

THE CAMBRIDGE HANDBOOK OF TWIN PEAKS FINANCIAL REGULATION

First proposed in 1994, the Twin Peaks model of financial system regulation employs two specialist peak regulators: one charged with the maintenance of financial system stability and the other with market conduct and consumer protection. This volume, with contributions from more than thirty scholars and senior regulators, provides an in-depth analysis of the similarities and differences in the Twin Peaks regimes that have been adopted around the world. Chapters examine the strengths and weaknesses of the model, provide lessons from Australia (the first to adopt the model) and offer a comparative look at the potential suitability of the model in leading non-Twin Peaks jurisdictions. A key resource for central bankers, public policy analysts, lawyers, economists, politicians, academics and students, this work provides readers with a comprehensive understanding of the Twin Peaks model and a roadmap for countries considering its adoption.

ANDREW GODWIN is Associate Professor and Director of Studies for Banking and Finance at Melbourne Law School, the University of Melbourne, Australia. His teaching and research interests include finance and insolvency law, transactional law, financial regulation (particularly disclosure and regulatory systems), property law and the regulation of the legal profession. He has worked closely with governments, financial regulators and international organisations on financial regulation reforms.

ANDREW SCHMULOW is Senior Lecturer in Law at the School of Law, University of Wollongong, Australia. He also holds visiting positions at universities in South Africa and South Korea. He advised South Africa's National Treasury on the drafting of the Conduct of Financial Institutions Act, and the World Bank on designing an indicator framework to measure consumer financial well-being.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-18642-2 — The Cambridge Handbook of Twin Peaks Financial Regulation

Edited by Andrew Godwin , Andrew Schmulow

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

The Cambridge Handbook of Twin Peaks Financial Regulation

Edited by

ANDREW GODWIN

Melbourne Law School

ANDREW SCHMULOW

University of Wollongong School of Law



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107186422

DOI: 10.1017/9781316890592

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Godwin, Andrew, editor. | Schmulow, Andrew, 1970– editor.

TITLE: The Cambridge handbook of Twin Peaks financial regulation / edited by Andrew Godwin, Melbourne Law School; Andrew Schmulow, University of Western Australia School of Law.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Cambridge law handbooks | Includes bibliographical references.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020042870 (print) | LCCN 2020042871 (ebook) | ISBN 9781107186422 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316890592 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: International finance—Law and legislation. | Financial institutions, International—Law and legislation. | Banks and banking, International—Law and legislation.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K4444 .C36 2021 (print) | LCC K4444 (ebook) | DDC 343/.03—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020042870>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020042871>

ISBN 978-1-107-18642-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
<i>Foreword</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xxi
1 Introduction: The Genealogy and Topography of Twin Peaks Andrew Godwin and Andrew Schmulow	1
PART I SURVEYING THE TERRAIN	
2 The Three Episodes of Twin Peaks Michael W. Taylor	17
3 Reflections on Twenty Years of Regulation under Twin Peaks Jeffrey Carmichael	32
4 Twin Peaks and Central Banks: Economics, Political Economy and Comparative Analysis Donato Masciandaro and Davide Romelli	51
PART II THE TREK TOWARDS TWIN PEAKS	
5 Twin Peaks in Australia: The Never-Ending Trek? Andrew Godwin, Ian Ramsay and Andrew Schmulow	71
6 Twin Peaks Financial Regulation in New Zealand Helen Dervan and Simon Jensen	93
7 Identifying Lessons and Best Practices for the Twin Peaks Model Marco van Hengel, Olaf Sleijpen and Femke de Vries	115
8 Twin Peaks in South Africa Roy Havemann	133

