liability)  
   cultural difference and, 1–2, 24–5,  
     28  
   in England and Wales (*See* England  
     and Wales)  
   fault, negligent or intentional (*See*  
     fault malice negligence)  
   in France (*See* France)  
   in Germany (*See* Germany)  
   industrialization and (*See*  
     industrialisation and  
     urbanisation)

- medieval and early modern
    - explications of Roman law, 3–5
  - in Netherlands (*See* Netherlands; nuisance law in)
    - as nuisance (*See* nuisance)
    - policy differences and, 1–2, 24–5
    - property law and (*See* property law and neighbour liability)
    - public health issues (*See* unsanitary dangerous or obnoxious activities laws banning)
    - Roman law on (*See* Roman law)
    - in Scotland (*See* Scotland, nuisance law in)
    - in Spain (*See* Spain, nuisance law in)
    - strict liability (*See* strict liability)
  - Netherlands case law
    - Driessen v. Teunissen*, 113
    - Eillert v. De Groot*, 121
    - Krul v. Joostens*, 111, 126, 129
    - Lindenbaum v. Cohen*, 108, 129
    - Water Tower I and II*, 112
  - Netherlands, nuisance law in, 107–8, 129–31
    - abuse of rights/powers in, 110, 112–14, 129
    - administrative law in industrial nuisances (*See subhead* ‘industrial licensing,’ *this entry*)
    - animals, noise caused by, 121
    - Baldus de Ubaldis, popularity of, 4
    - calculation of property damages, 120–1
    - Civil Code (1838–1992), 10–12
      - French law, influence of, 108
      - law of neighbours in, 109–10
      - negligence, tort of, 108–9
      - nuisance in present Code, 114–15
      - property rights-based approach to nuisance under, 110–1
    - collective actions in, 123, 129–31
    - conflict between unlawfulness and rights-based approaches to, 111–12
    - damage and unlawfulness, loss of distinction between, 116
    - delict, law of, 110
    - emotional versus financial loss, 118–20
    - factors determining liability, lists of, 10–1, 115
    - fault liability, development of, 107
    - financial versus emotional loss, 118–20
    - foreseeability of nuisance, 112
    - illegality or unlawfulness
      - conflict with rights-based approach, 111–12
      - damage and, loss of distinction between, 116
      - proper social conduct test for, 115–16
      - in tort of negligence, 108–9
    - industrial licensing
      - actions in tort and, 126–7
      - history of industrialisation in Netherlands, 127–9
      - legislative history of, 124–6
      - reduction of importance of tort of negligence due to, 130
    - injunctions, 122–3
    - interests versus rights,
      - distinguishing, 125, 129
    - landlord liability for tenant behaviour, 116–17
    - law of neighbours and, 109
    - negligence
      - eventual dominance of, 129–30
      - industrial licensing reducing importance of tort of, 130
      - law of neighbours and, 109
      - rights-based approach to nuisance versus, 110–1, 129, 130
      - tort of, 108–9, 114
      - unlawfulness, concept of, 108–9
    - no specific tort of nuisance, 108
    - noise caused by animals, 121
    - ownership, focus on concept of, 111
    - privacy violations, 121
    - proper social conduct test
      - conflict between abuse of rights and unlawfulness approaches, 112
      - eventual triumph of, 129–31



