

## Red Fighting Blue

The national electoral map has split into warring regional bastions of Republican red and Democratic blue, producing a deep and enduring partisan divide in American politics. In *Red Fighting Blue*, David A. Hopkins places the current partisan and electoral era in historical context, explains how the increased salience of social issues since the 1980s has redefined the parties' geographic bases of support, and reveals the critical role that American political institutions play in intermediating between the behavior of citizens and the outcome of public policy-making. The widening geographic gap in voters' partisan preferences, as magnified further by winner-takes-all electoral rules, has rendered most of the nation safe territory for either Democratic or Republican candidates in both presidential and congressional elections - with significant consequences for party competition, candidate strategy, and the operation of government.

David A. Hopkins is Associate Professor of Political Science at Boston College. He is coauthor of *Asymmetric Politics: Ideological Republicans and Group Interest Democrats* (with Matt Grossmann) and *Presidential Elections: Strategies and Structures of American Politics*, 14th edition (with Nelson W. Polsby, Aaron Wildavsky, and Steven E. Schier). His research has been the subject of a feature by Ezra Klein of Vox.com and cited by a number of other prominent journalists and analysts of American politics.

# Red Fighting Blue

*How Geography and Electoral Rules  
Polarize American Politics*

DAVID A. HOPKINS

*Boston College*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-19161-7 — Red Fighting Blue  
David A. Hopkins  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India  
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107191617](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107191617)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108123594

© David A. Hopkins 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-107-19161-7 Hardback  
ISBN 978-1-316-64214-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-19161-7 — Red Fighting Blue  
David A. Hopkins  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*For Monica*

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1 A Nation Votes, Ohio Decides	i
2 Solid States: The Regional Bases of the American Parties	29
3 The Geographic Roots of Party Strength and Cohesion	64
4 Mapping the Cultural Battlefield: How Social Issues Fuel the Regional Divide	99
5 Regional Polarization and Partisan Change in the U.S. Congress	146
6 Rural Red, Big-City Blue, and the Pivotal Purple Midwest	193
7 A Locked-Up Nation	213
<i>Index</i>	237

Figures

1.1	State partisan alignments in the 2016 presidential campaign	<i>page 8</i>
1.2	State-level partisan consistency in the 2012 and 2016 presidential elections	9
1.3	The decline of split partisan constituencies in presidential and congressional elections, 1968–2016	20
1.4	The five political regions of the United States	27
2.1	The 2000 presidential election (the original “red-versus-blue” map)	33
2.2	Popular and electoral vote winning percentages in U.S. presidential elections, 1968–2016	40
2.3	Average state popular vote margins in presidential elections, 1968–2016	46
2.4	Average state popular vote deviation in presidential elections, 1968–2016	47
2.5	The decline of electorally representative states, 1968–2016	49
2.6	The shrinking electoral battleground, 1976–2016	51
2.7	State partisan alignments in presidential elections, 2000–2016	55
2.8	State-level partisan consistency across five consecutive presidential elections, 1880–2016	56
2.9	Regional polarization in U.S. House elections, 1968–2016	58
2.10	Regional polarization in U.S. Senate elections, 1968–2016	60
3.1	Total number of presidential victories per state by Franklin D. Roosevelt (D), 1932–1944	72
3.2	Total number of presidential victories per state by Republican or independent candidates, 1968–1988	84

	<i>Figures</i>	
3.3	Share of southern congressional seats held by Republicans, 1960–2016	90
4.1	Comparison of the 1976 and 1992 presidential elections by state	110
4.2	The increasing partisan divide over abortion, 1980–2012	116
4.3	The emergence of the “God gap,” 1980–2012	118
4.4	The growing partisan divide over Christian fundamentalism, 1988–2012	119
4.5	Regional differences in economic and cultural attitudes, 1988–2012	130
4.6	Relationship between state religiosity and party shift in presidential elections, 1988–2016	138
5.1	The decline of ideological moderates in the U.S. House of Representatives, 1972–2016	173
5.2	The decline of ideological moderates in the U.S. Senate, 1972–2016	174
5.3	Party and ideology among House and Senate members in Red America, 1972–2016	175
5.4	Party and ideology among House and Senate members in Blue America, 1972–2016	175
5.5	Constituency partisanship and member ideology, 1972–2016 (average across House and Senate)	176
5.6	Reelection rate in the U.S. House of Representatives by incumbent ideology, 1972–2016	178
5.7	Reelection rate in the U.S. Senate by incumbent ideology, 1972–2016	178
5.8	Most House moderates are replaced by nonmoderates from the opposite party	179
5.9	Most Senate moderates are replaced by nonmoderates from the opposite party	180
5.10	The fundamental Republican advantage in House elections	184
5.11	The fundamental Republican advantage in Senate elections	185
5.12	The regional polarization of the U.S. House of Representatives, 1932–2016	190
5.13	The regional polarization of the U.S. Senate, 1932–2016	191
6.1	The geographic polarization of the Northeast and Pacific Coast, 1980–2016	196
6.2	The geographic polarization of the South and interior West, 1980–2016	200
6.3	The representativeness of the Midwest in presidential elections, 1968–2016	205

