

## Index

agrarian crisis, 246 1913 vocabulary, 273, 277-81, 441 Akers v. Samba Financial Group, 316, 319 AALS Directory of Law Teachers, 500 Allen v. Flood, 41, 322, 360 Abbott, Nathan, 499, 501 Justice Cave's opinion in, 41 abduction, 5, 160 ambiguity analogical, 161 argument-enthymeme, 181 characteristic virtues, 205 contents of, 277-81 example of, 208 correlativity and, 122 formal structure of, 205-8 in the law, 29 Mr. Justice Howell Edmunds Jackson's Hohfeldian, 215-19 interpretive-cum-logical, 181 language and, 23 judgment of plausibility in, 207 of expression, 46 legal, 5, 6, 209-12, 219 of legal terminology, 20, 64, 68, 101 use of the term 'right' and, 166, 426 logical species of, 203 Logocratic Method and, 201 American Bar Association, 513 mode-specific virtue, 198 Section on Legal Education, 495, 500 philosophical, 5, 160, 161, 164, 171, 187, 194, 203, American Legal Realism equity and, 334 212, 213 American Restatements, 142, 151 terminology and epistemology of, 198-201 American University, invention of, 495 absence of duty, 43, 481 complete, 27, 354 Ames, James Barr, 14, 16, 497, 512 liberty and, 42 analogical abductions, 161 analogical argument, 194-97 absolute duties, 116 absolute ownership, 229 Hohfeld and, 216 absolutist Blackstonian conception, 220 Logocratic explanation of, 105 absolutist conception of property, 483 analogy, features of, 196 academic identity, forming an, 495 analytic separation, 10 accident law, 386 Anglo-American legal systems, 9, 372, 376, 377 accidental harm, 389 anti-normative positions, 10 actual legal conceptions, 21 apartheid, 490-91 ad coelum, 435-37 Apology, The (Plato), 192 additive relations, 11 architecture of property adjective law, 40, entitlements, 6 adjudication, 50 argufication, 180-82 affirmative operative facts, 47 best, 187 aggregate legal relations argument, definition of, 164 argument-enthymeme, 164-65, 176 theory of, 3, 9 aggregates, theory of, 3 ambiguity, 181



Logocratic theory and, 180–82	"absolutist" Blackstonian conception, 229–30
arguments, 5, 172–73	Blackstonian conception, 223, 224, 249
dialectic of, 192	Bohr, Neils, 207
inferences as, 204	Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co., 402, 414
logical form of, 174	case, 411
Logocratic abduction of, 193	Bourgeois Monarchy, 245
mode-independent goal-purpose for, 191–92	Bowen, Lord, Mogul Steamship Co
strength and weakness of, 192, 194	v. McGregor, 36
tokens, 172	Brewer, Scott, 5–6
types of, 172, 173	British labor law case, 359
valid, 182	British subject, ordinary rights of, 34, 359,
Aristotle	360,
Aristotelian enthymeme, 175	Brobeck Phleger & Harrison, 80
formulation, 434	Browne-Wilkinson, Lord, 328
The Rhetoric, 174	bundle of rights, 6, 51, 65, 224, 231, 274, 483–86
Arizona Supreme Court, 275	bundle of sticks notion, 349–50, 362–65
Association of American Law Schools (AALS), 87	Burke, Edmund, 354
Atlantic Cement Company, 414	
	businesses or professions, public calling of, 57, 58
atomic relations, 347	Calabrasi Cuida ea un una a un es
complex aggregates, 348	Calabresi, Guido, 10, 404, 407–9, 413–16
Austin, J. L., 16, 166	Melamed typology, 388–403
How To Do Things With Words, 204	California Law Review, 90
Province of Jurisprudence Determined,	California Supreme Court
The, 497	decision in Rowland v. Christian, 366
authority, 53	decision of, 10
auxiliary jurisdiction, 298	capacity, 46
equity's, 304	Carley, Justice
axiological level, 202	argufied argument, 186
axioms, legal argument and, 186–89	legal abduction arguments, 210
	Wright and, 183, 189, 203, 209, 211–12, 219
Bad Man, 199, 387	cases, second class of, 45–46
Bagchi, Aditi, 12–13	category mistakes, presumptuous, 2
Balganesh, S., 6–7	Cathedral article (Calabresi and Melamed),
BankAmerica Housing Services v. P.D.N. &	10, 396
Associates, 405	Caton, Charles, 4, 108
Bartolus of Saxoferrato, 242–43, 244	Cave, Mr. Justice
basic rights, litigations and, 122	opinion in Allen v. Flood, 41
Bates, Henry M., 501	Chabrata v. Avis Rent-A-Car System, 393
Beale, Joseph, 14, 94, 497,	chameleon-hued words/terms, 20–21
beneficiary	Chapman, Bruce, 259, 261
of a trust, 323	charitable interpretation, 177
rights of a, 316-17	chattels, recovering, 405
benefit of the law (beneficium <i>juris</i> ), 38	child support, 163
Bentham, Jeremy, 26, 104, 110, 369, 370–73	choice theory of right, Hart's, 370-72, 374
Hohfeld and, 374, 377, 382	Christopher Columbus, Langdell, 496
best explanation, 209	Chrysler Credit Corp. v. Koontz, 405
conditional, 207, 212	Citizens United decision
inference to the, 5, 160, 174, 198	complaints about, 104
Biakanja v. Irving, 379	Civil Rights Act (1964), 490
Bierling, Ernst, 120	civil rights laws, 492
bilateral rights, 4	public accommodations and, 489
Bingham, Walter, 504	claim, 31
Blackacre, 55, 281	empty rights and, 355
Blackstone William 65	Hohfeldian 128–22



