

Women, Language and Politics

Women, Language and Politics addresses the problem of the under-representation of women in politics by examining how language use constructs and maintains inequality in political institutions. Drawing on different political genres, from televised debates to parliamentary question times, and fifty interviews with politicians conducted between 1998 and 2018, the book identifies the barriers and obstacles women face by considering how gender stereotypes constrain women's participation and give women additional burdens. By comparing the UK House of Commons with newer institutions such as the Scottish Parliament, the National Assembly for Wales and the Northern Ireland Assembly, the book asks: how successful have newer institutions been in encouraging equal participation? What are the interactional procedures that can be thought of as making an institution more egalitarian? *Women, Language and Politics* also explores the workings and effects of sexism, fraternal networks, high visibility in the media and gendered discourses through detailed case studies of Theresa May, Julia Gillard and Hillary Clinton.

SYLVIA SHAW is Senior Lecturer in English Language and Linguistics at the University of Westminster. She is a sociolinguist who has conducted research projects in the House of Commons and the devolved political institutions of the UK. Her publications focus on gender, language and power in different types of political discourse.

Women, Language and Politics

Sylvia Shaw

University of Westminster



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-44026-5 — Women, Language and Politics
Sylvia Shaw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107440265

DOI: 10.1017/9781139946636

© Sylvia Shaw 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Shaw, Sylvia, 1969- author.

Title: Women, language and politics / Sylvia Shaw, University of Westminster.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019058889 | ISBN 9781107080881 (hardback) | ISBN 9781107440265 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Women--Political activity. | Women politicians. | Sex role--Political aspects. | Feminism--Political aspects. | Sexism in political culture. | Male domination (Social structure)

Classification: LCC HQ1236 .S48 2020 | DDC 320.082--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019058889>

ISBN 978-1-107-08088-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-44026-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-44026-5 — Women, Language and Politics
Sylvia Shaw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For my family, great and small

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>Transcription Conventions</i>	xix
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Overview and Aims	1
1.2 Language, Gender and Politics	4
1.2.1 Theoretical Approaches to Language and Gender	4
1.2.2 Women and Language in the Public Sphere and in the Workplace	9
1.3 Women, Men and Politics	16
1.4 Summary and Structure of the Book	21
2 Gender and Language in Political Institutions	24
2.1 Introduction: Linguistic Research into Gender in Parliamentary Contexts	24
2.2 Feminist Linguistic Methodology	29
2.3 Ethnography in the ‘Community of Practice’	30
2.4 Discourse Analytic Approaches	34
2.4.1 Conversation Analysis	34
2.4.2 Critical Discourse Analysis and Gendered Discourses	39
2.5 Case Studies	41
2.6 The Mixed Method Approach	42
3 Women’s Linguistic Participation in a Traditional Male-Dominated Forum – The UK House of Commons	47
3.1 The House of Commons as a Community of Practice (CoP)	47
3.2 Floor Apportionment in the House of Commons	50
3.3 Adversarial Language	60
3.3.1 Introduction	60
3.3.2 Identifying Adversarial Features in PMQs	62
3.4 Changing the ‘Key’ of Debates	79
3.4.1 Introduction	79
3.4.2 Humour in House of Commons Debates	80
3.4.3 Irony and Rule Breaking – Filibustering	86
3.5 Discussion – Gender and Rule-Breaking in the 1998–2001 House of Commons Corpus	91
	vii

