

INDEX

A and others (ECHR), 340 modern flowering of illiberal A v Australia (UNHCR), 161–2, 163, potential of, 57 165, 333, 336 permanent emergency power, as, A v Secretary of State for Home 207-8, 209-12 Department (Belmarsh state sovereignty and, 224 decision, UK), 222-31, 248, war power, as extension of, 57, 209, 253, 312, 327, 332, 342 266 - 9ACLU (American Civil Liberties Aliens Restriction Act 1914 (UK), 45 Union), 236 alternatives to detention, 337–8 America. See United States Act to Regulate Immigration 1882 American Civil Liberties Union (US), 11-13Agamben, G., 300-1 (ACLU), 236 Ahsan and others, R v Governor of Amuur v France (ECHR), 147-8 Brixton Prison, ex parte (UK), anarchists, historical fears regarding, 82, 83, 84 36, 207 airport detentions, 146-8, 289 Angel Island, 19 Akrich (ECJ), 201 anti-terrorism. See terrorism and Al Kateb v Godwin (Australia), 104-7, immigration detention 324, 341, 343 Anti-terrorism and Effective Death Alexseev, M. A., 274 Penalty Act 1996 (US), Algerian Wars, French detentions 212 during, 108, 109 Anti-terrorism Crime and Security Act Aliens Act 1793 (UK), 36, 39 2001 (ACSA; UK). See under Alien Act 1798 (US), 3–4, 29 terrorism and indefinite Aliens Act 1905 (UK), 36-43 detention aliens power arbitrary power, immigration Australia, constitutionality of aliens detention as residue of, xix-xx power in, 98, 100, 103, Arenc, French detention centre at, 109, 105-6 111 Arendt, Hannah, 301, 303 concept of, xi, xiv ECHR, detention viewed as ancillary Asian boat people to aliens power in, 140-1 Australia, in. See under Australia Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people French Constitution, status of aliens power under, 108 in, 143, 158, 159 historical establishment of, 6-8, asylum seekers. See refugees, asylum 57 seekers and stateless persons



378 INDEX

Australia, 98-107, 116 Bakhtiyari v Australia (UNHCR), 294 Asian boat peoples crisis, 98–9 Baumbast (ECJ), 177 ICCPR, UNHCR challenges to Beatty, David, 331-2 detention policies under, 158, Bechta case (France), 113 161 - 3Belmarsh decision (A v Secretary of indefinite detention of, 101–3 State for Home Department), Nauru and Maunus, detention UK, 222-31, 248, 253, 312, 327, centres on, 103 332, 342 non-punitive nature of detention Benhabib, S., 303, 317 'blame' testing of detention cases by of, 100–1, 103 bonding bail, and parole, removal of ECHR, 141-6, 153-5, 156, 157 option of, 100 boat people constitutionality of aliens power in, Australia, in. See under Australia 98, 100, 103, 105-6 Cuban and Haitian flotillas arriving detention centres, poor conditions in US, mandatory detention and unrest at, 283-5 for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, equal liberty for aliens and citizens, 273, 281 rejection of, 105, 107 Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people extra-territorial jurisdiction over in, 143, 158, 159 aliens in, 38 bonding, bail and parole, xxi goal of immigration detention as as alternatives to detention, 337-8 end in itself in, 334 Australia, boat people crisis and, 100 habeas corpus tradition in, 99, 107 Cold War detention and denial of, legislative origins of mandatory 62,63 detention in, 325 Cuban and Haitian flotillas arriving non-white alien workers, historical in US, adoption of mandatory restrictions on, 38, 98 detention for, 67-9 political expediency, abandonment historical US practice of, 14, 17-18, of individual liberty to, 314 proportionality in, 333 Immigration Act 1952 (US), range remoteness, effects of, 98 of alternatives under, 64-5 segregation of aliens, Al Kateb 9/11, refusal of bail to immigrants jailed in US after, 234 decision regarding, 104-7 UN Working Group on Arbitrary right to seek bail and routine bail Detention, criticism of, 164 hearings in UK, 88, 91 vulnerable groups, detention of, 294, Russian Revolution, potential anarchists detained in wake of, 295 authorized aliens concept of, xii WW One, during, 32 in EU, 182-5 border controls Refugee Convention on lawfully EU common code on border versus unlawfully present movements, 184 refugees, 128-9, 138 foreign relations power, as aspect of, Azam v Secretary of State (UK), 83 310 fundamental rights, without Baban v Australia (UNHCR), 162 sacrifice of, 303-7 bail, bond, or parole. See bonding, bail, goal of immigration detention, as,

and parole



INDEX 379

historical development of, 1, 6-8 state sovereignty encouraging, 258 Bosniak, L., 350 Boumediene (US Supreme Court), 246-9 Britain. See United Kingdom Buchanan, A., 259 bureaucratic process, immigration detention as, xiii-xiv, xix-xx, 57, 79 Burlingame Treaty, 20, 119 C v Australia (UNHCR), 162, 165, 166, 296, 336 Cain, Attorney General for Canada v (UK), 38 Cambodian boat people in Australia. See under Australia Canada, historical restrictions on non-white alien workers in, 38 Caprino v United Kingdom (ECHR), 142, 150, 176 Carens, J., 260 Carlson v Landon (US Supreme Court), 62 - 3Carpenter (ECJ), 201 Casati (ECJ), 177 Castles, S., 269 CEDAW (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women), 167 centres for detention. See detention centres Cesarani, D., 45 Chae Chan Ping v United States (US Supreme Court), 24, 120 Chahal (ECHR), xvi, 144, 148-50, 156, 198, 214, 219, 320

