

Islam and Law in Lebanon

The modern state of Lebanon, created after the fall of the Ottoman Empire, is home to eighteen different officially recognised religious communities (or sects). Crucially, political office and representation came to be formally shared along confessional lines, and the privileges of power are distributed accordingly. One key prerogative is exclusivity when it comes to personal status laws: the family legal affairs of each community. In this book, Morgan Clarke offers an authoritative and dynamic account of how the sharia is invoked both within Lebanon's state legal system, as Muslim family law, and outside of it, as a framework for an Islamic life and society. By bringing together an in-depth analysis of Lebanon's state-sponsored sharia courts with a look at the wider world of religious instruction, this book highlights the breadth of the sharia and the complexity of the contexts within which it is embedded.

MORGAN CLARKE is Associate Professor of Social Anthropology at the University of Oxford and a fellow of Keble College. He previously held a Simon Fellowship at the University of Manchester and a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellowship at the University of Cambridge. He is the author of *Islam and New Kinship: Reproductive Technology and the Shariah in Lebanon* (2009) and many articles on the anthropology of Islam and the Middle East.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18631-6 — Islam and Law in Lebanon
Morgan Clarke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18631-6 — Islam and Law in Lebanon
Morgan Clarke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Islam and Law in Lebanon

Sharia within and without the State

Morgan Clarke

University of Oxford



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18631-6 — Islam and Law in Lebanon
Morgan Clarke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107186316

DOI: 10.1017/9781316888957

© Morgan Clarke 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Clarke, Morgan, 1972– author.

Title: Islam and law in Lebanon : Sharia within and without the state / Morgan Clarke, University of Oxford.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018012808 | ISBN 9781107186316 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316637142 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Law–Lebanon–Islamic influences. | Islamic law–Lebanon. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / Government / International.

Classification: LCC KMP46.7 .C58 2018 | DDC 349.5692–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018012808>

ISBN 978-1-107-18631-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18631-6 — Islam and Law in Lebanon
Morgan Clarke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To all those in Lebanon who helped make this
book possible

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18631-6 — Islam and Law in Lebanon
Morgan Clarke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
<i>Note on Transliteration</i>	xiv
Introduction	1
Part I Contextualising Sharia Discourse in Lebanon	29
1 Court, Community and State: A Legal Genealogy	31
2 The Consequences for Civility	55
3 Becoming a Shaykh	71
4 Lessons in the Mosque	87
Part II Sharia within the State	105
5 Introducing the Sharia Courts	107
6 Marriage before God and the State	126
7 Bringing a Case	143
8 Rulings and Reconciliation	165
9 The Judge as Tragic Hero	190
10 The Wider World of the Sharia	207
11 Reform and Rebellion	219
Part III Sharia outside the State	235
12 Becoming an Ayatollah	237
13 Making Law from the Bottom Up	263
	vii

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-18631-6 — Islam and Law in Lebanon
Morgan Clarke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

viii	Table of Contents	
14	The Limits of Authority	282
	Conclusion	305
	<i>Bibliography</i>	312
	<i>Index</i>	332

Tables

1.1 The Most Relevant Lebanese Legislation	<i>page</i> 51
4.1 The Subjects of Shaykh Muhammad’s Lesson Series	93
8.1 Rhetorical Oppositions Made in the Courts between ‘Sharia’ and ‘Law’	189

Acknowledgements

I could not have written this book without the help of a great many people in Lebanon. The fieldwork I draw on took place mostly in 2007–2008, but I also depended upon enduring relationships made during my doctoral fieldwork in 2003–2004. It is a profound pleasure to be able finally to acknowledge these debts here.

