

## Violence in Latin America and the Caribbean

Violence in Latin America and the Caribbean is no longer perpetrated primarily by states against their citizens, but by a variety of state and nonstate actors struggling to control resources, territories, and populations. This book examines violence at the subnational level to illuminate how practices of violence are embedded within subnational configurations of space and clientelistic networks. In societies shaped by centuries of violence and exclusion, inequality and marginalization prevail at the same time that democratization and neoliberalism have decentralized power to regional and local levels, where democratic and authoritarian practices coexist. Within subnational arenas, unique configurations – of historical legacies, economic structures, identities, institutions, actors, and clientelistic networks – result in particular patterns of violence and vulnerability that are often strikingly different from what is portrayed by aggregate national-level statistics. The chapters of this book examine critical cases from across the region, drawing on new primary data collected in the field to analyze how a range of political actors and institutions shape people’s lives and connect structural and physical forms of violence.

Tina Hilgers is Associate Professor of Political Science at Concordia University. Her research focuses on informal politics and violence in Latin America. She looks at exchange relationships that interact with formal political processes, focusing on the clientelistic networks of socioeconomically marginalized groups, political corruption, and the interconnections between state and nonstate violent actors.

Laura Macdonald is a Professor in the Department of Political Science and the Institute of Political Economy at Carleton University. She has published on topics including the role of nongovernmental organizations in development, global civil society, citizenship struggles in Latin America, Canadian development assistance, and the political impact of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) on human rights and democracy in its three member states.

# Violence in Latin America and the Caribbean

*Subnational Structures, Institutions,  
and Clientelistic Networks*

TINA HILGERS

*Concordia University, Montréal*

LAURA MACDONALD

*Carleton University, Ottawa*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-19317-8 — Violence in Latin America and the Caribbean  
Edited by Tina Hilgers, Laura Macdonald  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi - 110002, India  
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107193178](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107193178)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108140553

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-1-107-19317-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| <i>Figures and Tables</i>  | page vii |
| <i>Contributors</i>  | ix       |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>   | xi       |
| Introduction: How Violence Varies: Subnational Place,<br>Identity, and Embeddedness<br><i>Tina Hilgers and Laura Macdonald</i>   | I        |
| PART I METHODOLOGY   |          |
| I <i>Not</i> Killer Methods: A Few Things We Get Wrong When<br>Studying Violence in Latin America<br><i>Jean Daudelin</i>  | 39       |
| PART II URBAN VIOLENCE AND CLIENTELISM   |          |
| 2 The Clientelist Bases of Police Violence in Democratic<br>Mexico City<br><i>Markus-Michael Müller</i>  | 59       |
| 3 Of Criminal Factions, UPPs, and Militias: The State of<br>Public Insecurity in Rio de Janeiro<br><i>Robert Gay</i>   | 75       |
| 4 The Garrison Community in Kingston and Its Implications<br>for Violence, Policing, De Facto Rights, and Security in<br>Jamaica<br><i>Yonique Campbell and Colin Clarke</i> | 93       |
| 5 The Salvadoran Gang Truce (2012–2014): Insights on<br>Subnational Security Governance in El Salvador<br><i>Gaëlle Rivard Piché</i>   | 112      |

|  |   |     |
|--|---|-----|
| 6  | Guns and Butter: Social Policy, Semiclientelism, and Efforts to Reduce Violence in Mexico City<br><i>Lucy Luccisano and Laura Macdonald</i>     | 132 |
| PART III REGIONAL VIOLENCE AND CLIENTELISM |   |     |
| 7  | Subnational Authoritarianism and Democratization in Colombia: Divergent Paths in Cesar and Magdalena<br><i>Kent Eaton and Juan Diego Prieto</i> | 153 |
| 8  | Agricultural Boom, Subnational Mobilization, and Variations of Violence in Argentina<br><i>Pablo Lapegna</i>                                    | 173 |
| 9  | Patterns of Violence and the Dead Ends of Democratization in Subnational Argentina<br><i>Hugues Fournier</i>                                    | 192 |
| 10   | Clientelism and State Violence in Subnational Democratic Consolidation in Bahia, Brazil<br><i>Julián Durazo Herrmann</i>                        | 211 |
|  | Conclusion: Learning from Subnational Violence<br><i>Tina Hilgers and Laura Macdonald</i>   | 230 |
|  | <i>Bibliography</i>   | 243 |
|  | <i>Index</i>  | 283 |