520 Index

concomitant right/rights, 35 claim (cont.) Hohfeldian rights and, 31 against non-interference, 35 synonym for right, 25 concurrent, 8, 297-99 claim right, 9, 22, 23, 367-69 Hohfeld, 300-9 correlative duty violation, 384 conditionals, 178 correlative to duty, 168 Conflict of Equity and Law, The (Hohfeld), 305 Hohfeldian, 378-84 property claim, 484 Hohfeldian scholars and, 25 conflict' thesis, Hohfeld, 310 legal duty and, 367 conspiracy to injure, 36 claiming activity, 369 constitutional and statutory provisions, 23 Cla-Mil East Holding Corp. v. Medallion Funding constitutional rights, 355-58 Corp., 405 constitutive and regulatory law, 100-2 clarity, importance of to Hohfeld, 152 contract breach, intentional interference, 269-70 classical formalism, 29 Contract Clause, 62 contracts, 17, 57 Code Napoleon, 245 code pleading, 48 Hohfeld and drafting of, 151 cognitive aims, distinctive, 201 contractual duty, 45 Cohen, Felix S., 188, 377 contractual obligations, 53, 68 Cohen, Meir Dan, 445 contractual offer, 485 Columbia Law Review, 80, 499 revocation and, 56 article (1909), 384 Cook, Walter Wheeler, 3, 16, 70, 90, 151, 346, 505, Hohfeld published in, 502 515, 517 Commentators, 242 Hohfeld's papers and, 71, 94 common law (jus commune), 37, 309 Legal Realists, 12 Common Law and Equity Corbin, Arthur, 79, 87, 90, 124, 142, 145, 151, 157, normative positions and, 135 236, 506, 512, 515 Common Law, The (Holmes), 500 description of Hohfeld's behavior, 516 common liberty, 345, 355, See also liberty Hohfeld and, 497 Hohfeldian axion and, 219 common rights and, 363 common rights, 9, 345, 353, 358, See also right Hohfeldian glossary of, 160 Legal Realists, 12 common liberties and, 363 protected liberties and, 360 correlative entitlement-disentitlement pairs, 228 protected privileges and, 351-53 correlative jural relations, 167 comparative jurisprudence, 376 correlatives, 28-36, 114 compensation as mirror images, 114, duties of, 10, 392, 398, 412, 417, 418 symmetrical vs asymmetrical views of, 114-18 pure duties of, 418 correlativity compensation requirements, 386-88, 412 analysis of, 135-36 asymmetrical views of, 136 compensatory damages, 389 existential, 4, 118-20 compensatory liability, 386, See also liability compensatory tort liability, 389 for rights and duties, 115 complex aggregates, 349-50 justificational, 120-21 complex jural relations, 9, 345, 350, 365 rights, 4 adumbrating, 347 Court of Appeal of New South Wales, 323 complex relation, 32 Court of Appeals of Georgia, 401 Concept of Law, The (Hart), 133 Court of Chancery, 296, 298 concept/concepts Craft, 147-48 Crocker National Bank, 498 Hohfeld's classification of, 151 Cullison, Alan, 166 use of term, 113 conceptual sequencing and the partitioning, 261-65 De Natura Brevium, 303 deduction, 181 conceptual typology, Hohfeld and, 21 conclusion propositions, 173 deductive argument, 173, 191 conclusions, 173 deductive axiomatic system, 219



defeasible modus ponens, 175	empty rights, 355
delineation, 427–31	Enforcement of Decrees in Equity,
dematerialization, 223, 225, 235–37, 246,	The (Huston), 511
249	English Court of Appeal, 320–22
deontic	English labor law case, 41
logic, 26, 157	enthymeme, 164–65, 174–76
obligation, 50	argument, 176
dephysicalization, 225, 236, 238	Aristotelian, 175
dialectical strength (or weakness), 192	Hohfeld's, 217
disability, 74, 403	legal argument-enthymeme and, 178
immunity is correlative to, 170	Logocratic
disablements, 448	development of, 175
disaggregation, 225	theory and, 180
discrete entitlements, 233-34	rule, 176
discrimination, 23	entitlement options, 257
disintegration, 237	entitlement-disentitlement pairs, 232
distinctive cognitive aims, 201	entitlements, 394, 396, 447
distinctive methods, 201	complaints about, 473-75
dominium divisum, 242–44	Honoré's list of, 365
double-blind experiments, 202	lateral references and, 468-70
double-entry bookkeeping, 447–53	liability rules and, 388
dual level analysis, Hohfeld and, 152–54	of "privilege" and entitlements of "right,"
Due Process Clauses, 5th and 14th Amendments	479
and, 62	property and, 253
duties, 389–91	epistemic strength, 191
enforceable of, 59	epistemology, 213
duties of compensation, 10, 392, 398, 412, 417, 418	Epstein, Richard A.
duties to perform	Playing by Different Rules, 433
vs privilege to perform, 27, 28	equilibrium, reflective, 6
duty, 21	equitable
definition of, 285–87	correction, 333, 341
negation of a, 26	equitable exceptions, 9
rights and, 24	interests, 16
vs a right, 116	analysis of, 17
duty not to enter, 32	sausage meat conception, 328
duty not to interfere, 35	remedies, 334
duty of care	rights, 8, 301, 302, 306
negligence cases and, 379-83	in personam, 306
duty of entering, 27	of a trust beneficiary, 338
Dworkin, Ronald, 199	rules, 8, 300, 310, 320, 336, 338
dynamic specification of rights, 435-37	vs legal rule, 9
Dyson, Freeman, 207	equity, 8, 9, 333–35
	common law and, 297
East Coast legal academy, 14	corrective function of, 333
Eaton v. B.C. & M.R.R. Co., 64	fusion of to law, 18
egalitarian private law structure, 12	Hohfeld and, 295–96, 336–37
egalitarian theories, 475	Hohfeld historical treatment of, 296-97
Eleftheriadis, Pavlos, 119	Hohfeld representation and, 18
emergent properties, 11, 420	jurisdictions of, 297–309
obscuring, 64	separate, 9
scale up, 431–38	trust and, 8
eminent domain, 10, 388–89, 392, 404, 407	use of fiction in, 337
private powers of, 405	equity power
public, 412	Hohfeld's analysis, 433