Clinton, William Jefferson, 241 Cold War Communists, US detention of, 59-64, 207 Refugee Convention and, 127 Refugee Convention (1951) and, 298 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons during, 125 Cole, D., 239, 341 Commonwealth citizens, UK immigration controls aimed at, 79,80-5 Communist subversion, US detentions due to fear of, 59-64, 207 communities of character, 264 Constitution, Australian, aliens power under, 98, 100, 103, 105-6 Constitution, French equal liberty of aliens and citizens ensured under, 110-12 extension of detention period and, 114-15 international transit zones, extra-legal detention in, 112 status of aliens power under, 108 Constitution, US Mariel boat peoples' right to parole consideration, 68 unadmitted aliens viewed as beyond constitutional protection, 60-2, constitutional right to liberty in Britain, 91 in EU, 195, 197-201 judicial review and, 326 unauthorized persons generally, of, 313 constitutional status of aliens, lack of clarity regarding, 323-4 constitutional traditions, immigration detention in conflict with, xii, xiii-xiv Contract Labour Act of 1885 (US), 13 control order regime in UK replacing indefinite detention of suspected terrorists, 231-3 Convention Against Torture, 167

children, detention of, 290-6

18-29, 119

Churchill, Winston, 39, 43

279-87

Claghorn, K. H., 31

Chinese migrant labourers to US,

civil unrest in detention centres,

77-9, 154, 326

Clark v Martinez (US Supreme Court),



380 INDEX

Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), 167

Convention on the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (1949), 127

Convention on the Rights of Migrant Workers, 122

Convention on the Rights of Migrants Workers and their Families, 123

Convention on the Rights of the Child, 167, 291, 292–3, 294, 295

Council of Europe

anti-terrorism and

non-discrimination standards, 224

detention, interpretation of rules regarding, 187–9, 191

duration of detention, on, 194

ECHR. See European Convention on/Commission/Court of Human Rights

on interpretation of rules regarding detention, 187–9, 191

counter-terrorism. *See* terrorism and immigration detention

courts. See judicial review, and specific international courts

CPT (European Committee on the Prevention of Torture), 145, 287 crime and criminals

administrative detention, criminal sanctions as alternative to, 349–50

EU citizens, detention within EU, 175–8

failure to comply with removal process, US criminalization of, 65–7

French due process requirements, immigrants, association of moral panic with, 207

legal status of detainees approximating, xvii

nationality, criminal law applicable without regard to, 210

political visibility of criminal immigrants, 277

proportionality in treatment of, 340–2

security concerns as political tool, 271–2

UK foreign prisoners emergency, 95–7

UN on criminalization of unauthorized aliens, 167–8 undesirable aliens, early detention of, x–xi

Cuban American Bar Association and others v Christopher (US), 241

Cuban and Haitian flotillas arriving in US, mandatory detention for, 67–9, 77, 132, 240–2, 250, 273, 281

D and E v Australia (UNHCR), 163 damages

for detention of suspected terrorists after 9/11 in US, 236

for mistaken detention of EU citizens, 179

for unlawful imprisonment in UK, 93, 94–5

Danyal Safiq v Australia (UNHCR), 163

Dauvergne, C., 253, 318

defence powers applied to enemy aliens in wartime, 210

Demore v Kim (US Supreme Court), 75–7, 327

deportation

continuing link between detention and, 6, 28

EU citizens requiring social assistance, of, 178

EU Returns Directive, 185, 190–7 non-compliance with. *See*

non-compliance with removal process

possibility of, detention as conditional upon, 194

security-based detention divorced from, 208

torture, aliens at risk of, 214, 317 detention as means of immigration control. *See* immigration detention



INDEX 381

detention centres conditions at, 278-9, 282-3, 285-7, 288-90 extra-legal spaces, as. See extra-legal spaces, detention centres as unrest in, 279-87 Dicey, A. V., 37 Dublin Convention (1990), 189 due diligence test, ECHR, 141-6, 152-4, 156, 230 due process British proposals around time of French Revolution to restrict alien entry without, 5 equal right to liberty and access to, 342 - 3French requirements for arrest and detention of immigrants, ICCPR requirements, 319–20 in United States Alien Act 1798, 4 Cold War concerns about Communist aliens, 62 Demore v Kim on, 76 Dummett, A., 36 duration of immigration detention. See also indefinite detention EU member states, in, 191 EU Returns Directive, under, 193-6 fair balance between community and individual interests, striking, 338-40 in United States Chinese immigrant labourers, 21 - 3East Coast, limited duration of historical detentions on, 15-17 Immigration Act 1952, time limits imposed by, 65 unauthorized aliens under mandatory detention, 70 Dworkin, R., 248, 253, 323, 328 Dyzenhaus, D., 315, 322, 329, 348

ECHR. See European Convention on/Commission/Court of Human Rights ECJ. See European Court of Justice economic migration EU citizens within EU, of, 174-9 free movement, liberal principle of, ix-x, 1, 257 legal aliens, concept of, xii migrant workers, defined, 122 modern international trade liberalization mostly not applicable to, xiv post-WW Two encouragement of, 57, 58, 121 Refugee Convention delegates on, 129 restrictions from 1970s, 121 Russian Revolution, immigration fears related to, 30-1 unauthorized aliens and, xi Elias, A., 40 Ellis Island, 15, 16, 30, 36, 60, 64 emergency powers, xvii, 207–8, 209-12, 347-8 enemy aliens. See war and immigration detention England. See United Kingdom 'entry fiction,' in US Immigration Act 1891, 13 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, 124 Australian rejection of, 105, 107 border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons, 350 due process rights for all deprivations of liberty, 342-3 ECHR on, 149-55, 319 EU, in, 195, 197-201 France, in, 110-12 human right, as, 123 ICCPR, under, 319 other fundamental rights apart from those relating to detention, 253 'prison with three walls' argument, 112-13, 146-8, 155, 227 proportionality in treatment of genuinely dangerous detainees and, 340-2 security-based detention and denial of, 208-9, 252-5