- 9 **The Role of the SARB as Central Bank in the South African Twin Peaks Model** 153
 Corlia van Heerden and Gerda van Niekerk
- PART III DIFFERENT TOPOGRAPHIES**
- 10 **Can the Twin Peaks Model of Financial Regulation Serve as a Model for Israel?** 169
 Ruth Plato-Shinar
- 11 **Towards a Twin Peak Regulatory Architecture for Hong Kong?** 191
 Douglas W. Arner, Evan Gibson and Janos Barberis
- 12 **Regulatory Structure and the Revolving Door Phenomenon in South Korea:
 Evidence from the 2011 Savings Bank Crisis** 215
 Youkyung Huh and Hongjoo Jung
- 13 **China: Considering Elements of Twin Peaks to Upgrade Its Financial Regulation** 236
 Li Guo and Jessica Cheung
- 14 **Financial Regulatory Structure in China: Challenges and Transitioning to
 Twin Peaks** 253
 Robin Hui Huang
- 15 **US Financial Regulatory Structure: Beneath the Surface of Twin Peaks** 270
 Heidi Mandanis Schooner
- 16 **A ‘Twin Peaks’ Vision for Europe** 282
 Dirk Schoenmaker and Nicolas Véron
- 17 **A Complex European Financial Architecture: Ten Years On** 292
 Karel Lannoo
- PART IV SEISMIC ACTIVITY AND FAULT LINES**
- 18 **Twin Peaks and Boiling Frogs: Consumer Protection in One or Two Ponds?** 305
 Gail Pearson
- 19 **Twin Peaks: How Should Macrocultures Be Regulated?** 324
 Patrick McConnell
- 20 **Twin Peaks, Macroprudential Regulation and Systemic Financial Stability** 347
 Andrew Godwin, Steve Kourabas and Ian Ramsay

Figures

4.1 Conservativeness and CBIS level	<i>page</i> 61
4.2 Expected political risks and the CBIS level	62
7.1 Governance Dutch Twin Peaks model after the Global Financial Crisis	119
7.2 Elements of effective supervision (IMF)	120
7.3 Cooperation within the Twin Peaks model of supervision	126
8.1 The phased approach to Twin Peaks	134
8.2 Financial sector assets (bank and non-bank), selected emerging markets (2016)	135
8.3 The ratio of other financial institutions assets to bank assets has risen	136
8.4 South African banks are particularly exposed to other financial institutions	137
8.5 Financial inclusion indicators	137
8.6 Financial regulatory system before Twin Peaks	139
8.7 Household indebtedness and debt service costs	141
8.8 The two peaks	147
16.1 Supervisory synergies and conflicts	285
16.2 Share of financial conglomerates in banking and insurance at EU level (2015)	287
19.1 Corporate culture: influences	329
19.2 Risk culture: influences	336
19.3 Macroculture: influences	339
19.4 Regulating macrocultures	346

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18642-2 — The Cambridge Handbook of Twin Peaks Financial Regulation
Edited by Andrew Godwin , Andrew Schmulow
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Tables

3.1 Wallis Committee: distinctions between prudential and conduct regulation	<i>page</i> 44
4.1 Central bank as prudential supervisor in the Twin Peaks model: two views	55
4.2 Twin Peaks country models: CBIS level and regime drivers	66
7.1 Good practices and challenges under the Twin Peaks model	124
8.1 The four largest financial conglomerates (2016)	136
12.1 Major management indicators of savings banks in Korea	217
12.2 Outstanding PF loan amounts and delinquency rates	219
12.3 Annual issuance amount of subordinated debt	220
12.4 Number of executives at savings banks with backgrounds in financial authorities	222
14.1 Hierarchy of leaders of ‘one bank and three commissions’ and major banks	267
16.1 Organisational structure of financial supervision (as of mid-2017)	283
16.2 Share of financial conglomerates in banking and insurance at country level (2015)	288
17.1 Comparison of staffing and budget resources across five key agencies	294
19.1 Definitions of culture and risk culture by some Twin Peaks regulators	328
19.2 Cultural components in benchmark manipulation scandals	341

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18642-2 — The Cambridge Handbook of Twin Peaks Financial Regulation
Edited by Andrew Godwin , Andrew Schmulow
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contributors

Douglas W. Arner is the Kerry Holdings Professor in Law at the University of Hong Kong (HKU). At HKU, he is Director of the Asian Institute of International Financial Law and Faculty Director of the LLM in Corporate and Financial Law, LLM in Compliance and Regulation, and the new LITE (Law, Innovation, Technology, Entrepreneurship) Lab. He is a senior visiting fellow of Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, and a member of the Advisory Board of the Centre for Finance, Technology and Entrepreneurship. Arner coordinates Introduction to FinTech, the largest FinTech online course on edX. He has published 18 books and more than 150 articles, chapters and reports.

Janos Barberis is a FinTech Foundation lecturer; Head of Entrepreneurship at the Centre for Financial Technology and Entrepreneurship, London; and founder of SuperCharger. He is a research fellow at the Asian Institute of International Financial Law and a PhD candidate at the Faculty of Law, the University of Hong Kong.