escrow, 54	Fundamental Legal Conceptions (Hohfeld), 12, 16
Esher, Lord, opinion in Mogul Steamship, 41	105, 122, 223, 368, 476, 509–11
Europe	articles, 94
property disaggregation in, 239	use of, 504
property law in, 239–41, 245	fundamental
traditions of property analysis in, 225	legal relations, 21
European Hohfelds, 239	use of term, 112
evidence, 173	,
evidential fact/facts, 47, 50, 335	Galante, Jane Hohfeld, 3
vs operative facts, 50	games and sporting events, privileges and,
exception-making judges, rules and, 9	352
exclusion	general rules, 331–33
from a public accommodation, 491-93	Georgia Statute, 183–86
property rights and, 489–93	Georgia Supreme Court
existential correlativity, 4	Wright v. Newman, 162
scholarly disagreement, 118–20	Giere, Ronald
explananda, 187	Science Without Laws, 198
explanandum, 206, 208,	Glossators, 242
Wright v. Newman, 210	Gold, Andrew, 11, 219, 347
explanation. See best explanation	Goldberg, John, 10, 218
enterprise conception of, 201	inclusive pragmatism, 347
explanatory speech acts, 201	Goodman, Nelson, 6, 216
externalities, 404	Gray, John Chipman, 79, 347, 351, 352–53, 358,
extraordinary, use of the term, 295	363, 497, 499, 500, 504
emuoramary, use or the term, 29)	Hohfeld's criticism of, 32
factual judgments, 201	privilege and, 32
basis of, 201	The Nature and Sources of Law, 31
false consciousness, legal, 2	usage of "ownership", 363
Farah Constructions Pty Ltd. v. Say-Dee Pty Ltd.,	Gricean virtues, 197
323, 324	. 71
Fascism, 246	Hagan v. Transportation Cabinet, 33
Federal Tort Claims Act, 394	Hall, James Parker, 501
fee simple ownership, 348	Halpin, Andrew, 5
Feinberg, Joel, 10	criticism of Hohfeldian privilege, 350
claims and claiming, 369-74	Handbook of the Roman Law (MacKeldey), 39
right and, 120	Harrison, John, 10
The Nature and Value of Rights, 369	Hart, H. L. A., 10, 100, 132, 195
fiduciaries, 329	choice theory of right, 370-72
Finnis, John, 125, 130, 169, 171	concept of vagueness and, 202
Hohfeld's rulification and, 167	Legal Positivist and, 199
first-order legal relations, 45	The Concept of Law, 133
flat approaches	Harvard, 496
limits of, 433	curriculum, 496
focal points approach, 6	Harvard
formal	Law Review, 497
definition, 21	Law School, 14, 498
jurisprudence, 377	Hastings College of Law (University of
formalism, 32	California), 80
Forsyth County v. The Nationalist Movement, 357	Hawkins, Mr. Justice, 41,
Frank, Jerome, 107	High Court of Australia, 323
freedom vs liberty, 42	higher-order powers, 61
Frost v. Knight, 56	Hill v. Tupper, 322
Frydrych, David, 4–5, 16	Hilton v. Eckersley, 41
Fuller, Lon, 4, 99, 108, 109–11, 429–30	historical jurisprudence, 376



