

READING DANTE IN RENAISSANCE ITALY

Simon Gilson's new volume provides the first in-depth account of the critical and editorial reception in Renaissance Italy, particularly Florence, Venice and Padua, of the work of Dante Alighieri (1265-1321). Gilson investigates a range of textual frameworks and related contexts that influenced the way in which Dante's work was produced and circulated, from editing and translation to commentaries, criticism and public lectures. In so doing he modifies the received notion that Dante and his work were eclipsed during the Renaissance. Central themes of investigation include the contestation of Dante's authority as a 'classic' writer and the various forms of attack and defence employed by his detractors and partisans. The book pays close attention not only to the Divine Comedy but also to the Convivio and other of Dante's writings, and explores the ways in which the reception of these works was affected by contemporary developments in philology, literary theory, philosophy, theology, science and printing.

SIMON GILSON is Agnelli-Serena Professor of Italian in the University of Oxford and Fellow of Magdalen College. He is the author of *Dante and Renaissance Florence* (Cambridge, 2005).



READING DANTE IN RENAISSANCE ITALY

Florence, Venice and the 'Divine Poet'

SIMON GILSON

University of Oxford





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107196551 DOI: 10.1017/9781108164795

© Simon Gilson 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19655-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my wife Julie and to our daughters, Lauren and Sofia.



mentre che egli di ciascuna delle sette arti e della filosofia e, oltre acciò, di tutte le cristiane cose maestro ha voluto mostrar d'essere nel suo poema, egli men sommo e meno perfetto è stato nella poesia. Con ciò sia cosa che affine di poter di qualunque cosa scrivere, che ad animo gli veniva, quantunque poco acconcia e malagevole a caper nel verso, egli molto spesso ora le latine voci, ora le straniere, che non sono state dalla Toscana ricevute, ora le vecchie del tutto e tralasciate, ora le non usate e rozze, ora le immonde e brutte, ora le durissime usando, e allo 'ncontro le pure e gentili alcuna volta mutando e guastando, e talora, senza alcuna scielta o regola, da sé formandone e fingendone, ha in maniera operato che si può la sua Comedia giustamente rassomigliare ad un bello e spazioso campo di grano, che sia tutto d'avene e di logli e d'erbe sterili e dannose mescolato.

in wanting to show himself to be, in his poem, the master of each of the seven liberal arts and of philosophy, and of all Christian things, he was less supreme and perfect in the field of poetry. For, in order to write on all matters that came to his mind, however ill-fitting or awkward to capture in verse, he very often used now Latin words, now foreign ones that have not entered into currency in Tuscany, now completely old and forgotten words, now archaic and rough ones, now vulgar and ugly ones, and very harsh sounding ones; and, on the other hand, he changed and ruined pure and noble words; and at other times, without any discrimination or rule, he created and invented words by himself. He has thus acted in such a way that his *Comedy* may justifiably be compared to a beautiful spacious field of wheat which is interspersed all over with oats, tares, and sterile, harmful grasses. (Pietro Bembo)

E la fama di Dante al succedere del Petrarca non s'arrestò anch'ella? Did not Dante's fame stop with the coming of Petrarch? (Niccolò Franco)

Veramente quando io considero la *Commedia* di Dante io non vi veggo altro che un mescuglio, un zibaldone et un guazzabuglio delle lezioni che egli doveva udir da questo frate e da quello [...] in quell'opera non è scelta di parole, né osservanza di grammatica, né rispetto o verecundia di vocabuli, né freno alcuno che lo ritenga. Usa ogni sporco vocabolo, usa ogni licenzia nello storpiar le voci, empie que' suoi canti di parole hor pedantesche, hor barbare di qualsivoglia linguaggio [...] la *Comedia* di Dante non è poema.



Truly, when I consider Dante's *Comedy* I see nothing but a medley, a hotchpotch, a jumbled mishmash of the lectures that Dante must have heard from some friar or other [...] and in that work there is no discrimination in the use of words, no adherence to grammar, no sense of propriety in the use of lexis, no limit beyond which he will not stray. He uses every possible dirty word, every freedom in twisting words, he fills up his cantos with words that are now pedantic, now barbarous and that come from all languages [...] Dante's *Comedy* is not a poem. (Ridolfo Castravilla)



Contents

List of Illustrations Acknowledgements List of Abbreviations	<i>page</i> x xi xiii
Introduction: Dante between 'Words' and 'Things'	I
PART I: FLORENTINE LEGACIES AND VENETIAN INITIATIVES, 1481–1540	2 I
 Reading and Refashioning the <i>Comedy</i>, 1484–1536 Dante's Verse, the <i>De vulgari eloquentia</i>, and the 	23
Convivio: Editions and Critical Estimates, 1490–1532	62
PART II: DANTE AND FLORENTINE ACADEMIES, 1540-159	95 91
 Reading Dante in the Florentine, Crusca and Alterati Academies 'His Greatest Partisan': Giovan Battista Gelli as Public Reader of Dante 	93 144
PART III: VENETIAN 'DANTES', 1544-1596	173
 New Print Commentaries: The <i>Espositioni</i> of Alessandro Vellutello and Bernardino Daniello Dante and the Polygraphs 	175
Conclusion	209 24I
	249
Appendix: Printed Works of Dante, 1484–1596	
Notes	
Select Bibliography Index	
THUCK	414