382 INDEX

equal liberty for aliens (cont.) terrorist threat, indefinite detention for purposes of, 252-5 UK, in, 222, 224-6, 228 US, in, 243, 246-9 UK assertion of, 86–8, 222, 224–6, 228 EU. See European Union European Charter of Fundamental Rights, 198 **European Commission** asylum detention, interpretation of, 187 - 9on duration of detention, 193 European Committee on the Prevention of Torture (CPT), 145, 287 **European Convention** on/Commission/Court of Human Rights (ECHR), 140-57, 319-20 ACSA (UK), indefinite detention of suspected terrorists under, 216-17, 218, 219, 220, 222, 230 - 1airport detentions, on, 146-8, 289 aliens power, detention viewed as ancillary to, 140-1 Belmarsh decision, confirmation of, 230 - 1'blame' testing, on, 141-6, 153-5, 156, 157 deportation, detention as conditional on possibility of, 194 due diligence test, 141-6, 152-4, 156, 230 emergency powers, Court on, 347 equal right to liberty, on, 149-55, 319 EU legislation's compliance with fundamental rights under, 197, ICCPR compared to Convention, 158, 159

on non-compliance with removal process, 153-5 Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation of 2002, 155 proportionality in, 332 purely administrative detention, restraints on, 150-6 torture, Convention forbidding of deportation of aliens at risk of, 214, 317 UK incorporation of Convention, 80 vulnerable groups, detention of, 292 - 3European Court of Justice (ECJ) asylum seekers, case law on detention of, 186 on free movement rights of EU citizens, 176-8 principles of EU law evolved by, 171 proportionality in, 332 review of EU legislation for compliance with fundamental rights by, 197-201 rights of non-citizens, failure to address, 195 European Parliament on duration of detention, 193 on interpretation of rules regarding detention, 187-9, 191 Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation of 2002, 155 European Union (EU), 171-206 See also specific Member States free movement and non-detention of EU citizens, 172-3, 174-9, 317 Member State control of immigration and detention, loss of, 202-4 non-EU citizens, control over movement of, 173-4, 182 asylum seekers, 182, 185-9 authorized alien immigration left to Member States, 182-5 constitutional right to liberty, 195, 197-201 divergence between EU Member States as to detention practices, 187, 191

judicial review requirements, 331

necessity test, 148-50, 153, 155



INDEX 383

duration of detention, 193-6 evolution of supranational EU powers, 179-82 non-compliance with removal process, 193, 196, 350 rule of law, avoidance of, 196-7 security concerns as key feature of, 180, 181 unauthorized aliens, 182, 185, 190-3, 199-201 Schengen Treaty (1985) and system, 180 security concerns, 171, 172, 173 EU citizens, 174-9 non-EU citizens, 180, 181 unauthorized aliens, 185 social assistance, expulsion of EU citizens requiring, 178 state sovereignty and, 171, 172, 173 European Union (EU) Asylum Procedures Directive, 185, 187 - 9European Union (EU) border agency, creation of, 203 European Union (EU) common code on border movements, 184 European Union (EU) Directive on Long-Term Residents, 183 European Union (EU) Directive on Temporary Protection, 183 European Union (EU) Family Reunification Directive, 183, European Union (EU) Reception Conditions Directive, 185-7, 189, 196 European Union (EU) Returns Directive, 185, 190-7, 313, 333, European Union (EU) Students Directive, 184

extra-legal space, detention centres as, xviii-xix, 299-303. See also outsourcing/offshoring of detainees airport detentions, 146-8, 289 civil and criminal protections available to detainees, 301 disembarked detained passengers under UK Aliens Act 1905, 41 'entry fiction', US Immigration Act 1891, 13 French law on international transit zones, 112-13 judicial review, detention outside of, 302 'prisons with three walls', 112-13, 146-8 security-based detentions, 209 extra-territorial jurisdiction, 302 Australia, in, 38 Cubans and Haitians detained at Guantanamo Bay, challenges to, facilities for detention. See detention

Facilities for detention. See detention centres
Fallon, R. H., 249
Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), US, 233–6
Finnis, J., 228
Fletcher, G. P., 248
Fong Yue Ting v United States
(US Supreme Court), 26
Ford Committee, 12
foreign relations power, immigration control viewed as aspect of, 310
France, 107–16, 117–18
aliens power, constitutional status of, 108

of, 108
Article 120, internments under, 108–10
criminal due process requirements for arrest and detention of immigrants, deportation targets, adoption of, 115
duration of detention, limits on, 191

Executive Committee Conclusion 44,

executive versus legislative detention,

expulsion. See deportation

134-6, 139, 148, 151, 188

judicial review of, 79, 325-6

Ewing, K., 53



384 INDEX

France (cont.)

equal liberty for aliens and citizens, constitutional safeguards for, extension of constitutional detention period, 114-15 international transit zones, extra-legal detention in, 112 - 13number of unauthorized aliens, asylum seekers and detainees in, 115 police powers, immigration detention viewed as exercise of, 58, 108 pre-legislative scrutiny of detention policy in, 108-10, 325 free movement EU citizens, of, 172-3, 174-9, 317 liberal tradition of, ix-x, 1, 257 French Revolution, immigration fears related to, 3, 5 Galloway, D., 264-6, 307, 322 Gearty, C., 53 Geary Act of 1892 (US), 26 Geneva Conventions, 210, 240 Germans during WW One and WW Two, UK and US detention of, 29, 45-8, 50, 211 Germany duration of detention, limits on, UNCHR criticism of detention in West Germany, 133 Gibney, M. J., 259 Global Commission on International Migration, 167

