

The Origin of Divine Christology

Volume 169

In recent years, there has been considerable debate concerning the origin of divine Christology. Nevertheless, the proposed theories are beset with problems, such as failing to address the evidence of widespread agreement among the earliest Christians concerning divine Christology and the issues related to whether Jesus' intention was falsified. This book offers a new contribution by addressing these issues using transdisciplinary tools. It proposes that the earliest Christians regarded Jesus as divine because a sizeable group of them perceived that Jesus claimed and showed himself to be divine, and thought that God vindicated this claim by raising Jesus from the dead. It also provides a comprehensive critique of alternative proposals and synthesizes their strengths. It defends the appropriateness and merits of utilizing philosophical distinctions (e.g. between ontology and function) and Trinitarian concepts for explaining early Christology, and incorporates comparative religion by examining cases of deification in other contexts.

ANDREW TER ERN LOKE is Research Assistant Professor at the Faith and Global Engagement Initiative, The University of Hong Kong. His previous publications include *A Kryptic Model of the Incarnation* (2014) and several articles in leading international peer-reviewed journals such as *Religious Studies* and the *Journal of Theological Studies*.



SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES:

MONOGRAPH SERIES

General Editor: Paul Trebilco

169 THE ORIGIN OF DIVINE CHRISTOLOGY SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES MONOGRAPH SERIES

Recent titles in the series:

143. Cosmology and Eschatology in Hebrews

KENNETH L. SCHENCK

144. The Speeches of Outsiders in Acts

OSVALDO PADILLA

145. The Assumed Authorial Unity of Luke and Acts

PATRICIA WALTERS

146. Geography and the Ascension Narrative in Acts

MATTHEW SLEEMAN

147. The Ituraeans and the Roman Near East

E. A. MYERS

148. The Politics of Inheritance in Romans

MARK FORMAN

149. The Doctrine of Salvation in the First Letter of Peter

MARTIN WILLIAMS

150. Jesus and the Forgiveness of Sins

TOBIAS HÄGERLAND



151. The Composition of the Gospel of Thomas

SIMON GATHERCOLE

152. Paul as an Administrator of God in 1 Corinthians

JOHN K. GOODRICH

153. Affirming the Resurrection of the Incarnate Christ

MATTHEW D. JENSEN

154. Riches, Poverty, and the Faithful

MARK D. MATHEWS

155. Paul and the Rhetoric of Reversal in 1 Corinthians

MATTHEW R. MALCOLM

156. The Genre of Acts and Collected Biographies

SEAN A. ADAMS

157. The Eschatology of 1 Peter

KELLY D. LIEBENGOOD

158. The Hermeneutics of Christological Psalmody in Paul

MATTHEW SCOTT

159. Corinthian Wisdom, Stoic Philosophy, and the Ancient Economy

TIMOTHY A. BROOKINS

160. Faith and the Faithfulness of Jesus in Hebrews

MATTHEW C. EASTER

161. Covenant Renewal and the Consecration of the Gentiles in Romans

SARAH WHITTLE

162. The Role of Jewish Feasts in John's Gospel

GERRY WHEATON

163. Paul's Political Strategy in 1 Corinthians 1-4

BRADLEY J. BITNER

164. The Pauline Church and the Corinthian Ekklesia

RICHARD LAST

165. Jesus and the Temple

SIMON J. JOSEPH

166. The Death of Jesus in Matthew

CATHERINE SIDER HAMILTON



167. Ecclesiology and Theosis in the Gospel of John
ANDREW J. BYERS
168. The Book of Revelation and Early Jewish Textual Culture
GARRICK ALLEN



The Origin of Divine Christology

Volume 169

ANDREW TER ERN LOKE

The University of Hong Kong





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107199262

DOI: 10.1017/9781108185486

© Andrew Ter Ern Loke 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Loke, Andrew Ter Ern, author.

Title: The origin of divine Christology / Andrew Ter Ern Loke,

The University of Hong Kong.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. \mid

Series: Society for New Testament studies monograph series; Volume 169 |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017004893 | ISBN 9781107199262 (hardback : alk. paper) Subjects: LCSH: Jesus Christ–Divinity–History of doctrines–Early church, ca. 30–600. | Jesus Christ–Historicity. | Jesus Christ–Person and offices. Classification: LCC BT216.3 .L65 2017 | DDC 232/.8–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017004893

ISBN 978-1-107-19926-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> For Christ Jesus Ὁ κύριός μου καὶ ὁ θεός μου (John 20:28)



CONTENTS

	Acknowledgements	oage xv
1	Introducing the Theories and Approaches	
	Concerning the Origin of Divine Christology	1
	1.1 Significance of the Question	1
	1.2 Introducing Various Types of Theories Concerning the	e
	Origin of Divine Christology	3
	1.3 Introducing the Issue of Jesus' Self-Understanding	6
	1.4 The Approach of This Book	9
	1.5 Clarification of Key Terms	12
	1.6 An Overview of the Rest of This Book	21
2	The Highest Christology Was Present Among the	
	Earliest Christians: The Evidences	24
	2.1 Introduction	24
	2.2 1 Corinthians 8:6	26
	2.3 Philippians 2:6–11	33
	2.4 Evidence from Devotional Practices	41
	2.5 Evidence from Expressions of Spiritual Desire	
	for Christ	45
	2.6 Conclusion	47
3	Replies to Objections Involving Various Exalted	
	Figures in Second Temple Judaism	48
	3.1 Introduction	48
	3.2 The Importance of the Creator–Creature Divide	53
	3.3 Concerning the Angel of the LORD	66
	3.4 Concerning Kings, Messiahs and Others	68

