

## EUTHANASIA AND ASSISTED SUICIDE

Examining the evidence from Belgium – one of only five countries where euthanasia is practised legally – an international panel of experts considers the implications of legalised euthanasia and assisted suicide. Looking at the issue from an international perspective, the authors have written an invaluable in-depth analysis of the ethical aspects of this complex area. The discussion forms a solid foundation for informed debate about assisted dying. With contributors from a broad range of disciplines, this is ideal for students, academics, legislators and anyone interested in legal, medical, social and philosophical ethics. This book is a vital and timely examination of a growing phenomenon and one of the most challenging ethical questions of our time.

DAVID ALBERT JONES is Director of the Anscombe Bioethics Centre, Oxford and a Research Fellow at Blackfriars Hall, Oxford. He is also a Research Fellow at St Mary's University, Twickenham. He is Vice-chair of the Ministry of Defence Research Ethics Committee.

CHRIS GASTMANS is a Professor of Medical Ethics and Director of the Centre for Biomedical Ethics and Law, Faculty of Medicine, KU Leuven, Belgium. He was a member of the Bureau of the European Association of Centres of Medical Ethics and held the positions of Secretary-General, Treasurer and President.

CALUM MACKELLAR is Director of Research at the Scottish Council on Human Bioethics, Edinburgh and a Member of the Advisory Board of the Centre for Bioethics and Emerging Technologies at St Mary's University, Twickenham.



#### CAMBRIDGE BIOETHICS AND LAW

This series of books was founded by Cambridge University Press with Alexander McCall Smith as its first editor in 2003. It focuses on the law's complex and troubled relationship with medicine across both the developed and the developing world. Since the early 1990s, we have seen in many countries increasing resort to the courts by dissatisfied patients and a growing use of the courts to attempt to resolve intractable ethical dilemmas. At the same time, legislatures across the world have struggled to address the questions posed by both the successes and the failures of modern medicine, while international organisations such as the WHO and UNESCO now regularly address issues of medical law.

It follows that we would expect ethical and policy questions to be integral to the analysis of the legal issues discussed in this series. The series responds to the high profile of medical law in universities, in legal and medical practice, as well as in public and political affairs. We seek to reflect the evidence that many major health-related policy debates in the United Kingdom, Europe and the international community involve a strong medical law dimension. With that in mind, we seek to address how legal analysis might have a trans-jurisdictional and international relevance. Organ retention, embryonic stem cell research, physician assisted suicide and the allocation of resources to fund health care are but a few examples among many. The emphasis of this series is thus on matters of public concern and/or practical significance. We look for books that could make a difference to the development of medical law and enhance the role of medico-legal debate in policy circles. That is not to say that we lack interest in the important theoretical dimensions of the subject, but we aim to ensure that theoretical debate is grounded in the realities of how the law does and should interact with medicine and health care.

Series Editors
Professor Graeme Laurie, University of Edinburgh
Professor Richard Ashcroft, Queen Mary, University of London



# EUTHANASIA AND ASSISTED SUICIDE

Lessons from Belgium

Edited by

DAVID ALBERT JONES

Anscombe Bioethics Centre

**CHRIS GASTMANS** 

Catholic University of Leuven

CALUM MACKELLAR

Scottish Council on Human Bioethics





## **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107198869
DOI: 10.1017/9781108182799

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Jones, David Albert, editor. | Gastmans, Chris, 1966- editor. |

MacKellar, C. (Calum), editor.

Title: Euthanasia and assisted suicide: lessons from Belgium / edited by David Albert Jones,
Anscombe Bioethics Centre; Chris Gastmans, Catholic University of Leuven; Calum MacKellar
Description: Cambridge [UK]; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. |
Series: Cambridge bioethics and law | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2017016930 | ISBN 9781107198869 (hardback: alk. paper) |
ISBN 9781316648353 (pbk.: alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Euthanasia–Law and legislation–Belgium. |
Right to die–Law and legislation–Belgium. | Assisted suicide–Law and
legislation–Belgium. | Euthanasia–Law and legislation.
Classification: LCC KJK4058 .E98 2017 | DDC 344.49304/197–dc23
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017016930

ISBN 978-1-107-19886-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Kevin Fitzpatrick, who showed what it can be both to live well and to die well and whose contribution to this book is much more than the sum of his words.



#### CONTENTS

List of Tables x Authors' Affiliations xi

Introduction 1

DAVID ALBERT JONES, CHRIS GASTMANS AND CALUM MACKELLAR

- PART I Euthanasia Legislation in Belgium and Its Applications 5
- 1 A Discussion of the Legal Rules on Euthanasia in Belgium Briefly Compared with the Rules in Luxembourg and the Netherlands 7

HERMAN NYS

2 The Belgian Experience of Euthanasia Since Its Legal Implementation in 2002 26

ETIENNE MONTERO

3 Ethics and the Psychiatric Dimensions of Physician-Assisted Suicide: A View from the United States 49

DANIEL P. SULMASY

PART II Euthanasia and End-of-Life Care 65

4 Assisted Dying: The Current Situation in Flanders: Euthanasia Embedded in Palliative Care 67

PAUL VANDEN BERGHE, ARSÈNE MULLIE, MARC DESMET AND GERT HUYSMANS

Postscript: Death as Disruption or Disruptive Dying? Some Further Reflections Since 2013 78

vii



TENTS

5 The Practice of Continuous Sedation at the End of Life in Belgium: How Does it Compare to UK Practice, and is it Being Used as a Form of Euthanasia? 86