viii Contents

4	Women's Linguistic Participation in the New Devolved Assemblies of the UK	96
4.1	The Devolved Political Assemblies as Communities of Practice	96
4.1.1	Introduction	96
4.1.2	Description of the Northern Ireland Assembly (NIA)	98
4.1.3	Description of the Scottish Parliament (SP)	102
4.1.4	Description of the National Assembly for Wales (NAW)	105
4.2	The Analysis of the Debate Floor	108
4.2.1	The Quantitative Analysis of Debate Turns Across the Four UK Parliaments	108
4.3	The Close Analysis of the Debate Floors in the Scottish Parliament, the Northern Ireland Assembly and the National Assembly for Wales	117
4.3.1	The Debate Floor of the Scottish Parliament	117
4.3.2	The Debate Floor of the Northern Ireland Assembly	121
4.3.3	The Debate Floor of the National Assembly of Wales	123
4.4	What Makes a Political Institution More Egalitarian?	124
4.5	Women's Progress in the New Institutions	131
5	Barriers to Women's Participation in Politics	138
5.1	Stereotypical Views of Women's Professional Behaviour	138
5.2	Adversarial Politics, the 'Different Voice' Ideology and the Burden of the Civilising Difference	142
5.3	Sexist Language towards Women Politicians	147
5.3.1	Forms of Sexist Language	147
5.3.2	Sexist Language and Sexual Harassment in the UK House of Commons	150
5.4	Hegemonic Masculinity, Homosocial Bonding, Fraternal Networks and the 'Boys' Club'	161
5.5	The Representation of Women Politicians in the Media	164
5.5.1	The Under-representation and Framing of Women Politicians in the Media	164
5.5.2	Gender and Mediated Representations of Speech and Voice	169
5.5.3	Linguistic Analyses of Gendered Representations in Media Texts	171
5.5.4	Why Does It Matter? How Does Gendered Mediation Affect Political Representation and Participation?	174
6	Case Study: Theresa May	178
6.1	Introduction: Rationale for the Selection and Inclusion of Case Studies	178
6.2	Theresa May	180
6.2.1	Introduction	180
6.2.2	Theresa May: Adversarial Language in Prime Minister's Question Time	183
6.2.3	Theresa May: Language, Sexism and Fraternal Networks	194
6.2.4	Theresa May: Gendered Media Representations	202
6.2.5	Summary	206
7	Case Studies: Julia Gillard and Hillary Clinton	211
7.1	Julia Gillard	211
7.1.1	Introduction	211
7.1.2	Julia Gillard: Adversarial Language and Sexism	213
7.1.3	Julia Gillard: The 'Sexism and Misogyny Speech'	218
7.1.4	Julia Gillard: Gendered Mediation and the 'Gender Wars' Backlash	222
7.1.5	Summary	226

Contents	ix
7.2 Hillary Clinton	227
7.2.1 Introduction	227
7.2.2 Hillary Clinton: Critical Gendered Moments in the US Presidential TV Debates with Donald Trump, 2016	227
7.2.3 Hillary Clinton: Gendered Stereotypes and Media Representation	236
7.2.4 Summary	241
8 Women, Language and Politics: Gains and Losses	243
8.1 Introduction	243
8.2 Taking, Holding and Yielding the Floor	243
8.2.1 Turn-Taking on the Official or ‘Legal’ Debate Floor	243
8.2.2 Turn-Taking on the Unofficial or ‘Illegal’ Debate Floor	246
8.3 Adversarial Language and Ideological Beliefs about Gender and Speech Styles in Politics	247
8.4 Gender, Language and Institutional Change	249
8.4.1 Progress and Change in the UK House of Commons	249
8.4.2 Progress and Change in the UK’s ‘New’ Devolved Institutions: What Makes an Institution More Egalitarian?	252
8.5 Future Directions for Research into Gender, Language and Politics in Institutions	256
8.5.1 Interdisciplinary Research and Parliamentary Reform	256
8.5.2 Interdiscursivity and the Construction and Strengthening of Homosocial Bonds across Events	257
8.6 Case Studies of Women Leaders and Barriers to Political Participation	260
Appendix A: Description of the House of Commons Data Corpus 1998–2001	267
Appendix B: Description of the Devolved Parliaments Data Corpus 2009–11	271
Appendix C: Adversarial Language in the May–Corbyn Prime Minister’s Question Times	275
Notes	277
References	283
Index	315

