

## THIRD LANGUAGE ACQUISITION AND LINGUISTIC TRANSFER

Is acquiring a third language the same as acquiring a second? Are all instances of nonnative language acquisition simply one and the same? In this first book-length study of the topic, the authors systematically walk the reader through the evidence to answer these questions. They suggest that acquiring an additional language in bilinguals (of all types) is unique and reveals things about the links between language and mind, brain and cognition, which are otherwise impossible to appreciate. The patterns of linguistic transfer and what motivates it when there are choices (as can only be seen from third language acquisition onwards) underscore a key concept in linguistic and psychological sciences: economy. Overviewing the subfields examining multilingual acquisition and processing, this book offers an expanded systematic review of the field of multilingual morphosyntactic transfer and provides recommendations for the future emerging field.

JASON ROTHMAN is Professor of Linguistics at UiT The Arctic University of Norway and Nebrija University in Madrid, Spain.

JORGE GONZÁLEZ ALONSO is a Postdoctoral Researcher in Linguistics at UiT The Arctic University of Norway.

ELOI PUIG-MAYENCO is an ESRC Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the University of Southampton, United Kingdom.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-44343-3 — Third Language Acquisition and Linguistic Transfer  
Jason Rothman , Jorge González Alonso , Eloi Puig-Mayenco  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LINGUISTICS

*General Editors:* P. AUSTIN, J. BRESNAN, B. COMRIE, S. CRAIN,  
W. DRESSLER, C. J. EWEN, R. LASS, D. LIGHTFOOT, K. RICE, I. ROBERTS,  
S. ROMAINE, N. V. SMITH

---

*Third Language Acquisition and Linguistic  
Transfer*

*In this series*

119. D. ROBERT LADD: *Intonational Phonology* (Second Edition)
120. LEONARD H. BABBY: *The Syntax of Argument Structure*
121. B. ELAN DRESHER: *The Contrastive Hierarchy in Phonology*
122. DAVID ADGER, DANIEL HARBOUR and LAUREL J. WATKINS: *Mirrors and Microparameters: Phrase Structure beyond Free Word Order*
123. NIINA NING ZHANG: *Coordination in Syntax*
124. NEIL SMITH: *Acquiring Phonology*
125. NINA TOPINTZI: *Onsets: Suprasegmental and Prosodic Behaviour*
126. CEDRIC BOECKX, NORBERT HORNSTEIN and JAIRO NUNES: *Control as Movement*
127. MICHAEL ISRAEL: *The Grammar of Polarity: Pragmatics, Sensitivity, and the Logic of Scales*
128. M. RITA MANZINI and LEONARDO M. SAVOIA: *Grammatical Categories: Variation in Romance Languages*
129. BARBARA CITKO: *Symmetry in Syntax: Merge, Move and Labels*
130. RACHEL WALKER: *Vowel Patterns in Language*
131. MARY DALRYMPLE and IRINA NIKOLAEVA: *Objects and Information Structure*
132. JERROLD M. SADOCK: *The Modular Architecture of Grammar*
133. DUNSTAN BROWN and ANDREW HIPPLISLEY: *Network Morphology: A Defaults-based Theory of Word Structure*
134. BETTELOU LOS, CORRIEN BLOM, GEERT BOOIJ, MARION ELENBAAS and ANS VAN KEMENADE: *Morphosyntactic Change: A Comparative Study of Particles and Prefixes*
135. STEPHEN CRAIN: *The Emergence of Meaning*
136. HUBERT HAIDER: *Symmetry Breaking in Syntax*
137. JOSÉ A. CAMACHO: *Null Subjects*
138. GREGORY STUMP and RAPHAEL A. FINKEL: *Morphological Typology: From Word to Paradigm*
139. BRUCE TESAR: *Output-Driven Phonology: Theory and Learning*
140. ASIER ALCÁZAR and MARIO SALTARELLI: *The Syntax of Imperatives*
141. MISHA BECKER: *The Acquisition of Syntactic Structure: Animacy and Thematic Alignment*
142. MARTINA WILTSCHKO: *The Universal Structure of Categories: Towards a Formal Typology*
143. FAHAD RASHED AL-MUTAIRI: *The Minimalist Program: The Nature and Plausibility of Chomsky's Biolinguistics*
144. CEDRIC BOECKX: *Elementary Syntactic Structures: Prospects of a Feature-Free Syntax*
145. PHOEVOS PANAGIOTIDIS: *Categorial Features: A Generative Theory of Word Class Categories*
146. MARK BAKER: *Case: Its Principles and Its Parameters*
147. WM. G. BENNETT: *The Phonology of Consonants: Dissimilation, Harmony and Correspondence*
148. ANDREA SIMS: *Inflectional Defectiveness*
149. GREGORY STUMP: *Inflectional Paradigms: Content and Form at the Syntax-Morphology Interface*
150. ROCHELLE LIEBER: *English Nouns: The Ecology of Nominalization*
151. JOHN BOWERS: *Deriving Syntactic Relations*