- Netherlands, nuisance law in (*cont.*)  
 evolution of, 115–16  
 standing to sue and, 117  
 tort of negligence and, 108  
 property damage  
 calculation of loss, 120–1  
 financial versus emotional loss,  
 118–19  
 property rights, basis in, 110–1, 129,  
 130  
 public land use regulation, 26  
 relationship of provisions to general  
 principles, 7  
 remedies other than damages, 122–3  
 rights  
 abuse of, 110, 112–14, 129  
 conflict between rights-based and  
 unlawfulness approaches to  
 nuisance, 111–12  
 interests versus rights,  
 distinguishing, 125, 129  
 nuisance, rights-based approach  
 to, 110–1, 129, 130  
 standing to sue for, 117–18  
 strict liability, 10–12, 24, 121–2  
 unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious  
 activities, laws banning, 26  
 Netherlands statute law  
 Environmental Management Act of  
 1993 (*Wet Milieubeheer*),  
 124  
 Imperial Decree (1810), 124  
 Industrial Nuisance Act of 1875  
 (*Hinderwet*), 26, 124–6  
 Royal Decree (1824), 124, 131  
 noise  
 Dutch law on noise caused by  
 animals, 121  
 English Noise Act 1996, 53  
 in Spanish nuisance law, 203  
 North J., 19, 35  
 nuisance  
 in England and Wales (*See under*  
 England and Wales)  
 foreseeability of  
 in Dutch law, 112  
 in English and Welsh law, 43  
 in France  
 Civil Code applied to, 67  
 Civil Code's lack of provision for, 65  
 types of *Immissionem/immissioni*  
 for which relief is available,  
 73  
 in Germany (*See under* Germany)  
 in Netherlands (*See* Netherlands,  
 nuisance law in)  
 in Scotland (*See* Scotland, nuisance  
 law in)  
 in Spain (*See* Spain, nuisance law in)  
 obligations, law of. *See* tort and  
 neighbour liability  
 obnoxious activities. *See* unsanitary,  
 dangerous, or obnoxious  
 activities, laws banning  
 Odofredus, 3  
 Park J, 33  
 Penzance, Lord, 47  
 planning legislation. *See* public land  
 use regulation  
*plus quam tolerabile* (reasonable  
 tolerability), 15, 139, 140, 189  
 policy choices as basis for legal  
 differences, 1–2, 24–5  
 Pomponius, 3  
 positive interferences, 54  
 Pothier, Robert, 5, 7, 68, 69, 85, 92  
 Prats, Algarra, 178, 180  
 prescription in Scotland, 160  
 priority of interference in time in  
 French law, 74–5  
 privacy protections  
 in Germany, 105  
 in Netherlands, 121  
 proper social conduct test in  
 Netherlands (*See under*  
 Netherlands, nuisance law in)  
 property law and neighbour liability  
 France, will theory of property in,  
 69–71  
 Germany, property basis of  
 neighbour law in, 87–8, 106  
 Netherlands, property rights-based  
 approach to nuisance in, 110–1,  
 129, 130

- Scotland, nuisance as restriction on property rights in, 156–60, 171
- Spain, nuisance law as part of property law in, 181–2, 189–93, 195, 202
- public good defence against nuisance in Scotland, 140
- public health legislation. *See* unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious activities, laws banning
- public land use regulation, 26–8  
in England and Wales (*See under* England and Wales)  
in France (*See under* France)  
in Germany, 26, 97  
in Netherlands, 26  
regulatory state, emergence of, 27  
in Scotland, 27, 168–70  
in Spain, 27, 200  
urbanisation, rise of, 27–8
- Rau, C., 69, 70
- reasonable tolerability (*plus quam tolerabile*), 15, 139, 140, 189
- recklessness in Scottish nuisance law, 150–1
- regulatory state, public land use regulation and emergence of, 27
- Reid, Lord, 43
- remedies  
denial damages in Germany, 88, 90, 100  
in England and Wales, 31–8  
injunctions  
in Netherlands, 122–3  
Spain, *interdictos* or injunctions in, 195  
interdict  
Scotland, as remedy for nuisance in, 140–1  
Spain, *interdictos* or injunctions in, 195  
Netherlands, property damages in calculation of loss, 120–1  
financial versus emotional loss, 118–19  
remedies other than damages in, 122–3  
in Scottish nuisance law  
fault, requirement to prove, 142–4  
interdict as, 140–1  
right to reparation, 159  
Spain, actions for compensation in, 194–5, 203  
*res ipsa loquitur*, 153, 154, 155  
*restitutio in integrum*, 120
- rights  
abuse of (*See* abuse of rights)  
in Dutch law (*See under* Netherlands, nuisance law in)  
English and Welsh law  
Human Rights Act 1998, 30, 46  
on interference with natural rights in land, 46–50  
European Convention on Human Rights, 84  
European Court of Human Rights, 203  
to privacy  
in Germany, 105  
in Netherlands, 121  
Scottish nuisance law as restriction on absolute property rights, 156–60, 171  
Spain, human rights approach to nuisance in, 202–3
- Roman law, 2–3  
French law compared, 9  
German law influenced by, 7–8, 89  
*iniuria*, 2, 6, 7, 152  
*lex Aquilia*, 2, 6, 7, 152, 193–5  
medieval and early modern explications of, 3–5  
relationship of law on negligence or intention to cases of interference, 5–7  
Scottish law compared, 16, 152  
Spanish law influenced by, 176
- Scholten, Paul, 114, 117
- Scotland, nuisance law in, 132, 170–2  
abnormal disturbance or use  
conduct causing special risk of abnormal damage, 151