Figures

1.1	Anti-suffrage postcard sent to Christabel Pankhurst in 1909 (Source: © Museum of London)	<i>page 11</i>
3.1	Image of the House of Commons debating chamber looking towards the Speaker's chair (Source: Universal Images Group/Contributor/Getty Images)	48
3.2	Graph showing the number of adversarial and non-adversarial questions asked by men and women MPs in PMQT and DQT sessions	74
4.1	Image of the Northern Ireland Assembly building, Stormont, Belfast (Source: Tim Graham/Contributor/Getty Images)	99
4.2	Image of the debating chamber of the Northern Ireland Assembly, facing the Speaker's chair (Source: 'Assembly Chamber' by Northern Ireland Assembly is licensed under CCBY-ND 2.0. www.flickr.com/photos/niassembly/7440311610/in/album-72157630281414678/)	99
4.3	Image of the Scottish Parliament, Holyrood, Edinburgh (Source: Jeff J. Mitchell/Staff/Getty Images)	103
4.4	Image of the chamber of the Scottish Parliament, Holyrood, Edinburgh with the Presiding Officer's (moderator's) Chair on the left (Source: Christopher Furlong/Staff/Getty Images)	104
4.5	Image of the National Assembly for Wales, Cardiff Bay (Source: Matthew Horwood/Contributor/Getty Images)	106
4.6	Image of the debating chamber of the National Assembly for Wales, facing the Presiding Officer (Source: Loop Images/Contributor/Getty Images)	106
4.7	Graph showing the percentage of men and women politicians in each institution in 2007–11	110
4.8	Graph showing the percentage of speaking turns taken by women and men in the sample for each institution	110
4.9	Graph showing the percentage of 'allocated turns' taken by men and women politicians in a sample of proceedings from each institution	112
		xi

xii	List of Figures	
4.10	Graph showing the percentage of ‘spontaneous turns’ taken by men and women politicians in a sample of proceedings from each institution	114
4.11	Chart showing the percentages of different types of turns taken by MSPs in the Scottish Parliament	126
4.12	Chart showing the percentages of different types of turns taken by AMs in the National Assembly for Wales	126
4.13	Graph showing the representation of political parties in the National Assembly for Wales and the total speaking turns by party in the sample of proceedings	127
6.1	Image of Theresa May giving her speech at the Conservative Party conference in September 2017 (Source: Carl Court/Staff/Getty Images)	183
6.2	Graph showing how much May and Corbyn used each of seven adversarial features in a sample of PMQs	186
6.3	Graffiti image of Theresa May, June 2017. Mortimer St, London W1 (Source: Unknown artist, photo by Sylvia Shaw)	205
6.4	Screenshot of Theresa May’s Tweet about being a ‘bloody difficult woman’ 4 March 2018 (Source: https://twitter.com/theresa_may)	208
6.5	Theresa May crying at the end of her resignation speech, 24 May 2019 (Source: Leon Neal/Staff/Getty Images)	210
7.1	Image of Julia Gillard and Tony Abbott in Question Time in the House of Representatives, 5 February 2013 (Source: Stefan Postles/Stringer/Getty Images)	218
7.2	Image of Hillary Clinton and Donald Trump during the second presidential debate at Washington University in St. Louis, Missouri, 9 October 2016 (Source: Robyn Beck/Staff/Getty Images)	235

Tables

2.1	Summary of data and methods in the book	<i>page 44</i>
3.1	Table showing the number and percentage of women and men MPs in the 1997–2001 parliament	56
3.2	Table showing the number and percentage of (legal) turns taken by men and women MPs in the whole corpus	56
3.3	Question forms used by Hague in PMQs (3 March 1999)	66
3.4	The assertions, question and responses to one of Hague’s turns	67
3.5	Table showing the number of questions asked by men and women MPs showing their parliamentary status and political party in a corpus of PMQs and DQ sessions 1998–2001	68
3.6	The way in which adversarial features were classified	73
3.7	Table showing the number of adversarial questions asked by men and women MPs according to their political party and status	74
3.8	Table showing adversarial and non-adversarial responses by senior and junior MPs in DQ sessions	76
4.1	Table showing MLAs in the Northern Ireland Assembly (third term 2007–11)	101
4.2	Table of MSPs in the Scottish Parliament (third term 2007–11)	105
4.3	Table showing AMs in the National Assembly for Wales (third term 2007–11)	107
5.1	Newspaper headlines about the naming of Emily Thornberry as ‘Lady Nugee’ in the UK House of Commons on the 27 March 2018	173
6.1	Timeline of Theresa May’s premiership and significant events, 2016–19	182
7.1	Timeline of Julia Gillard’s premiership and significant events, 1998–2013	212
7.2	Timeline of significant events – Hillary Clinton 1993–2017	228
8.1	Possible factors affecting the uptake of speaking turns in political institutions	245
8.2	An example of linked events over time (Lady Nugee)	260
		xiii

