Prokofiev’s Soviet Operas

Prokofiev considered himself to be primarily a composer of opera, and his return to Russia in the mid 1930s was partially motivated by the goal to renew his activity in this genre. His Soviet career coincided with the height of the Stalin era, when official interest and involvement in opera increased, leading to demands for nationalism and heroism to be represented on the stage in order to promote the Soviet Union and the Stalinist regime. Drawing on a wealth of primary source materials and engaging with recent scholarship in Slavonic studies, this book investigates encounters between Prokofiev’s late operas and the aesthetics of socialist realism, contemporary culture (including literature, film, and theatre), political ideology, and the obstacles of bureaucratic interventions and historical events. This contextual approach is interwoven with critical interpretations of the operas in their original versions, providing a new account of their stylistic and formal features and connections to operatic traditions.

Nathan Seinen is Assistant Professor of Musicology at The Chinese University of Hong Kong.
Music Since 1900

General Editor    Arnold Whittall

This series – formerly Music in the Twentieth Century – offers a wide perspective on music and musical life since the end of the nineteenth century. Books included range from historical and biographical studies concentrating particularly on the context and circumstances in which composers were writing, to analytical and critical studies concerned with the nature of musical language and questions of compositional process. The importance given to context will also be reflected in studies dealing with, for example, the patronage, publishing, and promotion of new music, and in accounts of the musical life of particular countries.

Titles in the series
Jonathan Cross
The Stravinsky Legacy
Michael Nyman
Experimental Music: Cage and Beyond
Jennifer Doctor
The BBC and Ultra-Modern Music, 1922–1936
Robert Adlington
The Music of Harrison Birtwistle
Keith Potter
Four Musical Minimalists: La Monte Young, Terry Riley, Steve Reich, Philip Glass
Carlo Caballero
Fauré and French Musical Aesthetics
Peter Burt
The Music of Toru Takemitsu
David Clarke
The Music and Thought of Michael Tippett: Modern Times and Metaphysics
M. J. Grant
Serial Music, Serial Aesthetics: Compositional Theory in Post-War Europe
Philip Rupprecht
Britten’s Musical Language
Mark Carroll
Music and Ideology in Cold War Europe
Adrian Thomas
Polish Music since Szymanowski
J. P. E. Harper-Scott
Edward Elgar, Modernist
Yayoi Uno Everett
The Music of Louis Andriessen
Ethan Haimo
Schoenberg’s Transformation of Musical Language
Rachel Beckles Willson
Ligeti, Kurtág, and Hungarian Music during the Cold War
Michael Cherlin
Schoenberg’s Musical Imagination
Joseph N. Straus
Twelve-Tone Music in America
David Metzer
Musical Modernism at the Turn of the Twenty-First Century
Edward Campbell
Boulez, Music and Philosophy
Jonathan Goldman
The Musical Language of Pierre Boulez: Writings and Compositions
Pieter C. van den Toorn and John McGinness
Stravinsky and the Russian Period: Sound and Legacy of a Musical Idiom
David Beard
Harrison Birtwistle’s Operas and Music Theatre
Heather Wiebe
Britten’s Unquiet Pasts: Sound and Memory in Postwar Reconstruction
Beate Kutschke and Barley Norton
Music and Protest in 1968
Graham Griffiths
Stravinsky’s Piano: Genesis of a Musical Language
Martin Iddon
John Cage and David Tudor: Correspondence on Interpretation and Performance
Martin Iddon
New Music at Darmstadt: Nono, Stockhausen, Cage, and Boulez
Alastair Williams
Music in Germany Since 1968
Ben Earle
Luigi Dallapiccola and Musical Modernism in Fascist Italy
Thomas Schuttenhelm
The Orchestral Music of Michael Tippett: Creative Development and the Compositional Process
Marilyn Nonken
The Spectral Piano: From Liszt, Scriabin, and Debussy to the Digital Age
Jack Boss
Schoenberg’s Twelve-Tone Music: Symmetry and the Musical Idea
Deborah Mawer
French Music and Jazz in Conversation: From Debussy to Brubeck

Philip Rupprecht
British Musical Modernism: The Manchester Group and Their Contemporaries

Amy Lynn Wlodarski
Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation

Carola Nielinger-Vakil
Luigi Nono: A Composer in Context

Erling E. Guldbrandsen and Julian Johnson
Transformations of Musical Modernism

David Cline
The Graph Music of Morton Feldman

Russell Hartenberger
Performance and Practice in the Music of Steve Reich

Joanna Bullivant
Modern Music, Alan Bush, and the Cold War: The Cultural Left in Britain and the Communist Bloc

