

INSIDERS, OUTSIDERS, INJURIES, & LAW

A central theme of law and society is that people's ideas about law and the decisions they make to mobilize law are shaped by community norms and cultural context. But this was not always an established concept. Among the first empirical pieces to articulate this theory was David Engel's 1984 article "The Oven Bird's Song: Insiders, Outsiders, and Personal Injuries in an American Community." More than thirty years later, this article is now widely considered to be part of the law and society canon. This book argues that Engel's article succeeds so brilliantly because it integrates a wide variety of issues, such as cultural transformation, attitudes about law, dispute processing, legal consciousness, rights mobilization, inclusion and exclusion, and inequality. Contributors to this volume explore the influence of Engel's important work, engaging with the possibilities in its challenging hypotheses and provocative omissions related to the legal system and legal process, class conflict and difference, and law in other cultures.

Mary Nell Trautner is Associate Professor of Sociology at the University at Buffalo, SUNY. She earned her Ph.D. in Sociology from the University of Arizona. She is currently working on a National Science Foundation–funded study of how families cope and make decisions about their child's birth injuries. Her research appears in *Gender & Society*, *American Sociological Review*, *Law & Policy*, and other outlets.



Cambridge Studies in Law and Society

Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are: studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers' discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law; socio-legal studies; sociology; and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

Series editors

Chris Arup Monash University, Victoria Sally Engle Merry New York University Susan Silbey Massachusetts Institute of Technology

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.



Insiders, Outsiders, Injuries, & Law

REVISITING "THE OVEN BIRD'S SONG"

Edited by

MARY NELL TRAUTNER

University at Buffalo, State University of New York





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316638484

DOI: 10.1017/9781316979716

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Celebrating David Engel's "The Oven Bird's Song" (Conference) (2015 :

Baldy Center for Law and Social Policy (Buffalo, N.Y.) | Trautner, Mary Nell, 1974- |

Baldy Center for Law and Social Policy (Buffalo, N.Y.), sponsoring body. TITLE: Insiders, outsiders, injuries, & law: revisiting "the oven bird's song" /

TITLE: Insiders, outsiders, injuries, & law: revisiting "the oven bird's song" edited by Mary Nell Trautner, University of Buffalo.

DESCRIPTION: New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 2018.

Series: Cambridge studies in law and society | Includes papers presented at the conference

"Celebrating David Engel's "The Oven Bird's Song" held on October 23, 2015 at the Baldy Center for Law & Social Policy at the University at Buffalo. | "David M. Engel.

The Oven Bird's Song: Insiders, Outsiders, and Personal Injuries in an American

Community, 18 Law & Society Review 551-582 (1984)" | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017028893 | ISBN 9781107188402 (alk. paper) |

1SBN 9781316638484 (alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Personal injuries–Social aspects–United States–Congresses. |

Personal injuries-Social aspects-Illinois-Case studies-Congresses. | Engel,

David M. Oven bird's song-Congresses.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KF1257.A5 C45 2015 | DDC 346.7303/23–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017028893

ISBN 978-1-107-18840-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-63848-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Note	es on the Contributors	page vii
Ackn	nowledgments	xiii
PAR	TI INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXTUALIZATION	1
1	Insiders, Outsiders, Injuries, and Law Mary Nell Trautner	3
2	The Oven Bird's Song: Insiders, Outsiders, and Personal Injuin an American Community $David\ M.\ Engel$	ries 8
3	Emulating Sherlock Holmes: The Dog That Didn't Bark, the Victim Who Didn't Sue, and Other Contradictions of the "Hyper-Litigious" Society Barbara Yngvesson	e 38
4	Karl's Law School, or The Oven Bird in Buffalo Alfred S. Konefsky	56
	T II THE OVEN BIRD'S INSIGHTS INTO THE LEGAL SYSTEM LEGAL PROCESS	ī 69
5	Challenging Legal Consciousness: Practice, Institutions, and Varieties of Resistance Anna-Maria Marshall	71
6	Client Selection: How Lawyers Reflect and Influence Community Values Lynn Mather	82
7	Do Jurors Hear the Oven Bird's Song? Valerie P. Hans	98



