

## The Art of Counterpoint from Du Fay to Josquin

This book transforms our understanding of a fifteenth-century musical revolution. Renaissance composers developed fresh ways of handling musical flow in pursuit of intensifications, unexpected explosions, dramatic pauses, and sudden evaporations. A new esthetics of opposition, as this study calls it, can be contrasted with smoother and less goal-oriented approaches in music from before – and after – the period ca. 1425–1520. Casting wide evidentiary and repertorial nets, the book reinterprets central genres, theoretical concepts, historical documents, famous pieces, and periodizations; a provocative concluding chapter suggests that we moderns have tended to conceal the period's musical poetics by neglecting central evidence. Above all the book introduces an analytical approach sensitive to musical flow and invites new ways of hearing, performing, and thinking about music from Du Fay to Josquin.

JESSE RODIN is Professor of Music at Stanford University and a Guggenheim Fellow. His publications include several books and many articles on Renaissance music, as well as recordings with his vocal ensemble Cut Circle. He directs the Josquin Research Project, a tool for exploring a large musical corpus, and co-directs the digital project Mapping the Musical Renaissance.

# The Art of Counterpoint from Du Fay to Josquin

---

JESSE RODIN  
Stanford University



Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-107-18459-6 — The Art of Counterpoint from Du Fay to Josquin  
Jesse Rodin  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107184596](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107184596)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316882191

© Jesse Rodin 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781316882191

First published 2025

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Rodin, Jesse, author.

Title: The art of counterpoint from Du Fay to Josquin / Jesse Rodin.

Description: [1.] | Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York : Cambridge University Press,  
2024. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024030821 | ISBN 9781107184596 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316636015  
(paperback) | ISBN 9781316882191 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Counterpoint – History – To 1500. | Counterpoint – History – 16th century.  
| Music – 15th century – Analysis, appreciation. | Music – 16th century – Analysis,  
appreciation. | Music – 15th century – History and criticism. | Music – 16th century – History  
and criticism.

Classification: LCC ML172 .R63 2024 | DDC 781.309/02–dc23/eng/20240709

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024030821>

ISBN 978-1-107-18459-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

*For Iris Davidson-Rodin (b. 31 October 2018), who always  
wants to listen again (especially to Petite camusette)*

*and*

*in memory of Iris Davidson (1914–2007), who would have  
loved that*

## Contents

*List of Figures* [page ix]  
*List of Tables* [xi]  
*List of Musical Examples* [xii]  
*Acknowledgments* [xiv]  
*Note on Musical Examples* [xvi]  
*List of Abbreviations* [xvii]

Introduction [1]

### PART I STARTING POINTS [13]

- 1 An Esthetics of Opposition That Privileges Intensification, Deintensification, and Dramatic Arcs – and What Came Before and After [15]
- 2 A Discursive Vacuum [39]

### PART II TINCTORIS'S *VARIETAS* [61]

- 3 Defining Terms [63]
- 4 *Varietas* as an Esthetic Paradigm [86]
- 5 Tinctoris Knew the Repertoire [103]
- 6 Pieces Exemplifying *Varietas* [113]

### PART III FUNDAMENTS OF THE ART [137]

- 7 The Parameters [139]
- 8 Affordances of Four- and Five-Voice Texture [157]
- 9 Sacred Genres [167]
- 10 The *Formes Fixes* [189]

### PART IV THE ART IN ACTION [201]

- 11 Some Songs by Du Fay [203]
- 12 Peaks, Valleys, and Flow in Okeghem's Sacred Music [219]
- 13 Busnoys, Josquin, and the Hurricane Osanna [241]

- 14 Seven Awesome Endings [254]
- 15 *Pater noster* across the Esthetic Divide [277]
- 16 The Art of Counterpoint in Performance [293]
  
- Appendix A Tinctoris's Rules of Counterpoint* [319]
- Appendix B Rough Guide to the Late Fifteenth-Century Cyclic Mass* [322]
- Bibliography* [326]
- Index of Compositions* [362]
- General Index* [365]

