Contents

List of Figures *page* xii

List of Tables xix

Acknowledgments xx

General Notation xxi

1 Introduction 1
- 1.1 Claims Problems 1
- 1.2 The Model 3
- 1.3 Two Puzzles in the Talmud 9
- 1.4 Three Approaches 11
  - 1.4.1 Direct Approach 12
  - 1.4.2 Axiomatic Approach 12
  - 1.4.3 Game-Theoretic Approach 15
- 1.5 Historical Note 16
- 1.6 Road Map 16
- 1.7 How to Use This Book 17
- 1.8 Concluding Comment 18

2 Inventory of Division Rules 21
- 2.1 An Inventory of Rules 22
  - 2.1.1 Proportional Rule 22
  - 2.1.2 Constrained Equal Awards Rule 23
  - 2.1.3 Constrained Equal Losses Rule 26
  - 2.1.4 Concede-and-Divide 28
  - 2.1.5 Piniles' Rule 31
  - 2.1.6 Talmud Rule 32
  - 2.1.7 Constrained Egalitarian Rule 34
  - 2.1.8 Random Arrival Rule 37
  - 2.1.9 Minimal Overlap Rule 38
  - 2.1.10 Rule Based on Random Stakes 43

2.2 Families of Rules 45
2.2.1 Sequential Priority Family 45
2.2.2 Young's Family 46
2.2.3 ICI and CIC Families 53
2.3 Summary 60

3 Basic Properties of Division Rules 62
3.1 Balance 62
3.2 Continuity 63
3.3 Homogeneity 64
3.4 Lower and Upper Bounds on Awards and Losses 65
3.4.1 Defining Bounds 65
3.4.2 Recursive Assignment of Lower Bounds 72
3.5 Conditional Full Compensation, Conditional Null Compensation, and Related Properties 75
3.6 Symmetry Properties 79
3.7 Order Preservation Properties 89

4 Monotonicity Properties 94
4.1 Endowment Monotonicity and Related Properties 95
4.2 Claim Monotonicity and Related Properties 105
4.3 Inverse Sets Axioms 115

5 Claims Truncation Invariance and Minimal Rights First 118
5.1 Claims Truncation Invariance 119
5.2 Minimal Rights First 123

6 Composition Down and Composition Up 131
6.1 Composition Down 131
6.2 Composition Up 140

7 Duality 157
7.1 Duality for Rules 157
7.2 Duality for Properties 165
7.3 Duality for Theorems 171
7.4 Characterizations 172

8 Other Invariance Properties 182
8.1 No Advantageous Transfer 182
8.2 Claims Separability and Variants 184
8.3 Convexity and Additivity Properties 187
8.4 Rationalizing Rules as Maximizers of Binary Relations 195

9 Operators 200
9.1 Claims Truncation Operator 200

9.2 Attribution of Minimal Rights Operator 202
9.3 Convexity Operator 205
9.4 Relating and Composing the Operators 206
9.5 Preservation of Properties under Operators 214
9.5.1 Properties Preserved under Claims Truncation 215
9.5.2 Properties Preserved under Attribution of Minimal Rights Operator 218
9.5.3 Properties Preserved under the Composition of the Claims Truncation and Attribution of Minimal Rights Operators 219
9.5.4 Properties Preserved under Convexity 221
9.6 Extension Operators 222
9.7 Summarizing 227

10 Variable-Population Model: Consistency and Related Properties 229
10.1 The Variable-Population Model 230
10.2 Consistency and Related Properties 231
10.3 Converse Consistency 239
10.4 Other Logical Relations between Consistency, Its Converse, and Other Properties 241
10.5 Lifting of Properties by Bilateral Consistency 249
10.6 Characterizations 255
10.7 Average Consistency 266

