

Leibniz on Causation and Agency

This book presents a comprehensive examination of Gottfried Leibniz's views on the nature of agents and their actions. Julia Jorati offers a fresh look at controversial topics including Leibniz's doctrines of teleology, the causation of spontaneous changes within substances, divine concurrence, freedom, and contingency, and also discusses widely neglected issues such as his theories of moral responsibility, control, attributability, and compulsion. Rather than focusing exclusively on human agency, she explores the activities of non-rational substances and the differences between distinctive types of actions, showing how the will, appetitions, and teleology are key to Leibniz's discussions of agency. Her book reveals that Leibniz has a nuanced and compelling philosophy of action that has relevance for present-day discussions of agency. It will be of interest to scholars and students of early modern philosophy as well as to metaphysicians and philosophers of action.

JULIA JORATI is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the Ohio State University. She has published numerous articles on Leibniz's metaphysics, philosophy of mind, and ethics, in publications including the *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, *The Leibniz Review*, *Philosophy Compass*, and several edited volumes.

Leibniz on Causation and Agency

Julia Jorati
The Ohio State University



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-19267-6 — Leibniz on Causation and Agency
Julia Jorati
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107192676
DOI: 10.1017/9781108131629

© Julia Jorati 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19267-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	vii
<i>Note on Translations and Citations</i>	viii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	ix
Introduction	1
1 Monads and Their Actions	8
2 Spontaneity	37
3 Teleology	59
4 Attributability and Divine Concurrence	92
5 Freedom	114
6 Control, Weakness, and Compulsion	148
7 Moral Agency	180
<i>References</i>	208
<i>Index</i>	217

Tables

1	Three Types of Spontaneity	<i>page</i> 58
2	Types of Spontaneity and Teleology	77
3	Types of Necessity	128

Acknowledgments

Many people have made direct or indirect contributions to this project. First and foremost, I am grateful to Michael Della Rocca, whose many comments over the years have shaped and sharpened my thoughts about Leibniz. I also thank Bernd Ludwig, who first introduced me to early modern philosophy and to Leibniz when I was an undergraduate. Marleen Rozemond, Paul Lodge, Donald Rutherford, and Stephan Schmid provided extensive comments on the book manuscript and prompted me to make many improvements, for which I am tremendously thankful. Moreover, I am grateful to all the others who have given me feedback at various stages: Chloe Armstrong, Christian Barth, Sebastian Bender, Gregory Brown, Julia Borcharding, John Carrier, Lisa Downing, Tom Feeney, Juan Garcia, Ursula Goldenbaum, Sean Greenberg, John Hare, Verity Harte, Glenn Hartz, Larry Jorgensen, Sukjae Lee, Antonia LoLordo, Jeffrey McDonough, Brian McLean, Sam Newlands, Robert Pasnau, Sydney Penner, Dominik Perler, Kristin Primus, Kelley Schiffman, Tad Schmaltz, Lisa Shabel, Stewart Shapiro, Sun-Joo Shin, Allan Silverman, Alison Simmons, Robert Sleigh, Neil Tennant, John Whipple, and Kenneth Winkler. Of course, I am solely to blame for any mistakes and imperfections in this book – much like Leibnizian agents are responsible for all privations in their actions, as we will see in Chapter 4. Finally, I thank my partner Hadi Jorati, who encouraged me every step of the way.

There is some overlap between this book and material already published elsewhere: Chapters 2 and 3 contain some of the material from Jorati (2015) and (2013); Chapter 4 contains some material from von Bodelschwingh (Jorati) (2011). I thank the publishers for their permission to use this material.

Note on Translations and Citations

If an English edition is explicitly cited (or associated with an abbreviation), translations are taken from that English edition unless otherwise specified. In all other cases, translations are mine. Quotations will include all italics from the original text, unless otherwise specified.