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-19161-7 — Red Fighting Blue  
David A. Hopkins  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

x	<i>Figures</i>	
6.4	The representativeness of the Midwest in House elections, 1968–2016	206
6.5	The persistence of split Senate delegations in the Midwest, 1968–2016	207
6.6	The geographic polarization of the Midwest, 1980–2016	209



## Acknowledgments

This book has taken shape over a long period of time, and many people have helped along the way. My interest in American political geography, which dates back to an era before anyone had even heard of red states and blue states, first assumed academic form as an undergraduate thesis at Harvard University with the incisive assistance of advisor David E. Campbell. During my graduate studies at the University of California, Berkeley, I was fortunate to benefit from a dedicated group of faculty mentors. Eric Schickler served as an uncommonly thoughtful dissertation advisor, and Rob Van Houweling, John W. Ellwood, and J. Merrill Shanks graciously shared their considerable expertise. I am especially grateful to the brilliant Laura Stoker for her advice and generosity.

While at Berkeley, I spent countless hours at the Institute of Governmental Studies in the company of talented colleagues who were a constant source of intellectual enrichment, perceptive feedback, and personal camaraderie, including Melissa Cully Anderson, Justin Buchler, Devin Caughey, Brendan Doherty, Casey Dominguez, Brent Durbin, Patrick Egan, Angelo Gonzales, Jill Greenlee, Matt Grossmann, Rebecca Hamlin, John Hanley, Peter Hanson, Amanda Hollis-Brusky, Iris Hui, Matt Jarvis, Amy Lerman, Mark Oleszek, Sarah Reckhow, Keith Smith, and Rachel Van Sickle-Ward. Special thanks to Darshan Goux and Alison Gash for their suggestions and encouragement during a critical phase of research.

Since arriving at Boston College, I have once again found myself in an exceptionally stimulating scholarly environment inhabited by gifted colleagues and students. I am particularly indebted to Ken Kersch, Marc Landy, Shep Melnick, Kay Schlozman, Peter Skerry, David Karol, and

David Mayhew, all of whom read a draft of the manuscript with great care and assembled on a spring day in Boston to share an assortment of valuable critiques that vastly improved the final product. Thanks to Marissa Marandola for providing excellent research assistance and to Jennifer Erickson for kindnesses too numerous to detail. I also express my appreciation to Sara Duskow of Cambridge University Press for skillfully shepherding this book into print.

The pages that follow reflect the profound influence of the late Nelson W. Polsby. Nelson was a teacher, mentor, collaborator, and friend whose analytical gifts and playful wit remain as vivid as ever in my mind, and whose dedication to the study of political life in every imaginable form and context still inspires me today. I extend thanks as well to Linda, Emily, Lisa, and Dan Polsby for their continued friendship.

I owe my own lifelong fascination with American politics to my parents, Allen and Joan Hopkins, who have always remained true to their belief that the civic health of a community depends upon the dedication and service of well-informed and public-spirited citizens. Along with Finnegan Hopkins, Caitlin DeAngelis, and Molly and Sam Hopkins, as well as my official and unofficial extended family and friends, they have provided me with boundless love and support for which I cannot adequately convey my appreciation.

Finally, I wish to express my deepest affection and gratitude to Monica Soare. The academic life is often challenging and uncertain; the shared life of two academics can be exponentially more so. She has remained steadfastly enthusiastic, patient, and good-humored throughout, and she has always believed in me. As the dedication page proclaims, this book is for her.