actio quanti minoris 11, 115 actio redhibitoria see rescission of contract agricultural products, liability arising from 5-6 see also under national laws e.g. English law AIDS/HIV, response to see under national laws American law class actions re pharmaceuticals, victims' involvement in 141 development of liability for products 4-5 influence in Europe 5-6, 20, 43-6 see under national laws Convention on product liability 23 'Aquilian liability' see under Roman law bad faith see good faith/bad faith

blood transfusions, contaminated see under national laws burden of proof see under national laws

cars, defects in *see under national laws* cases *see* courts, role of; individual cases e.g. Contagen/ Thalidomide causation *see under national laws caveat emptor see under* English law chain of contracts/relationships *see under national laws* class actions *see under national laws* colza oil affair 22, 224, 254, 255 compensation/damages see under national laws cost of, as manufacturing cost 187 competitiveness, effect of product liability on 186 'complex structure theory' 130 consumer protection 8–9 see also under national laws Convention on product liability 23 Directive as a consumer protection measure 47 growing support for 46-7 Contagen/Thalidomide, response to 6 see also under national laws at international level 23 contract law cumulation of contract and tort remedies 117 liability under see under national laws influence of Roman law 10-11 non-performance of contract see under national laws protection for third parties 116 Council of Europe Convention on product liability 5, 22 - 3courts, role of 20-1, 38-9 see under national laws interpretation of Directive provisions 38-9 criminal liability 34, 36 see also under national laws culpa in contrahendo see under German law

#### INDEX

damage to property, liability for in Lex Aquila 11 under Directive 9 dangerous activities, fault for 29 defect, definition of see under national laws defences to liability 24 see also under national laws delict see tort design of product, liability for negligence in (English law) 75 'development risks' defence 24, see *also under national laws* and Product Liability Directive Directive see Product Liability Directive Dutch law burden of proof 160-3, 167, 178-9, 187 cars, defects in 158 causation 162-3 'claim culture', existence of 176 compensation/damages 184-5 for pain and suffering 171 - 2under tort 184-5 consumer protection priority relative to employees' health and safety 158 as reason for stricter liability 187 under tort 178-80 Contagen/Thalidomide, response to 20 contractual liability 153, 172-3 courts, role of 20-1, 30, 38, 154-5, 156, 157, 158, 159-63, 165, 166-76, 177, 178-9, 181-2, 185 - 6numbers of cases 171 size of awards 171-2 defects in cars 158 definition of defective product 164, 166 distinction between categories of 154

liability for 34, 160, 164, 167, 178 Directive liability regime and delict 154-5 employees health and safety, priority over consumer protection 158 liability for 155-6 European product liability see Product Liability Directive fault-based liability combined with negligence-based and strict liability 155 fault and wrongfulness 167 under tort 163 goodwill, manufacturers' fear of losing 170 implementation of Directive 30, 37-8, 164-6 industrial injuries, liability for 18 influences on legal development see also courts; legal scholars American law 43, 182–3 German law 42-3, 183 legal and societal influences 176-81, 183 insurance schemes, impact of 159, 170, 187–91 legal scholars, role of 20, 30, 40, 154, 159, 165-6, 168 out-of-court settlements 168-9, 170 pharmaceutical products, liability for 178 presumption of fault 35, 38, 47 producer', definition of 164–5 recall of products 159, 169-70 safety failure to provide expected level of 166 greater emphasis by manufacturers 170 scandals and scares, impact of 158-9 settlements, preference for 168-9, 170 significance of product liability 152, 159, 186 strict liability 154-5, 173, 186

CAMBRIDGE

## INDEX

combined with fault-based and tort 155 suppliers' liability 164-5 12, 18, 20-1, 153-6, 157-8, tort 160, 163, 164, 173, 178 combined with fault-based and strict liability 155 compensation/damages 184-5 consumer protection 178-80 failure to provide expected level of safety 166 liability for wrongful acts 178 relationship to European product liability 166-7 replacement by strict liability? 176-8 wrongfulness and fault 167, 178 types of products involved in cases 168 use of product, 160, 162, 173 duty of care, determining existence of (English law) 53 economic considerations

as to Directive 48-50 see also under national laws employees' liability see under national laws English law see also United Kingdom agricultural products, liability arising from 79-80 application of liability for products, extent of 73 burden of proof of manufacturers' liability 74 caveat emptor and seller's liability 18 development of exceptions to 61-9 meaning of 62 commercial law basis of liability 6-7 'complex structure theory' 130 consumer protection pre-Donoghue v. Stevenson 67 Consumer Protection Act 78-84 contractual liability 6-7, 18-19, 32, 38,83