Shaykh Muhammad Kana'an, the then president of the Sunni *mahakim shar'iyya*, gave me my first opportunity in 2003 to enter the world of the courts, and gave generously of his time subsequently. I owe him a great deal. In 2007–2008, my work in the Sunni courts took place during the presidency of Shaykh 'Abd al-Latif Daryan, and I am grateful to him for allowing me to conduct my research there. I am grateful for the same reason to Shaykh Hasan 'Awwad, president of the Ja'fari courts, who also kindly met with me. A number of judges granted me repeated access to their courts, in some cases over many years, and this book is owed in very large part to their great patience and generosity. Shaykh Hasan Marmar has been an exceptionally open and patient interlocutor since the very beginning and has taught me an incalculable amount. So too Shaykh Ahmad al-Kurdi, who welcomed me not only into his court, but also showed me other paths to understanding Islam. If I have not followed those paths to their ends, the fault is not his. Shaykh Zakaria Ghandour, Shaykh 'Ali Haydar, Shaykh 'Ali Mawla and Shaykh 'Abd al-Rahman al-Mughrabi all allowed me to sit in their courts for months on end in 2007–2008. Thank you to you all. Without your continued help and openness, I could not have written this book. Shaykh Humam al-Sha'ar was very generous with his insights and other materials. I sat with Shaykh Muhammad Dali-Baltah many times in 2003–2004; these experiences were formative. Civil court judge John al-Qazzi also allowed me to sit in his court and met with me several times. I am very grateful to them all. I must also thank Shaykh Muhammad Hasan al-Amin, Shaykh Muhammad 'Assaf, Shaykh Muhammad Kana'an (the Ja'fari consultant judge) and Shaykh 'Abd al-Halim Sharara for their time and insights, as well as Dr Ahmad Fawzi, inspector of the sharia courts. Aside from the judges,

Acknowledgements

xi

I am also very grateful to the other sharia court personnel, the judges' assistants, scribes and others, in both the Sunni and Ja'fari courts. There are too many to name individually here, but I note my especial thanks to Shaykh Mustafa al-Ja'fari for also welcoming me into his Islamic Centre. And beyond the courts but within their ambit I must thank Dr Ahmad al-Faris and Shaykh Muhy al-Din Ba'yun.

Many lawyers also helped me. I cannot thank them all, but, for granting me their time and many other kindnesses, I am very grateful to Ustaz Ramiz al-Atat, Ustaz Basim Ghzayl, Dr 'Ali al-Homsi, Ustaz Muhammad al-Jawhari, Ustaz Musa Mnaymne and Professor Ibrahim Traboulsi. Most of all, I must record my overwhelming debt of gratitude to the late Professor Talal Khodari. His patience with my endless questions and his bottomless fund of legal knowledge were simply invaluable. It is of enormous regret to me that he passed away before he could see the realisation of the book that I promised for so long. I can only hope that in some small way it is worthy of what he might have expected. Thank you, Dr Talal. I miss you.

The courts are only half of my story, and I depended on the help of many others for understanding Islam in Lebanon beyond them. Ayatollah Fadlallah's offices have been exceptionally helpful throughout my researches and I must thank Sayyid 'Ali Fadlallah and Sayyid Ja'far Fadlallah, as well as Shaykh Husayn al-Khishn, for their time, patience and knowledge. Shaykh Muhsin 'Atwi, head of Ayatollah Fadlallah's *maktab shar'i*, was perhaps the first shaykh I ever met. His generosity to a bewildered doctoral student was exceptional, and crucial to all I have learned since: I have lost track of the number of hours of his time he has given subsequently. His door was always open to me. But he also opened a great many other doors to me besides, socially and intellectually. I will always be profoundly grateful to him for doing so. Thank you so much, Shaykh Muhsin. Hajj 'Ali Sammour was also unendingly patient in facilitating my access to the Ayatollah's world. Thank you, Hajj 'Ali. I would also like to thank Shaykh 'Ali Mir'i, Shafiq al-Musawi, Hani 'Abdallah, and all the other staff at the Ayatollah's offices. Mona Sukkariyya helped me in understanding Sayyid Fadlallah's impact beyond the Shi'i community. I also benefited from being able to visit the offices of Ayatollahs Sistani and Khamenei and must thank Hajj Hamid al-Khaffaf and Shaykh Muhammad Tawfiq al-Muqdad, respectively.

Shaykh 'Umar Jalloul has been an exceptionally engaging and generous interlocutor. I learned a huge amount from him and will always be grateful to him for that. Thank you, Shaykh 'Umar. I must also thank Shaykh Mahmud Khatib for his generosity and his time, as well as Shaykh Husam al-Ghali, Shaykh Amin al-Kurdi and Shaykh Maher Hammoud.

xii Acknowledgements

Last, but by no means least, I would also like to thank all those at the ‘A’isha Bekkar mosque and the Naqshbandi-Qadari Centre, as well as Shaykh Muhammad al-Azhari and Shaykh Ahmad, and, with especial affection, Mustafa, his brother ‘Ali and Shaykh Khalid al-Rifa’i and all his circle.

