

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-19365-9 — Big Data, Health Law, and Bioethics

Edited by I. Glenn Cohen , Holly Fernandez Lynch , Effy Vayena , Urs Gasser

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

BIG DATA, HEALTH LAW, AND BIOETHICS

When data from all aspects of our lives can be relevant to our health – from our habits at the grocery store and our Google searches to our FitBit data and our medical records – can we really differentiate between big data and health big data? Will health big data be used for good, such as to improve drug safety, or ill, as in insurance discrimination? Will it disrupt healthcare (and the healthcare system) as we know it? Will it be possible to protect our health privacy? What barriers will there be to collecting and using health big data? What role should law play, and what ethical concerns may arise? This timely, groundbreaking volume explores these questions and more from a variety of perspectives, examining how law promotes or discourages the use of big data in the healthcare sphere, as well as what we can learn from other sectors.

I. GLENN COHEN is Professor of Law and Faculty Director of the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School.

HOLLY FERNANDEZ LYNCH is Assistant Professor and Assistant Faculty Director of Online Education in the Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy at Perelman School of Medicine of the University of Pennsylvania.

EFFY VAYENA is Professor of Bioethics at the Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (ETH Zurich).

URS GASSER is Executive Director of the Berkman Klein Center for Internet & Society at Harvard University and Professor of Practice at Harvard Law School.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-19365-9 — Big Data, Health Law, and Bioethics

Edited by I. Glenn Cohen , Holly Fernandez Lynch , Effy Vayena , Urs Gasser

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Big Data, Health Law, and Bioethics

Edited by

I. GLENN COHEN

Harvard Law School

HOLLY FERNANDEZ LYNCH

Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania

EFFY VAYENA

Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (ETH Zurich)

URS GASSER

Berkman Klein Center for Internet & Society, Harvard University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-19365-9 — Big Data, Health Law, and Bioethics

Edited by I. Glenn Cohen, Holly Fernandez Lynch, Effy Vayena, Urs Gasser

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107193659

DOI: 10.1017/9781108147972

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Cohen, I. Glenn, editor. | Lynch, Holly Fernandez, editor. | Vayena, Effy, 1972– editor. | Gasser, Urs, editor.

TITLE: Big data, health law, and bioethics / edited by I. Glenn Cohen, Holly Fernandez Lynch, Effy Vayena, Urs Gasser.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom : New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017041362 | ISBN 9781107193659 (Hardback)

SUBJECTS: | MESH: Data Mining | Health Policy | Legislation, Medical | Bioethical Issues | Privacy | United States

CLASSIFICATION: LCC RA425 | NLM W 26.55.14 | DDC 362.1–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017041362>

ISBN 978-1-107-19365-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-44967-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-19365-9 — Big Data, Health Law, and Bioethics

Edited by I. Glenn Cohen , Holly Fernandez Lynch , Effy Vayena , Urs Gasser

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

For Will Zhang – I. Glenn Cohen

For Barbara Bierer – Holly Fernandez Lynch

For Martha Minow – Urs Gasser

For Bishop Nikolaos Chatzinikolaou – Effy Vayena

Contents

<i>List of Editors and Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
Introduction	1
I. Glenn Cohen, Holly Fernandez Lynch, Effy Vayena, and Urs Gasser	
PART I SHIFTING PARADIGMS: BIG DATA'S IMPACT ON HEALTH LAW AND BIOETHICS	15
Introduction	15
<i>Urs Gasser</i>	
1 Big Data and Individual Autonomy in a Crowd	19
Barbara J. Evans	
2 Big Data's Epistemology and Its Implications for Precision Medicine and Privacy	30
Jeffrey M. Skopek	
3 Correlation versus Causation in Health-Related Big Data Analysis: The Role of Reason and Regulation	42
Tal Z. Zarsky	
4 Big Data and Regulatory Arbitrage in Healthcare	56
Nicolas P. Terry	
PART II OVERCOMING THE DOWNSIDES OF BIG DATA	69
Introduction	69
<i>I. Glenn Cohen</i>	