xi



xii Contents

4	Replies to Other Objections Concerning the Highest	
	Christology of the Earliest Christians	79
	4.1 Concerning the Claim That According to Acts the	
	Earliest Christians Did Not Worship Jesus	79
	4.2 Concerning the Claim That Jesus Was Distinguished	
	from and Subordinated to God	80
	4.3 Concerning the Claim That Adoptionism/Exaltation	
	Christology Was Present Earlier	83
	4.4 Concerning the Claim That Jesus Was Regarded as	
	Functionally Divine but Not Ontologically Divine	93
	4.5 Concerning the Claim That Jesus Was Merely	
	Venerated, Not Worshipped	94
	4.6 Concerning the Claim That Sacrifice Is Never Said in	
	the New Testament to Be Offered to Christ	95
	4.7 Conclusion	97
5	The Extent of Highest Christology in Earliest	
	Christianity	100
	5.1 Introduction	100
	5.2 The Argument for Widespread Extent	101
	5.3 Is There Absence of Jewish Objection to Paul's Divine	
	Christology?	103
	5.4 Argument from Silence?	107
	5.5 Reply to Objections by Bart Ehrman and Others	110
	5.6 Examples of Theories Which Fail to Explain the	
	Widespread Extent	114
	5.7 Conclusion	131
6	The Best Explanation for the Origin of Highest	
	Christology	134
	6.1 Introduction	134
	6.2 The Earliest Christians Were Evidently Concerned	
	About Passing on the Traditions of Jesus' Teachings	134
	6.3 The Difficulty of the Idea of Regarding a Human Jesus	
	As Also Truly Divine	137
	6.4 The Issue of Falsification of Jesus' Intention	140
	6.5 The Best Historical Explanation for a Diversity of	
	Other Peculiar Beliefs and Practices of the Earliest	
	Christians Is That They Originated from Jesus	144



	Contents	xiii
	6.6 It Is Likely That Jesus Was Perceived to Have Given	
	Clear Indications That He Regarded Himself as Truly	
	Divine by a Significant Number of Disciples	146
	6.7 The Role of Early Christian Thinking About	
	Intermediary Figures	147
	6.8 Is My Proposal Too Christocentric Rather Than	
	Theocentric?	147
	6.9 Conclusion	151
7	Assessing the Evidences for the Origin of Highest	
	Christology in the Gospels	153
	7.1 Introduction	153
	7.2 Counter-Evidence in the Gospels?	153
	7.3 Traces in the Gospels	159
8	Conclusion	194
	Bibliography	209
	Scripture and Apocrypha Index	232
	Index of Other Ancient Sources	240
	Index of Authors	242
	Index of Subjects	245



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There is a special feeling writing this acknowledgement during Christmas 2016, ten years after I embarked on a journey that took me from a medical career to the study of theology.

The idea for this book first came when, while working on my PhD on the historical basis and coherence of the incarnation, I began to wonder why there was absence of disagreement among the earliest Christians concerning the divine status of Christ. I am indebted to Professors Alister McGrath and Richard Burridge for encouraging me to develop this idea and for giving me helpful feedback. I am grateful to Professor James Dunn, who spent hours discussing the Christology of the earliest Christians with me over coffee in Durham, to Professor Larry Hurtado for a very helpful email exchange, and to Professors Glen Thompson, Clement Shum, Brian Thomas and Sarah Williams for their helpful and amazingly timely feedback.

I am thankful for my wonderful colleagues and friends in Hong Kong – in particular, Professor Daniel Chua, Dr Mike Brownnutt, Grace Lee Baughan, Carmen Bat and K. Y. Wong – my parents, parents-in-law, daughters Joy, Serene and Evangel and my beloved wife Mary, and my friends at Macedonia Bible Presbyterian Church, for their encouragement, advice and prayer for this project. I am indebted to the Fan Trust and Tom Chan for supporting my work financially at the University of Hong Kong. I would like to thank Professor Kang Phi Seng from China Graduate School of Theology for the use of their excellent library facilities.

I am grateful to Professors Darrell Bock, Paul Trebilco (the editor for the Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series, Cambridge University Press) and Simon Gathercole (the reader) for their very helpful comments and recommendations for publication. I would like to thank the team at Cambridge University Press – in particular, Beatrice Rehl, Edgar Mendez and Bethany Johnson – for



xvi Acknowledgements

their assistance, and Dr Lawrence Osborn for his meticulous editorial work. I hope that this monograph will prove worthy of their efforts, though any mistakes remain my responsibility.

I would like to acknowledge the scholarly writings of Professors Richard Bauckham, Larry Hurtado, N. T. Wright, Martin Hengel, Richard Burridge, Dale Allison, Darrell Bock, Craig Keener, Ben Witherington III, Simon Gathercole, Aquila Lee, Sigurd Grindheim, Chris Tilling, Matthew Bates, Wesley Hill, Richard Weymouth and Donald Williams. I have found their writings immensely helpful and am grateful that many of them were discovered or recommended to me just in time for the writing of this book.

Finally, no words can adequately express my indebtedness to the Lord Jesus for the things He has done. I offer this book with love and humble gratitude to Him who – together with God the Father and Holy Spirit – is worthy of all glory and praise.