152. ANA TERESA PÉREZ-LEROUX, MIHAELA PIRVULESCU and YVES ROBERGE:  
*Direct Objects and Language Acquisition*
153. MATTHEW BAERMAN, DUNSTAN BROWN and GREVILLE G. CORBETT:  
*Morphological Complexity*
154. MARCEL DEN DIKKEN: *Dependency and Directionality*
155. LAURIE BAUER: *Compounds and Compounding*
156. KLAUS J. KOHLER: *Communicative Functions and Linguistic Forms in Speech Interaction*
157. KURT GOBLIRSCH: *Gemination, Lenition, and Vowel Lengthening: On the History of Quantity in Germanic*
158. ANDREW RADFORD: *Colloquial English: Structure and Variation*
159. MARIA POLINSKY: *Heritage Languages and Their Speakers*
160. EGBERT FORTUIN and GETTY GEERDINK-VERKOREN: *Universal Semantic Syntax: A Semiotactic Approach*
161. ANDREW RADFORD: *Relative Clauses: Structure and Variation in Everyday English*
162. JOHN H. ESLING, SCOTT R MOISIK, ALLISON BENNER and LISE CREVIER-BUCHMAN: *Voice Quality: The Laryngeal Articulator Model*
163. JASON ROTHMAN, JORGE GONZÁLEZ ALONSO and ELOI PUIG-MAYENCO:  
*Third Language Acquisition and Linguistic Transfer*

*Earlier issues not listed are also available*

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-44343-3 — Third Language Acquisition and Linguistic Transfer  
Jason Rothman , Jorge González Alonso , Eloi Puig-Mayenco  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# THIRD LANGUAGE ACQUISITION AND LINGUISTIC TRANSFER

JASON ROTHMAN

*UiT The Arctic University of Norway & Nebrija University*

JORGE GONZÁLEZ ALONSO

*UiT The Arctic University of Norway*

ELOI PUIG-MAYENCO

*University of Southampton*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-44343-3 — Third Language Acquisition and Linguistic Transfer  
Jason Rothman, Jorge González Alonso, Eloi Puig-Mayenco  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107443433](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107443433)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316014660

© Jason Rothman, Jorge González Alonso, and Eloi Puig-Mayenco 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

First paperback edition 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Names: Rothman, Jason, author. | Gonzalez Alonso, Jorge, 1986– author. | Puig-Mayenco, Eloi, 1990– author.

Title: Third language acquisition and linguistic transfer / Jason Rothman, Jorge Gonzalez Alonso, Eloi Puig-Mayenco.

Description: New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: Cambridge studies in linguistics ; 163 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019018393 | ISBN 9781107082885 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Language transfer (Language learning) | Multilingualism. | Language acquisition. | Economy (Linguistics) | Language and languages – Study and teaching. | BISAC: LANGUAGE ARTS & DISCIPLINES / Linguistics / Psycholinguistics.