political visibility of large influxes, 277, 278 UK, in, 93, 279 US, in, 59, 63 Guantanamo Bay, 209, 213, 239-50, 302, 312, 327, 330, 343 Guild, E., 198, 200 Guiraudon, V., 275 Gulf War detentions in UK, 212 habeas corpus tradition Australia, in, 99, 107 citizens and aliens not distinguished in, ix criminal law, detention under, 210 historical guarantee against unlawful immigration measures, loss of, 2, 5, 55 judicial reconciliation of migration controls with, 322 politicization of immigration detention eroding, 57, 58 UN concern over adequacy of, 159 United Kingdom, in citizens detained under Reg. 14B of Defence of the Realm Regulations during WW One, detainees without status, right to liberty of, 91 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 86 United States, in Chinese immigrant labourers, 19-21, 24 East Coast, immigration applications on, 17 Guantanamo detainees, jurisdiction over, 243, 246, 330 plenary powers undermining, Russian Revolution, detention of potential anarchists in wake of,

unlimited/indefinite detention,

challenges to, 71-5

Global Detention Project, 257

Great Britain. See United Kingdom

modern tendency toward, 58

individualized detention decisions, importance of, 336

Great War. See World War One

Golove, D., 245

Gross, O., 229

'group' detention

Goodwin-Gill, G., 133



INDEX 385

Haddad, E., 126, 139, 269 Haitian and Cuban flotillas arriving in US, mandatory detention for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 Halliday, R v (UK), 50 Hamdan v Rumsfeld (US Supreme Court), 246, 247, 248 Hamdi v Rumsfeld (US Supreme Court), 244–6, 248 Hardial Singh, R v Governor of Durham Prison ex parte (UK), 89, 96, 103 Hassan, R v Governor of of Risley ex parte (UK), 84-5 Hathaway, J. C., 128 Held, D., 288 Henderson v Mayor of New York (US Supreme Court), 9 Hill Maher, K., 317 historical development of immigration detention, 1-56 border as site of regulation, 1, 6-8 centralized state control over aliens, development of, 6-8 in UK, 36-54. See also under United Kingdom in US, 8-36. See also under United States expulsion and detention, continuing link between, 6, 28 French Revolution, immigration fears related to, 3, 5 in international law, 119-21, 124-6 liberal tradition of free movement of aliens, ix-x, 1, 257 undesirable aliens, early detention of, x-xi WW One and WW Two. See World War One; World War Two Hobbes, Thomas, 266, 268, 314 Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people in, 143, 158, 159 human rights, 121-4 border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 ECHR. See European Convention on/Court/Commission of **Human Rights**

liberty, right to, 123 migration, qualified right of, 124 of refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons, xvi, 121–3 sovereignty concept in conflict with, 121 unauthorized aliens, of, xv-xvii, 121 - 4UNHRC (UN Human Rights Committee) and ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights universality of. See equal liberty for aliens and citizens Hutchinson, E. P., 17 Hutto, In Re (US), 293 ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ID and others v Home Office (UK), 95 illegal aliens. See unauthorized aliens Immigration Act 1891 (US), 13-14 Immigration Act 1893 (US), 14-15 Immigration Act 1917 (US), 32 Immigration Act 1952 (US), 64-5 Immigration Act 1971 (UK), 81, 83, 84-5, 88 Immigration and Nationality Act, US, 238 Immigration and Naturalization Service (INS), US, 234, 235 immigration detention, ix-xxiii aliens power, concept of, xi, xiv. See also aliens power arbitrary power, as residue of, xix-xx as bureaucratic process, xiii-xiv, xix-xx, 57, 79 constitutional traditions in conflict with, xii, xiii-xiv EU, in, 171-206. See also European Union expulsion never unhinged from, 6 extra-legal nature of detention centres, xviii-xix. See also extra-legal space, detention centres as

goals of, determining, 333-6



386 INDEX

immigration detention (*cont.*) growth in scope and scale of, ix, xii,

historical development of, 1–56. *See* also historical development of immigration detention

international law and, 119–70. See also international law and immigration detention

judicial system and. *See* judicial system

legal status of detained foreigners, xvii–xviii, xix–xx

liberal tradition of free movement of aliens and, ix–x, 1, 257

modern practice of, 57–118. *See also* modern immigration detention practice since WW Two

political issue, as, xix–xxi. See also political issue, immigration detention as

rule of law and, xxii–xxiii, 310–53. See also rule of law and immigration detention

security measure, as, 207–55. See also security and immigration detention

unauthorized aliens, of. *See* unauthorized aliens

impartialists, 259–62

indefinite detention

Australia, modern policy of mandatory indefinite detention in, 98–107

ECHR due diligence approach to and 'blame' testing of, 141–6

terrorism, as means of combating. *See* terrorism and indefinite detention

UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention on, 165

United Kingdom, in

as counter-terrorist measure. See under terrorism and indefinite detention

damages for unlawful imprisonment, 93, 94–5

foreign prisoners emergency, 95–7

historical development during WW One and post-war period, 45–54

restrictions on, 88-91

United States, in

as counter-terrorist measure. *See under* terrorism and indefinite detention

current practice, effect of Zadvydas and Martinez cases on, 77–9

historical development during WW One and post-war period, 33–4

of *Mariel* boat people, 68 modern challenges to, 71–5 Supreme Court's Cold War

Supreme Court's Cold War deference to government on, 62

individualized detention decisions, importance of, 336 INS (Immigration and Naturalization

Service), US, 234, 235

international cooperation on immigration controls, ix

International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 167, 224

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 157–66

ACSA (UK), indefinite detention of suspected terrorists under, 222, 224

Article 9 prohibiting arbitrary detention, 159–61 due process requirements, 319

ECHR compared, 158, 159 equal right to liberty under, 319

EU legislation's compliance with

fundamental rights under, 197 extreme nature of cases handled by, 320

growing concerns from mid-1990s and, 158–9, 163–5 proportionality under, 161–3



INDEX 387

US detention of aliens after 9/11 as violation of, 237 Working Group on Arbitrary

Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, 159, 163–5

International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights, 167, 224

international law and immigration detention, 119–70

absence of legal framework for migration and migrant rights, xiv-xv

bureaucratic rather than judicial process, immigration detention as, xiii

criminalization of unauthorized aliens, on, 167–8

ECHR. See European Convention on/Court/Commission of Human Rights

Executive Committee Conclusion 44 on, 134–6, 139, 148, 151, 188

historical development of, 119–21, 124–6

human rights. See human rights ICCPR and. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

'outlaw' status of detainees in international law, 296–9

political pressure for accountability, 287–90

proportionality guidelines. See proportionality

Refugee Convention (1951). See
Refugee Convention

rule of law, limits on guardianship of, 316–21

state sovereignty, concept of, 120.

See also state sovereignty

LIK Royal Commission of 1905 on

UK Royal Commission of 1905 on, 36, 38

UNHCR on, 131-8

WW Two and Cold War refugee crisis, 124–6

International Refugee Organization, 125 Ireland, no limits on duration of detention in, 191

irregular aliens. *See* unauthorized aliens

Italy

conditions for detainees in, 286 outsourcing of detainees to Libya, 287

Jackson, J., 313, 330

Japan, UN criticism of detention policies under, 158

Jean v Nelson (US Supreme Court), 67, 73, 272

Iews

French detentions during WW Two, 108

UK immigrants, nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, 36, 43, 44

Johnson v Eisentrager (US Supreme Court), 242, 243

Joppke, C., 275

Ju Toy, United States v (US Supreme Court), 25

judicial review, 321–31. *See also* habeas corpus tradition

Australia, exclusion of judicial review of detention of boat people in, 101

damages for unlawful imprisonment, UK cases seeking, 93, 94–5

ECHR on judicial review of detention decisions, 155–6 equality of protection for aliens and

citizens by UK courts, 86–8
EU, detention of non-EU citizens in,

EU, detention of non-EU citizens in,

extra-judicial treatment of immigration detention, xiii–xiv, 55, 79

France, prompt judicial approval of detention required in, 110

global tendency toward requiring,

involvement in rights of entry and stay, xix–xx



> 388 INDEX judicial review (cont.) Libya, Italian detainees outsourced to, legal entitlements of aliens, scrutiny Liebmann, R v Superintendent of Vine of, xxi of legislative versus executive Street Police Station ex parte detention, 325-6 (UK), 48outline of statutory system for, Lim case (Chu Kheng Lim and others v 343 - 7Minister for Immigration, Local plenary powers of Congress to Government and Ethnic Affairs control immigration in US, and another; Australia), 103, 23-7, 75-7 106 proportionality as basis for, 331-3 Lubbers, Ruud, 137 Lusitania, sinking of, 46, 50 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons, rights of, xiii Lynas v Switzerland (ECHR), 141 UN consideration of need for, 159, 164, 165 Maastricht Treaty, 177 Madafferi v Australia (UNHCR), Kadzoev (ECJ), 195, 201, 202, 204 295 Kansas v Hendricks (US Supreme Madison, James, 3-4, 6, 27, 314 Magna Carta, 1 Court), 72 Kanstroom, D., 4, 28, 326 Malta Kant, Immanuel, 261 conditions for detainees in, 286 duration of detention, no limits on, Kaoru Yamataya v Fisher (US Supreme Court), 27 191 Khawaja case (UK), 86–8, 90, 95, 105, mandatory detention 219 in Australia, 98-107, 117 Kolompar (ECHR), 144 in EU, 192 Kosopud, In Re (US), 33 political and psychological effects of, Kurds detained in UK, 279 302 US, in, 116 labour migration. See economic for Cuban and Haitian flotillas, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, migration legal aliens. See authorized aliens legislative versus executive detention, historical development of, 14-15 judicial review of, 325-6 legislative origins of, 325 liberalism suspected terrorists, 238-9 free movement of aliens as tradition unauthorized aliens, as tool to control, 69-71 of, ix-x, 1, 257 fundamental rights, border control Mariel boat people, 67-9, 77, 241, 250, administration without 273, 281 sacrifice of, 303-7 Martin, David, 236 illiberal outcomes in relation to Maurus Island, Australian asylum detention produced by, camps on, 103, 302 257-66 May, Erskine, 5, 6, 37 impartialists, 259-62 Meltzer, D. J., 249 partialists, 259, 262–6 membership, migration issues viewed liberty, right to. See equal liberty for as problem of, 303 aliens and citizens; free mental health, effects of detention on, movement 286, 290, 294, 295, 338



INDEX 389

mental health problems, detention of persons with, 290-6 Mexican immigrants to US, mandatory detention of, 70 Mezei, Ignatz, and Mezei case (US Supreme Court), 60-2, 64, 68, 73, 74, 112, 227, 250, 330, 343 migrant workers, defined, 122 n20. See also economic migration migration, qualified right of, 124 Mikolenko v Estonia (ECHR), 153, 333 Miller, M. J., 269 modern immigration detention practice since WW Two, 57-118. See also World War Two Australia, in, 98-107, 117. See also Australia bureaucratic control of immigration process, 57 France, in, 107-16, 117-18. See also France political issue, as, 57, 58, 114, 116 political issue, detention as, 57, 58 security, aliens as permanent threat to, 57 UK, in, 79-97, 117. See also United

Kingdom US, in, 58–79, 116. See also United States Mubilanzila Mayeka and Kaniki Mitunga v Belgium (ECHR), 292 Muskhadziyeva v Belgium (ECHR), 293