## Figures

- 1.1 Pacing and flow in the Agnus dei III of Okeghem's *Missa L'homme armé*. [page 19]
- 1.2 *Rex pacificus (Liber Usualis)*. [22]
- 2.1 Fiore dei Liberi, *Il fior di Battaglia* (Venice [or Padua], ca. 1410–20), 12r. Pierpont Morgan Library. MS M.383. [54]
- 6.1 Levels of intensity in *Ma maistresse*, *D'ung aultre amer*, and *Presque transi*. [115]
- 6.2 Syncopation and imitation in *Ma maistresse*. [117]
- 6.3 The *varietates* in pieces that for Tinctoris exemplify *varietas*. [118]
- 6.4 Relevant *varietates* in the opening duo of Du Fay, *Missa L'homme armé*, Credo. [127]
- 8.1 Common registral limits in four-voice texture. [160]
- 9.1a Average length of each mass movement relative to the whole. [177]
- 9.1b Average degree of melismatic writing in each movement, as compared to the composer's average in masses. [178]
- 9.2 Sections, mensuration, and time in an “average” polyphonic mass by Josquin. [179]
- 10.1 Characteristic energetic trajectory in the rondeau. [195]
- 10.2 Duration of A relative to B in rondeaux by Du Fay and Okeghem. [196]
- 12.1 Melodic highpoints in the *Missa De plus en plus*, Kyrie and Gloria. [226]
- 12.2 Discantus range in the *Missa De plus en plus*, Kyrie and Gloria. [227]
- 12.3 Melodic highpoints in the *Missa Caput*. [230]
- 12.4 Hypothetical vocal ranges in Okeghem's *Missa L'homme armé*. [233]
- 12.5 Wide ranges in Okeghem's *Missa L'homme armé*, Credo. [233]
- 14.1 Activity plot for the *prima pars* of Regis's *Lux solempnis/ Repleti sunt*. [260]
- 15.1 Activity plots showing cumulative note attacks per measure in *Pater noster* settings. [280]
- 16.1 Introductory and first “settled” tempo (semibreves to the minute) in performances of music by Josquin and Palestrina notated under  $\text{♩}$ . [298]

- 16.2 Josquin, *Virgo salutiferi*, altus *primus*, mm. 1–51 (London 1070, fol. 69r). [301]
- 16.3 Proper temporal relationship between one breve under  $\text{C}$  and one breve under  $\mathbf{3}$ . [303]
- 16.4 Jan van Eyck's *Ghent Altarpiece*, close-up. [314]



## Tables

- 3.1 Tinctoris's eight *varietates* as rendered by various authors [page 69]
- 4.1 Functions of Tinctoris's *varietates* [97]
- 5.1 Pieces that Tinctoris says exemplify *varietas* (*De arte contrapuncti*, III:8) [104]
- 5.2 Passages Tinctoris cites from polyphonic pieces by others [107]
- 6.1 Oppositions in the Et incarnatus est of Du Fay's *Missa L'homme armé* [132]
- 9.1a Average durations of some cyclic masses [177]
- 9.1b Average degree of melismatic writing, expressed as the number of measures per syllable [178]
- 9.2 Music and text in some five-voice, two-section, O to C tenor motets [187]
- 10.1 What happens after the ends of the A and B sections in the three *formes fixes* [198]
- 16.1 Tempo relationships into and out of the sesquialtera (3:2) passage ("Ave vera virginitas") in Josquin's *Ave Maria . . . virgo serena* [304]

## Musical Examples

- 0.1 Okeghem, *Missa De plus en plus*, Qui tollis, opening. [page 5]
- 1.1 Okeghem, *Missa L'homme armé*, Agnus dei III. [16]
- 1.2 La Rue, *Missa Cum iocunditate*, end of the Gloria. [22]
- 1.3 Power, Gloria à 5 (Old Hall, 16v–17r), opening. [26]
- 1.4 Power, Gloria à 5 (Old Hall, 16v–17r), conclusion. [27]
- 1.5 Machaut, *Biauté qui toutes autres père*, A section. [30]
- 1.6 Willaert, *Verbum bonum*, mm. 149–64. [33]
- 1.7 Willaert, *Verbum bonum*, beginning of the *secunda pars*. [34]
- 2.1 Isaac, *Alla battaglia*, refrain. [41]
- 2.2 Binchoys, *Je ne vis oncques la pareille*, discantus and tenor. [53]
- 2.3 Du Fay, *Missa L'homme armé*, Credo, mm. 45–51. [56]
- 3.1 *Redictae* and *fuga* in Tinctoris, *De arte contrapuncti*, III:6, second musical example. [78]
- 3.2 Tinctoris's example of how “two or more *perfectiones* must not be made in the same position one after another,” even if the chant encourages as much (*De arte contrapuncti*, III:7). [80]
- 3.3 Josquin, *Ave Maria . . . virgo serena*, mm. 16–22. [82]
- 5.1 Tinctoris, *De arte contrapuncti*, II:34: diminished fifths in Caron's *Helas* (mm. 42–46). [109]
- 5.2 Tinctoris, *De arte contrapuncti*, II:34: diminished fifths in Faugues's *Missa Le serviteur*, Gloria (mm. 159–72). [109]
- 5.3 Tinctoris, *De arte contrapuncti*, II:34: diminished fifth in Busnoys's *Je ne demande autre de gré* (mm. 19–23). [110]
- 5.4 Tinctoris, *De arte contrapuncti*, II:30: semibreve-length dissonance in the Gloria of Domarto's *Missa Spiritus almus* (mm. 19–22). [111]
- 6.1 Regis, *Clangat plebs flores*, join between the two *partes*. [120]
- 6.2 Faugues, *Missa Vinnus vina*, Agnus dei III. [123]
- 6.3 Du Fay, *Missa L'homme armé*, Credo, mm. 1–33. [128]
- 7.1 *Missa L'ardant desir*, Kyrie, mm. 78–87 (tenor *tacet*). [145]
- 7.2 *Missa L'ardant desir*, Kyrie, mm. 16–23. [145]
- 7.3 Josquin, *Ave verum corpus*, conclusion. [149]
- 7.4 Regis, *Missa Ecce ancilla domini*, Credo, mm. 252–60. [151]
- 7.5 *Missa Di dadi*, Agnus dei, mm. 163–71. [155]