279

development pre-Donoghue v. Stevenson 61-9 implied terms 62–5 privity of contract 19, 38, 58-9, 67-8,69-70 relationship to tort 55-60, 69-70 courts, role of 32-3, 35, 38, 52-3, 55-7, 58-9, 60-1, 67, 68, 69-77, 81-2, 85-6, 130 see also Donoghue v. Stevenson attitude to and use of legal authorities 70-5, 81-2 legislative and judicial intervention contrasted 85 damage to property, liability 130 for defect 82 design of product, and 75 knowledge and liability for 19, 34 development of liability for products 4, 41-2, 54 before Donoghue v. Stevenson relationship between contract and tort 54-69 sale of goods, liability under law of 61-9, 83 tort 60-1 **Consumer Protection** Act 78-84 from Donoghue v. Stevenson to Consumer Protection Act 1987 support for reform 77-8 tort of breach of statutory duty 75-7 tort 69-78 development risks defence 26-7, 78-9, 80, 82 Donoghue v. Stevenson 4, 19–20, 32-3, 52-3, 54, 69 duty of care, determining existence of 53 exclusion of liability 68-9, 83 'fault' 33-4 harmonisation of liability under the Directive 79

#### INDEX

English law (cont.) hepatitis C case 81-2 implementation of Directive 26-7, 32-3, 37-8, 78-84 implied terms of sale, liability arising from 18, 37, 63, 64, 65-9,83 Benjamin and 62-5 in contracts of sale 67 influences see also courts; legal scholars American law 43, 65, 70, 71, 86 Roman law 10 insurance schemes, impact of 80-1, 85-6 knowledge of defects, imposition of liability legal scholars, role of 20, 21, 32, 40, 53-4, 55, 56, 57, 59–60, 62–5, 77, 78, 85-6 meaning of 'merchantable quality' 6–7, 18, 19, 64,66 'satisfactory quality' 84 negligence, liability for see tort 'neighbour principle' 4, 52–3, 72 - 3Pearson Report 77 personal injury, liability for 4 pharmaceutical products, liability for 73 presumption of fault 35 principle, role of 71-3 privity of contract see under contractual liability above product liability, distinctiveness of 52-4 pure economic loss, liability for 75 quality, legal standard of 84 'reasonable fitness for purpose' 6-7, 19, 64, 66 res ipsa loquitur, application of 74 risk of quality 62, 63 sale of goods by sample, liability arising from 63 'satisfactory quality' 7, 84 scandals and scares, impact of 86

special liability schemes, role of 85 strict liability 21, 35, 66, 86 equating to liability without negligence 33 Pearson Report, recommendation for 77 terminology, changes in Thalidomide, response to 77, 78,86 tort 4, 7, 19–20, 32, 33, 37, 38, 41-2,69as to design of product 75 breach of statutory duty 75-7 damage to property 130 development pre-Donoghue v. Stevenson 60-1 for pure economic loss 75 relationship to law of sale of goods 55-60, 69-70, 84 role of principle 71-3 European Court of Justice (ECJ), 'complete harmonisation' ruling 5, 25 - 6effect on consumer protection 8–9 effect on Member States see under national laws European Legal Development Project, purpose of 1 exclusion of liability see under national laws extra-contractual liability see tort 'fault', meaning of 33-4 fault-based liability 34 see under national laws foreign influences on development of liability for products see under national laws French law action directe en garantie (direct

action) 4, 94, 95 blood transfusions, contaminated 31, 47, 105 burden of proof 96, 97 causation 104, 111–13 chain of contracts 93–4 compensation/damages 95