Nafziger, James, 120
Nauru, Australian asylum camps in, 103, 302
necessity test
ECHR on, 148–50, 153, 155
individualized detention decisions, importance of, 336
UN Working Group on Arbitrary
Detention on, 164
Netherlands
conditions for detainees in, 286

Netherlands conditions for detainees in, 286 duration of detention, no limits on, 191 Neuman, G., 4, 243, 315 New Zealand, interpretation of Refugee Convention by, 138 Nicol, A., 36

9/11, 212–13, 215–18, 233–7. See also terrorism and immigration detention

Nishimura Ekiu v United States (US Supreme Court), 25, 120 non-compliance with removal process

ECHR on, 153–5 in EU, 193, 196, 350 UK criminalization of, 350

US criminalization of, 65–7, 350 non-immigration objectives, use of aliens powers to achieve,

207-8

Office of the Inspector General (OIG), US, 235–6 Ogata, Sadako, 135 Oklahoma bombings, 238 Oulane (ECJ), 177–9, 184 'outlaws,' detainees as, xviii, xix–xx, xxi, 209, 296–9

outaws, detainees as, xviii, xix–xx, xxi, 209, 296–9 outsourcing/off-shoring of detainees by Australia, 103

EU proposals, 203, 287 Guantanamo Bay, 209, 213, 239–50, 302, 312, 327, 330, 343

Italy, by, 287

legal position of detainees weakened by, 302

Panayi, P., 52

Papua New Guinea, Australian asylum camps in, 103, 302

parole, bail, or bond. *See* bonding, bail, and parole

partialists, 259, 262–6

pathogenic nature of detention, 286 Peers, S., 200

PENTTBOM, 233, 235, 236

physical detention facilities. *See* detention centres

plenary powers doctrine, US development of, 23–7 modern retention of, 75–7

Plyer v Doe (US Supreme Court), 351



> INDEX 390

police powers, immigration detention in France viewed as exercise of, 58, 108 political activists, detention of anarchists, 36, 207 Communist subversion, 59-64, 207 French Revolution, 3, 5 Russian Revolution, 30-1 political issue, immigration detention as, xix-xxi, 256-309. See also liberalism Belmarsh decision (UK) on indefinite detention of terrorists and, 228-30 conditions in detention centres, 278-9, 282-3, 285-7, 288-90 ECHR and, 153 extra-legal political spaces, detention centres as. See extra-legal space, detention centres as free movement of aliens, liberal tradition of, ix-x, 1, 257 fundamental rights, border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 impartialists, 259-62 international pressure and accountability, 287-90 in modern detention regimes, 57, 58, 114, 116 non-immigration objectives, use of aliens powers to achieve, 207-8 non-liberal political theory, 266-9 'outlaw' status of detainees, 296–9 partialists, 259, 262-6 security-based detention, political problems arising from, 251, 255 security concerns as political tool, 269 - 75traditional left/right groupings, migration issues cutting across,

'prisons with three walls' argument, 112-13, 146-8, 155, 227 proportionality disabilities imposed upon unauthorized persons, of, ECHR on, 155 fair balance between community and individual interests, striking, 338–40 genuinely dangerous detainees, treatment of, 340–2 ICCPRR, under, 161-3 Refugee Convention on, 136-8 rule of law and, 331-3 psychological problems, detention of persons with, 290-6 psychological stresses of detention, 286, 290, 294, 295, 338 punishment, status of immigration detention as Australia, in, 100-1, 103 Chinese immigrant labourers in US, criminal sanctions as alternative to administrative detention, 349 - 50deterrent effect of detention, 278 ECHR on, 153, 154 in EU Returns Directive, 196 Madison and Alien Act 1798 (US) on, 3-4 security-based detention and, 209 US Supreme Court rulings that detention is not legally imprisonment, 27-9, 60 racism and immigration Australian and Canadian historical restrictions on non-white alien workers, 38, 98 Chinese migrant labourers to US, 18 - 29Commonwealth citizens, UK detention, racist abuses during,

immigration controls aimed at,

unrest in detention centres, 279-87

visibility of problem and controls,

vulnerable groups, detention of,

275-8

290-6



INDEX 391

Jewish immigrants to UK in 19th century, 36 partialist view of, 265 Rasul v Bush (US Supreme Court), 243, 244, 245, 246, 247, 248, 249 Rawls, John, 258 Refugee Convention (1951) criminal punishment, exemptions from, 349 emergency situations, on, 348 EU, movement of non-EU citizens within, 181, 187 international law and immigration detention, xvi, 122, 126-31, 138-40, 317 post-WW Two/Cold War and, 298 US detention of Cuban refugees at Guantanamo as violation of, refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons Australian boat people crisis. See under Australia criminalization of failure to comply with removal process in US and, 65-7 EU detention powers aimed at, 182, 185 - 9Executive Committee Conclusion 44 on, 134-6, 139, 148, 151, 188 growth in British use of detention for, 91-4 Haitian and Cuban flotillas arriving in US, mandatory detention for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 human rights of, xvi, 121-3 international law, under, xiv judicial rights of, xxi lawfully versus unlawfully present, 128-9, 138 political visibility of, 277 proportionality guidelines for. See proportionality unauthorized aliens as, xi UNHCR on detention of, 131-8, 288