ix



Illustrations

Ι	1492 edition of the <i>Comedy</i> : printed page with Dante's text, Landino's commentary, print annotations, and woodcut of narrative scene from <i>Inferno</i> VI. John Rylands University	
	Library, Manchester. © The University of Manchester	page 30
2	1502 Aldine edition of the <i>Comedy</i> : text of first page of the	
	Inferno. John Rylands University Library, Manchester. © The	
	University of Manchester	34
3	Giorgio Vasari, Six Tuscan Poets, 1544 (oil on panel)/	
	Minneapolis Institute of Arts, MN, USA/The William Hood	
	Dunwoody Fund/Bridgeman Images	108
4	1544 Vellutello, <i>Espositione</i> : printed page of <i>Inferno</i> VI with	
	Dante's text, Vellutello's exposition and woodcut. John	
	Rylands University Library, Manchester. © The University of	
	Manchester	185



Acknowledgements

This book would not have been possible without the encouragement and support of many colleagues and friends in the UK and Ireland, the US, and Italy. I owe special debts to Zyg Barański, Ted Cachey, and Brian Richardson – all three have been major sources of inspiration and support throughout the last twelve years in which this book has been researched and written. In Italy, Saverio Bellomo, Francesco Bruni, Giuseppe Ledda, and Paolo Procaccioli, both on the page and in conversation, have also offered valuable encouragement. I have benefited from conversations and from responses to papers with many other important interlocutors including: Annalisa Andreoni, Guyda Armstrong, Albert Ascoli, Johannes Bartuschat, Luca Bianchi, Steven Botterill, Dario Brancato, Elisa Brilli, Abi Brundin, Judith Bryce, George Corbett, Alison Cornish, Virginia Cox, Eva del Soldato, Chiara Franceschini, Paul Gehl, Roberta Giubilini, Nick Havley, Claire Honess, Bernhard Huss, Rhiannon Daniels, Catherine Keen, Jill Kraye, Elena Lombardi, Daragh O'Connell, Lino Pertile, Ron Martinez, Giuseppe Mazzotta, Martin McLaughlin, Christian Moevs, Ambra Moroncini, Steve Milner, Federica Pich, Eugenio Refini, Claudia Rossignoli, Lisa Sampson, Helena Sanson, Justin Steinberg, Claudia Tardelli, Mirko Tavoni, Matthew Treherne, Heather Webb and Robert Wilson. I am grateful to several libraries and library staff, especially at the John Rylands, Manchester, the Newberry Library, Chicago, and the Hesburgh Library at the University of Notre Dame. This book has grown alongside the activity and energy of collaborative work undertaken on projects related to vernacular philosophy and Dante's theology funded by the UK's Arts and Humanities Research Council (AH/H034913/1 and AH/ Joo3778/I) and by the EU's European Research Council (no. 335949).

During my time at Warwick, the project benefited from periods of study leave in 2009–2010 and 2014–2015, and has been nurtured through the input of my close colleagues in Italian, David Lines and Maude Vanhaelen,



xii

Acknowledgements

and the support of others, in particular Ingrid De Smet, Linda Paterson, Anna Pegoretti, and Peter Mack. Maude read the entire script with insight and made very many helpful suggestions, and I have also benefited from comments on chapters by Anna Pegoretti and Rhiannon Daniels. Equally insightful were the anonymous readers at Cambridge University Press, and I am grateful to Linda Bree for her encouragement and patience throughout. Last but not least I signal close friends and family, the Harveys, the Myatts, the Ractliffe-Cadonis, the Reddishes, Marion Cornforth, Kate Mitchell, my own parents, and the memory of David and Rosemary Herbert. My wife, Julie, has remained a constant source of love and understanding; the book is dedicated to her and to our daughters, Lauren and Sofia.



Abbreviations

Short titles are used in referencing in the notes; the reader is referred to the bibliography for full publication details. The following abbreviations are used in the notes and bibliography:

Works by Dante

Con. Convivio

Dve De vulgari eloquentia

Inf. Inferno
Mon. Monarchia
Par. Paradiso
Purg. Purgatorio
VN Vita nova

Works by Petrarch

Rvf Rerum vulgarium fragmenta

Other Publications

ASI Archivio storico italiano
BHR Bibliothèque d'humanisme et renaissance
B&C Bruniana&Campanelliana

CdT Critica del testo

DBI Dizionario Biografico degli italiani

DS Dante Studies

ED Enciclopedia Dantesca F&L Filologia e Letteratura

GSLI Giornale storico della letteratura italiana

xiii



> Abbreviations xiv Italia medioevale e umanistica IMUIS Italian Studies JΗΙ Journal of the History of Ideas **IWCI** Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes LILettere italiane LIA Letteratura Italiana Antica. Rivista annuale di testi e studi MeRMedioevo e Rinascimento NRLI Nuova rivista di letteratura italiana RdEIRevue des études italiennes RLI Rivista di linguistica italiana Renaissance Quarterly RQRS Renaissance Studies Rivista di studi danteschi RSDStudi sul Boccaccio SBocSD Studi danteschi SFI Studi di filologia italiana SLIStudi di lessicografia italiana SP Studi petrarcheschi SR Studi rinascimentali