Nicholas Jones
Peter Maxwell Davies, Selected Writings

J. P. E. Harper-Scott
Ideology in Britten’s Operas

Jack Boss
Schoenberg’s Atonal Music: Musical Idea, Basic Image, and Specters of Tonal Function

Nathan Seinen
Prokofiev's Soviet Operas
Prokofiev’s Soviet Operas

Nathan Seinen

*The Chinese University of Hong Kong*
Contents

List of Music Examples  page viii
List of Tables  x
Acknowledgements  xi
Note on Terminology and Transliteration  xiii

Introduction  1
1 Semyon Kotko and the Melodrama of High Stalinism  20
2 Buffed by Buffa: Betrothal in a Monastery  67
3 Kutuzov’s Victory, Prokofiev’s Defeat: The Revisions of War and Peace  121
4 The Story of a Real Man and Late Stalinist Subjectivity  162

Conclusion  225

Bibliography  232
Index  250
Music Examples

1.1a Semyon Kotko, Introduction, bars 9–18, Theme 1 page 34
1.1b Semyon Kotko, Act I, tableau 1, bars 1–8, Theme 2 34
1.2a Semyon Kotko, Act II, conclusion of scene 7, the interruption of the matchmaking ceremony 38
1.2b Semyon Kotko, Act II, opening of scene 8, the entrance of the Germans 39
1.3 Semyon Kotko, Act II, scene 10, Semyon’s lament 44
1.4a Semyon Kotko, Act III, scene 14, Tkachenko’s threat against Sofya 47
1.4b Semyon Kotko, Act III, scene 14 (continued) 48
2.1 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act II, tableau 2, scene 1, Louisa’s first theme (L1) 76
2.2 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act II, tableau 2, scene 1, Louisa’s third theme (L3) 77
2.3 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act II, tableau 3, scene 4, Louisa’s fifth theme (L5) 77
2.4 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act II, tableau 2, scene 1, Louisa’s second theme (L2) 79
2.5 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act III, tableau 5, scene 4, Louisa and Antonio’s second theme (LA2) 80
2.6 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act II, tableau 3, scene 3, Clara’s first theme (C1) 81
2.7a Betrothal in a Monastery, Act I, tableau 1, scene 3, Ferdinand’s first theme (F1) 82
2.7b Betrothal in a Monastery, Act I, tableau 1, scene 2, Ferdinand’s second theme (F2) 83
2.8 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act II, tableau 2, scene 1, Duenna’s second theme 85
2.9 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act I, tableau 1, scene 1, Mendoza’s first theme 86
2.10 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act IV, tableau 9, scene 5, the contredanse finale 89
2.11 Betrothal in a Monastery, Act II, tableau 4, scene 3, original ‘Segodnya vecherom’ (manuscript) 117
3.1 War and Peace, original version, Act III, tableau 7, peasants at the front 127
3.2 War and Peace, original version, Act III, tableau 7, Kutuzov’s arioso 131
3.3 War and Peace, final version, Part 2, tableau 10, Kutuzov’s order to retreat 148
3.4 War and Peace, original version, Act V, tableau 11, conclusion of the opera 151
4.1 The Story of a Real Man, Act I, tableau 2, no. 3, Aleksey’s vision of Olga 184

[viii]
List of Music Examples

4.2 *The Story of a Real Man*, Act II, tableau 5, no. 15, ‘Aleksey’s delirium’ 188
4.3 *The Story of a Real Man*, Act II, tableau 5, no. 17, the Commissar’s first appearance 195
4.4 *The Story of a Real Man*, Act II, tableau 5, no. 24, ‘But I am a Soviet man’ 197
4.5 *The Story of a Real Man*, Act IV, tableau 9, no. 30, Aleksey’s first letter to Olga 203
4.6 *The Story of a Real Man*, Act IV, tableau 10, no. 42, Aleksey’s second letter to Olga 204
4.7 *The Story of a Real Man*, Act IV, tableau 10, no. 43, Aleksey and Olga’s duet 206
4.8 *The Story of a Real Man*, Act IV, tableau 10, no. 41, ‘Aleksey’s return’ 209
## Tables