5	The Future of Pharmacovigilance: Big Data and the False Claims Act Efthimios Parasidis	73
6	Big Data's New Discrimination Threats: Amending the Americans with Disabilities Act to Cover Discrimination Based on Data-Driven Predictions of Future Disease Sharona Hoffman	85
7	Who's Left Out of Big Data? How Big Data Collection, Analysis, and Use Neglect Populations Most in Need of Medical and Public Health Research and Interventions Sarah E. Malanga, Jonathan D. Loe, Christopher T. Robertson, and Kenneth S. Ramos	98
8	Potential Roadblocks in Healthcare Big Data Collection: <i>Gobeille v. Liberty Mutual</i>, ERISA, and All-Payer Claims Databases Carmel Shachar, Aaron S. Kesselheim, Gregory Curfman, and Ameet Sarpatwari	112
	PART III THE INTERNET OF THINGS (IOT) AND HEALTH BIG DATA	125
	Introduction <i>Nathan Cortez</i>	125
9	Avoiding Overregulation in the Medical Internet of Things Dov Greenbaum	129
10	Data Policy for Internet of Things Healthcare Devices: Aligning Patient, Industry, and Privacy Goals in the Age of Big Data Marcus Comiter	142
	PART IV PROTECTING HEALTH PRIVACY IN THE WORLD OF BIG DATA	157
	Introduction <i>Effy Vayena</i>	157
11	Thought-Leader Perspectives on Risks in Precision Medicine Research Laura M. Beskow, Catherine M. Hammack, Kathleen M. Brelsford, and Kevin C. McKenna	161

Contents

ix

12	From Individual to Group Privacy in Biomedical Big Data Brent Mittelstadt	175
13	Big Data and Informed Consent: The Case of Estimated Data Donna M. Gitter	193
	PART V OVERSIGHT OF BIG DATA HEALTH RESEARCH: PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVEMENT	205
	Introduction <i>Holly Fernandez Lynch</i>	205
14	Is There a Duty to Share Healthcare Data? I. Glenn Cohen	209
15	Societal Lapses in Protecting Individual Privacy, the Common Rule, and Big Data Health Research Laura Odwazny	223
16	The Common Rule and Research with Data, Big and Small Liza Dawson	237
17	Big Data, HIPAA, and the Common Rule: Time for Big Change? Margaret Foster Riley	251
	PART VI BIG DATA, FDA, AND LIABILITY CONSIDERATIONS	265
	Introduction <i>Jerry Avorn</i>	265
18	Data Sharing that Enables Postapproval Drug and Device Research and Protects Patient Privacy: Best Practice Recommendations Ameet Sarpatwari, Bradley A. Malin, Aaron S. Kesselheim, Joshua J. Gagne, and Sebastian Schneeweiss	269
19	Big Data and Human Medical Judgment: Regulating Next-Generation Clinical Decision Support Jeffrey M. Senger and Patrick O'Leary	283
20	Medical Malpractice and Black-Box Medicine W. Nicholson Price II	295
	PART VII INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS FOR HEALTH BIG DATA	307
	Introduction <i>Rachel E. Sachs</i>	307

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-19365-9 — Big Data, Health Law, and Bioethics

Edited by I. Glenn Cohen , Holly Fernandez Lynch , Effy Vayena , Urs Gasser

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

x

Contents

21	Big Data and Intellectual Property Rights in the Health and Life Sciences	311
	Timo Minssen and Justin Pierce	
22	The Pathologies of Data-Generating Patents	324
	Ted Sichelman and Brenda M. Simon	
	Epilogue: Professional Cooperation and Rivalry in the Future of Data-Driven Healthcare	337
	Frank Pasquale	
	<i>Index</i>	341

Editors and Contributors

EDITORS

I. Glenn Cohen is Professor of Law and Faculty Director of the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School. He is one of the world's leading experts on the intersection of bioethics and the law, as well as health law. He also teaches civil procedure. He is the author of one hundred articles and book chapters in venues such as the *New England Journal of Medicine*, the *Journal of the American Medical Association*, *Nature*, and the *Harvard Law Review* and the author, editor, or coeditor of eight books. He has appeared on or been covered by PBS, NPR, ABC, CNN, MSNBC, *Mother Jones*, the *New York Times*, the *New Republic*, and the *Boston Globe*, among other media venues. He has been a fellow of the Radcliffe Institute and the Hastings Center.

Holly Fernandez Lynch is John Russell Dickson, MD Presidential Assistant Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy and Assistant Faculty Director of Online Education in the Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy at the Perelman School of Medicine of the University of Pennsylvania. She is an expert on issues at the intersection of law, bioethics, and health policy, in particular, the regulation of research with human subjects and conflicts of conscience in healthcare. She published *Conflicts of Conscience in Health Care: An Institutional Compromise* in 2008 and has released several coedited volumes. In 2014, she was appointed as a member of the Secretary's Advisory Committee on Human Research Protections (SACHRP) at the US Department of Health and Human Services. She previously practiced Food and Drug Administration law, served as a bioethicist working with the National Institutes of Health's Division of AIDS, and staffed President Obama's Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues.