281

extent of recoverable damage 109 for industrial accidents 88-9 for victims 100-1 'complete harmonisation' ruling, effect of 31, 108-11 consumer goods, accidents and 91 relationship to strict liability 102 consumer protection 101-2, 109 Contagen/Thalidomide, response to 92 contractual liability 89, 94, 95-6 distinguished from delict 93, 97 contrast with other legal codes 94 courts, role of 31, 32, 38, 88, 90, 91, 95, 96-7, 98, 99, 101, 105, 109-13 development of liability for products 4, 10–11, 34, 42 before 1950s 88-90 1950s 91-3 1960-1985 factors influencing reform 99 rules for contractual liability and tort 94-9 structure of liability law 93-9 1985 onwards current uncertainties 106-7 role of courts and case 106-8, 109-13 law role of legal scholarship 103 113 summary development risks defence 105-6 direct action (action directe en garantie) 4, 94, 95 distinction between different types of damage 97 economic considerations 102-3 fault, liability for 11-12, 96, 96-7 meaning of 'fault' (la faute) 33 harmonisation, approach to 17 implementation of Directive 17, 31-2, 38, 46, 47, 87, 103, 104-5, 108-11 influence of French Law on Italian law 42, 195-8

Spanish law 42 influences on French law foreign influences 92-3 Roman law 15, 95 insurance schemes, impact of 102-3 knowledge of defects, imposition of liability for 8, 15-16, 21, 95 latent defects guarantee (garantie des vices cachés) 95-6 contrasted with 'safety defect' *(défaut de sécurité), liability* for 106 - 7legal scholars, role of 20, 21, 39-40, 88, 90, 91-2, 99, 100 - 1, 103legislation 89 see also consumer protection implementation of Directive 31-2, 42, 95, 108-11 liability for fault, change to strict liability from 99 liability for things (responsabilité du *fait des choses*) 90, 91, 93, 99, 102 'liability without fault', use of term 33 no-choice rule 93 non-performance of contract, liability for 10 obligation de sécurité 90 owners, liability of 16-17, 42, 89-90 traffic accidents 91 parties to contract, liability of 42 pharmaceutical products, liability for 32, 91, 111-13 presumption of fault 33, 35, 95 privity of contract 93-4 recoverable damage, extent of 109 sale of goods, liability under 4, 10, 15 - 16, 17scandals and scares, impact of 92 special liability schemes, maintenance of 110-11 strict liability 16-17, 90, 97-9 change from liability for fault 99 importance in French law 87

CAMBRIDGE

## 282

## INDEX

French law (cont.) relationship to consumer protection 102 strictness of rules 98-9 tort 11-12, 16, 89, 94, 96-7 distinguished from contractual liability 93,97 traders' liability 8, 16 traffic accidents, liability for 91 users' liability 16-17, 42 victims, concern for 100-1 garantie des vices cachés (latent defects guarantee) (French law) 95-6 German law actio doli, liability under 120 after-sales duties 129-30 AIDS/HIV, response to 140-1 applicability of liability for products 132-3 breach of trust (Vertrauenshaftung), liability for 123 burden of proof 119, 127-8, 131, 143, 145 chain of relationships 130-1 class actions, victims' involvement in 141 compensation/damages from trust funds 139, 140 'complete harmonisation' ruling, effect of 31, 36 'complex structure theory' 130 construction defects, liability for 137 Contagen/Thalidomide, response to 36, 47, 139 contract law contractual liability 120 growing support for 122-3 legislation 115-16 rejection of 123-4, 144 relationship to tort 115-17, 126, 144 privity of contract 116 protection for third parties 116

courts, role of 20-1, 30, 38, 115-16, 117-20, 123-32, 138, 147 culpa in contrahendo, quasi-contract within 122 cumulation of remedies 117, 134 damage to property, liability for 134 damage to the product, liability for 130-1 development risks defence 128, 137 directors' liability 132 employees' liability 131 employers' liability (*Organisationspflicht*) 119, 124-6, 127, 128, 132 environmentalism as factor in lack of litigation 143-4 fault-based liability 115-16, 137, 145 Ford Cars case 120 fraud, liability for 18 guarantees/warranties as to certain features of product, liability for 115 HIV/AIDS, response to 140-1 implied terms of sale, liability arising from 123 industrial injuries, liability for 18, 118-9 influence of German law on Dutch law 42-3, 183 Spanish law 42 influences on German law American law 20, 43, 121, 124, 144 Roman law 115 post-industrialisation as factor in lack of litigation 143 instruction, defect in 128 insurance schemes, impact of 18, 118-19, 124, 140, 141-2, 148-50 knowledge of defects, imposition of liability for 115