11 Constructing Consistent Extensions of Two-Claimant Rules 270
11.1 A General Extension Technique 271
11.2 Consistent Extensions of Two-Claimant Rules Satisfying Equal Treatment of Equals 277
11.2.1 Consistent Extension of Weighted Averages of the Two-Claimant Constrained Equal Awards and Constrained Equal Losses Rules 277
11.2.2 Two-Claimant Rules that Have No Consistent Extension 282
11.2.3 Consistent ICI and CIC Rules 283
11.2.4 Other Consistent Families 288
11.3 Consistent Extensions of Two-Claimant Rules that May Not Satisfy Equal Treatment of Equals 289
11.3.1 Generalizing the Talmud Rule by Not Insisting on Equal Treatment of Equals 290
11.3.2 Consistent Extensions of Two-Claimant Rules Satisfying Homogeneity, Composition Down, and Composition Up 297

11.4 Further Characterizations Involving Consistency and Other Axioms but Not Equal Treatment of Equals 302

12 Variable-Population Model: Other Properties 308
12.1 Population Monotonicity and Related Properties 308
12.2 Guarantee Structures 313
12.3 Merging and Splitting Claims; Manipulation Issues and Extension Operators 315
12.3.1 No Advantageous Merging or Splitting and Variants 316
12.3.2 Extension Operators Based on the Merging of Claims 320
12.4 Replication and Division: Invariance and Limit Results 324
12.4.1 Convergence of Rules under Replication 330
12.5 Balanced Impact and Potential 334
12.6 Multiple Parameter Changes; Logical Relations and Characterizations 335

13 Ranking Awards Vectors and Ranking Rules 339
13.1 Orders Based on the Lorenz Criterion 340
13.1.1 Maximality and Minimality Results 340
13.1.2 A Criterion for Lorenz-Domination within the ICI Family 342
13.2 Preservation of Orders by Operators 348
13.3 Lifting of Orders by Bilateral Consistency 351
13.4 Other Properties of Rules Pertaining to Orders 352
13.5 Orders Based on Gap and Variance 354

14 Modeling Claims Problems as Games 359
14.1 Modeling Claims Problems as Cooperative Games 359
14.1.1 Bargaining Games 359
14.1.2 Coalitional Games 367
14.2 Modeling Claims Problems as Strategic Games 380
14.2.1 Game of Stakes 380
14.2.2 Game of Rules 383
14.2.3 Sequential Game of Offers 388

15 Variants and Generalizations of the Base Model 390
15.1 Claims Problems in Which No Claim Exceeds the Endowment 390
15.2 Claims Problems in Which the Data Are Natural Numbers 391
15.3 Claims Problems with a Large Number of Claimants 393
15.4 Surplus-Sharing Problems 395
15.5 Generalizing the Notion of a Rule 396

15.6 Computational Issues 397
15.7 Incorporating Additional Information into the Model 397
15.8 Experimental Testing 405
15.9 A Concluding Comment 406

16 Summary Graphs and Tables 408

17 Appendices 416
17.1 Deriving a Formula for the Minimal Overlap Rule 416
17.2 More about the CIC Rules 417
17.3 Paths of Awards of the DT Rule 420
17.4 Neither Claim Monotonicity Nor No-Transfer Paradox Is Preserved under the Duality Operator 422
17.5 Claim Monotonicity Is Not Preserved under the Attribution of Minimal Rights Operator 426
17.6 Lifting of Properties by Bilateral Consistency 428
17.7 Characterizing the Family of Equal-Sacrifice Rules 429
17.8 On the Existence and Uniqueness of Average Consistent Extensions 432
17.9 Constructing Consistent Extensions 434
17.10 On the Consistent Members of the CIC Family 436
17.11 Characterizing a Family of Sequential Talmud Rules 438
17.12 Completion of the Proof of the Characterization of Family $\mathcal{M}$ 440
17.13 Population Monotonicity Is Not Preserved under Duality 444
17.14 Characterization of the Constrained Equal Awards Rule as Offering Maximal Group Guarantees 447
17.15 Under Replication, the Random Arrival Rule Converges to the Proportional Rule 449
17.16 Convexity of the TU Coalitional Game Associated with a Claims Problem 452
17.17 Proof of the Correspondence between the Talmud Rule and the Nucleolus, and of the Constrained Equal Awards Rule and the Dutta–Ray Solution 453

References 456

Index 472