- Scotland, nuisance law in (*cont.*)  
 non-natural/dangerous users,  
 145–8  
 abuse of rights, nuisance as, 157, 171  
 administrative law, 27, 161–70, 171  
*aemulatio* and *immissio* principles,  
 16, 135–6, 138, 170  
 common law, location in, 156–61  
 concept of, 14–17  
 dangerous/non-natural users, 145–8  
 delict law, 158–60  
 English law, influence of, 133, 137–8,  
 145, 148, 154, 170  
 establishing in law, 138–42  
 fault, 142–56, 171  
   affirmation as basis for liability,  
   148–51  
   concept of, 16–17  
   as continuum, 150  
   inferred, 145, 148, 153  
   intention and recklessness, 150–1  
   negligence, 146, 148, 150–1, 156  
   relationship to nuisance, 132  
   remedies sought, requirement to  
   prove fault dependent upon,  
   142–4  
   strict liability versus, 14–17, 24,  
   144–8, 152–3  
 illegality of, 138, 141, 146  
 industrialisation and urbanisation  
 in, 133–4, 161–2, 170  
 inferred fault, 145, 148, 153  
 intention, malicious, 150–1  
 jurisdiction over, 136–7  
 landlord and tenant law, 142  
 local government, evolution of, 132,  
 161–70, 171  
 negligence, 146, 148, 150–1, 156  
 no public/private nuisance  
 distinction in, 136  
 origins and development of, 133–8  
*plus quam tolerabile* (reasonable  
 tolerability) standard for, 15,  
 139, 140  
 prescription, 160  
 prima facie case, establishing, 140  
 property rights, nuisance as  
 restriction on, 156–60, 171  
 public good defence against, 140  
 public land use regulation, 27,  
 168–70  
 recklessness, 150–1  
 relevant circumstances for, 139–40  
 remedies  
   fault, requirement to prove, 142–4  
   interdict as, 140–1  
   right to reparation, 159  
 rights-based approach to, 156–60,  
 171  
 Roman law compared, 16, 152  
 strict liability in, 14–17, 24, 144–8,  
 152–3  
 taxonomical location of, 156–61  
 title to sue for, 142  
 trespass, 160  
 types of actionable harm, 142  
 unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious  
 activities, laws banning, 26,  
 132, 136, 161–70, 171
- Scottish case law  
*Argyll & Clyde Health Board v.*  
*Strathclyde Regional Council*,  
 149, 153, 155  
*Armistead v. Bowerman*, 143  
*Blantyre v. Clyde Navigation*  
*Trustees*, 144  
*Caledonian Railway Co. v. Greenock*  
*Corporation*, 153  
*Campbell v. Kennedy*, 145, 154  
*Chalmers v. Wm Dixon Ltd*, 144,  
 145–7, 148, 154, 155  
*Charity v. Riddell*, 135  
*Cleghorn v. Taylor*, 144, 153, 154  
*Collins v. Hamilton*, 143, 144  
*Cooper & Wood v. North British*  
*Railway Co.*, 143  
*Dewar v. Fraser*, 16, 136, 137  
*Duke of Buccleuch v. Cowan*, 143,  
 146, 155  
*Fleming v. Ure*, 132–3  
*Gardner v. Fraser*, 142  
*Giblin v. Lanarkshire County*  
*Council*, 154  
*Hamilton v. Charles Tennant & Co.*,  
 143  
*Inglis v. Shotts Iron Co.*, 141