Finally, I also owe very special thanks to Laila Bassam and Nadim Ladki. Without their trust and help in need, I could not have seen this project through. Thank you so much to you both. And I owe the very greatest debt of all to Tom Perry, without whom much of this would have been impossible – and certainly much less fun. You have been the truest of friends.

The support of these people was simply invaluable. Without it, I could not have written this book. It is a great pleasure to acknowledge that here. No doubt they would not all agree with everything I have written. This is my account, not theirs. But I do hope that they will find it a respectful and rewarding one. I owe them everything, and it is thus to them that I dedicate this book.

I also depended on the support of many academic colleagues and institutions. The initial research and early stages of writing were conducted during a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellowship at the University of Cambridge, mentored by James Laidlaw, and a Simon Fellowship at the University of Manchester and I am very grateful to all concerned. Paul Dresch taught me anthropology and a lot more besides – I will be forever in his debt. I am also profoundly grateful to Michael Gilson for his peerless hospitality and for inviting me on numerous occasions to the Islamic Law and Society workshops that he convened at New York University, where I presented parts of this book. I owe a great many insights to the circle of scholars that Michael brought together there, too many to name all individually here, although I should acknowledge in particular the sustained encouragement of Jonathan Brown, Guy Burak, Brinkley Messick and Michael Peletz. Getting to know the work of James Baldwin was important at a crucial stage. The sections of this book bearing on Shi‘i studies benefited hugely from discussions with colleagues met through the Hawza Project convened by Robert Gleave and later enabled by a Princeton–Oxford collaborative grant with Mirjam Künkler. Again, there are just too many people to name them all here, but thank you all so much for so many stimulating meetings and conversations. I presented portions of this work at various venues in Oxford and would like to thank Fernanda Pirie, Matthew Erie, Michael Feener and Talal al-‘Azm especially. A sabbatical term was crucial: many thanks to my colleagues for that and especially Lambros Malafouris. Emanuel Schaeublin and Alex Henley both read several chapters and provided

Acknowledgements

xiii

invaluable comments on them: I am very grateful indeed to them both for doing so. Samer El-Karanshawy was with me at the very beginnings of my research in Lebanon, invited me to fertile meetings in Doha, and went on to read and comment on the entirety of the book. Thank you so much Samer – it is very much appreciated. Thanks are also due to Samer Ghamroun and Moussa Abou Ramadan for helping fill some important gaps in my knowledge late in the day. Portions of Chapter 9 were previously published in *American Ethnologist*, as I gratefully acknowledge here. I would also like to thank Maria Marsh and all at Cambridge University Press.

In academia today, some speak (disparagingly) of the ‘lone scholar’ model. I hope the preceding acknowledgements go some way to showing that there is no such thing. But beyond those named above, I have – thankfully – not had to work alone. I have been able to count on the support of my wonderful wife Alex and the shared joys of our young son Louis and now, as I write these words, our daughter Lily, freshly arrived into this world. Thank you Alex. I must also thank my mother Joan for countless years of support. Some portions of the book were written while enjoying the hospitality of Alex’s parents and I thank them too. I only wish that my father Michael and my brother Parry were alive to see it.

Note on Transliteration

I have used a standard, if much simplified, system for transliterating Arabic words in English. I have not used any diacritical marks, although I have marked *ʿayn* and *hamza* using apostrophes and I have italicised all words coming from languages other than English. Where an English spelling has become commonplace, or accepted, then I use that without italics: for example, sharia. Non-specialists will hopefully thereby find the text more approachable; specialists should be able to work out the Arabic without too much difficulty. As for names of people and places, where there are commonly accepted English spellings, or where the people themselves have adopted a particular spelling, then I use that. Sometimes one has to make choices: I have preferred ‘Quran’ to ‘Koran’ or ‘Qur’an’, and ‘Hizballah’ to ‘Hezbollah’, for instance. I also use ‘shaykh’ rather than ‘sheikh’, as well as a derived adjective, ‘shaykhly’, a neologism meaning ‘associated with shaykhs’ on the lines of ‘priestly’. Where I have referred to articles from the *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, I have done so explicitly in the footnotes rather than as a separate entry in the bibliography and I have used the conventional abbreviations: *EI*² for the second edition of the *Encyclopaedia of Islam* and *EI*³ for the third edition.