2.1 Themes in *Betrothal in a Monastery*, Act 3, tableau 6   page 93
2.2 Themes in *Betrothal in a Monastery*, Act 1, tableau 1  93
2.3 Themes in *Romeo and Juliet*, Act 1, tableau 2        94
3.1 *War and Peace*, original version (April 1942)       126
3.2 Revisions to tableau 11, 1942–52, with thematic reprises 152
3.3 Final version of *War and Peace*, 1952              157
4.1 Outline of *The Story of a Real Man*, with recurring themes and dates of completion of tableaux 177
Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I thank Marina Frolova-Walker, who suggested the topic of Prokofiev’s Soviet operas to me and guided my research in its early stages. I have benefited tremendously from her expert advice and from the example of her scholarship. I am grateful to all those who offered critical comments on earlier versions of the chapters of this book: David Fanning, Daniel Grimley, Sarah Hibberd, Robin Holloway, Steven Huebner, Jeffrey Levenberg, Simon Morrison, Roger Parker, and Benjamin Walton. I am particularly grateful to Nanette Nielsen for her unfailing support over many years. My heartfelt thanks to Vladimir Orlov for his hospitality and help with practical matters, and for his thorough reading of a late draft of the manuscript. I am deeply indebted to the staff at several archives: the Russian State Archive of Literature and Art, the Glinka Museum, the Russian National Library, and the Serge Prokofiev Archive. Thanks to Vicki Cooper and Kate Brett at Cambridge University Press and to my editor Arnold Whittall for their assistance in preparing this book for publication. Mark Audus and Tobias Fandel provided invaluable help with the music examples. I also wish to express my gratitude to the Prokofiev family for permission to reproduce manuscript materials.

Previous versions of two of the chapters have been published as articles: Chapter 1 as ‘Prokofiev’s Semyon Kotko and the melodrama of high Stalinism’, Cambridge Opera Journal, 21/3 (November 2009), 203–36, and Chapter 3 as ‘Kutuzov’s victory, Prokofiev’s defeat: the revisions of War and Peace’, Music & Letters, 90/3 (August 2009), 399–431. I am grateful to Cambridge Journals and to Oxford Journals for permission to reproduce these articles here, and I also thank the editors and anonymous readers of both journals for their comments and suggestions. Short research trips in 2015 to Moscow, St Petersburg, and New York, as well as time off from teaching duties, were made possible by an Early Career Scheme Award from the Research Grants Council of Hong Kong.

Finally, special thanks to Luiza Duarte Cardoso, whose sense of humour and taste for adventure have enlivened the last phase of research and writing. Our travels together included a ‘late Stalinism’-themed trip to Moscow and St Petersburg, during which she cheerfully endured (in...
addition to the Russian winter) Soviet-era cuisine, overnight trips on the Red Arrow, a revived 1950 production of a gloomy opera by Stalin’s favourite composer, and accommodation in a spacious but spooky apartment at the top of one of the Stalinskiye višotki.
Note on Terminology and Transliteration

A note of clarification is required in relation to the terminology used for act divisions. I have translated kartina, usually rendered as ‘scene’, instead as ‘tableau’, and the smaller division, stsena, as ‘scene’. ‘Tableau’ is of course also French for ‘scene’ as it is commonly understood in the musicological literature (especially on eighteenth- and nineteenth-century opera), usually corresponding to the second definition of ‘scene’ given in The New Grove Dictionary of Opera: ‘any part of an opera in a single location’.1 Prokofiev’s use of stsena, meanwhile, tends to follow New Grove’s third definition of ‘scene’: ‘A portion of an act during which the characters on the stage remain unchanged’. These translations should avoid potential ambiguity or confusion, while also providing a more logical match with Prokofiev’s unique structural arrangements, based as they are around rapid stage action.

The system of transliteration I have employed is that of Gerald Abraham, as described in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians, ed. Stanley Sadie, vol. 1 (London: Macmillan, 1980), xvi–xvii. The Russian letter ъ is rendered as Ĭ, the letter я as ya, and the letter ю as yu. The letter е at the beginning of a word, after vowels, and after hard or soft signs is transliterated as ye, and otherwise as e. Hard and soft signs are retained. Exceptions have been made in the use of the surname suffix -sky (rather than -ski), common spellings of familiar names (‘Prokofiev’ and ‘Tchaikovsky’ instead of ‘Proko’f’yev’ and ‘Chaykovskiy’), and the omission of soft signs from the names of characters in the operas and other dramatic works. In the bibliographic citations, the transliteration is strict.

Abbreviations of Archives

RGALI (Rossiyskiy gosudarstvennyi arkhiv literaturi i iskusstva) – Russian State Archive of Literature and Art, Moscow
RNB (Rossiyskaya natsional’naya biblioteka) – Russian National Library, St Petersburg

Note on Terminology and Transliteration

VMOMKG (Vserossiyskoye muzeynoye obyedineniye muzikal'noy kul'tury imeni M. I. Glinki) – All-Russian Consortium of Museums of Musical Culture, formerly GTsMMK (Gosudarstvennyi tsentral'nyi muzey muzikal'noy kul'tury imeni M. I. Glinki) – The Central State Glinka Museum of Musical Culture, Moscow