Jeff Carmichael AO is Australasian Practice Leader for Promontory. He is a recognised expert in regulatory structure, design and effectiveness. He was formerly chairman of the Australian Prudential Regulation Authority. Before that he held senior positions with the Reserve Bank of Australia and was Professor of Finance at Bond University. He has served on a number of government inquiries and government and private sector boards. Carmichael has a PhD in Economics from Princeton University. He was awarded an AO in 1995 for services to finance, education and the community.

Jessica Cheung is a trainee solicitor at Lau, Horton & Wise LLP (Hong Kong). She is also a graduate of the University of Warwick (LLB), Peking University (LLM) and the City University of Hong Kong (PCLL).

Helen Dervan is a senior lecturer in law at Auckland University of Technology, where she teaches banking and financial services law and law of trusts. She has published nationally and internationally in both fields, and her current research focuses on prudential regulation. She practised in the City of London in banking and international finance litigation before commencing her academic career. Dervan holds a BCL from the University of Oxford, and is a recipient of the Rex Mason Prize for excellence in legal writing.

Femke de Vries is, by special appointment, Professor of Supervision at the University of Groningen, and Managing Partner at &smhoud, a strategic consultancy firm. She worked in

financial supervision for fifteen years, including as Divisional Director and Secretary-General at the Dutch Central Bank, as a board member of the Netherlands Authority for Financial Markets (the Dutch securities commission and conduct regulator). After the global financial crisis she became a member of the Financial Stability Board's (FSB) working group on the effectiveness of supervision.

Evan Gibson is a postdoctoral research fellow with the Asian Institute of International Financial Law at the University of Hong Kong. He specialises in researching and publishing on economic and financial law, and financial regulation. Previously, Dr Gibson held the position of Research Fellow at the University of New South Wales.

Andrew Godwin is Associate Professor and Director of Studies for Banking and Finance at Melbourne Law School, the University of Melbourne, Australia. His teaching and research interests include finance and insolvency law, transactional law, financial regulation (particularly disclosure and regulatory systems), property law and the regulation of the legal profession. He has worked closely with governments, financial regulators and international organisations on financial regulation reforms.

Li Guo is a professor of law at Peking University (PKU) Law School, and the chief editor of Peking University Law Journal in English. He has also taught and researched at Cornell, Duke, Freiburg, Sydney, Vanderbilt and Case Western Reserve universities, and is the recipient of the Humboldt Foundation Fellowship. His scholarly interests cover financial laws, social development and comparative studies. Guo serves as an expert committee member of the China Securities Regulatory Commission, the Shanghai Stock Exchange, the Asset Management Association of China, among others. He is a graduate of PKU, Southern Methodist University and Harvard Law School.

Roy Havemann is Chief Director for Financial Markets and Stability at the National Treasury of South Africa. He is responsible for legislative and regulatory design, focusing on prudential, financial stability and capital markets issues. Havemann first joined the National Treasury in 2002 in the economic forecasting unit. Shortly after the start of the 2008 financial crisis, he joined the tax and financial sector policy division to lead South Africa's post-crisis regulatory reform programme. This included the introduction of a Twin Peaks system. He has an MSc in Economics from the London School of Economics and a PhD from Stellenbosch University. He was previously in the strategic finance team at Deloitte.

Robin Hui Huang is Professor in the Faculty of Law, Chinese University of Hong Kong; Adjunct Professor of Law at the University of New South Wales (UNSW); Li Ka Shing Visiting Professor in the McGill Law School; and Honorary Professor at East China University of Political Science and Law. He received two bachelor degrees, in mechanical engineering and in law, a master's degree in law from Tsinghua University in Beijing, China and a PhD from the Faculty of Law, UNSW. He is a leading expert in the field of corporate law, securities regulation, financial law, commercial dispute resolution and foreign investment, with a particular focus on Chinese and comparative law issues.

Youkyung Huh is a director of Consumers Korea, an organisation focused on creating safer and fairer markets for consumers. She is a member of the Korean Bar Association, serving as legal counsel at the Korean Financial Supervisory Service (FSS) and in private practice. She sits on the FSS Insurance Policy Review Committee and the Korean Copyright Commission. Huh is a

doctoral candidate at the University of Virginia Law School, investigating financial regulatory structures with a focus on consumer protection. She earned LLM degrees from Georgetown University Law School (2014) and Harvard Law School (2013) and a master's degree from Seoul National University (2012).