History of English Law (Pollock & Maitland), 63	no-rights, 26
Hohfeld, Edward, 3	personal papers of, 71
Hohfeld, Edward Jr., 91	platform, 444–47
Hohfeld, Wesley Newcomb, 1, 108	platform of, 442–44
1913 vocabulary of, 277–81	privilege, 11, 27, 30, 34, 42, 44, 350, 351
A Vital School of Jurisprudence and Law, 87,	and concomitant right, 35
376, 511, 517	professional identity and, 494, 506
abduction of Mom's rule, 169	property
abductions and, 160, 219–20	analysis, 226, 235–37
absence of privilege, 349	theory and, 273–77
aggregate-level analysis and, 145–48	publications, 502
analogy to physics and chemistry, 9	reception to his analytical scheme, 138–40
analysis of use of legal language, 100-5	residuum, 12, 453–58
analytical scheme, 142, 441–42	right and non-interference, 32
childhood of, 71	right/rights, 24, 25, 26, 27, 30, 31, 351
claim rights and other legal concepts, 367–69	rule-enthymemes and, 218
college life of, 76	schema of jural relations, 112, 121, 137
common right as a privilege, 345	social relationality and, 226–28
conflict between law and conflict, 337-41	Some Fundamental Legal Conceptions as
criticism of Gray, 32	Applied in Judicial Reasoning, 1, 3, 165,
critics of, 5	345, 367, 505
death of, 90–91, 157	Stanford Law School, 80–81
definition of privilege, 43	The Conflict of Equity and Law, 305
disagreement with Maitland's views, 295	The Relations Between Equity and Law, 295,
distinction between Hohfeldian categories, 403	434, 502
dual level analysis and, 152–54	typology, 17, 21, 24, 69
egalitarian theories of private law, 475	unfinished manuscript/work of, 94, 140, 348
enthymematic nature of jural relations, 164	Yale Law School and, 87
enthymemicity of propositions, 165–69	Hohfeldian relation, See also legal relations
equity and, 295–96, 336–37	Hohfeldian right. See Hohfeld, Wesley Newcomb
essential elements of legal education and,	Hohfeldian typology, 15, 57
377-78	constitutional and administrative law and, 23
features for understanding the work of, 143–49	liability and, 60
Fundamental Legal Conceptions, 12, 16, 94, 105,	Hohfelds, European, 239
122, 223, 368, 476, 504, 509, 510	Holland, Professor [Thomas Erskine], 29
Harvard Law School and, 79–80	Holmes, Oliver Wendell, 80, 99, 108
historical treatment of equity, 296–97	analysis of legal language and, 105–7
Hohfeldian	Bad Man and, 199, 387
abductions, 215–19	The Path of the Law, 71, 105, 504, 516
analysis, 374–78	Holmes, Oliver Wendell Jr., 4
claim and, 128–32	Honoré, 365
opposite or negation, 144–45	horizontal dimension, 459
reductionism, 149	How To Do Things With Words (Austin),
importance of clarity to, 152	204
in rem rights and, 282–84	human being/beings, 45
in rem/in personam distinction, 258	legal powers and, 45
jural relations and, 165–69, 335–36	Huston, Charles A.
jural relations as privileges, 348	The Enforcement of Decrees in Equity, 511
jurisdictions of equity and, 297–300	Hutcheson, Joseph, 107
legal disputes analysis and, 138–40	hyper-individuation, 12
legal language and, 99	
legal relations, 150, 152, 170	identity formation, social aspects of, 500-1
legal rules and, 142, 151–52	immunities, 368
legal system of legal relations, 421	correlative to disability, 170



```
immunity, 117
                                                       jural correlatives, 1, 111, 164
  rules, 386-88
                                                        jural interests, 17
imperfect rights, 470-73
                                                          discussions of, 18
in personam, 4, 7, 70, 127, 258-59
                                                        jural opposites, 22, 111
                                                       jural privileges, 20
  and rights, 345
  relations, 40, 285, 406
                                                       jural relations, 5, 6, 174, 311, 331
  relations as an exception to in rem relations,
                                                          adumbrating complex, 347
       287-88
                                                          bilaterality of, 291
in personam/in rem distinct, 368
                                                          classification of, 5
                                                          complex, 365
in rem
  distinction, 368
                                                          correlative relationship and, 115, 167-69
  jural relation, 285
                                                          correlativity and schema of, 121-22
  relations, 40, 285, 421
                                                          enthymematic nature of, 164
  relations and in personam relations and,
                                                          explanations of, 212
       287-88
                                                          Hohfeld and, 335-36, 341-42
  relationship, 258, 260
                                                          Kocourek and, 128,
                                                          rights and litigations and, 124, 127-28
  rights, 1, 4, 7, 69, 70, 126, 284, 290
     analysis of, 11
                                                          rulification of, 167
     contents of, 285-87
                                                          theory of, 3
                                                       jural, use of term, 18
     duties and, 290-92
     Hohfeld and, 282-84
                                                       iurisdictions
in rem/in personam distinctionions, 121,
                                                          characteristics of, 300-9
       258-50
                                                          concurrent, 300-9
  claims about, 271
                                                       jurisprudence, 42
  normative structure of, 284-85
                                                          comparative, 376
inalienability rules, 10
                                                          formal, 377
                                                          historical, 376
incisive statement, 20, 166
inclusive
                                                          logical form, 187
  functionalism, 347
                                                          Salmond, and, 43
                                                          treatise (Salmond), 20
  pragmatism, 347
                                                       justice and policy, 13, 69, 152, 216, 480, 484
indefiniteness
                                                          concomitant rights and, 35
  712, 436
information costs, 8
                                                          Hohfeld analysis and, 452
                                                          property rights and, 482
intentional
  interference, 269-70
                                                          protecting people and, 487-88
                                                          same-sex couples and, 489-93
  torts, 390
interference, right against, 9
                                                       Justice Holmes. See Holmes, Oliver Wendell
interpersonal relations, 124
                                                        justificational correlativity, 120-21
interpretandum, 181
                                                       justificatory claims, 201-2
interpretive abductions
  Wright's case and, 188
                                                       Kales, Albert M., 504
interpretive procedure, 177,
                                                       Katz, Leo, 6-7
                                                       Keller, Albert Galloway, 90
interpretive-cum-logical abduction,
                                                        Kennedy, Duncan, 448
                                                       King James, 158
Jackson, Mr. Justice Howell Edmunds,
                                                          1616 decision, 337
                                                       Kocourek, Albert, 39, 113, 117, 128
Jhering, Rudolph von, 120
                                                       Kramer, Matthew, 115, 118, 119, 125, 349–50, 471, 473
Josserand, Louis, 246
iudicial
  opinion, 444-47
                                                       Lake Shore & M.S.R. Co. v. Kurtz, 24
                                                       Langdell, Christopher Columbus, 14, 16, 499
  reasoning
     legal conceptions applied in, 16-20
                                                       language strata, 109
                                                       languages, Hohfeld and, 172
  remedies, 405
```



lateral references absence of, 12	legal education, 87, 376, 516 essential elements of, 377–78
entitlements and, 468–70	Hohfeld at Harvard, 497
Laudan, Larry, 201	reform of, 376
axiological model, 203	legal effect, 56
scientific explanation of, 198, 201	legal entitlements, 480
law	use of terms and, 277
and equity, 8	legal false consciousness, 2
atomic approach to, 437	legal fiction, 103–4
constitutive and regulatory, 100-2	State as, 356
double-entry bookkeeping of, 447–53	legal formalism, 467–68
equitable override of, 337–41	legal language, 4
equity and, 8	as technical language, 99
Holmes theory of, 199	Hohfeld, 99, 111
imperatival and sanction theories of, 132-35	problems in use of, 100–5
lowest common denominators of, 68	use of, 4, 105–8
physicalist approach to, 63	legal liability, correlative of, 44
scaling up, 431	legal liberty, synonym to legal privilege-4, 367
theories of, 133	legal nullity, 391
vertical and horizontal dimensions of the, 12	legal power/powers, 20, 45, 46, 52, 58, 67, 366,
law of evidence, 40	374, 383
privilege and, 40	first order legal relations, 61
law of libel, 40	intrinsic nature of, 45
privilege and, 40	
	of private parties, 48
law of things, 224	powerholder and, 46
law school, mission of, 496	privilege and, 58
law-free zones, 12, 460–61	legal privilege, 41, See also privilege
Laycock, Douglas, 412	Legal Realism/Realists, 2–3, 44, 107, 216, 218, 330,
Leathem. See Quinn v. Leathem	384, 421, 422, 437, 441, 465
Lectures on Equity (Maitland), 16	American, 334
Lectures on Jurisprudence, 16	early, 12
Leff, Arthur, 463	equity and, 9
legal abduction	Hohfeld and, 9, 346
Wright's case and 277-68, 182	Hohfeld and Holmes as allies of, 107
legal abductions, 209–12, 219	legal relations, 18, 32
legal analysis, symmetrical legal relations and, 12	as a Rorschach blot, 419
legal and social relationships	as physical things, 63
liberties and, 486–88	as rights and duties, 20
legal argument	between legal actors, 25
axiomatic interpretation of, 188	bilateralism of, 4
deductive axiomatic explanation of, 189	change of, 47, 48, 51
legal changes, distinguishing between physical	complex aggregates and, 349–50
acts, 399	conceptions of rights and power and, 31
legal conceptions	flat and structured, 421–27
Hohfeld's, 5	reductionist analysis into, 149–50
in judicial reasoning, 16–20	rights and, 22
Legal Conceptions Contrasted with Non-Legal	treatment of, 427-31
Conceptions, 20	legal relationships, 11
legal delineation	legal right, 30
property law and, 438	as legal duty, 30
legal disability, 44	correlative of legal duty, 30
legal disputes	normative link to powers, 10
Hohfeld analysis of, 143	legal rule-enthymemes, 178
mutual relation and, 143–45	legal rules
12 12	-