- Kennedy v. Glenbelle*, 17, 149–51, 155  
*Kerr v. Earl of Orkney*, 145, 148, 153  
*Kinloch v. Robertson*, 14, 134, 156  
*Laurent v. Lord Advocate*, 145  
*Lindsay v. Thompson*, 159  
*More v. Boyle*, 16  
*Morris v. Bickett*, 160  
*R v. White and Ward*, 137  
*Ralston v. Pettigrew*, 136  
*RHM Bakeries (Scotland) Ltd v. Strathclyde Regional Council*, 145, 148, 150, 153, 155  
*Rylands v. Fletcher* influence of, 145, 148, 154  
*Shanlin v. Collins*, 142  
*Skene v. Maberleys*, 143  
*Watt v. Jamieson*, 15, 139, 147  
*Webster v. Lord Advocate*, 141
- Scottish statute law  
   Alkali Act 1863, 165  
   Burgh Police Acts (1833, 1842, 1847, 1850, 1892), 162–4, 165, 166  
   Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982, 168  
   Clean Air Acts (1956, 1968), 166  
   Control of Pollution Act 1974, 166  
   Diseases Prevention Act 1849, 165  
   Environment Act 1995, 166  
   Environmental Protection Act 1990, 166, 167–8  
   Housing and Town Planning Act 1909, 27, 168  
   Local Government (Scotland) Acts (1889, 1929, 1973, 1994), 165  
   Locomotives Act 1861, 165  
   Nuisances Removal (Scotland) Acts (1848, 1856), 164, 165, 167  
   Police and Improvement Act 1862, 163  
   Public Health (Scotland) Acts (1867, 1897), 162, 165, 166, 168  
   Reorganization of Offices (Scotland) Act 1928, 165  
   Rivers Pollution Act 1876, 166  
   Smoke Nuisance (Scotland) Act 1857, 165
- Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts (1947, 1997), 168  
   Town Council (Scotland) Act 1900, 165  
 servitudes, law of, 2, 4, 65, 76–8, 82–4, 181  
 Shaw LJ, 41  
*sic utere tuo ut neminem laedere*, 3, 18, 34, 137, 154  
 Smith, Sir T. B., 147, 156  
 social necessity rule of Bonfante in Spain, 188  
 Sotelo, Calvo, 185  
 Spain, nuisance law in, 173–6, 200–4  
   abnormal use theory of, 186–7  
   abuse of rights theory of, 185–6, 193  
   *actio negatoria*, 188, 193–5, 197, 202  
   administrative law, 198–200  
   *aemulatio*, 184–5  
   Aquilian or duty-based actions, 193–5  
   Catalan law, 183, 188, 196–7  
   central principle or systematic treatment, lack of, 180, 196, 201  
 Civil Code  
   antecedents of, 177–8  
   commentators and case law supplementing, 181, 201  
   definition of nuisance, failure to provide, 183  
   flexibility of, 180  
   French Civil Code, influence of, 175, 180, 181  
   inadequacy of, 180, 196, 201  
   relevant portions of, 178–9  
   compared with other European regimes, 175–6  
   compensation actions, 194–5, 203  
   concepts of nuisance, 183–93  
   definition of nuisance, 183  
   *Eingriff*, 187–8  
   expansion of nuisance liability ambit, 203–4  
   fault liability in, 189–93, 201  
   French law, influence of  
     abnormal use or disturbance, 186  
     abuse of rights theory, 185