Abbreviations

(a) Texts by Leibniz and Editions of Leibniz Texts

- A *Sämtliche Schriften und Briefe*. Ed. Deutsche Akademie der Wissenschaften. Darmstadt, Leipzig, Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1923–2015. Cited by series, volume, page.
- AG *Philosophical Essays*. Ed. and transl. Roger Ariew and Daniel Garber. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1989.
- Beeley “Leibniz on Wachter’s *Elucidarius cabalisticus*” (1706). Ed. Philip Beeley. *The Leibniz Review* 12 (2002), 1–11.
- C *Opuscules et fragments inédits de Leibniz*. Ed. Louis Couturat. Paris: F. Alcan, 1903.
- CD *Causa Dei*, appended to the *Theodicy* (1710). Cited by section number as in G 6:439–62.
- COE “Observations on the Book Concerning the Origin of Evil,” appended to the *Theodicy* (1710). Cited by section number as in G 6:400–36.
- CP *Confessio Philosophi: Papers concerning the Problem of Evil, 1671–1678*. Ed. and transl. Robert Sleight. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2005.
- DM “Discourse on Metaphysics” (1686). Cited by section as in A 6.4.1529–88; translation from AG 35–68.
- DPG *Dissertation on Predestination and Grace*. Ed. and transl. Michael J. Murray. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011.
- Dut *Opera Omnia*. 6 vols. Ed. Louis Dutens. Geneva: Fratres de Tournes, 1768. Cited by volume, part, and page.
- E *Opera Philosophica*. 2 vols. Ed. Johann E. Erdmann. Berlin: Eichler, 1839–40. Cited by volume and page.
- ET “Excursus on Theodicy §392” (1711), G 6:347–50.
- FR “Preliminary Dissertation on . . . Faith and Reason,” published with the *Theodicy* (1710). Cited by section number as in G 6: 49–101.

x List of Abbreviations

- G *Die philosophischen Schriften von Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz*. 7 vols. Ed. Carl Immanuel Gerhardt. Berlin: Weidmann, 1875–90. Reprinted Hildesheim: Georg Olms, 1978. Cited by volume and page.
- GLW *Briefwechsel zwischen Leibniz und Christian Wolff*. Ed. Carl Immanuel Gerhardt. Halle: Schmidt, 1860.
- GM *Leibnizens Mathematische Schriften*. 7 vols. Ed. Carl Immanuel Gerhardt. Berlin: Asher, 1849–63. Reprinted Hildesheim: Georg Olms, 1971. Cited by volume and page.
- Gr *Textes inédits d'après des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque provinciale d'Hanovre*. 2 vols. Ed. Gaston Grua. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1948.
- H *Theodicy*. Transl. E.M. Huggard. La Salle: Open Court, 1985.
- L *Philosophical Papers and Letters*. Ed. and transl. Leroy Loemker. Dordrecht: Reidel, 1969.
- LC The Leibniz-Clarke Correspondence (1715–16). G 7:352–440; cited by number of letter and number of paragraph [e.g., LC 5.2: letter 5, paragraph 2]; translation from *Correspondence*. Ed. and transl. Roger Ariew. Indianapolis: Hackett, 2000.
- LDB *The Leibniz-Des Bosses Correspondence*. Ed. and transl. Brandon Look and Donald Rutherford. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007.
- LDV *The Leibniz-De Volder Correspondence*. Ed. and transl. Paul Lodge. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2013.
- LGR *Leibniz on God and Religion: A Reader*. Ed. and transl. Lloyd Strickland. London: Bloomsbury, 2016.
- LSC *The Leibniz-Stahl Controversy*. Ed. and transl. François Duchesneau and Justin E.H. Smith. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2016.
- M “Monadology” (1714). Cited by section as in G 6:607–23; translation from AG 213–25.
- Mason *The Leibniz-Arnauld Correspondence* (1686–1690). Ed. and transl. Haydn T. Mason. New York: Barnes & Noble, 1967.
- Mollat *Mittheilungen aus Leibnizens ungedruckten Schriften*. Ed. Georg Mollat. Leipzig: Haessel, 1893.
- MP *Philosophical Writings*. Ed. and transl. Mary Morris and George H.R. Parkinson. London: J. M. Dent, 1973.
- NE *New Essays on Human Understanding* (1704). Cited by page numbers from A.6.6; translation from *New Essays on Human Understanding*, transl. Peter Remnant and Jonathan Bennett. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

