

THE IMPACT OF IDEAS ON LEGAL DEVELOPMENT

This book explores the intellectual contexts in which the development of tort law took place in Europe. With contributions from legal theorists, social and intellectual historians and comparative lawyers, it examines how conceptions of community and responsibility have changed over time, providing a context both for new notions of the role of the state in protecting its citizens and for new interpretations of older private law concepts. The book also examines how the law of tort was shaped and applied by judges in the codified and uncodified systems, comparing the common law system of England with the systems in France and Germany, whose codes were created in very different contexts. The book includes chapters that look at the role of experts in shaping the law's response to workplace hazards and concludes with a discussion of the role of academic networks in developing the notion of a European private law.

MICHAEL LOBBAN is Professor of Legal History at Queen Mary, University of London, where his research interests lie in the fields of English legal history and the history of jurisprudence.

JULIA MOSES is a Lecturer in Modern History at the University of Sheffield, where her research focuses on the intersection of social policy, the law and transnational connections in nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Britain and Europe.



COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE LAW OF TORTS IN EUROPE

Series editors John Bell and David Ibbetson



THE IMPACT OF IDEAS ON LEGAL DEVELOPMENT

Edited by
MICHAEL LOBBAN
and
JULIA MOSES

Comparative Studies in the Development of the Law of Torts in Europe

VOLUME 7





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107023116

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012 First paperback edition 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Lobban, Michael.

The impact of ideas on legal development / Michael Lobban, Julia Moses.
c. cm. – (Comparative studies in the development of the law of torts in Europe; 7)
Includes index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02711-4 (hardback)

1. Law – Philosophy – Europe. 2. Law – Europe – History.

I. Moses, Julia, 1979 – II. Title.

KJC450.L63 2012

340´.1094–dc23 2012007316

ISBN 978-1-107-02711-4 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-47560-1 Paperback

Hardback only available as ISBN 978-1-107-02311-6 3-volume set

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

Series	editors'	preface	page vii
001103	canors	prejuce	puzc vii

- 1 Introduction 1
 MICHAEL LOBBAN AND JULIA MOSES
- Responsibility, solidarity and state regulation in classical
 Continental social theory 34
 ROGER COTTERRELL
- Individual and social responsibility in nineteenth-century
 British political thought
 SANDRA DEN OTTER
- The 'welfare state' in legal and social philosophy: origins and controversies
 JOSE HARRIS
- 5 Continental European jurisprudence 1850–2000 100 JOHN BELL
- 6 English jurisprudence and tort theory 127
 MICHAEL LOBBAN
- 7 The left and wrongs: Marxism, law and torts 150 CHRISTINE SYPNOWICH
- 8 The process of codification applied to the law of delicts
 JEAN-LOUIS HALPÉRIN
 167
- 9 Codifications, commentators and courts in tort law: the perception and application of the civil code and the constitution by the German legal profession 186
 NILS JANSEN

v



vi CONTENTS

The English codification debate and the role of jurists in the development of legal doctrines
 ALEXANDRA BRAUN

- 11 Regulating workplace hazards: the role of medical, scientific and technical experts in legal change
 P. W. J. BARTRIP
- 12 Expertise and the evolution of private law: the case of occupational illness in twentieth-century France 244
 PAUL-ANDRÉ ROSENTAL
- 13 The notion of a European private law and a softer side to harmonisation 265LUCINDA MILLER

Index 286



SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

The European Legal Development series has arisen from a project funded by the Arts and Humanities Research Council from January 2005 until February 2008.

The aim of the project as a whole was to examine the nature of legal development in western Europe since 1850, focusing sharply on liability for fault. Behind this there is a more abstract purpose: to attempt to cast some light on the factors that have influenced the way in which the law has changed over this period. Legal historians have looked at the general question, usually focusing on the rather facile distinction between the English common law and continental European legal systems. Though rooted in the sources, these works have been marred by a somewhat unsophisticated methodology and an inevitably selective use of evidence. Comparative lawyers have developed far more sophisticated methodologies, but their theoretical perspectives have too often borne little relation to empirical data. Over the last twenty years, tort lawyers have looked at the same types of question; but their analysis has invariably been at a high level of generality and has rarely looked at the historical component. By bringing together experts with different disciplinary backgrounds – comparative lawyers and legal historians, all with an understanding of modern tort law in their own systems - and getting them to work collaboratively, we have aimed to produce a more nuanced comparative legal history, and one that is theoretically better informed.

The topic of legal development is broad, so, to make it manageable, we have undertaken a programme of work that has built up from a number of case studies and has moved towards a more general analysis and conclusions. Although we have been concerned with the development of the law, and although many of those involved in the project have been lawyers, we have also been concerned to include and benefit from the insights of historians and scholars in other disciplines.

Liability for fault between 1850 to 2000 has been our major area of study. Around 1850 there were many similarities in approaches to liability for

vii



viii

SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

fault across the legal systems of western Europe. Since then, however, there has been significant divergence. Our method has been first to chart the changes and then to seek the explanations for what happened. Although there have been many changes in tort and delict laws over the period, the idea of liability for fault remains central to private law approaches to the compensation of victims of harms caused by the actions of others.

As a first stage, the project worked on six case studies, which illustrate the general theme of liability for fault and its development within the period:

- · product liability
- legal doctrine
- medical liability
- relations between neighbours
- technological change
- traffic and railways

Each of the topics gave rise to a volume published by Cambridge University Press in 2010. This research involved scholars from a range of countries, in particular England and Scotland, Spain, the Netherlands, Germany, France, Sweden, Austria and Italy. Each working group drew on the expertise of scholars, both senior and more junior, familiar with different European legal systems, and contained a mixture of comparative lawyers and legal historians.

A second stage has involved further groups examining a number of salient factors in legal development. The topics covered in this stage are:

- social and political ideas
- institutions and professions
- the economy (including the impact of insurance)

A final strand to the work is an overview book.

This book, edited by Michael Lobban and Julia Moses, is the first of the second stage reviews of factors that influence legal development. In the study of the impact of ideas, we begin to see how far the law is influenced by the general intellectual and social climate within which the law operates. We are grateful to them and to their multinational team for reflecting deeply on the issues involved in this relationship.

John Bell David Ibbetson