526

legal rules (cont.)

Hohfeld compatibility with, 151–52

vs equitable rule, 9

legal scheme, 468

conflict of rights in, 12

legal scholarship, 1, 248, 443, 447, 448

American, 223

current state of, 517

Hohfeld and, 442

legal systems, 127, 133, 376, 429, 474

Anglo-American, 9, 372, 376, 377

errors of, 12

third-party beneficiaries and, 371

legal terminology

ambiguity and looseness of, 64

art and, 44

non-lawyers and, 99, 104

Lenox v. Prout, 354

Levinson, Daryl, 409

LGBTQ people, 487, 489, 493

liability

consequences of, 8

Hohfeld usage of, 59

jural opposite to power, 368

power is correlative to, 167

vs power, 116

liability rules, 10, 388-403, 407, 417, 434

definition of, 386

entitlement and, 388

libel, 266-68

liberal democratic state, 458-60

liberal legalism, 12

liberalism, 246, 460

failure of, 12

Hohfeldian analysis and, 465-66

legal commitments of, 11

libertarians, 432

liberties

as relationships, 486-88

being distinct from rights, 489

without rights, 488-89

liberty, 34-35, 36

absence of duty and, 42

as a legal relation, 34

common liberties and freedoms, 353-55

for privilege, 27

free of legal restraint, 42

Hohfeldian privilege and, 34, 353

Lord Lindley's use of, 36

liberty (Privilege)