283

legal scholars, role of 20-1, 30, 116, 120, 127-8, 129-30, 135-6, 137-8, 138, 144, 147 negligence, liability for 115, 116 see also tort below 'objective' and 'subjective' test 127-8 relationship to product defect 126 *Newcastle Disease* case 123 owners, liability of 12 personal injury, liability for 134-5 pharmaceutical products, liability 36, 138, 149 for reasons for lack of cases 140 presumption of fault 35, 38, 47 privity of contract 17, 116 product defect, relationship to negligence 126, 145 Product Liability Directive construction defects 137 damage to property 134 development risks defence 137 fault-based liability 137 impact of 138 implementation of 30, 133-8 personal injury 134-5 pharmaceutical products 142-3 reasons for lack of cases 141-2, 143 relationship to tort 134-5 retention of 'special liability systems' 135 strict liability 135-8 suppliers' liability 137 product safety law and codes 145-7 quasi-contract 122 quasi-vicarious liability 119 reasonably safe design, duty to 128 provide recall of products as factor in lack of litigation 144 liability for failure to initiate 31, 129 - 30

relationship between manufacturers and consumers, history of 114-15 retention of 'special liability systems' 36 sale of goods, liability under law of 17 scandals and scares, impact of 148 self-employed persons, liability of 131 settlements, preference for 144 small- and medium-size enterprises (SMEs), liability of 131 statutory duty, tort of breach of 146 strict liability 127, 135-8, 145 suppliers' liability 130-1, 137 third parties, contracts for 116, 122-3 12, 17-18, 20-1, 30-1, 116-17, tort 120 see also negligence, liability for above after-sales and product recall 129-30 breach of statutory duty, tort of 146 damage to the product 130-1 development of early cases, 117 directors 132 employees 131 *Newcastle Disease* case 123 problem of superior responsibility 124 relationship to contractual liability 115–17, 126, 144 relationship to European product liability 134-5, 137, 138 small- and medium-size enterprises (SMEs) 131 tort of breach of statutory duty 146 traffic accidents, liability for 120 trust funds, victims' 139, 140 use of product, normal/ abnormal 145 vicarious liability 118 see also employers' liability above

## INDEX

German law (cont.) quasi-vicarious liability 119 victims choice of law to favour 134-5 compensation funds 139, 140 involvement in US class actions re pharmaceuticals 141 victims, choice of law to favour 135 warning, failure to give 128 good faith/bad faith see under national laws guarantees/warranties see under national laws guardian's liability see under Italian law harmonisation by the Directive see under national laws courts, role of 38-9 Directive as a harmonising measure 24 ECJ ruling on 'complete harmonisation' 5,38 effect on consumer protection 8-9 health and safety see under national laws *hepatitis C* case (English law) 81–2 HIV/AIDS, response to see under national laws implied condition of goods see English law implied terms of sale see English law industrial injuries, liability for see under national laws influences on legal development foreign laws 213-15 instruction, defect in see under national laws insurance schemes see under national laws Italian law agricultural products, liability arising from 218–19 assembler liability 210

blood transfusions, contaminated 225-6, 227-9,230 burden of proof 194, 197, 198-9, 200, 201, 208, 208-12, 214, 218, 227 cars, defects in 207, 210, 211-12, 217, 220 - 1chain of contracts 204 colza oil affair, response to 223-4 compensation/damages 199-201, 204, 215-18 minimum value 218 'complete harmonisation' ruling, effect of 30 consumer protection 202, 205, 208, 216-17 contractual liability 194, 198-9, 203, 208, 213-14, 217-18, 226 relationship to tortious liability 194-5, 196, 198-201, 202, 204-5, 211, 218 courts, role of 20-1, 29, 38, 198, 204, 206-12, 219, 220-2, 223-31 criminal liability 194-5, 200, 223 - 4current situation for product liability 231-3 dangerous activities 29, 227-8 defective product, liability for 14, 29, 219-20 knowledge of defects, liability for 14, 193, 194, 196, 196–8, 200, 207 defences to liability 200 European product liability continued use of other laws 222-9 ECJ ruling on 'complete harmonisation' 229-31 implementation of Directive 29-30, 37-8, 218 - 33reasons for lack of cases 231-3 exclusion of liability 202, 207-8, 211

