

A SOCIOLOGY OF JUSTICE IN RUSSIA

Much of the media coverage and academic literature on Russia suggests that the justice system is unreliable, ineffective and corrupt. But what if we look beyond the stereotypes and preconceptions? This volume features contributions from a number of scholars who studied Russia empirically and in depth, through extensive field research, observations in courts and interviews with judges and other legal professionals as well as lay actors. A number of tensions in the everyday experiences of justice in Russia are identified and the concept of the 'administerial model of justice' is introduced to illuminate some of the less obvious layers of Russian legal tradition, including file-driven procedure and extreme legal formalism combined with informality of the pre-trial proceedings, followed by ritualistic format of the trial. The underlying argument is that Russian justice is a much more complex system than is commonly supposed, and that it both requires and deserves a more nuanced understanding.

MARINA KURKCHIYAN is a Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies and a Fellow of Wolfson College at the University of Oxford.

AGNIESZKA KUBAL is a Lecturer in Sociology at Department of Social Science, University College London.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Founded in 1997, Cambridge Studies in Law and Society is a hub for leading scholarship in socio-legal studies. Located at the intersection of law, the humanities, and the social sciences, it publishes empirically innovative and theoretically sophisticated work on law's manifestations in everyday life: from discourses to practices, and from institutions to cultures. The series editors have longstanding expertise in the interdisciplinary study of law, and welcome contributions that place legal phenomena in national, comparative, or international perspective. Series authors come from a range of disciplines, including anthropology, history, law, literature, political science, and sociology.

Series Editors

Mark Fathi Massoud, University of California, Santa Cruz Jens Meierhenrich, London School of Economics and Political Science Rachel E. Stern, University of California, Berkeley

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.



A SOCIOLOGY OF JUSTICE IN RUSSIA

Edited by

Marina Kurkchiyan
University of Oxford

Agnieszka Kubal
University College London





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107198777

DOI: 10.1017/9781108182713

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kurkchiyan, Marina, 1954- editor. | Kubal, Agnieszka, 1983- editor.

Title: A sociology of justice in Russia / edited by Marina Kurkchiyan, University of Oxford; Agnieszka Kubal, University College London.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Series: Cambridge studies in law and society

Identifiers: LCCN 2018009839 | ISBN 9781107198777 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781316648285 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Justice, Administration of-Social aspects-Russia (Federation)

Classification: LCC KLB1572 .S66 2018 | DDC 340/.1140947-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018009839

ISBN 978-1-107-19877-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Michael and Ashish

with thanks



More Information



CONTENTS

		ge ix
	of Tables	X
	of Contributors	хi
Ack	nowledgements	xii
1	Introduction: Exploring the Diversity of Experiences of Justice in Russia	1
	MARINA KURKCHIYAN AND AGNIESZKA KUBAL	
2	The Professionalisation of Law in the Context of the Russian Legal Tradition	12
	MARINA KURKCHIYAN	
3	To Go to Court or Not? The Evolution of Disputes in Russia	40
	KATHRYN HENDLEY	
4	The Everyday Experiences of Russian Citizens in Justice of the Peace Courts	68
	VARVARA ANDRIANOVA	
5	In Search of Justice: Migrants' Experiences of Appeal in the Moscow City Court AGNIESZKA KUBAL	92
6	When Business Goes to Court: Arbitrazh Courts in Russia timur bocharov and kirill titaev	118
7	Journalists, Judges and State Officials: How Russian Courts Adjudicate Defamation Lawsuits against the Media	141
	MARIA POPOVA	
8	Accusatorial Bias in Russian Criminal Justice	170
	PETER H. SOLOMON, JR	

vii



CONTENTS

9	Decision-Making in the Russian Criminal Justice	
	System: Investigators, Procurators, Judges and Human Trafficking Cases	205
	LAUREN A. MCCARTHY	
10	The Richelieu Effect: The Khodorkovsky Case and Political Interference with Justice JEFFREY KAHN	231
11	Administerial Justice: Concluding Remarks on the Russian Legal Tradition MARINA KURKCHIYAN AND AGNIESZKA KUBAL	259
Inde	2 Y	2.78

viii



FIGURES

4.1	Comparison of civil, criminal and administrative	
	cases heard in Courts of Justices of the Peace from	
	2005 to 2014	page 72
4.2	Categories of cases — according to the parties	
	involved – decided in Russian Courts of Justices	
	of the Peace from 2007 to 2014	73
5.1	Immigration law cases in District Courts in Russia,	
	2007–2016	98
6.1	The current structure of Arbitrazh courts in Russia	120
7.1	Number of civil defamation cases in Russia, 1997–2015	144
7.2	Plaintiff success rate, 1997–2011 (in %)	155
7.3	Share of municipal officials among plaintiffs (in %)	156
7.4	Share of regional officials among plaintiffs (in %)	157
7.5	Share of federal officials among plaintiffs (in %)	157
7.6	Share of siloviki among plaintiffs (in %)	157
7.7	Share of byudzhetniki among plaintiffs (in %)	158
7.8	Median Compensation Award (in rubles), 1997–2011	160
7.9	Median Moral Compensation Award (in rubles)	160
7.10	Predicted probability of victory in court	
	by plaintiff group (%)	164

ix



More Information

TABLES

6.1	The outcome of administrative cases in the	
	Arbitrazh courts (%) from 2007–2011	page 129
7.1	Regions represented in the sample by percentage and	
	number of cases	154
7.2	Moral compensation awards by plaintiff group	161
7.3	Logit coefficients for the probability of success	
	in court by plaintiff group, 1998–2011	163
7.4	Logit coefficients for the probability of success in court	
	by plaintiff group, 1998–2011	166
7.5	FGLS coefficients for size of moral compensation award	
	by plaintiff group, 1996–2011	167
9.1	Human trafficking (Article 127.1) definition as of 2003	209
92	The use of slave labour (Article 127.2)	210



CONTRIBUTORS

Varvara Andrianova

Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford

Timur Bocharov

Institute for the Rule of Law, European University at St Petersburg

Kathryn Hendley

Law School, University of Wisconsin

Jeffrey Kahn

Law School, Southern Methodist University

Agnieszka Kubal

Department of Social Science, University College London

Marina Kurkchiyan

Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford

Lauren A. McCarthy

Department of Political Science, University of Massachusetts Amherst

Maria Popova

Department of Political Science, McGill University

Peter H. Solomon, Jr

Munk School of Global Affairs, University of Toronto

Kirill Titaev

Institute for the Rule of Law, European University at St Petersburg



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank the Foundation for Law, Justice and Society, with special appreciation for the contribution of its chairman, John Adams, who has been generous in his sponsorship of our research. His continued interest in and support of the work carried out at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies in Oxford provided the opportunity for years of study of Russian law and society. In many ways this book emerged from a set of workshops supported by the Foundation. Our appreciation goes to all our contributors for their excellent contributions, their forbearance in the face of occasionally stern editing, and their collegiality, especially during the trips that they were asked to make to Oxford while we were developing the book and its themes. During the final stages we had the privilege of experiencing the high professionalism of the Cambridge University Press production team. They have brought the book to life with their combination of courteous and insightful suggestions for improvement, along with an impressive efficiency and scrupulous adherence to deadlines. Our gratitude goes to all of them.