Simon Jensen is a consultant at Buddle Findlay, one of New Zealand's pre-eminent financial services firms, having retired as a partner in 2019. Prior to joining Buddle Findlay, Jensen was general counsel at Westpac New Zealand Limited, one of New Zealand's four major banks. He is a specialist in prudential regulation, payment systems, banker–customer relationships and corporate governance. He is an editor of one of New Zealand's leading banking law texts, Tyree's *Banking Law in New Zealand*, wrote the 'Directors and the Law' section of the Institute of Directors training materials and was a winner of the 2018 Honourable Rex Mason Prize for a published article, for an article he co-authored with Helen Dervan entitled 'Prudential Regulation in 21st Century New Zealand: The Case for Deposit Insurance'.

Hongjoo Jung has been teaching at Sungkyunkwan University since 1991. He was the founding president of Korean Academy of Financial Consumers (KAFC) from 2010 to 2012 and the founding chairperson of the International Academy of Financial Consumers (IAFICO) from 2015 to 2019. Jung received his doctoral degree in applied economics and managerial science at the Wharton School, USA; an MS at the Stern School, NYU; and a BA at Seoul National University. He is a global citizen who enjoys international travels and sabbaticals.

Steve Kourabas is a lecturer in, and deputy director of, the Centre for Commercial Law and Regulatory Studies, Monash University Law School. Kourabas's areas of specialisation include financial regulation, international economic law and corporate governance. He has a special interest in technological innovation in finance and corporate law, and teaches predominantly in this area. Before joining Monash, he worked as an in-house counsel in government and within corporations. He received master's and doctoral degrees from Duke Law School.

Karel Lannoo is CEO of the Centre for European Policy Studies (CEPS), the leading European think tank based in Brussels. He has published widely on European and international policy, with a special focus on financial markets regulation. His latest book, *The Great Financial Plumbing: From Northern Rock to Banking Union* (2015), covered the EU's financial crisis response.

Donato Masciandaro is Full Professor of Economics at Bocconi University, Milan, where he holds the Chair in Economics in Financial Regulation. He is the Director of the Baffi Carefin Centre on Banking, Finance and Regulation. He is a member of the Management Board and Honorary Treasurer of the SUERF (Société Universitaire Européenne de Recherches Financières). He is associate editor of the *Journal of Financial Stability* and an editorial board member of the *Italian Economic Journal*. He served as a visiting scholar at the IMF Institute, and was a consultant at the World Bank, the Inter-American Development Bank and the United Nations.

Patrick McConnell has been a senior manager in, and a consultant to, large international financial institutions, corporations and governments on multiple continents for over thirty-five years. His expertise is in information technology, governance and risk management. He holds a doctoral degree in business administration with a thesis on finance and technology, and is a fellow of the British Computer Society (FBCS). He has been published widely in risk journals

and has written a number of books and book chapters, including on trading room technology and on strategic and operational risk management.

Gail Pearson is Professor of Business Law at the University of Sydney. She writes on financial services and commercial and consumer law, and has various roles internationally and domestically in consumer affairs, including on the Australian Securities and Investments Commission (ASIC)'s Consumer Affairs Panel and as immediate past president of the International Association of Consumer Law. She has also undertaken research in India and ASEAN.

Ruth Plato-Shinar is Full Professor of Banking Law and Financial Regulation at the Netanya Academic College, Israel, where she also serves as Director of the Centre for Banking Law and Financial Regulation. The opinions expressed in her books and numerous articles have become binding precedents from Israel's Supreme Court. She is the Advisory Committee Chairperson of the Commissioner of Financial Service Providers; the Advisory Board Deputy Chairperson of the Commissioner of Capital Markets, Insurance and Savings; a member of the Advisory Committee to the Governor of the Bank of Israel; and a member of the License Committee of the Supervisor of Banks.

Ian Ramsay is the Harold Ford Professor of Commercial Law and also Redmond Barry Distinguished Professor at Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, where he is Director of the Centre for Corporate Law. Ramsay has published extensively on corporate law, financial regulation and corporate governance issues both internationally and in Australia. He has wide experience as an expert consultant to government reviews and as a member of government advisory committees, including his appointment as chair of the independent panel appointed by the government to review the Australian financial system's external dispute resolution and complaints framework.