vi

Table of Contents

8	Having a Right but Using It Too: "The Oven Bird's Song" about Contracts	113
	Stewart Macaulay	
PAR	T III INSIDERS, OUTSIDERS, CLASS CONFLICT,	
ANI	DIFFERENCE	121
9	Indigenous Litigiousness: The Oven Bird's Song and the Miner's Canary Eve Darian-Smith	123
10	Listening for the Songs of Others: Insiders, Outsiders, and the Legal Marginalization of the Working Underclass in America <i>Michael McCann</i>	139
11	Racing the Oven Bird: Criminalization, Rightlessness, and the Politics of Immigration Jamie Longazel	161
12	Irresponsible Matter: Sublunar Dreams of Injury and Identity <i>Anne Bloom</i>	181
13	Student Perceptions of (Their) Place in Relationship to "The Oven Bird's Song" Renée Ann Cramer	199
PAR	PART IV CONFLICT AND LAW IN OTHER CULTURES	
14	The Songs of Other Birds Anya Bernstein	219
15	Imagined Community and Litigation Behavior: The Meaning of Automobile Compensation Lawsuits in Japan Yoshitaka Wada	237
16	Can "The Oven Bird" Migrate North of the Border? Annie Bunting	262
PAR	T V AFTERWORD	277
17	Looking Backward, Looking Forward: Past and Future Lives of "The Oven Bird's Song" David M. Engel	279
Inde	ex	295



Notes on the Contributors

Anya Bernstein, Associate Professor at SUNY Buffalo Law School, holds a PhD in Anthropology from the University of Chicago and a JD from Yale Law School. Her research investigates how states constitute themselves as social actors. She has written on how government administrators justify the law and construct democratic identities; how information undercuts knowledge in national security governance; and how courts evaluate non-legal realities and misrecognize their own interpretive practices. Spanning the United States and Taiwan, her current projects aim to illuminate everyday practices of legal interpretation among government actors in those two very different democracies.

Anne Bloom is Executive Director of the Civil Justice Research Institute at the University of California Berkeley and Irvine Schools of Law. She holds a JD and a PhD in political science. Previously, she was Associate Dean for Scholarship and Professor of Law at McGeorge Law School, where she taught courses in litigation, law and politics, and public interest law. She has also served as the Associate Director of the Civil Justice Program at Loyola Law School and the Director of Public Programs at Equal Justice Works. Anne has significant experience as a public interest lawyer, primarily with Public Justice, where she worked for more than ten years litigating precedent-setting cases. She has authored many articles on law and society-related subjects and is currently working on an edited collection of essays on injuries in cultural perspective, which will be published by Cambridge University Press.

Annie Bunting is Associate Professor in the Law & Society program at York University in Toronto, teaching in the areas of legal pluralism and human rights. She is currently directing an international research collaboration on forced marriage in conflict situations with historians of slavery and women's human rights scholars. Her books include *Marriage by Force? Contestations*



viii

Notes on the Contributors

over Coercion and Consent in Africa (edited with Benjamin N. Lawrance and Richard L. Roberts, 2016) and Contemporary Slavery: Popular Rhetoric and Political Practice (edited with Joel Quirk, 2017).

Renée Ann Cramer PhD is Professor and Chair of Law, Politics, and Society at Drake University. Her second book, *Pregnant with the Stars*: Watching and Wanting the Celebrity Baby Bump, on our obsession with celebrity pregnancy, was published in 2015. Cramer is currently working on a project mapping the regulation of homebirth midwifery, funded by the National Science Foundation. She teaches a wide range of interdisciplinary courses in undergraduate legal studies, and serves as president of the Consortium of Undergraduate Law and Justice Programs.