correlative to no-right, 167

distinguishing from privilege, 101

use of, 67

Index

Lindley, Lord, 35-36, 347, 359-62, 363

Hohfeld critique of, 36

usage of "liberty", 363

Lindsley v. Nat. Carbonic Gas Co., 33

litigation, 113,

Llewellyn, Karl N., 90, 94, 107, 423, 448, 515,

work on the Uniform Commercial Code, 151

evidential conception of, 174

propositional deductive, 179

logic and mathematics

Modernist understanding of, 188-89

logical abduction, 164

logical form, 174

logical inference, 174

modes of, 193-94

logical relations, 166

logical relationships, 21

Logocractic virtues mode-dependent, 193

Logocratic analysis (Logocratic abduction), 175

Logocratic Method, 5, 6, 162, 164, 169, 171, 196, 219

abduction and, 171, 198, 201, 212 axioms of legal argument and, 186-89

charity and, 181

enthymeme and, 174, 175

moral virtue and, 190

philosophical abductions, 194, 204-5

rhetoric and, 192

treatment of arguments and, 205

unclarities and, 182

virtue and, 189-91

Logocratic virtues, 191

mode-independent, 191

Louis Philippe, 245

MacCormick, Neil, 118, 119

Mackeldey, Ferdinand

Handbook of the Roman Law, 37, 39

MacPherson v. Buick Motor Co., 268

Magruder v. Virginia-Carolina Chemical Co, 403

Maitland, Frederick, 63, 101, 135, 303, 336 equity and, 300

equity and common law view of, 297

Lectures on Equity, 16 thesis, 8

malicious prosecution, 41 map, analogy of, 199

May Treat Morrison Foundation, 91

McDonald, Audra, 491

McFarlane, Ben, 8, 350

The Structure of Property Law, 259

McMillan v. McMillan: 401



McMurray, Orrin, 90	non-legal language, use of, 105–8
Melamed, A. Douglas, 10, 404, 407-9, 413-16	no-rights, 28, 31
typology, 388–403	normalized conflict, entitlements and, 473-75
mental power, 44	normative connections, 10
Merrill, Thomas	normative positions, 4, 112-14, 118, 120, 124, 131, 137
"Property and the Aggregate of Rights That	Hohfeld and, 125
Others Shall Not Enter", 276	Nowheresville, 369
metaphysical judgments, philosophical abduction	nugatory rights, 355
and, 213	nuisance, 436
methodological level, 201	nuisance law, 11, 416
Michelman, Frank, 413-16, 448	
Michigan Law Review, 295	O'Rourke, Allen Thomas, 350, 356
micro and the macro	obligation, deontic definition of, 24
gap between, 11	offer and acceptance, 56
middle classes, professionalization and, 496	power and liability and, 57
mirror images, 4	operative facts, 47–56
correlatives as, 114,	jural relations and, 6
mode-independent logocratic virtues, 191,	legal relations and, 46
modular structures, 431–32	revocation as, 56
modus ponens, 182	specific, 49
modus tollens, 165	Operative Facts Contrasted with Evidential
Mogul Steamship Co. v. McGregor, 36	Facts, 20
Mom's TV rule, Hohfeldian abduction of, 169	opinions, writing, 444
monadic predicate, 167	opportunism, 434
moral connotations, removing words with, 105	opposites, 28
moral notions, 4	opposites jural relations, Corbin's rulification
morality scale up, 432	of, 217
Morrison & Cope, 80, 498, 499	ordinary language philosophy, 108
Morrison, Cope & Brobeck, 80	ordinary rights, 34
Mostyn v. Fabrigas, 103	original jurisdiction, 298
multital and paucital legal relations, 6, 258	ownership
multital rights, 1, 282, 368, 425	absolute, 229
multital/paucital distinction, 125-27	divisibility of, 232, 233
mutatis mutandis, 57	property rights and, 483
	remedies and, 404–6
natural languages, 164, 172-73, 176	ownership claim
conditional, 178	bundle of rights and, 483
non-formal, 166	
natural rights paradigm, 1	pain in my heel, 208–9
natural rights-oriented concepts, 2	Palsgraf opinion, 269
Nature and Sources of Law, The (Gray), 31	paradox of cycling/Arrovian circularity, 7,
Nature and Value of Rights, The (Feinberg), 369	particular cases, equitable correction in, 334
negation of duty, 37, 38, 462	partition, choice of, 270–71
negative operative facts, 48,	Path of the Law, The (Holmes), 105, 504, 516
negligence act, duties of compensation in, 10	Hohfeld's copy of, 71
negligence liability, 408-9	Patterson, Edwin, 4, 99, 107–8, 110
Negro Travelers' Green Book, 491	paucital relationships, 258
neo-Blackstonians, 224, 225, 253	paucital rights, 368
348, 224	paucital/multital distinction, 125–27
critics of, 237	Pauli, Wolfgang, 207
New South Wales Court of Appeal, 324,	Penner, James, 8, 149, 152, 275, 280, 284,
New York Supreme Court	325, 328
use of the term 'right' and, 23	duties not to interfere and, 327-28
Newman, Kim, 7, 210, See also Wright v. Newman	People v. Dikeman, 22



528 Index

perpetrator, vs the victim, 12 primitive rights, 42 persistence. See persistent right principle of charity, 177 persistent partitioning, 270 private property rights persistent right, 7, 259-61, 265-66 liability rules and, 388 private torts, 400 personal property sales of, 60 privilege, 22, 26, 367 as a "franchise", 38 personal rights, 41 contrast to liberty, 42 claiming, 369 personalty, conditional sale of, 54 definition of, 23 Hohfeld definition of, 43 personam Hohfeldian, 27, 30, 38, 349-50, 351 relations, 285 perspectival realism, 198-199 Hohfeld's recognition of, 38 philosophical abduction, 160, 161, 164, 171, 187, 194, liberty for, 27 Lord Lindley and, 36 198, 203, 212 axiological level of, 214-15 negation of a duty, 40 Hohfeld and, 5 no-right regimes, 459 Logocratic Method as, 204-5 no-right relations, 461-65 metaphysical judgments in, 213 right-duty relation and, 453-58 methodological level of, 213 technical definition of, 38-40 of legal abduction, 188 under the law of libel, 40 types of relations and, 213 privilege (privilegium) physical acts, 46, 129, 394-95 in Roman law, 38 legal changes and, 399 privileged communications, 40 physical and mental facts, 101 privileges physicalist approach, 63 against self-incrimination, 40 Plato, The Apology, 192 rights and, 9, 32 plausible explanation, 188 products liability, 268-69 Playing by Different Rules (Epstein), 433 professional identity, 494 Hohfeld's, 506 "plum pudding" model of the atom identity formation, 500-1 Thomson, 365 point of view, 199-200 professionalization, middle classes and, 496 enterprise conception of, 201, 203 progressivism, 3 Pollock, Fredrick, 42, 44, 63, 101, 235, 249 promise, 179 promissory estoppel, 163, 183, 186, 188, 209, 210, 211 duties and, 290-91 Hohfeld and, 290-91 Georgia statute and, 170, 171 positive laws, 37 Georgia's rule for, 211-12 possession, 51 promissory estoppel, statutory, 188 possessory interest, 404 property, 17 Pound, Roscoe, 13, 120, 127, 376, 501, 506, 509, 511 architectural analysis of, 252-57 as a piece of, 147 correlative to liability, 167 as a tree, 244-47 Hohfeld's analysis and, 433 beyond, 265-66 vs liability, 116 Blackstonian view of, 223 power and liability bundle of sticks notion of, 349, 362-65 bundle-of-rights view of, 223-25, 231, offer and acceptance and, 57 powers, 61, 367 234, 235 powers and liabilities, 44-47 conception of, 6 pre-existing duty dematerialization of, 235-37, 248-52 negation of, 40 dephysicalization, 236 premises, 173 dereification of, 234 presumptive positivism, 332 disintegration view and, 234, 252 entitlements of, 6, 232-34 presumptuous category mistakes, 2, primary private duty, breach of, 390 ownership and, 252 primary rights, 132, 133 Hohfeldian analysis and, 226, 234, 238