Classification: LCC P118.25 .R68 2019 | DDC 404/.2–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019018393>

ISBN 978-1-107-08288-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-44343-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-44343-3 — Third Language Acquisition and Linguistic Transfer  
Jason Rothman , Jorge González Alonso , Eloi Puig-Mayenco  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

**To Mom**  
**To Irati and Oihan**  
**To Laura**  
**In memory of David Rothman, Albert Puig-Mayenco and**  
**Blueberry**

# Contents

---

	<i>List of Figures</i>	Page xii
	<i>List of Tables</i>	xiv
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvi
<b>1</b>	<b>Setting the Context</b>	<b>1</b>
1.0	General Introduction	1
1.1	Setting the Stage	3
1.2	Adult Second Language Acquisition: Acquisition Potential and L1 Effects	8
	1.2.1 Can Grammatical Representations Distinct from One's Native Language Be Acquired in Adulthood?	12
	1.2.2 Is There a Critical Period for Adult Nonnative Language?	14
1.3	Who Is a Multilingual?	17
1.4	Linguistic Transfer as a Construct	23
1.5	Previous Language Experience ≠ Metalinguistic Knowledge	27
1.6	The Scientific Method in L3 Theorizing: Predictions and Falsifiability	31
1.7	Theory Building and the Importance of Solid Foundations	40
1.8	Taking Stock: The What, When, How and Why of Transfer in L3 Acquisition	42
<b>2</b>	<b>Theoretical Approaches to Sequential Multilingualism</b>	<b>45</b>
2.0	General Introduction	45
2.1	Cognitive Approaches	46
	2.1.1 Generative Approaches	47
	2.1.2 Usage-Based Approaches	51
	2.1.3 Multi-competence	56
	2.1.4 Dynamic Systems Theory	58
2.2	Sociolinguistic Approaches	61
2.3	Educational Approaches	67
2.4	Taking Stock: Multiple Perspectives, Multiple Interactions	73



x *Contents*

<b>3</b>	<b>Multilingual Lexis (Acquisition and Processing) and Phonology</b>	75
3.0	General Introduction	75
3.1	One Brain, Multiple Languages	76
3.2	Processing and the Multilingual Lexicon	80
	3.2.1 Language (Non)Selectivity in Lexical Access	81
	3.2.2 Lexical Representation and Incorporation in Multilingualism	87
	3.2.3 Verbal Fluency and Processing Speed	95
3.3	Lexical Acquisition in a Third or Further Language	99
3.4	Phonology in L3/ <i>L<sub>n</sub></i> Acquisition	107
3.5	Taking Stock	112
<b>4</b>	<b>Transfer in Multilingual Morphosyntax</b>	116
4.0	General Introduction	116
4.1	Transfer in L2 Acquisition	118
4.2	Current L3/ <i>L<sub>n</sub></i> Transfer Models	121
	4.2.1 The Default L1 Transfer Scenario	121
	4.2.2 The L2 Status Factor	127
	4.2.3 The Cumulative Enhancement Model	134
	4.2.4 The Linguistic Proximity Model	141
	4.2.5 The Scalpel Model	147
4.3	The Typological Primacy Model	154
	4.3.1 The Framework: Why Wholesale Transfer?	155
	4.3.2 Why the TPM Rejects the Role of Consciousness in Determining Typological Similarity	160
	4.3.3 How Does the Parser Determine Typological Proximity?	161
	4.3.4 Empirical Support	167
	4.3.5 Conclusions about the TPM	182
4.4	Taking Stock: Moving Toward an Overview of What the Available Data Can Tell Us	183
<b>5</b>	<b>A Review of Published Work</b>	188
5.0	General Introduction	188
5.1	Why a Systematic Review?	191
5.2	Study Retrieval and Inclusion Criteria	193
5.3	Demographics of Included Studies	194
5.4	Coding Procedure	196
	5.4.1 Macro variables	198
	5.4.2 Methodological Factors	207
5.5	Results: Correlations of Methodological Variables within Each Macro-Variable Category	211
	5.5.1 L1 Transfer	213
	5.5.2 L2 Transfer	215