Davide Romelli is an assistant professor of economics at Trinity College Dublin, Ireland. He is also a research affiliate of IM-TCD (International Macro-TCD) and SUERF – The European Money and Finance Forum, and a fellow of the BAFFI-CAREFIN centre, Bocconi University. His research focuses on international finance and macroeconomics, central banking and financial supervision. Romelli holds a PhD in Economics from ESSEC Business School and THEMA-University of Cergy-Pontoise, awarded jointly.

Andrew Schmulow is Senior Lecturer in Law at the School of Law, University of Wollongong, Australia. He also holds visiting positions at universities in South Africa and South Korea. He advised South Africa's National Treasury on the drafting of the Conduct of Financial Institutions Act, and the World Bank on designing an indicator framework to measure consumer financial well-being. He has previously provided advice to the governments of South Korea and New Zealand, and in 2018 was invited by the Australian Banking Royal Commission to provide insights into combating regulatory capture. That advice was reflected in Recommendation 6.14 of the Royal Commission's Final Report, and subsequently in the Financial Regulator Assessment Authority Bill, currently before Australia's Federal Parliament.

Dirk Schoenmaker is a professor of banking and finance at the Rotterdam School of Management, Erasmus University and Director of the Erasmus Platform for Sustainable Value Creation. He is also a fellow at the think tank Bruegel. His research covers the fields of sustainable finance, central banking, financial supervision and European banking. Before joining RSM, he worked at the Dutch Ministry of Finance and the Bank of England.

Schoenmaker is (co-)author of *Principles of Sustainable Finance*, *Financial Markets and Institutions: A European Perspective* and *Governance of International Banking: The Financial Trilemma*.

Heidi Mandanis Schooner is Professor of Law at Columbus School of Law, the Catholic University of America. Her research focuses on the regulation of financial institutions. She has served as a consultant to the International Monetary Fund and to various federal and state agencies. Before entering academia in 1992, Schooner was in-house counsel for a regional bank holding company. She also practised in the General Counsel's Office of the Securities and Exchange Commission.

Olaf Sleijpen is Executive Director for Monetary Affairs and Financial Stability at De Nederlandsche Bank and alternate member of the governing council of the ECB. He has been a professor at the Maastricht School of Business and Economics since 2007. Before joining the governing board of DNB in 2020, Sleijpen held different positions as Director of Supervision within the DNB. Between 2004 and 2011 he worked with the largest pension fund and pension provider in the Netherlands. From 2001 to 2004, he was adviser to ECB President Wim Duisenberg, after holding various other positions within DNB.

Michael W. Taylor has had a varied career as an academic, journalist and public official, working at various times for the Bank of England, the International Monetary Fund, the Hong Kong Monetary Authority and the Central Bank of Bahrain. He has published widely on financial regulation, including a textbook entitled *Global Bank Regulation* (with Heidi Schooner, 2009), as well as producing the founding statement for the Twin Peaks model, for the London think tank the Centre for the Study of Financial Innovation, in 1995.

Corlia van Heerden holds the ABSA Chair in Banking Law in Africa and is a professor in the Mercantile Law Department in the Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria. Her main interests are banking regulation (with a particular focus on models of regulation, central banking, SIFI regulation, bank resolution and deposit guarantees), credit law and consumer protection law. She also has a keen interest in and has lectured in insolvency law, competition law and law of civil procedure.

Marco van Hengel is Senior Financial Stability Expert at De Nederlandsche Bank. He specialises in financial sector reform, supervisory governance and European supervision. He has written several articles about trends in regulation and supervision, financial architecture and the Twin Peaks model. Van Hengel has been a member of various working groups and international review teams for the Financial Stability Board and Bank of International Settlements, and coordinated several external national and international evaluations of DNB policies. Before joining DNB in 2010, he was Senior Economist and Financial Specialist at the Dutch Ministry of Finance.

Gerda van Niekerk has a BCom LLB LLD from the University of Pretoria. She practised as an attorney for twenty-five years. Currently she is a senior lecturer at the University of Limpopo in the Mercantile Law Department. Her fields of interest are financial regulation, financial economic law, business law, central banks, financial stability and banking law.