WW One and post-war period, 33 - 4,56WW Two and Cold War, 124–6 release on bail, bond, or parole. See bonding, bail, and parole remote controls on immigration, 277 removal. See deportation Riad and Idiab v Belgium (ECHR), 289 Richard, Alain, 109 Rubio-Marín, R., 306 rule of law and immigration detention, xxii-xxiii, 310-53 alternatives to detention, 337-8 constitutional status of aliens, lack of clarity regarding, 323-4 criminal sanctions as alternative to administrative detention. 349-50 disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons, 350-2 due process rights for all deprivations of liberty, 342–3 emergency powers and, 347–8 EU Returns Directive avoiding, 196 - 7fair balance between community and individual interests, striking, 338-40 general principles of, 343 genuinely dangerous detainees, treatment of, 340-2 goals of detention, determining, 333 - 6individualized detention decisions, 336 international law, limitations of, 316-21 judicial review of government power of detention, 321-31, 343-7 proportionality requirements, 331 - 3security concerns and, 207, 311-16 Russian Revolution, immigration fears related to, 30-1

Saadi and Others, Secretary of State for the Home Department ex parte (UK), 93



392 INDEX

Saadi and Others v United Kingdom (ECHR), 151, 164, 333, 347 Sale v Haitian Centers Council v US (US Supreme Court), 241 Sarno, R v Governor of Brixton Prison ex parte (UK), 48 Sassen, S., 55, 316 Schengen Treaty (1985) and system, 180 Schmitt, Carl, 262, 266-8, 296, 300, 314, 315 Schuck, P., 304 security and immigration detention, 207-55. See also terrorism and immigration detention aliens power as permanent emergency power for purposes of, 207–8, 209–12 ASCA (UK) as security rather than immigration measure, 223-4 de-legitimation of all aliens for security purposes, xx-xxi deportation, security-based detention divorced from, equal liberty for aliens and citizens, denial of, 208-9, 252-5 EU, in. See under European Union extra-legal space, detention centres as, 209 fundamental rights, border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 modern permanent sense of aliens as security threats, 57 political problems arising from security-based detention, 251, 255 political tool, security concerns as, 269 - 75proportionality in treatment of genuinely dangerous detainees, 340 - 2Refugee Convention delegates on refugees as security threats, 129

segregation of aliens in Australia, Al Kateb decision regarding, 104–7 Sen, Amartya, 305 September 11, 2001, 212-13, 215-18, 233-7. See also terrorism and immigration detention Shamsa v Poland (ECHR), 156, 331 Sharpe, R. J., 51 Sibley, N. W., 40 Simpson, B., 50, 51, 211 Singer, P., 260 Singh v Czech Republic (ECHR), 145 social assistance, expulsion of EU citizens requiring, 178 Somersett's Case (UK), 86 sovereignty. See state sovereignty Spanish Civil War refugees, French internment of, 108, 129 Special Immigration Appeals Commission (SIAC), UK, 219-20 state sovereignty aliens power and, 224 border control as manifestation of, 258 concept of, 120 EU and, 171, 172, 173 free movement tradition affected by rise of, 258 globalized world, in, 318 goal of immigration detention, as, 335 human rights and migration controls, conflict between, 121 justification of immigration detention, as, 169 political pressure for accountability and, 287-90 stateless persons. See refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons Steel, Z., 338 Sunstein, C., 313 Switzerland, UN criticism of detention policies of, 158 Tamil asylum seekers in UK, 135, 279 Tampere European Council meeting of

1999, 181

rule of law and, 207, 311-16

of, x-xi

undesirable aliens, early detention



INDEX 393

Tan Te Lam v Superintendent of Tai A Chau Detention Centre (British Hong Kong), 90 territorial sovereignty. See state sovereignty terrorism and indefinite detention, xi, 212 - 13emergency powers, 348 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, 252 - 5UK assertion of, 222, 224-6, 228 US assertion of, 243, 246–9 EU concerns regarding non-EU citizens, 181 political problems arising from, 251, 255 political tool, security concerns as, 274 September 11, 2001, 212-13, 215-18, 233-7 UK, in Belmarsh decision (A v Secretary of State for the Home Department), 222-31, 248, 253, 312, 327, 332, 342 control order regime replacing detention, 231-3 drafting and passage of ACSA, 215 - 18equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 222, 224-6, 228 first detentions and litigation under ACSA, 219-22 Gulf War detentions, 212 provisions of ASCA, 218–19 security rather than immigration measure, ACSA as, 223-4 torture, aliens undeportable due to threat of, 213-15 US, in citizens, detention of, 244-6 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 243,

initial detention of immigrants after 9/11, 233-7 Oklahoma bombings, 238 removable aliens, mandatory indefinite detention of, 238-9 Supreme Court rulings on, 243-9 US PATRIOT Act, 233, 238 three walls, prisons with, 112-13, 146-8, 155, 227 Torpey, J., 7 torture Convention Against Torture, 167 CPT, 145, 287 detention of aliens undeportable due to threat of, 213-15, 317 Tudor period, alien rights during, 1 Turkish Kurds detained in UK, 279, 280 UN Commission on Human Rights (UNCHR), 167 UN Conventions and Covenants. See entries at Convention; International Convention; International Covenant UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), 131-8, 284, 288, 337 UN Human Rights Committee (UNHRC) and ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights UN Relief and Rehabilitation Agency, 125 UN Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights of Migrants, 123, 167-8, 288, 289, 291, 299 UN standards on anti-terrorism and non-discrimination, 224 UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention (WGAD), 159, 163-5, 236, 252 unauthorized aliens Australian boat people crisis. See under Australia authorized/unauthorized divide replacing citizen/alien divide, xii-xiii concept of, xi-xii