- 8.1 Busnoys, *Missa L'homme armé*, Gloria, mm. 34–37. [161]
- 11.1 Du Fay, *Adieu ces bons vins de Lannoy*, opening. [204]
- 11.2 Du Fay, *Ma belle dame souverainne*, opening. [208]
- 11.3 Du Fay, *He, compagnons, resvelons nous*, opening. [209]
- 11.4 Du Fay, *Ce jour de l'an*, opening. [210]
- 11.5 Du Fay, *Malheureulx cueur*. [212]
- 11.6 Du Fay, *En triumpphant de Cruel Dueil*, join between A and B. [217]
- 12.1 Okeghem, *Missa De plus en plus*: Kyrie and start of Gloria. [220]
- 12.2 Okeghem, *Missa Caput*, Gloria, mm. 10–21 (with the tenor notated on the bottom staff). [229]
- 12.3 Okeghem, *Missa De plus en plus*, Credo, opening. [236]
- 12.4 Okeghem, *Missa De plus en plus*, Sanctus, mm. 40–51. [238]
- 12.5 Okeghem, *Missa De plus en plus*, Agnus dei, opening. [239]
- 13.1 Du Fay, *Missa Se la face ay pale*, Osanna I, opening. [242]
- 13.2 Busnoys, *Missa O crux lignum triumphale*, Osanna. [243]
- 13.3 Josquin, *Missa L'homme armé super voces musicales*, Osanna, mm. 77–87. [245]
- 13.4 Josquin, *Missa Hercules dux Ferrarie*, Osanna. [246]
- 13.5 Josquin, *Missa Sine nomine*, Osanna. [248]
- 13.6 *Missa Di dadi*, Osanna. [251]
- 14.1 Okeghem, *Ma bouche rit*, conclusion. [256]
- 14.2 *Missa Gross senen*, Credo (Crucifixus), mm. 161–74. [257]
- 14.3 Regis, *Lux solempnis/Repleti sunt*, end of *prima pars*. [262]
- 14.4 Malcort, *Malheur me bat*, conclusion. [264]
- 14.5 Obrecht, *Missa Malheur me bat*, Christe, conclusion. [267]
- 14.6 Josquin, *Missa Malheur me bat*, Gloria, conclusion. [271]
- 14.7 Agricola, *Missa Malheur me bat*, Agnus dei I. [274]
- 15.1 Richafort, *Pater noster*, opening. [279]
- 15.2 Josquin, *Pater noster*, opening. [282]
- 15.3 Josquin, *Pater noster*, end of *prima pars*. [286]
- 15.4 Willaert, *Pater noster à 6*, opening. [289]
- 16.1 Josquin, *Virgo salutiferi*, mm. 69–73. [302]

## Acknowledgments

Irrigating these pages are insights drawn from conversations with colleagues, students, and friends who share my passion for polyphony. Relatively early on I was fortunate enough to gain as a teacher and mentor Sean Gallagher, who welcomed me with open arms into a world in which fifteenth-century music offered up not only fun intellectual problems but also pleasurable sound experiences. In Sean's company I spent hours dissecting compositional decisions and musical effects across a large swath of the repertory. Sean's infectious enthusiasm, high scholarly standards, musicality, and generosity of spirit sent me down a path that has led, among other places, to the publication of this book.