fault, liability for 14, 15, 194

gas cylinders, damage caused

meaning of 'fault' (colpa) 33

by 227 good faith/bad faith 194, 196, 200, 207 guarantees/warranties 193, 194, 195-8, 201, 203, 205 guardian's liability 201, 227 influences on Italian law American law 20, 43, 216 French law 42, 195–8, 200, 213 - 14instruction, defect in 210, 222 insurance schemes, impact of 217, 228 - 9legal scholars, role of 20, 40, 192-8, 204-5, 206, 208, 213-15, 230-3 legislation 1865 Civil Code 192-201 1942 Civil Code 202-18 owners, liability of 14 pharmaceutical products, liability for 29, 227-8 presumption of fault 33, 35, 38, 47, 208-12 privity of contract 15, 199 regulatory authorities, liability of 29 rescission of contract 195 Saiwa case 208 sale of goods, liability under law of 14, 29 strict liability 29, 212, 213 12, 14–15, 20–1, 194, 196–8, tort 204, 208-9, 211-13, 214, 219, 226 relationship to contractual liability 194–5, 196, 198–9, 199-201, 202, 204-5, 211 use of product, normal/ abnormal 204, 210–11, 219, 220 - 2wrongfulness ('unlawful fact' ) 29

*ius commune see* Roman law

INDEX

285

under national laws latent defects see under French law (garantie des vices cachés) 'law and economics' approach see economic considerations legal scholars, role of 20, 39-41, see also under national laws in creation of Directive 40 presumption of fault, view as to use of 35 legislation see national laws e.g. English law see Product Liability Directive (Directive) Lex Aquilia see Roman law liability for products development of liability for products 41-2, see also under national laws 1850-1960 9 1960-1985 20-3 1985-2006 23-33 as distinct area of law 4 - 5role of courts 38-9 legal scholars 39-41 legislation 36-8 summary 50 distinguished from product liability 5-6 extent of application of (English law) 73 'objective' and 'subjective' nature of liability 33-4 liability for things see under French law; Italian law liability without fault/negligence see strict liability 'Mad Cow Disease', response to 5-6, 47-8 'merchantable quality' 6-7 see also English law

knowledge of defects, imposition of

liability for 34 see also

methodology of study 1-2

## INDEX

negligence-based liability see tort 'neighbour principle' see under English law Netherlands, the see Dutch law Newcastle Disease case see under German law no-fault liability see strict liability *obligation de sécurité* (French law) 90 other forms of liability, use of 5, see also under national laws out-of-court settlements see under Dutch law Pearson Report (English law) 77 pharmaceutical products, liability for see specific cases, e.g. Contagen/Thalidomide; see under national laws presumption of fault 35 see also under national laws principle, role of (English law) 71–3 privity of contract see under national laws product liability 87 distinguished from liability for products 5-6 focus of study on 2 usage of term 3-4Product Liability Directive (Directive) 23-33, 37, see also harmonisation of liability under the Directive absolute v. strict liability in 43–4 amendment in response to 'Mad Cow Disease' 47-8 consumer protection 8-9, 47 'damage', definition of 9 defective product, definition of 166 defences to liability 24 ECJ case law see European Court of Justice future trends and developments 180-1 harmonisation and 24, 173-4 impact of Directive 182, 183-4, 186

implementation 37-8, see under national laws extent of Member States' discretion 26-8 maximum and bases of liability 24-6 influence of American law 43-6 insurance schemes, impact of 48-50 'law and economics' approach to 48 - 50legal scholars' role in creating 40 political considerations in creation of Directive 47 in implementation of Directive 47 relationship to tort 166–7, 173, 178 retention of 'special liability 25, 174-6 systems' strict liability 24 transplant, as a 46 product safety law and codes see under national laws property, liability for damage to see damage public authorities, liability of see national laws pure economic loss, liability for 75 quasi-vicarious liability see under German law 'reasonable fitness for purpose' see under English law recall products, liability for failure to (German law) 31 regulatory authorities, liability of (Italian law) 29 res ipsa loquitur, application of (English law) 74 rescission of contract 11, 115, 195, 239 responsibility of superiors (respondeat superior) see under German law Roman law actio quanti minoris 11