5.5.3	Typological Transfer	217
5.5.4	Hybrid Transfer	220
5.5.5	Nonfacilitative Transfer	221
5.6	Interpreting the Data: Contextualizing and Understanding What Correlations Mean for Subsets and the Superset of Studies	223
5.7	Implications of Methodological Choice: A Snapshot from the Existing Literature	235
5.8	Taking Stock	243
<b>6</b>	<b>Moving On and Going Forward in L3/Ln Acquisition</b>	<b>247</b>
6.0	General Introduction	247
6.1	Is Transfer the Same in L3 Acquisition for All Bilingual Types?	248
6.1.1	Hopp (2018)	250
6.2	Consequences for the L1 and L2: Does the L3 Affect Them in the Same Way?	252
6.3	Is It Easier to Overcome L1 versus L2 Transfer during L3 Development?	254
6.4	A Note on Cross-Module Converging Evidence	256
6.5	Complementary Evidence from Neurolinguistic Methodologies	258
6.6	Taking Stock: A Few Closing Points	261
	<i>Appendix A</i>	263
	<i>Appendix B</i>	267
	<i>Appendix C</i>	270
	<i>References</i>	273
	<i>Index</i>	319

## Figures

---

3.1	Lexical triad for the Spanish word <i>gustar</i> , ‘like’	Page 93
4.1	Acquisition of L3 English relative clauses by Kazakh children and adults	138
4.2	Competition/resolution leads to neuroanatomical and cognitive function adaptive outcomes	158
4.3	The Typological Primacy Model’s cue hierarchy. Note that the relative size of the font and the ovals are meant to evoke the relative weight/order of applicability that each cue level has overall in the implicational hierarchy	163
5.1	Distribution of datasets from 2003 to 2018	195
5.2	Venn diagram showing overlap in the valuation of the four macro variables related to transfer source, as well as the compatibilities of the six models of L3 morphosyntactic transfer	205
5.3	Venn diagram for the four transfer source macro variables as related to the type variable (nonfacilitation)	206
5.4	Hypothetical graph explaining how to read the graphs in this section	212
5.5	Pie chart of proficiency in the L3 (methodological variable) distribution over the L1 transfer (macro-variable) studies	214
5.6	Pie chart for the methodological variable distribution across the L1 transfer (macro-variable) studies	215
5.7	Pie charts for the methodological variable distribution across the L2 transfer (macro-variable) studies	217
5.8	Pie chart for the methodological variable distribution across the typological transfer (macro-variable) studies	219
5.9	Pie chart for the methodological variable distribution across the hybrid transfer (macro-variable) studies	222
5.10	Pie chart for the methodological variable distribution across the nonfacilitative (macro-variable) studies	224

*List of Figures* xiii

5.11	Example of the experimental item in the CON+NPI condition	239
5.12	Example of the experimental item in the CON+NQ condition	239
5.13	Percentages of Catalan-like interpretation by condition and by group	241
5.14	Percentages of Catalan-like interpretation by condition and by group, after removing participants with high exposure to English	243

## Tables

---

4.1	Accuracy rates (%) by structure and grammaticality in AJT	<i>Page</i>	124
4.2	Negation placement, data collection A and B		131
4.3	The learners and their knowledge of V2 languages, data collection A		133
4.4	The learners and their knowledge of V2 languages, data collection B		133
4.5	Percentage of correct responses in all the conditions		145
4.6	Rejection (out of 10) in the GJT in each condition by each group		170
4.7	Distribution of SV order and VS order in BP, English and Spanish		177
5.1	Number of citations in Google Scholar		194
5.2	Binary value assignment to macro variables and factors in the study		197
5.3	Methodological factors included in the study		198
5.4	Distribution of studies by methodological factor within the L1 transfer subset (n=15), and p values for Fisher's exact tests on the associations between distribution and outcome		213
5.5	Distribution of studies by methodological factor within the L2 transfer subset (n=29), and p values for Fisher's exact tests on the associations between distribution and outcome		216
5.6	Distribution of studies by methodological factor within the typological transfer subset (n=59), and p values for Fisher's exact tests on the associations between distribution and outcome		218
5.7	Distribution of studies by methodological factor within the hybrid transfer subset (n=20), and p values for Fisher's exact tests on the associations between distribution and outcome		221