Eve Darian-Smith is Professor of Anthropology and Law and Director of International Studies at the University of California, Irvine. She is also an adjunct professor in the School of Regulation and Global Governance, Australian National University. Trained as a lawyer, historian, and anthropologist, she is interested in issues of postcolonialism, legal pluralism, and sociolegal theory and has published widely, including ten books and edited volumes. Her first book, Bridging Divides: The Channel Tunnel and English Legal Identity in the New Europe (2009), won the Law & Society Association Herbert Jacob Book Prize. Her more recent book Laws and Societies in Global Contexts (2013) won the International Book Award in law and the Kevin Boyle Book Award. Her upcoming book is The Global Turn: Theories, Research Designs and Methods (2017). She is on various editorial boards, including those of the Canadian Journal of Law and Society and Social & Legal Studies, and she is a former associate editor of American Ethnologist and Law & Society Review. She is also currently on the executive committee and board of trustees of the Law & Society Association.

David M. Engel is SUNY Distinguished Service Professor of Law at the State University of New York at Buffalo, a former President of the Law & Society Association, and the recipient of that Association's 2017 Kalven Award for Outstanding Scholarship in Law and Society. He studies law, culture, and society in America and Thailand, where he has lived, worked, and taught for many years. His book Tort, Custom, and Karma: Globalization and Legal Consciousness in Thailand (2010) examines the effects of global transformations on Thailand's legal culture, and The Myth of the Litigious Society: Why We Don't Sue (2016) explains American injury victims' avoidance of claiming. Engel is a visiting professor at the Chiang Mai University Law School, from which he received an honorary doctorate in 2011. He serves as



Notes on the Contributors

an editor-in-chief of the Asian Journal of Law and Society and is a member of the inaugural Board of Trustees of the Asian Law and Society Association.

Valerie P. Hans is Professor of Law at Cornell Law School, where she teaches courses on law and social science, empirical legal studies, torts, and the contemporary American jury. Trained as a social psychologist, she has conducted extensive research and lectured widely about juries, jury reform, and other law and social science issues. Professor Hans has written more than one hundred scholarly articles and is the author or editor of eight books. Her latest book is *The Psychology of Tort Law* (2016), coauthored with Jennifer Robbennolt. She served as President of the Law & Society Association from 2015 to 2017.

Alfred S. Konefsky, a University at Buffalo Distinguished Professor Emeritus, joined the SUNY Buffalo Law School faculty in 1977 after serving as the Charles Warren Fellow in American Legal History at Harvard Law School and as editor of *The Legal Papers of Daniel Webster at Dartmouth College*. He taught contracts and a variety of courses in American legal history, including the subject areas of the nineteenth century (from the Revolution to the Civil War), the colonial period, law and American labor history, American constitutional history, and Herman Melville and the law.

Jamie Longazel is Associate Professor of Law & Society in the Department of Political Science at John Jay College. His recent book, *Undocumented Fears: Immigration and the Politics of Divide and Conquer in Hazleton, Pennsylvania*, won the North Central Sociological Association's Scholarly Achievement Award. It examines the politics of race and class surrounding Hazleton's 2006 passage of an exclusionary immigration ordinance. He is also the coauthor of *The Pains of Mass Imprisonment* (with Benjamin Fleury-Steiner). His work on race, immigration control, and political economy has appeared in publications such as *Law & Social Inquiry, Punishment & Society, Theoretical Criminology*, and the *Chicanalo-Latinalo Law Review*.

Stewart Macaulay is the Malcolm Pitman Sharp Professor Emeritus of the University of Wisconsin-Madison. He is a past president of the Law and Society Association and a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. He pioneered the study of business practices and the work of lawyers related to contracts. He is the author of the frequently cited "Non-Contractual Relations in Business: A Preliminary Study" (American Sociological Review, 1963) and coeditor of Law in Action: A Socio-Legal Reader (with Lawrence Friedman and Elizabeth Mertz, 2007) and Contracts: Law in Action (with William Whitford, Kathryn Hendley, and Jonathan Lipson; 4th ed., 2017).

ix



Х

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-18840-2 — Insiders, Outsiders, Injuries, and Law Edited by Mary Nell Trautner Frontmatter More Information

Notes on the Contributors

Anna-Maria Marshall is Associate Professor in the Sociology Department at the University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign. She received her JD from the University of Virginia (1985) and her PhD in Political Science from Northwestern University (1999). Her research is broadly focused on studying the relationship between law and social change. Her first book, Confronting Sexual Harassment: The Law and Politics of Everyday Life (2005), analyzed the institutional and political foundations of legal consciousness when women navigate problems in the workplace. Her articles have appeared in Law & Society Review, Law & Social Inquiry, and Annual Review of Law and Social Science.