Effy Vayena is Professor of Bioethics in the Department of Health Sciences and Technology at the Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (ETH Zurich). She is an

international expert on issues of ethics and policy in digital health technologies. Her work has appeared in highly ranked journals such as the *Lancet*, *PLoS Medicine*, and the *Proceedings of National Academies of Science*. She has worked extensively in policy areas, consulting for the World Health Organization and the Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development, among others. She was elected a member of the Swiss Academy of Medical Sciences, and she chairs the Ethical, Legal and Societal Issues Advisory Group of the Swiss Personalised Health Network, a large-scale, federally funded national initiative advancing health data uses.

Urs Gasser is Executive Director of the Berkman Klein Center for Internet & Society at Harvard University and Professor of Practice at Harvard Law School. His research and teaching activities focus on information law, policy, and society issues and the changing role of academia in the digitally networked age. In addition to his appointments at Harvard, he is a guest professor at KEIO University (Japan), was a visiting professor at the University of St. Gallen (Switzerland), and taught at Fudan University School of Management (China). He has written and edited several books and published over a hundred journal articles and frequently acts as a commentator on digital technology, policy, and society issues for US and European media.

CONTRIBUTORS

Jerry Avorn, M.D. Chief of the Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Department of Medicine, Brigham and Women's Hospital and Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Laura M. Beskow, Ph.D., M.P.H. Professor in Health Policy and Director of Research Ethics in the Center for Biomedical Ethics and Society, Vanderbilt University Medical Center, Nashville, TN, USA

Kathleen M. Brelsford, Ph.D., M.P.H. Research Assistant Professor in Health Policy, Center for Biomedical Ethics and Society, Vanderbilt University Medical Center, Nashville, TN, USA

Marcus Comiter Ph.D. candidate in Computer Science, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA, USA

Nathan Cortez, J.D. Associate Dean for Research, Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow, and Adelfa Botello Callejo Endowed Professor of Law in Leadership and Latino Studies, Southern Methodist University Dedman School of Law, Dallas, TX, USA

Gregory Curfman, M.D. Editor-in-Chief, Harvard Health Publications, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Liza Dawson, Ph.D. Research Ethics Team Leader, Basic Sciences Program, Division of AIDS, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, US Department of Health and Human Services, Bethesda, MD, USA

Barbara J. Evans, M.S., Ph.D., J.D., LL.M. Alumnae College Professor of Law and Director of the Center on Biotechnology and Law, University of Houston Law Center, Houston, TX, USA

Joshua J. Gagne, Pharm.D., Sc.D. Associate Epidemiologist, Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Department of Medicine, Brigham and Women's Hospital and Associate Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Donna M. Gitter, J.D. Professor of Law, Zicklin School of Business, Baruch College, New York, NY, USA

Dov Greenbaum, J.D., Ph.D. Director of the Zvi Meitar Institute for Legal Implications of Emerging Technologies, Hertsliya, Israel
Assistant Professor, Department of Molecular Biophysics and Biochemistry, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT, USA

Catherine M. Hammack, J.D., M.A. Associate in Health Policy, Center for Biomedical Ethics and Society, Vanderbilt University Medical Center, Nashville, TN, USA

Sharona Hoffman, J.D., LL.M., S.J.D. Edgar A. Hahn Professor of Law, Professor of Bioethics, and Co-Director of the Law-Medicine Center, Case Western Reserve University School of Law, Cleveland, OH, USA

Aaron S. Kesselheim, M.D., J.D., M.P.H. Director of the Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, and Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Department of Medicine, Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard Medical School and Associate Professor at Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Jonathan D. Loe, J.D., LL.M. Associate, Business and Corporate Practice Group, Sherman & Howard, LLC, Scottsdale, AZ, USA

Sarah E. Malanga, J.D., M.P.H. Fellow of the Regulatory Science Program, University of Arizona James E. Rogers College of Law, Tucson, AZ, USA

Bradley A. Malin, Ph.D. Vice Chair for Research, Professor of Biomedical Informatics, Professor of Biostatistics, and Affiliated Faculty in the Center for Biomedical Ethics and Society, Vanderbilt University School of Medicine and Professor of Computer Science, Vanderbilt University School of Engineering, Nashville, TN, USA

Kevin C. McKenna, M.P.H. Research Program Leader, Department of Population Health Sciences, Duke University School of Medicine, Durham, NC, USA

Brent Mittelstadt, Ph.D. Postdoctoral Research Fellow in Data Ethics, Oxford Internet Institute, University of Oxford, Oxford, United Kingdom