*List of Tables* xv

5.8	Distribution of studies by methodological factor within the nonfacilitative transfer subset (n=82), and p values for Fisher's exact tests on the associations between distribution and outcome	223
6.1	Predictions of electrophysiological components by model of L3/Ln morphosyntactic transfer in Rothman et al.'s (2015) methodology	261

## *Acknowledgments*

---

It is said that it takes a village to raise a child. It seems to us that this is even more true when your child is a research monograph. This book reflects the input – direct and indirect alike – of a long list of people. Imperfect as such an attempt is destined to be, we would be remiss not to try to thank everyone explicitly here.

First, to our beloved families – wonderful partners, children (human and pet alike), parents, siblings, friends and lab members/mates, whom we count as members of our families – this book would have been impossible without your support, understanding and generosity on so many levels. It is a testament to what you all bring to our lives in general, particularly to the indulgence with which you permit us to work crazy hours and deal with our ever-changing priorities and moods to accomplish this arduous task. This book would not have been possible had it not been for you, and so it stands most directly in your honor. We love you and thank you from the bottom of our hearts.

To our many colleagues in the field who have directly and indirectly shaped the content of this book, we are forever in your debt. We are especially grateful to all the researchers who have contributed to the emerging field of L3/*L<sub>n</sub>* morphosyntax; without them, we could not have written this book, and the field would not be as promising. A special note to our colleagues who have offered competing models: thank you for your ideas, argumentation, dedication to finding empirical answers to difficult questions and, most sincerely, for the many conversations (and critiques) we have had over the years. Although we do not see eye-to-eye on all the merits, we are proud to consider you all as cherished and respected colleagues, and even as our friends. Our nascent field is potentially special – or at least small – enough that mutual respect and, when necessary, collegial disagreement not only abound but are also the default. Although there will be statements and/or interpretations of ours with which you disagree, we hope that you find our treatment of your work and that of others accurate and handled with the respect we intended.

*Acknowledgments* xvii

We wish to acknowledge our gratitude to several colleagues who took the time to read parts of the book and offered very helpful comments: Terje Lohndal, Ellen Bialystok, David Green, Judith Kroll, Viorica Marian, Rex Sprouse, Tanja Kupisch, Bonnie Schwartz, Roumyana Slabakova, Fatih Bayram, Jennifer Cabrelli Amaro, Marit Westergaard, Tom Rankin, Itziar Laka, Elena Valenzuela, Mike Iverson, Tanja Angelovska, Rosalinde Stadt, Aafke Hulk, Laurent Deydtspotter, Jeanne McGill, Kathleen Bardovi-Harlig, Becky Halloran, Theres Grüter, Francesco Saldarini, Isabel Jensen, Bror Strand and Stela Leticia Kreveldj, as well as the anonymous reviewers of the manuscript. There is no doubt that your comments have improved this book enormously. If you should reread parts of it, we hope you will appreciate how very earnestly we took your suggestions and criticisms.

The team at CUP has been wonderful throughout the long process of writing this book. In particular, we wish to thank Helen Barton for her keen editorial eye, her encouragement and her relentless support. Most of all, we thank her for her patience with us. We also wish to thank the series editorial board for their support of the book, particularly Suzanne Romaine, whose rapid and exceedingly positive response to including the book in this series was extremely humbling.

Of course, we could not have taken on such a project without the support of our colleagues, institutions/centers, laboratories and students. In this regard, we wish to thank the School of Psychology and Clinical Language Sciences, the Centre for Literacy and Multilingualism (CeLM) and the Centre for Integrative Neuroscience and Neurodynamics (CINN) at the University of Reading, as well as the University of Reading's Psycho-/Neurolinguistics Lab. In addition, we thank the Department of Language and Culture and the Language Acquisition, Variation and Attrition (LAVA) research group at UiT The Arctic University of Norway as well as the Acquisition, Variation, and Attrition (AcqVA) cross-university research group in Norway (UiT and NTNU).