Lynn Mather, SUNY Distinguished Service Professor and Professor of Law and Political Science Emerita, has published widely on lawyers, legal ethics, dispute processing, and trial courts. Her recent books include Lawyers in Practice: Ethical Decision Making in Context (2012), Private Lawyers and the Public Interest: The Evolving Role of Pro Bono in the Legal Profession (2009), and Divorce Lawyers at Work: Varieties of Professionalism in Practice (2001). She has also analyzed litigation against tobacco manufacturers in the United States and in the United Kingdom. A former director of the Baldy Center for Law & Social Policy, Mather has served as President of the Law & Society Association and Chair of the Law and Courts Section of APSA.

Michael McCann is Gordon Hirabayashi Professor for the Advancement of Citizenship at the University of Washington. McCann is the author of more than sixty article-length publications and author, coauthor, editor, or coeditor of eight books, including the monographs Rights at Work: Pay Equity Reform and the Politics of Legal Mobilization (1994) and (with William Haltom) Distorting the Law: Politics, Media, and the Litigation Crisis (2004). Michael is currently writing a book with George Lovell that documents and analyzes the history of struggles for socioeconomic rights and social justice by Filipino immigrant workers in the western United States over the twentieth century. McCann is a former President of the Law & Society Association (2011–13) and presently is Director of the Harry Bridges Center for Labor Studies at UW and Co-Director of the SeaTac/Seattle Minimum Wage Campaign Project.

Yoshitaka Wada is Professor of Law at Waseda Law School and is engaged in research on law and society, including socio-legal theory, dispute resolution, and legal professions. His books with Japanese publishers include *Process of Dispute Negotiation* (1991), *Dispute Resolution* (1994), *Deconstruction of Sociology of Law: Beyond Postmodern Perspectives* (1996), *Medical Malpractice Dispute Resolution* (2001), *Promise of Sociology of Law* (2004), and *Medical Conflict*



Notes on the Contributors

Management (2006). Wada served as a member of the program committee for the 2003 Annual Meeting of Law and Society Association and has been Executive Officer of the Asian Law & Society Association since 2015.

Barbara Yngvesson is Professor Emerita of Anthropology at Hampshire College in Amherst, Massachusetts, where she was Dean of the School of Social Science and founding director of the Culture, Brain, and Development Program. Her publications include *Virtuous Citizens*, *Disruptive Subjects*: Order and Complaint in a New England Court (1993), Law and Community in Three American Towns (coauthored with Carol Greenhouse and David M. Engel, 1994; recipient of the 1996 Law & Society Association Book Award), and Belonging in an Adopted World: Race, Identity and Transnational Adoption (2010).

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

хi





Acknowledgments

The Baldy Center for Law & Social Policy at the University at Buffalo provided substantial financial and logistical support for the October 2015 conference that was the genesis of this volume. The Humanities Institute, the Department of Sociology, and the Law School at the University at Buffalo also provided financial support. We appreciate the assistance provided by Baldy Center Director Errol Meidinger, staff support from Laura Wirth, and the enthusiastic help provided by sociology PhD students Matthew McLeskey and Yaqi (Sam) Yuan.

Lynn Mather, Alfred Konefsky, David Engel, Anya Bernstein, and Samantha Barbas helped organize the conference. This volume is based on the excellent presentations and remarks provided by its participants.

John Berger at Cambridge University Press was unendingly supportive and patient. David Engel, Lynn Mather, and Debra Street gave helpful advice regarding editing and completing this collection of essays. I feel fortunate to have learned from such experienced and smart colleagues. Special thanks go to David, of course, for creating such an inspirational work of legal scholarship in the first place. "The Oven Bird's Song" is such an enduringly influential work that law and society scholars around the world turn to David's work again and again and again for insight and inspiration.