Nicolas Véron co-founded Bruegel in Brussels in 2002–05, joined the Peterson Institute for International Economics in Washington DC in 2009 and is currently employed on equal terms

by both organisations as a senior fellow. His research is primarily on financial systems and financial services policies. He is also an independent board member of the global derivatives trade repository arm of DTCC, a financial infrastructure company that operates on a non-profit basis. In September 2012, Bloomberg Markets included Véron in its yearly global ‘50 Most Influential’ list with reference to his early advocacy for a European banking union.

Foreword

*Howell E. Jackson**

Scholarship on financial regulation tends to focus on legal standards for safeguarding the solvency of financial institutions or protecting the public from misconduct in financial transactions. When it comes to regulatory design, the most commonly studied topic is the development of regulatory networks that have emerged in recent decades to create an international financial architecture. Much less attention has been focused on the evolution of the organisational structure of supervisory agencies at the national level, even though that is where the lion's share of regulation is done. Work of this sort is immensely challenging, as it is inherently comparative and requires expertise and experience across a host of jurisdictions. In this volume, Andrew Godwin and Andrew Schmulow fill that gap by offering the first comprehensive examination of one of the most significant organisational innovations in financial regulation of the past quarter-century: the emergence of the Twin Peaks regulatory structure.

During the final decades of the twentieth century, as the boundaries between the traditional financial sectors of banking, securities and insurance began to merge and financial firms increasingly operated in multiple sectors, policymakers were led to explore new regulatory structures that also move beyond traditional sectoral boundaries. While some jurisdictions, such as Japan and several northern European countries, took the fairly straightforward step of combining sectoral agencies like banking departments and securities commissions into a single consolidated body, others chose the more innovative Twin Peaks approach, which deconstructs sectoral agencies and reassembles the resources into a pair of industry-wide bodies: one focused on market conduct requirements that protect customers and market structures, and a second targeted at the prudential regulations that ensure the safety and soundness of financial firms. In addition to breaking down entrenched supervisory silos, Twin Peaks reforms allow for both regulatory specialisation and the reduction of persistent conflicts between consumer protection mandates – which tend to reduce firm profitability – and solvency concerns – which lead supervisors to favour strong firm earnings.

While the theory underlying Twin Peaks oversight is elegant and compelling, the actual manner in which the Twin Peaks regimes have been implemented has varied considerably across jurisdictions and now, after more than two decades of experience, the time is ripe to investigate how the Twin Peaks model works in practice, and where the challenges lie. Originally the brainchild of former Bank of England official and volume contributor Michael Taylor, Twin Peaks had its first and most fulsome implementation with the Australian Securities

* James S. Reid, Jr, Professor of Law, Harvard University

and Investments Commission (ASIC) and the Australian Prudential Regulation Authority (APRA). As this volume so nicely documents, the model has been taken up in an increasing number of jurisdictions over the years, from the Netherlands to New Zealand, eventually even finding its way back to Albion shores in the post-financial crisis reforms of the past decade. Interestingly, the Twin Peaks approach has now also been adopted in South Africa, perhaps heralding a trend towards Twin Peaks structures in the developing world. While the United States remains, as always, an outlier, Professor Schooner's chapter documents the extent to which one can even see glimmers of Twin Peaks arrangements in America's Byzantine regulatory structure.

The Cambridge Handbook of Twin Peaks Financial Regulation does an admirable job of reconstructing the history of the Twin Peaks revolution, with contributions from those who were present at the founding, as well as expert commentators on all of the major jurisdictions that have adopted the Twin Peaks regime, along with several others from jurisdictions likely headed in that direction in the near future. With this volume, the readers will find a richly documented education of the paths that Twin Peaks reforms have followed, as well as the most promising steps forward. One of the virtues of this collection is that it includes chapters exploring the implications and potential value of Twin Peaks reforms for countries such as Israel or China that maintain more traditional regulatory structures. The influence of Twin Peaks reforms extends well beyond the model's formal adoptions. The collection also illustrates, with admirable clarity, the principal difficulties of implementing an effective system of Twin Peaks oversight.

A recurring theme in the volume is the importance of coordination across Twin Peaks regimes, which necessarily involves overlapping supervision of many firms by both the market conduct authority and the prudential regulatory authority. Complete separation of regulatory objectives is impractical and so the principal operating units in a Twin Peaks regime need to find ways to work in harmony. In certain respects, this problem of coordination is similar to the one that national authorities face in cross-border supervision, and the various mechanisms documented in the volume employ a number of familiar instruments, including memoranda of understanding and documentation of shared principles. While the need for coordination may strike some readers as a weakness of the Twin Peaks approach, one must recognise that similar, if not more confounding, issues of coordination are faced in sectoral models of regulation, where financial conglomerates are also subject to overlapping jurisdictions. Even within consolidated regulatory bodies, coordination must be imposed across operational divisions, so the question is not whether supervisory coordination is required, but rather whether the coordination is more easily and efficiently accomplished through Twin Peaks models, as opposed to organisational alternatives.

