A SOCIOLOGY OF JUSTICE IN RUSSIA

Much of the media coverage and academic literature on Russia suggests that the justice system is unreliable, ineffective and corrupt. But what if we look beyond the stereotypes and preconceptions? This volume features contributions from a number of scholars who studied Russia empirically and in depth, through extensive field research, observations in courts and interviews with judges and other legal professionals as well as lay actors. A number of tensions in the everyday experiences of justice in Russia are identified and the concept of the ‘administrative model of justice’ is introduced to illuminate some of the less obvious layers of Russian legal tradition, including file-driven procedure and extreme legal formalism combined with informality of the pre-trial proceedings, followed by ritualistic format of the trial. The underlying argument is that Russian justice is a much more complex system than is commonly supposed, and that it both requires and deserves a more nuanced understanding.

Marina Kurkchiyan is a Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies and a Fellow of Wolfson College at the University of Oxford.

Agnieszka Kubal is a Lecturer in Sociology at Department of Social Science, University College London.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Founded in 1997, Cambridge Studies in Law and Society is a hub for leading scholarship in socio-legal studies. Located at the intersection of law, the humanities, and the social sciences, it publishes empirically innovative and theoretically sophisticated work on law's manifestations in everyday life: from discourses to practices, and from institutions to cultures. The series editors have longstanding expertise in the interdisciplinary study of law, and welcome contributions that place legal phenomena in national, comparative, or international perspective. Series authors come from a range of disciplines, including anthropology, history, law, literature, political science, and sociology.

Series Editors
Mark Fathi Massoud, University of California, Santa Cruz
Jens Meierhenrich, London School of Economics and Political Science
Rachel E. Stern, University of California, Berkeley

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.
A SOCIOLOGY OF JUSTICE IN RUSSIA

Edited by

Marina Kurkchiyan
University of Oxford

Agnieszka Kubal
University College London
To Michael and Ashish
with thanks
## CONTENTS

**List of Figures**

page ix

**List of Tables**

x

**List of Contributors**

xi

**Acknowledgements**

xii

1. **Introduction: Exploring the Diversity of Experiences of Justice in Russia**
   - Marina Kurkchiyan and Agnieszka Kubal
   - Page 1

2. **The Professionalisation of Law in the Context of the Russian Legal Tradition**
   - Marina Kurkchiyan
   - Page 12

3. **To Go to Court or Not? The Evolution of Disputes in Russia**
   - Kathryn Hendley
   - Page 40

4. **The Everyday Experiences of Russian Citizens in Justice of the Peace Courts**
   - Varvara Andrianova
   - Page 68

5. **In Search of Justice: Migrants’ Experiences of Appeal in the Moscow City Court**
   - Agnieszka Kubal
   - Page 92

6. **When Business Goes to Court: Arbitrazh Courts in Russia**
   - Timur Bocharov and Kirill Titaev
   - Page 118

7. **Journalists, Judges and State Officials: How Russian Courts Adjudicate Defamation Lawsuits against the Media**
   - Maria Popova
   - Page 141

8. **Accusatorial Bias in Russian Criminal Justice**
   - Peter H. Solomon, Jr
   - Page 170
CONTENTS

9  Decision-Making in the Russian Criminal Justice System: Investigators, Procurators, Judges and Human Trafficking Cases 205
  LAUREN A. MCCARTHY

10  The Richelieu Effect: The Khodorkovsky Case and Political Interference with Justice 231
  JEFFREY KAHN

11  Administerial Justice: Concluding Remarks on the Russian Legal Tradition 259
  MARINA KURKCHIYAN AND AGNIESZKA KUBAL

Index 278
FIGURES

4.1 Comparison of civil, criminal and administrative cases heard in Courts of Justices of the Peace from 2005 to 2014  

4.2 Categories of cases — according to the parties involved — decided in Russian Courts of Justices of the Peace from 2007 to 2014  

5.1 Immigration law cases in District Courts in Russia, 2007–2016  

6.1 The current structure of Arbitrazh courts in Russia  

7.1 Number of civil defamation cases in Russia, 1997–2015  

7.2 Plaintiff success rate, 1997–2011 (in %)  

7.3 Share of municipal officials among plaintiffs (in %)  

7.4 Share of regional officials among plaintiffs (in %)  

7.5 Share of federal officials among plaintiffs (in %)  

7.6 Share of siloviki among plaintiffs (in %)  

7.7 Share of byudzhetniki among plaintiffs (in %)  

7.8 Median Compensation Award (in rubles), 1997–2011  

7.9 Median Moral Compensation Award (in rubles)  

7.10 Predicted probability of victory in court by plaintiff group (%)  

ix
# TABLES

6.1 The outcome of administrative cases in the
Arbitrazh courts (%) from 2007–2011 page 129

7.1 Regions represented in the sample by percentage and
number of cases 154

7.2 Moral compensation awards by plaintiff group 161

7.3 Logit coefficients for the probability of success
in court by plaintiff group, 1998–2011 163

7.4 Logit coefficients for the probability of success in court
by plaintiff group, 1998–2011 166

7.5 FGLS coefficients for size of moral compensation award
by plaintiff group, 1996–2011 167

9.1 Human trafficking (Article 127.1) definition as of 2003 209

9.2 The use of slave labour (Article 127.2) 210
CONTRIBUTORS

Varvara Andrianova
Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford

Timur Bocharov
Institute for the Rule of Law, European University at St Petersburg

Kathryn Hendley
Law School, University of Wisconsin

Jeffrey Kahn
Law School, Southern Methodist University

Agnieszka Kubal
Department of Social Science, University College London

Marina Kurkchiyan
Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford

Lauren A. McCarthy
Department of Political Science, University of Massachusetts Amherst

Maria Popova
Department of Political Science, McGill University

Peter H. Solomon, Jr
Munk School of Global Affairs, University of Toronto

Kirill Titaev
Institute for the Rule of Law, European University at St Petersburg
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank the Foundation for Law, Justice and Society, with special appreciation for the contribution of its chairman, John Adams, who has been generous in his sponsorship of our research. His continued interest in and support of the work carried out at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies in Oxford provided the opportunity for years of study of Russian law and society. In many ways this book emerged from a set of workshops supported by the Foundation. Our appreciation goes to all our contributors for their excellent contributions, their forbearance in the face of occasionally stern editing, and their collegiality, especially during the trips that they were asked to make to Oxford while we were developing the book and its themes. During the final stages we had the privilege of experiencing the high professionalism of the Cambridge University Press production team. They have brought the book to life with their combination of courteous and insightful suggestions for improvement, along with an impressive efficiency and scrupulous adherence to deadlines. Our gratitude goes to all of them.