Timo Minssen, M.I.C.L., LL.M., LL.D. Professor of Law, Mng. Director, Centre For Advanced Studies in Biomedical Innovation Law (CeBIL), University of Copenhagen Faculty of Law, Copenhagen, Denmark

Laura Odwazny, M.A., J.D. Senior Attorney, Public Health Division, Office of the General Counsel, US Department of Health and Human Services, Rockville, MD, USA

Patrick O’Leary, J.D. Deployment Strategist, Palantir Technologies, Washington, DC, USA

Efthimios Parasidis, J.D., M.Bioethics Associate Professor of Law and Public Health, Moritz College of Law and College of Public Health, and Faculty Affiliate, College of Medicine, The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH, USA

Frank Pasquale, M.Phil., J.D. Professor of Law, University of Maryland Francis King Carey School of Law, Baltimore, MD, USA

Justin Pierce, J.D. Postdoctoral Fellow, Department of Law, Lund University, Lund, Sweden

W. Nicholson Price II, J.D., Ph.D. Assistant Professor of Law, University of Michigan Law School, Ann Arbor, MI, USA

Kenneth S. Ramos, M.D., Ph.D., Pharma.D. Associate Vice President for Precision Health Sciences, University of Arizona Health Sciences, Interim Dean of the University of Arizona College of Medicine – Phoenix, Professor of Medicine in the Division of Pulmonary, Allergy, Critical Care, and Sleep Medicine, and Director of the Center for Applied Genetics and Genomic Medicine and the M.D.-Ph.D. Program, University of Arizona College of Medicine, Tucson, AZ, USA

Margaret Foster Riley, J.D. Professor of Law, General Faculty, Professor of Public Health Sciences, School of Medicine, Professor of Public Policy, Batten School of Leadership and Public Policy and Director of the Animal Law Program, School of Law, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, VA, USA

Christopher T. Robertson, J.D., Ph.D. Associate Dean for Research and Innovation and Professor of Law, University of Arizona James E. Rogers College of Law, Tucson, AZ, USA

Rachel E. Sachs, J.D., M.P.H. Associate Professor of Law, Washington University in St. Louis School of Law, St. Louis, MO, USA

List of Editors and Contributors

xv

Ameet Sarpatwari, J.D., Ph.D. Assistant Director of the Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, and Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Department of Medicine, Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Sebastian Schneeweiss, M.D., Sc.D. Vice Chief of the Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Department of Medicine, Brigham and Women's Hospital, and Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Jeffrey M. Senger, J.D. Partner in the Food, Drug, and Medical Device Regulatory and Enforcement Group, Sidley Austin, LLP, Washington, DC, USA

Carmel Shachar, J.D., M.P.H. Executive Director of the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, MA, USA

Ted Sichelman, J.D., M.S. Professor of Law, Director of the Center for Intellectual Property Law and Markets, Founder and Director of the Center for Computation, Mathematics, and the Law, and Founder and Director of the Technology Entrepreneurship and Intellectual Property Clinic, University of San Diego Law School, San Diego, CA, USA

Brenda M. Simon, J.D. Associate Professor of Law and Director of the Center for Law and Intellectual Property, Thomas Jefferson School of Law, San Diego, CA, USA

Jeffrey M. Skopek, Ph.D., J.D. Lecturer in Medical Law, Ethics, and Policy and Deputy Director of the Centre for Law, Medicine and Life Sciences, University of Cambridge Faculty of Law, Cambridge, United Kingdom

Nicolas P. Terry, LL.M. Hall Render Professor of Law and Executive Director of the William S. and Christine S. Hall Center for Law and Health, Indiana University Robert H. McKinney School of Law, Indianapolis, IN, USA

Tal Z. Zarsky, LL.M., J.S.D. Professor of Law and Vice Dean, University of Haifa Faculty of Law, Haifa, Israel

Acknowledgments

A book like this is the result of the hard work of many. We thank our student line editors Ethan Stevenson (lead line editor), Brian Yost, Colin Herd, and Wilfred Beaye for their meticulous work. We are also grateful to Cristine Hutchison-Jones and Justin Leahey for their administrative support in putting on the conference that gave rise to this book and Cristine in particular for her hard work shepherding all the many pieces of this manuscript. We also thankfully acknowledge the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School, with support from the Oswald DeN. Cammann Fund, for conference sponsorship and the Berkman Klein Center for Internet & Society at Harvard University and the Health Ethics and Policy Laboratory at the University of Zurich for their collaboration. Finally, of course, we thank the contributors for their thoughtful and important scholarly contributions.