287

'Aquilian liability' 7 defective product, liability for 10-11 influence on civil law jurisdictions 7-8,9 influence on English law 10 influence on French law 15 influence on law of sale of goods 10-11 knowledge of defects, imposition of liability for 7 Lex Aquilia 7, 11 damage to property, liability for 11 price of goods, right of recovery or reduction of 11 rescission of contract 11 'safety defect' (défaut de sécurité), liability for see under French law Saiwa case (Italian law) 208 sale of goods, liability under law of see under contract scandals and scares, product see specific cases e.g. Contagen/Thalidomide; see under national laws self-employed persons, liability of see German law settlement, preference for see under national laws Spanish law agricultural products, liability arising from 249 blood transfusions, contaminated 256-9, 267-8 burden of proof 13, 243-4, 245, 246, 249, 254, 262, 263 cars, defects in 240-2 causation 254 colza oil affair, response to 22, 36, 40, 43, 47, 247, 251-6 compensation 253, 255-6 'complete harmonisation' ruling, effect of 28, 36, 266-7, 267-8 consumer protection 22, 235–6, 246 - 8

contractual liability 237-8, 239 - 42latent defects 239-40 non-performance of contract, liability for 13 privity of contract 13, 241-2 rescission of contract 239 courts, role of 22, 28, 29, 38, 237-9, 240-2, 246, 251-9, 262-3, 266 - 8reasons for lack of cases 234-5 criminal liability 253 defective product, liability for 13 defects, types of 238 instruction, defect in 242, 245 knowledge of defects, imposition of liability for 13, 34 defences to liability 249-50, 258, 262 - 3development of liability for products in to 1970s 237-40, 242-5, 246-51 development risks defence 250, 256-7, 258-9 direct action (action directe) 235, 241 - 2European product liability ECJ ruling on 'complete harmonisation' 266-8 impact of Directive 251, 266 - 8implementation of Directive 38, 248-51, 258-9 force majeure 256-7 Hague Convention 264 health and safety 260 hospitals, liability of private hospitals 258-9 public hospitals 256-7 industrialisation, State's role in 259-60 influences on Spanish law American law 43, 235, 264 French law 42, 235 German Law 42, 235, 264 insurance schemes, impact of 263-5 latent defects 239-40

INDEX

Spanish law (*cont*.) legal scholars, role of 21-2, 40, 234-6, 240-1, 264, 267 legislation compulsory insurance 263-4 consumer protection 235-6, 246-8,267 health and safety 260-1 industrial inspection 260 ordering and defence of industry 260-1 public administration 256 - 9limitation period 243 presumption of fault 28, 35, 38, 244,246 product safety law and codes relationship to product liability 259 public authorities, liability of 254-5 retention of 'special liability systems' 36, 38 sale of goods, liability under law of 28-9 standard of care 262-3 strict liability 22, 28, 256-7 tort 12, 28-9, 238, 242, 242-3, 246-8,263 requirements for 243

types of products involved in cases 247, 249 use of product, normal/ abnormal 244–5 wrongfulness and fault 256–7 statutory duty, breach of *see* English law; German law strict liability *see under national laws*, *Product Liability Directive* 

terminology, development of 3–9 Thalidomide case *see* Contagen/Thalidomide, response to tort *see under national laws* in civil law jurisdictions 11 traffic accidents, liability for *see under national laws* 

United Kingdom *see* English law United States *see* American law 'unlawful fact' *see under* Italian law

vicarious liability *see under* employer's liability

warranties see guarantees/warranties wrongfulness see under national laws