Guantanamo Bay, 209, 213,

246 - 9

239-50



394 INDEX

unauthorized aliens (cont.) constitutional right to liberty of, 313 EU, in, 182, 185, 190-3, 199-201 human rights of, xv-xvii, 121-4 in international law, 167-8 legal entitlements of, xxi legal status of, xviii, xix-xx 'outlaws', as, xviii, xix-xx, xxi, 209, 296-9 proportionality of disabilities imposed upon, 350-2 re-authorization of, xx-xxi Refugee Convention on lawfully versus unlawfully present refugees, 128-9, 138 US concerns regarding, 69-71 undocumented aliens. See unauthorized aliens United Kingdom bonding, bail and parole, right to seek, 88, 91 children, detention of, 291 Commonwealth citizens, immigration controls aimed at, 79,80-5 criminalization of failure to comply with removal process, 350 damages for unlawful imprisonment, cases seeking, 93,94-5deportation, detention as conditional on possibility of, detention centres, poor conditions and unrest at, 279-81 disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons in, 351 duration of detention, no limits on, 191 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 86-8, 222, 224-6, European Convention on Human Rights, incorporation of, 80 executive rather than legislative control of detention matters in, 79, 325 foreign prisoners emergency, 95-7

'group' detention in, 93, 279 growing use of detention in, 86 habeas corpus tradition in. See under habeas corpus tradition historical development of centralized state control over aliens, 5-6, 36-54 Aliens Act 1793, 36, 39 anarchists, fears regarding, 36, burden of justification placed on alien rather than state, 52 citizens detained under 14B of Defence of the Realm Regulations, 49-51 immigrant receiving house, establishment of, 43-4 Jewish immigrants, 36, 43, 44 Magna Carta, 1 mid-ninteenth century, 5-6, 36 Royal Commission, Bill and Aliens Act 1905, 36-43 Tudor period, in, 1 WW One and post-war period, 45-54, 212 Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people in, 143, 158, 159 Immigration Act 1971, effects of, 81, 83, 84-5, 88 indefinite detention in. See under indefinite detention modern detention practice since WW Two, 79-97, 117 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons in, 187 terrorism and detention in. See under terrorism and indefinite detention UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, criticism of, 107, 163 United States children, detention of, 293 Communists, Cold War detentions of, 59-64, 207 constitutional protection, unadmitted aliens viewed as beyond, 60-2



INDEX 395

criminalization of failure to comply with removal process, 65-7, 350 Cuban and Haitian flotillas, adoption of mandatory detention for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 deportation, detention as conditional on possibility of, detention centres, poor conditions and unrest at, 281-3 disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons in, 350 due process in. See under due process duration of detention in. See duration of detention 'group' detention in, 59, 63 Guantanamo Bay detainees, 209, 213, 239-50, 302, 312, 327, 330, habeas corpus tradition in. See under habeas corpus tradition historical development of centralized state control over aliens, 8-36 Act to Regulate Immigration 1882, no detention in, 11-13 Alien Act 1798, 3-4, 29 bonding of immigrants, 14, 17 - 18Chinese migrant labourers, 18–29, detention centres, institution of, 13 - 14East coast, limited duration of detentions on, 15-17 imprisonment, Supreme Court ruling that detention not legally regarded as, 27-9 mandatory detention, 14-15 plenary powers doctrine, development of, 23-7 unlimited detention, allowance of, 33 - 4

indefinite detention in. See under indefinite detention mandatory detention in. See under mandatory detention modern detention practice since WW Two, 58-79, 116 paradox of massive immigration with tough detention policy, 58-9 plenary powers doctrine development of, 23-7 modern retention of, 75-7 proportionality in, 332, 333 security concerns as political tool in, 2.70 - 4terrorism and detention in. See under terrorism and indefinite detention unauthorized aliens, mandatory detention as tool to control, Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), 124, 224 universality of human rights. See equal liberty for aliens and citizens unrest in detention centres, 279-87 US PATRIOT Act, 233, 238 utilitarianism, 260 Van Alphen v Netherlands (UNHCR), 160, 161 Vattel, Emmerich de, 4, 261 Venicoff, R v Inspector of Leman Street Police Station ex parte (UK), 53 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 160 Vietnamese boat people in Australia. See under Australia in Hong Kong, 143, 158, 159 V.M.R.B. v Canada (UNHCR), 160 vulnerable groups, detention of, 290-6 Waldron, J., 291, 305 Walzer, M., 263 war and immigration detention. See also specific wars and conflicts aliens power as extension of war power, 57, 209, 266-9

WW One and post-war period,

Immigration Act 1952, 64-5

29 - 34



396 INDEX

war and immigration detention (cont.) defence powers applied to enemy aliens in wartime, 210 historical distinction between 'enemy' and 'friend', 1 international immigration treated as inherently equivalent to armed conflict, 24 legal status of detainees as enemy aliens, xvii non-liberal political theory, links between view of aliens and war powers in, 266-9 prisoner of war status and protections contrasted with detainees, 296 undesirable aliens, early detention of, xi Weber, ex parte (UK), 47, 48 Weber, Max, 7 Weiler, J. H. H., 202 Weis, Paul, 130 Welch, M., 270, 273 West Germany, UNCHR criticism of detention in, 133 WGAD (UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention), 159, 163-5, 236, 252 Wong Wing v United States (US Supreme Court), 27–9 Working Group on Arbitrary Detention (WGAD), 159, 163-5, 236, 252

World War One and post-war period, Germans, UK and US detention of, 29, 45-8, 50 Refugee Convention (1951) and, 298 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons, 33-4, 56 UK, in, 45-54, 212 US, in, 29–34 World War Two economic migration encouraged following, 57, 58 French detention of Jews during, Germans, UK and US detention of, 211 Refugee Convention and, 127 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons after, 124-6 X v United Kingdom (ECHR), 142

Zadig, Arthur, 50

Zadvydas v Davis (US Supreme Court),
71–5, 76, 77–9, 89, 103, 104,
154, 209, 233, 238, 254, 325,
326, 341, 342

Zaireans detained in UK, 279

Zamir v Secretary of State for the Home
Department (UK), 85, 86

Zimbabweans detained in UK, 280

Zolberg, A., 26