## Figures and Tables

### FIGURES

|     |  |                |
|-----|--|----------------|
| 1.1 | Volatility of Homicide Rates in Brazil   | <i>page 42</i> |
| 1.2 | Homicide (Criminal Justice System) and Victimization Rates for Mexico, Central, and South America, 2006–2011 | 45             |
| 1.3 | Standard Deviations of Homicide Rates in Brazilian Cities Larger than 1 Million in 2014                      | 48             |
| 1.4 | Females' Percentage of Total Homicides and Overall Homicide Rates (LAC, 2008–2009)                           | 49             |
| 4.1 | Place Names and Street Names in the Kingston Metropolitan Region   | 98             |
| 4.2 | Kingston and St. Andrew Corporate Area: Constituencies Represented in the National Parliament                | 100            |
| 6.1 | Mixed Model of Social Development, Urban, and Law Enforcement Policies                                       | 140            |

### TABLES

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 1.1 | Crime patterns in New York City, Toronto, and Montreal, 2007 (rate per 100,000)      | 46  |
| 1.2 | Homicides and their Determinants in Selected Latin American and Comparison Countries | 53  |
| 9.1 | Intergovernmental Relations and Local Challenges in Two Argentine Provinces          | 194 |

## Contributors

**Yonique Campbell**, Department of Government, The University of the West Indies, Mona, Jamaica

**Colin Clarke**, School of Geography and the Environment, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

**Jean Daudelin**, Norman Paterson School of International Affairs, Carleton University, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

**Julián Durazo Herrmann**, Department of Political Science, Université du Québec à Montréal, Montréal, Québec, Canada

**Kent Eaton**, Politics Department, University of California, Santa Cruz, California, USA

**Hugues Fournier**, Department of Political Science, Université du Québec à Montréal, Montréal, Québec, Canada

**Tina Hilgers**, Department of Political Science, Concordia University, Montréal, Québec, Canada

**Robert Gay**, Sociology Department, Connecticut College, New London, Connecticut, USA

**Pablo Lapegna**, Department of Sociology and Latin American and Caribbean Studies Institute (LACSI), University of Georgia, Athens, Georgia, USA

**Lucy Luccisano**, Department of Sociology, Wilfrid Laurier University, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

**Laura Macdonald**, Department of Political Science, Carleton University,  
Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

**Markus-Michael Müller**, Lateinamerika-Institut, Freie Universität  
Berlin, Berlin, Germany

**Gaëlle Rivard Piché**, Norman Paterson School of International Affairs,  
Carleton University, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

**Juan Diego Prieto**, Politics Department, University of California, Santa  
Cruz, California, USA



## Acknowledgments

This volume is the result of a two-day workshop, “Clientelism and Violence in Latin America and the Caribbean,” that took place in December 2013 at Carleton University in Ottawa. The meeting was funded by a Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) Connection Grant, as well as by generous contributions from Concordia University’s Department of Political Science, Carleton University’s Office of the Dean—Faculty of Public Affairs, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. We would like to thank all of the participants in the workshop, especially Julián Durazo Hermann, Enrique Desmond Arias, Jorge Luiz Barbosa, Markus Gottsbacher, Horace Levy, Ivan Darío Ramirez, Victoria Simmons, and Jill Wigle. Victoria Simmons and Lara Khattab provided invaluable support in organizing and running the workshop, Daniel Gavin Tubb in taking notes during the event, and Lara Khattab in producing the final report. We are also grateful to the participants—especially Lee Seymour—in the Latin American Studies Network of Montreal (RELAM) workshop “Violence in Latin America: New Actors, New Issues?,” held at Concordia University in Montreal in November 2015 where we presented a draft of the introduction. Enrique Desmond Arias and Robert Gay also provided helpful comments on previous versions of the introduction. Two anonymous reviewers took the time to write extensive, thoughtful comments on, and suggestions for, the entire manuscript, which have made the book much stronger. We would like to thank them, as well as Sara Duskow, Robert Judkins, and Claudia Bona-Cohen at Cambridge, for their enthusiastic support. We dedicate this book to those individuals struggling to protect the rights of victims of violence in the Americas.