List of Abbreviations

xi

- ONI “On Nature Itself” (1698). Cited by section as in G 4:504–16; translation from AG 155–67.
- PNG “Principles of Nature and Grace, Based on Reason” (1714). Cited by section as in G 6:598–606; translation from AG 206–13.
- PT *Philosophical Texts*. Ed. Roger Woolhouse and Richard Francks. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- RH “Reflections on Hobbes,” appended to the *Theodicy* (1710). Cited by section number as in G 6:388–99.
- Riley *Political Writings*. Ed. and transl. Patrick Riley. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1972.
- Robinet *Malebranche et Leibniz: Relations Personnelles*. Ed. André Robinet. Paris: Vrin, 1955.
- SLT *The Shorter Leibniz Texts: A Collection of New Translations*. Ed. and transl. Lloyd Strickland. New York: Continuum, 2006.
- T *Theodicy* (1710). Cited by section number as in G 6:102–365.
- Ta “Summary of the Controversy Reduced to Formal Arguments,” appended to the *Theodicy* (1710). G 6:376–87.
- Toland *A Collection of Several Pieces of Mr. John Toland*, London: Peele, 1726. [Contains a short Leibniz text as an appendix.]
- Tp Preface to the *Theodicy* (1710). G 6:25–48.
- W *Leibniz Selections*. Ed. and transl. Philip Wiener. New York: Scribner, 1951.
- WF *Leibniz’s “New System” and Associated Texts*. Ed. and transl. Roger Woolhouse and Richard Francks. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

(b) Texts by Authors Other Than Leibniz

- AT René Descartes, *Oeuvres de Descartes*. 11 vols. Ed. Charles Adam and Paul Tannery. Paris: Vrin, 1996. Cited by volume and page.
- Concordia Luis de Molina, *Liberi arbitrii cum gratiae donis, divina praescientia, providentia, praedestinatione et reprobatione concordia*. Ed. Johannes Rabeneck. Oniae: Collegium Maximum, 1953 [1588]. Cited by part, disputation, and paragraph.
- CT Thomas Aquinas, *Corpus Thomisticum: Sancti Thomae de Aquino Opera Omnia*. Ed. Enrique Alarcon. www.corpusthomicum.org/iopera.html
- De Angelis Francisco Suárez, *De Angelis*. In *Opera omnia*. 28 vols. Ed. Carolo Berton. Paris: Vivès, 1856–78, vol. 2. Cited by chapter and section.

xii	List of Abbreviations
DV	Thomas Aquinas, <i>De veritate</i> . In CT. Cited by question and article.
MD	Francisco Suárez, <i>Metaphysicarum disputationum</i> . In <i>Opera omnia</i> . 28 vols. Ed. Carolo Berton. Paris: Vivès, 1856–78, vols. 25–26. Cited by disputation, section, and paragraph.
OCC	Francisco Suárez, <i>On Creation, Conservation, and Concurrence: Metaphysical Disputations 20, 21, and 22</i> . Ed. and transl. Alfred J. Freddoso. South Bend: St. Augustine Press, 2002.
OEC	Francisco Suárez, <i>On Efficient Causality: Metaphysical Disputations 17, 18, and 19</i> . Ed. and transl. Alfred J. Freddoso. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994.
SCG	Thomas Aquinas, <i>Summa contra gentiles</i> . In CT. Cited by book, chapter, and paragraph.
ST	Thomas Aquinas, <i>Summa Theologiae</i> . In CT. Cited by part, question, and article.