A second question about Twin Peaks regimes, touched upon in multiple chapters, is whether financial regulation can really be divided into just two peaks or whether, in fact, macroprudential regulation focusing on systemic risk represents a third peak, and perhaps financial crime/anti-money laundering constitutes at least another foothill. Throughout the volume this tension plays out most clearly in discussions of the appropriate relationship between the central bank/monetary authority and the prudential regulatory authority. As the chapters explore, a variety of approaches are possible, including embedding the prudential authority within the central bank (as is done in the United Kingdom) or imposing structural distance (as is true in Australia). Weaknesses in prudential restraints, as well as widespread market misconduct of the sort preceding the Global Financial Crisis, can pose systemic risks, thus arguing in favour of a tight connection between central bank officials and Twin Peaks agencies. On the other hand, regulatory focus is one of the key virtues of Twin Peaks reforms and blurring the lines between

monetary authorities and supervisory agencies can muddle matters. Moreover, especially in times of economic stress, there are advantages in separation, as conflicts can emerge with macroprudential concerns focused on avoiding pro-cyclical policies, and the prudential authority's responsibilities for ensuring the solvency of individual firms. There is no consensus on this issue, but proper integration of Twin Peaks agencies with the third peak of macroprudential oversight is an important design consideration.

Beyond the question of how closely Twin Peaks agencies should be anchored to monetary authorities, there is a separate design issue of how far out into the real economy the regulatory perimeters of regulatory agencies should extend. While sectoral agencies are naturally bound to specific institutional structures, like banks or insurance companies or securities firms, Twin Peaks supervisors are grounded in regulatory objectives: firm solvency and market misconduct. As several chapters explore, one of the advantages of Twin Peaks systems is that they are better suited to reach beyond traditional sectors to areas such as finance companies (New Zealand) or Fintech innovations (Hong Kong). With the rise of big tech and the ever-rising importance of various flavours of shadow banking, the comparative advantages of Twin Peaks structures should continue to grow. Objectives-based supervision may just be a better fit for the twenty-first-century economy.

For scholars, students, policymakers and practitioners, *The Handbook* provides both an invaluable history and a stimulating window into what the future might hold.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18642-2 — The Cambridge Handbook of Twin Peaks Financial Regulation
Edited by Andrew Godwin , Andrew Schmulow
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Acknowledgements

This book has been as much a journey for us as it has been a destination and there are many people to whom we owe irredeemable debts of gratitude. First, our sincere thanks go to Michael Taylor for his pioneering inspiration and generous suggestions as to who might be able to join us on our trek. We are also grateful to our research colleagues who have supported us throughout the process of researching Twin Peaks: Timothy Howse, Malcolm Anderson, Chenjie Ma, Amy Feng, Tom Monotti, Timothy Tabalujan and James Occleshaw. We are indebted to our employer institutions – the University of Melbourne and the University of Wollongong – for their support and for providing us with the time and funds to pursue this research project. We are also indebted to the University of Pretoria and, in particular, Corlia van Heerden and her colleagues in the Department of Mercantile Law for inviting us to the Twin Peaks Colloquium in 2017 and for providing us with access and insights into South Africa’s transition towards Twin Peaks, and to colleagues in the South African National Treasury, and in particular Roy Havemann, for inviting us to participate in the design and implementation of the Twin Peaks model in South Africa.

We are immensely grateful to Matt Gallaway and the team at Cambridge University Press for their invitation to us to publish such a book and for their patience and support in what has been a much longer trek than we had originally anticipated.

Last, but certainly not least, we are grateful to the contributors and to other fellow travellers who have encouraged us along the journey towards Twin Peaks, including Eddy Wymeersch, Howell Jackson, Emiliós Avgouleas, Parker Hood, Yuan Kang and Kevin Davis.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18642-2 — The Cambridge Handbook of Twin Peaks Financial Regulation
Edited by Andrew Godwin , Andrew Schmulow
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