SIGRID STERCKX AND KASPER RAUS

- 6 2002-2016: Fourteen Years of Euthanasia in Belgium: First-Line Observations by an Oncologist 101 BENOIT BEUSELINCK
- 7 'A Last Act of Grace'? Organ Donation and Euthanasia in Belgium 114

TREVOR STAMMERS

- PART III Euthanasia and Particular Vulnerable Groups 131
- 8 A Life Worth Living? Disabled People and Euthanasia in Belgium 133

KEVIN FITZPATRICK AND DAVID ALBERT JONES

Euthanasia in Patients with Intolerable Suffering Due to an Irremediable Psychiatric Illness: A Psychiatric Perspective 150

JORIS VANDENBERGHE

10 Euthanasia in Children: Keep Asking the Right Questions 173

STEFAAN VAN GOOL AND JAN DE LEPELEIRE

- 11 Euthanizing People Who Are 'Tired of Life' 188
- 12 Euthanasia in Persons with Severe Dementia 202
  CHRIS GASTMANS
  - PART IV Euthanasia in Belgium: A Philosophical and Bioethical Discussion 217
- 13 Some Possible Consequences Arising from the Normalisation of Euthanasia in Belgium 219

CALUM MACKELLAR



CONTENTS ix

14 Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide in Belgium: Bringing an End to Interminable Discussion 235

DAVID ALBERT JONES

15 Psychiatric Patients and the Culture of Euthanasia in Belgium 258

WILLEM LEMMENS

Final Conclusions on Final Solutions 278

DAVID ALBERT JONES, CHRIS GASTMANS AND CALUM MACKELLAR

Appendix I Wet Betreffende de Euthanasie 28 Mei 2002

(The Belgian Act on Euthanasia, Dutch-language Version) 284

Appendix II Loi Relative à L'Euthanasie 28 Mai 2002

(The Belgian Act on Euthanasia, French-language Version) 295

Appendix III The Belgian Act on Euthanasia of

**28 May 2002** (Unofficial Translation) 305

References 316 Index 352



## TABLES

1	Euthanasia		daalamad	£	م احتفاد د حدث	diagnalana'	22
1	Eutnanasia	cases	aeciarea	IOT	muitiple	disorders.	32

- 2 Euthanasia cases declared for neuropsychiatric disorders. 34
- 3 Registered euthanasia cases. 45
- 4 Euthanasia reported based on the expected time of death. 45



### AUTHORS' AFFILIATIONS

DAVID ALBERT JONES, Anscombe Bioethics Centre, Oxford, United Kingdom, and the Centre for Bioethics and Emerging Technologies, St Mary's University, Twickenham, United Kingdom.

CHRIS GASTMANS, Centre for Biomedical Ethics and Law, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium.

CALUM MACKELLAR, Scottish Council on Human Bioethics, Edinburgh, United Kingdom, and the Centre for Bioethics and Emerging Technologies, St Mary's University, Twickenham, United Kingdom.

HERMAN NYS, Centre for Biomedical Ethics and Law, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium.

ETIENNE MONTERO, Faculty of Law, University of Namur, Belgium.

DANIEL P. SULMASY, Departments of Medicine and Philosophy, the Pellegrino Center and the Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University, USA.

PAUL VANDEN BERGHE, Federation of Palliative Care Flanders, Belgium.

ARSÈNE MULLIE, Federation of Palliative Care Flanders, Belgium.

MARC DESMET, Federation of Palliative Care Flanders, Belgium.

GERT HUYSMANS, Federation of Palliative Care Flanders, Belgium.

SIGRID STERCKX, Bioethics Institute Ghent, Ghent University, Belgium.



xii

#### AUTHORS' AFFILIATIONS

KASPER RAUS, University Hospitals and Bioethics Institute Ghent, Ghent University, Belgium.

BENOIT BEUSELINCK, Department of Oncology, University Hospitals, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium.

TREVOR STAMMERS, Centre for Bioethics and Emerging Technologies, St Mary's University, Twickenham, United Kingdom.

KEVIN FITZPATRICK, Disability Rights Commission for Wales, United Kingdom (2000 to 2007) and Euthanasia Prevention Coalition International (2014 to 2016).

JORIS VANDENBERGHE, Department of Neurosciences, University Hospitals and University Psychiatric Center, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium.

STEFAAN VAN GOOL, Immunology-Oncology Centre, Cologne, Germany.

JAN DE LEPELEIRE, Academic Centre for General Practice, and University Psychiatric Center, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium.

RAPHAEL COHEN-ALMAGOR, School of Law and Politics, University of Hull, United Kingdom.

WILLEM LEMMENS, Department of Philosophy, University of Antwerp, Belgium.