holding on trust, 317	Radin, Max, 115,
neo-Blackstonian concept of, 224	rationalism, Hohfeld's brand of, 378
objects of, 248–52	Rawls, John, 6, 214, 216, 354, 458
post-formalist conceptions of, 248	Raz, Joseph, 120, 398
public accommodation and, 485–86	normative positions and, 116–17
real, 69	Razian duty, 116, 117
relational conception of, 6	Razian right, 119
resource-specific character of, 239	real facts, 48
Roman, 239	real property, 69
social relations and, 224, 226–31, 235, 257	Realist movement, 335
what is, 237–38, 248	reductionism, 11, 365
property analysis	Hohfeldian, 149
disintegration, 248	reference and truth, analyses of, 199
European, 225	reflective equilibrium, 6, 160, 214–15, 216, 219
Property and the Aggregate of Rights That Others	relation
Shall Not Enter (Merrill), 276	reticulated, 201
property entitlement, 389	use of, 115
property owners/ownership, 153, 291, 386, 391,	Relations Between Equity and Law,
	The (Hohfeld), 18, 295, 328, 502
393, 410 as central rights, 492	relationships, liberties as, 486–88
remedies and, 404–6	religious liberty, 13, 478–79, 485
property rights	being relative to place, 490
persistence and, 260	causing harm and, 487–88
public accommodations and, 485 same-sex couples and, 489	clash of liberties, 490 property rights and, 489–93
	public accommodations and, 13
same-sex marriage conflicts, 483–86 property rules, 10, 395	without rights, 488–89
distinction from liability rules, 397	
property theory, Hohfeld and, 273–77	rem rights, 6
	remedial consequences, 387
proportional equity, 498	res communes, 240
proposition, 172–73	res mancipi, 240
propositional constants, 179	residuum, Hohfeld's, 12
propositional deductive logic, 179	resources vs things, 249
propositions, 179	respective rights (or claims), 31
protected privileges, 9	Restatement (Second) of Contracts, 179, 184
common rights and, 351–53	Restatement (Third) of Restitution, 324
Province of Jurisprudence Determined,	Restatement of Property, 159
The (Austin), 497	Restatement of the Law of Property, The
public accommodations, 13, 488	Hohfeld influence on, 151
as property, 485–86	Restatements, 152 reticulated relation, 201
public calling duty, 57, 58	
public duty, performance of, 57	Rhetoric, The (Aristotle), 174
Public Service Companies (Wyman), 57	rhetorical syllogism, 175
Pugliatti, Salvatore, 246	right, 36
pure compensatory duties, 404, 407	as a claim, 355
pure compensatory protection, 404	definition of, 22
pure duties of compensation, 398, 418	Hohfeld and, 24, 27, 351 senses of, 355
quarks, 9, 68, 346, 348, 349	synonym for, 25
quaternary rights, 133	use of the term, 277–81
Queen's Bench, 36	right of entry, 55
Quinn v. Leathem, 34, 35, 36, 135, 359–62,	right to trade, 36
437	right/claim vs privilege, 29
Hohfeld's critique of, 35, 359	right-duty relation



```
rule-enthymeme, 165, 174, 164–65, 176
right-duty relation (cont.)
                                                         Hohfeld, 218
  privilege-no-right relation and, 453-58
rights
                                                         in Wright, 182-86
  and duties, 22-26
                                                         legal argument-enthymeme and, 181
  bundle of, 51
                                                         propositional constants and, 179
  claims and claiming and, 369-74
                                                         rulification of, 165, 177-78, 183
  clash of, 479
                                                         Wright and, 178, 179
  concomitant, 35
  conflict of in legal scheme, 12
                                                         general, 331-33
  correlation to duties, 486
                                                         Hohfeld and, 335-36
  distinction between claims and, 366
                                                       rule-sensitive particularism, 332,
  distinctiveness of, 368
                                                       rulifications, 165-69, 180
  duty as its correlative, 31
                                                         criteria for fairness and, 177
  enjoying benefit of versus holding of the, 317-18
                                                         formulation of
  fundamental types of, 112-14
                                                            272-64, 180
  Hohfeldian, 30
                                                         Hohfeld jural relations, 167
  legal disputes and, 144
                                                         Hohfeld's opposites jural relations, 217
  legal relations and, 119
                                                         Hohfeld's rule-enthymemes, 218
                                                         rule-enthymeme and, 165, 177-78
  personal, 41
  powers and, 10
                                                         rule-enthymeme in Wright, 179-80
  primary, 132, 133
                                                         rule-enthymeme in Wright case, 183
  primitive, 42
  quaternary, 133
                                                       Salmond, John W., 1, 16, 26, 118, 127, 133
  reasons for, 119
                                                         jural privileges and, 20
                                                         schema of jural relations, 122
  secondary, 132, 133
  senses of, 112-14
                                                       same-sex couples
                                                         property rights and, 489-93
  tertiary, 132, 133
  uncorrelated, 119
                                                       same-sex marriage, 478, 479-82
  usage of, 22
                                                       sanction theories, 133
rights against rights, 327
                                                       sausage meat conception, 328
rights and litigations, 124
                                                       scale up
  conceptions of, 136
                                                         modular structures, 431-32
  types of, 128
                                                         second-order adjustments, 432-35
rights correlativity, 4, 137
                                                       Schauer, Frederick, 4, 332
rights literature, 112, 120, 124
                                                       schema, 208
rights models, 112
                                                         symmetry and asymmetry, 122-23
rights of bodily safety and freedom, 41
                                                       schema of jural relations (Hohfeld), 112, 121, 137
rights of property, 41
                                                       Schlag, Pierre, 11-12, 218, 274, 359
rights of reputation, 41
                                                       Schlegel, John, 13-14
                                                       Schorr, Daniel, 230
rights scholars, 116
Risinger, D. Michael
                                                       Scialoja, Vittorio, 239
  "Substance" and "Procedure Revisted" ..., 40
                                                       Science Without Laws (Giere), 198
Robilant, Anna di, 6
                                                       Searle, John, 100
Rogers, Henry Wade, 158
                                                       second order adjustments, 11
Roman "law of things", 239-41, 244,
                                                       secondary boycott, 34
                                                       secondary rights, 132, 133
       247
Roman dominium, 239
                                                       second-order law, 310, 433
Roman property, 239
                                                       second-order powers, 61
                                                       Securities Act (1933), 102
Roman-Bourgeois, 245-46
Romano-Bourgeois jurists, 239
                                                       self-incrimination
Ropes and Gray, 497
                                                         privilege against, 40
Rorschach blot, 419
                                                       self-regarding acts, 13, 480, 487
Rose, Carol, 230
                                                         absolute duties and, 116
Rowland v. Christian, 10, 366, 379-83
                                                         exclusion and, 491
```