Acknowledgements

Many people have supported me in the research and writing stages of the work presented in this book. I would like to acknowledge the contribution of all the research participants in the House of Commons, the Northern Ireland Assembly, the National Assembly for Wales and the Scottish Parliament. I am extremely grateful for their time, good nature and willingness to participate in the interviews for the projects. I am also very grateful to Denis Oag in the Scottish Parliament and Elizabeth Connolly in the Northern Ireland Assembly for helping with practical arrangements in the institutions and for sharing their valuable insider knowledge and suggestions. The research in the devolved parliaments was also supported by Stephen Pihlaja, Irene Lucking and Lucy Dawson, who helped with the classification and enumeration of speaking turns, the transcription of interview data, administration and travel arrangements. Thanks also to Roshi Naidoo and Phil Cole for their hospitality while I was undertaking research in Cardiff.

Next, I would like to acknowledge the financial support I have received from the Economic and Social Research Council; from Middlesex University in the initial stages of writing this book; and from the School of Humanities, University of Westminster, for awarding me a research sabbatical to complete the book in 2018–19. Thanks also to colleagues who commented on drafts of the chapters: Jane Arthurs, Andrew Caink, Anna Charalambidou, Lucy Jones, Petros Karatsareas, Damien Ridge, and Louise Sylvester; to the anonymous US reviewer who made valuable suggestions, particularly about the Hillary Clinton case study in Chapter 7 and to Helen Barton at Cambridge University Press. Billy Clark has been present in my working life through all the stages of the twenty years of research discussed here, and I am very grateful for the positive advice and support he has given me over those years. Similarly, Deborah Cameron has been an inspirational, witty and knowledgeable supervisor, mentor and then co-author in this period. I have also been lucky enough to work in environments in which I have been encouraged by my colleagues, whether a quick conversation by the photocopier or more detailed advice about research and publications, and this is greatly appreciated.

xvi Acknowledgements

Finally, I would not have managed to write this book without the kindness, encouragement and support of family and friends who have listened to me and kept my spirits up in times of need. Most importantly, to Rob and the boys, who have patiently shared the daily ups and downs of research and writing and who have lost me to multiple field trips and to the office in the loft for weeks on end – thank you.

Abbreviations

AL	Alliance Party (Northern Ireland)
AM	Assembly Member (National Assembly for Wales)
BAME	black, Asian and minority ethnic
CA	Conversion Analysis
CDA	Critical Discourse Analysis
CMP	current MP (the MP with the current ‘legal’ speaking turn)
Con	Conservative Party (UK)
CoP	community of practice
DQTs	departmental question times
DUP	Democratic Unionist Party (Northern Ireland)
EU	European Union
FM	first minister
FMQs	first minister’s questions
HoC	House of Commons, Westminster, UK
HoR	House of Representatives (Australian National Parliament)
IMP	intervening MP (the MP intervening on the CMP, either legally or illegally)
LAB	Labour Party (UK)
LibDem	Liberal Democrats Party (UK)
LO	leader of the opposition
MLA	Member of the Legislative Authority (Northern Ireland Assembly)
MP	Member of Parliament (of the UK House of Commons)
MSP	Member of the Scottish Parliament
NAW	National Assembly for Wales, Cardiff, UK (to be renamed ‘Welsh Assembly’)
NIA	Northern Ireland Assembly, Belfast, UK
OR	official report
PC	Plaid Cymru (the national party of Wales)
PM	prime minister
PMQs	Prime Minister’s Questions

xviii	List of Abbreviations
SDLP	Social Democratic and Labour Party (Northern Ireland)
SF	Sinn Féin (Northern Ireland)
SNP	Scottish Nationalist Party (the national party of Scotland)
SP	Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, UK
SRW	the substantive representation of women
U	an illegal utterance that is ‘unattributable’ to an individual speaker
UUP	Ulster Unionist Party (Northern Ireland)
VAW-P	Violence against women in politics

Transcription Conventions

[beginning of an overlapping utterance with the line above/below
]	end of an overlapping utterance with the line above/below
CAPS	increased volume, shouting
underline	particular emphasis on word or syllable
(.)	micropause of under a second
(3)	pause in seconds
=	latching – one utterance runs straight on from the next without a pause
(laughter)	round brackets indicate noises such as cheering or laughter