- Spain, nuisance law in (*cont.*)  
 Civil Code, 175, 180, 181  
 German influence on  
 Catalan law, 197  
*Eingriff*, 187–8  
 harmful versus non-harmful  
 nuisance, 182, 183–4  
 historical background to, 176–8  
 human rights approach to, 202–3  
*immissio*, 187  
 industrialisation and urbanisation,  
 effects of, 174–5, 180, 193, 204  
 inhibitory actions, 194–5  
*interdictos* or injunctions, 195  
 judicial discretion theory, 188–93  
 legal mechanisms regulating,  
 193–6  
 legal regime governing, 178–81  
 licences, protection provided by,  
 199  
 local government responsibilities,  
 200  
 Navarre, foral law of, 189, 197  
 noise, 203  
*plus quam tolerabile* (reasonable  
 tolerability) standard in, 189  
 property law, as part of, 181–2,  
 189–93, 195, 202  
 public and private law, relationship  
 between, 198–200  
 public land use regulation, 27, 200  
 Roman law, influence of, 176  
 scholarly attention to, 174  
 servitudes, law of, 181  
 strict liability in, 12–13, 24, 189–93,  
 201  
 taxonomical location of, 181–3  
 tort law (obligations), 182, 189–90,  
 193–5, 201–2  
 unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious  
 activities, laws banning, 26,  
 198–200
- Spangenberg, Ernst Peter Johann, 91,  
 187
- Spanish statute law  
 Catalan Act of 13/1990, 188  
*Compilation of the Private Law of  
 Navarre*, 189
- Regulation for Annoying, Unhealthy,  
 Harmful, and Dangerous  
 Activities* (1961), 27, 198, 200  
*Siete Partidas*, 190
- Stair, James Dalrymple, Viscount, 152,  
 159
- statutory law. *See also* entries for  
 individual countries for specific  
 statutes, e.g. German statute law  
 England and Wales, statutory  
 regulation of nuisances in, 29,  
 30, 50–4 (*See also* English and  
 Welsh statute law, for specific  
 statutes)  
 defence of statutory authority  
 to permit common-law  
 nuisances, 29, 30, 61–3  
 movement towards, 63–4
- strict liability  
 as chief problem of neighbour  
 liability, 1, 23–5  
 in Dutch law, 10–12, 24, 121–2  
 in English and Welsh law, 14, 17–23,  
 24, 32–3  
 in French law, 9, 24, 65, 66–8, 85  
 in German law, 7–8, 24, 87, 106  
*iniuria*, 2, 6, 7  
 relationship of Roman law on  
 negligence or intention to,  
 5–7  
 in Scottish law on nuisance, 14–17,  
 24, 144–8, 152–3  
 in Spain, 12–13, 24, 189–93, 201
- tenants and landlords  
 title to sue for nuisance in Scotland,  
 142  
 as tortfeasors in Netherlands,  
 116–17
- Thier, Andreas, 3, 87
- tort and neighbour liability  
 delict law  
 in Germany, 87–8, 103–4  
 in Netherlands, 110  
 in Scotland, 158–60  
 England and Wales  
 fault-based liability in tort in (*See  
 under* England and Wales)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-47563-2 - The Development of Liability Between Neighbours: Volume 2

Edited by James Gordley

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX

225

- types of tort remedies, 31–8
- Netherlands, nuisance law in
  - landlord liability for tenant behaviour, 116–17
  - negligence, 108–9, 114, 130
  - no specific tort of nuisance, 108
- in Spain, 182, 189–90, 193–5, 201–2
- trespass
  - in English and Welsh law, 31–8
  - in Scottish law, 160
- troubles de voisinage*. *See under* France
- ‘ultrahazardous activity’ doctrine, 22
- United Kingdom. *See* England and Wales
- Scotland, nuisance law in
- United States, ‘ultrahazardous activity’
  - interpretation of *Rylands* in, 22
- unlawfulness or illegality
  - in Netherlands (*See under* Netherlands, nuisance law in)
  - in Scotland, 138, 141, 146
- unsanitary, dangerous, or obnoxious activities, laws banning, 26, 27
  - in English and Welsh law, 26, 29, 50–4
  - in France, 26, 75
  - Germany, health protections in, 105
  - in Netherlands, 26
  - in Scottish law, 26, 132, 136, 161–70, 171
  - in Spain, 26, 198–200
- unusual disturbance or use. *See* abnormal disturbance or use
- unusual sensitivity on part of claimant
  - in English and Welsh law, 36
  - in French law, 74
- urbanisation. *See* industrialisation and urbanisation
- Verheij, A. J., 11, 107
- vis major*, 37
- Wales. *See* England and Wales
- Weinrib, E., 38
- Whitty, N., 135, 142, 158, 168, 171
- Wilberforce, Lord, 42
- will theory of property in France, 69–71
- Winfield, Sir Percy, 19
- Wright, Lord, 39
- zoning. *See* public land use regulation