religious liberties and, 13, 488	statutory promissory estoppel, 188
sentence, 172	statutory repeal, 309-11
sentences, 172-73	analogy of, 309–11
distinction between propositions and, 172	Steamship Co. v. McGregor
tokens of propositions, 179	Lord Ester's opinion in, 41
sexual orientation	Story v. Gateway Chevrolet, Inc., 401
exclusion and, 491	straight thinking, lack of, 100
Shaffer, 276	strength (virtue), 191
Shell UK Ltd. v. Total UK Ltd., 320-22, 323	strength and weakness
Shelley v. Kramer, 207	inferential, 191
Sherman Act, 103	internal, 191–92
Sherwin, Emily, 9	measure of, 192–93
Sichelman, Ted, 3, 9	of an argument, 194
Simmonds, Nigel, 125	virtues or vices and, 189, 191
Singer, Joseph, 13, 127	strict bilaterality, 124–25
single-blind experiments, 202	strict right, 22, 26
Smith, Henry, 11, 150, 152, 218, 219, 252, 363	Strong, Mr. Justice, 22
inclusive functionalism, 347	structural enthymemicity
intensional logic, 279	288–79, 188
jural relations and, 346	structural reductionism, 365
Smith, Professor Jeremiah, 64	Structure of Property Law, The (McFarlane),
social network, 495	259
building a, 500	"Substance" and "Procedure" Revisited
social organization, 11	(Risinger), 40
social relations	substantive law, 40,
Hohfeldian analysis of property and, 226–28	substantive rights
property and, 6, 224, 228–31, 235	equity and, 8
social-relational claim, 228, 229, 234	Swan, Thomas, 90
sociological jurisprudence, 3	Syed, Talha, 6
Socrates, 182, 192	syllogism, 175
Some Fundamental Conceptions as Applied in	symmetrical view
Legal Reasoning (Hohfeld), 367	identity version of, 115
Some Fundamental Legal Conceptions as Applied	mutual equivalence version of, 116
in Judicial Reasoning (Hohfeld), 3, 87	system regret, 12
Some Realism About Realism (Llewellyn), 423	3,000
sound argument, 173	technical language
South Africa, property ownership in, 490–91	legal language as, 99
special law (jus singulare s. exorbitans), 37, 38	problem of, 4, 108–11
Special Law Governing Public Service	Tennessee Constitution
Corporations, The, 57	Hohfeld's citation to, 23
special privileges, 38	term, vagueness of, 202
vs general privilege, 39	Termes de la Ley, 38
specific facts, 48	terms of art, 104
Sprint Communications, 318, 322	tertiary rights, 132, 133
Sprint Communications Co. v. APCC Services	Texas v. Johnson, 356
Inc., 317–18	Thayer, James B., 497, 499, 511
Spur Industries, 414	thing, as legal analysis, 249
St. Louis v. Hall, 65	third party/parties, 270
Stanford Law School, 498-99	concomitant rights against, 35
Hohfeld at, 80–81	costs and, 313
Stanford University, 498	duty not to interfere and, 35
Stanford's Law Department. See Stanford Law	restricting, 30
School	trust and other equitable interests and, 319-23
State, as a legal actor, 23	trusts and, 317



532 Index

Thomson, J. J., "plum pudding" model of the Virginian Ry. Co. v. Jefferies' Administrator, 403 atom, 365 virtual absence, 251 Thon, August, 120 virtues tort law, 368-69, 372, 374, 380, 384, 424, 432 arguing, 189 California Supreme Court and, 379-83 vices and, 180 Rowland and, 380 virtuous things and, 190-91 tort of battery, 32, 61, 373 Vital School of Jurisprudence and Law, as an in rem right, 290 A (Hohfeld), 87, 376, 511, 517 torts, 17 Touiller, Charles Bonaventure Marie, 245 Waismann, Friedrich, 4, 109 Trade Disputes Act (1906), 362 weakness (vice), 191 transactions costs, 389, 407-12 Whiteacre, 306 transfer property Whittier, Clarke, 501 Wigmore's "Evidence", 496 power and, 52 Williams, Glanville, 130, 353 Treanor, Dean, 399 Williston's "Contracts", 496 trenchant critique, Nozick's, 177 Wilson v. Ward Lumber Co., 64 triadic relations, 167 Truax v. Corrigan, 362 Woodward, Frederic Campbell, 501, 506 Wright v. Newman, 177, 215 holding property on, 317 other equitable interest and, 326-28 abduction and, 198 trust beneficiary. See also beneficiary facts and summary of, 162-64 equitable rights of, 338 Hohfeldian abduction of, 170 trust law, Hohfeld and, 17 Justice Carley's analysis of, 189, 203 trusts, 16 legal abduction and, 182 analysis of, 17 legal relations between, 171 and other legal problems, 18 legal significance, 210 other equitable interests and, 312-14, 329-30 privilege and, 170 other equitable interests and third parties, promissory estoppel and, 193 319-23 rule-enthymeme in, 178-80 other equitable interests debate and, 314-16 rulification of rule-enthymeme in, 182-86 Twining, William, 151 Wright, Bruce, 210 child support, 162-64 unconstitutional statute, 309 writ of replevin, 407 uncorrelated rights, 119 wrongdoers, compensation and, 401 Wyman, Bruce, 497, Uniform Commercial Code, 102, 151 United States Supreme Court, 354 Wyman, Professor Wayne United States v. Craft. See Craft Public service companies, 57 United States v. Patrick, 23 Wynehamer v. People, 65 United States v. Stanford, 498 University of California (Berkeley), 76, 79 Yale Law Journal, 509 commemorative issue of, 90 Yale Law Library valid argument, 173, 182 Hohfeld's law books at, 71 Vandevelde, Kenneth, 236 vertical dimension, 459 Yale Law School Hohfeld at, 81, 87 vs the perpetrator, 12 Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer, 394 Videckis v. Pepperdine Univ., 484

Zipursky, Ben, 10, 218

viewpoint. See point of view