Rewarding exchanges have sustained my progress even in fallow times. I owe unrepayable debts to Joshua Rifkin and Emily Zazulia, who have shown an unflinching willingness to bat around ideas and put pressure on weak ones. Many other friends and colleagues have offered moral support and practical help, including Anna Maria Busse and Karol Berger, Lawrence Bernstein, Bonnie Blackburn, Clare Bokulich, Sam Bradley, Ximena Briceño, David Burn, Marc Busnel, Philippe Canguilhem, Camilla Cavicchi, Ioanida Costache, James Davies, Karen Desmond, Rowan Dorin, Yuval Dvoran, Marisa Galvez, Shana Goldin-Perschbacher, Roger Grant, Fiona Griffiths, Stephen Hinton, Jennifer Hoyer, Héctor Hoyos, Thomas Forrest Kelly, Beatrice Kitzinger, Brett Kostrzewski, Charles Kronengold, Elisabeth Le Guin, Shawn Lee, Jesse Lewis, Evan MacCarthy, Herbert Myers, the late Alejandro Enrique Planchart, Jamie Reuland, William Robin, Alex Ross, Kailan Rubinoff, Deborah Sager, Peter Schmelz, Kathryn Starkey, Riccardo Strobino, Bettina Varwig, Philippe Vendrix, and Anna Zayaruznaya. Many thanks to Dara Kravitz Gottfried and Jessica Kirson for their help in securing permissions, and to Rupert Peacock for proofreading the book. Craig Sapp, Technical Director of the Josquin Research Project, has shown extraordinary generosity in running queries that go beyond the analytical tools available online, in offering advice on the setting of musical examples, and in assisting with several figures. Indeed much of the data presented here owes to Sapp's world-class expertise.

Invitations to present work-in-progress spurred me to take my ideas further. Material that has found its way into this study was first presented at the Centre d'Études Supérieures de la Renaissance (Tours), the Gruppo di Analisi e Teoria Musicale (Rimini), the Schola Cantorum (Basel), the University of Vienna, Brandeis University, Cornell University, Princeton University, Stanford University, the University of California (both Berkeley and Davis), the University of Maryland, the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, and the University of Texas at Austin. Several colleagues were kind enough to comment on one or more chapters: Allan Atlas, David Fallows, Leofranc Holford-Strevens, Stefano Mengozzi, Joshua Rifkin, and Emily Zazulia. Fabrice Fitch and Benjamin Ory generously offered feedback on the complete manuscript. And I am grateful to Stanford students past and present for working on and asking smart questions about issues relevant to this study, especially Victoria Chang, Gabriel Ellis, Simon Frisch, Zachary Haines, Christina Kim, Daniel Koplitz, Eric Tuan, Lorenzo Tunesi, and Calvin van Zytveld.

Slow thinking is needed to bring a project like this to fruition, and so it needs acknowledging that the book would not have been written without fellowships from the American Council of Learned Societies (Burkhardt Fellowship), the Villa I Tatti, and the Guggenheim Foundation. Help has been in abundant supply from my editor, Kate Brett, and from my copyeditor, Kathleen Fearn. And I owe thanks to the members of Cut Circle, above all to Bradford Gleim, for making it possible for me to hear – and feel – the pieces. Remarkably, my wife Daphna, my mother Joyce, and my son Harry not only tolerated my work on this book but also contributed by reading, reacting, and sometimes setting me straight. Research is always more fun when loved ones take an interest – and so it has been especially rewarding to see Iris, who has just turned six, get excited about the music. You can't ask for more than that.

## Note on Musical Examples

Musical examples have been edited almost exclusively from original sources. Note values are unreduced. Unless specified otherwise (and save for the chronologically early examples 1.3–1.5 and 11.1–11.3), passages in triple meter are notated under  $\text{O}$ , passages in duple meter under  $\text{C}$ . In four-voice music, unlabeled voices appear in the order superius/discantus – altus/contratenor – tenor – bassus.

## Abbreviations

|              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|--------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| CopChanson   | “The Copenhagen Chansonnier and the Loire Valley Chansonniers: An Open Access Project,” directed by Peter Woetmann Christoffersen. 2013– . ( <a href="http://chansonniers.pwch.dk/index.html">http://chansonniers.pwch.dk/index.html</a> ) |
| DIAMM        | “The Digital Image Archive of Medieval Music.” 1998– . <a href="http://www.diamm.ac.uk/">www.diamm.ac.uk/</a>                                                                                                                              |
| EMT          | “Early Music Theory: Johannes Tinctoris,” directed by Ronald Woodley. 2013– . ( <a href="https://earlymusictheory.org/Tinctoris">https://earlymusictheory.org/Tinctoris</a> )                                                              |
| <i>Grove</i> | <i>Grove Music Online</i> ( <a href="http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com">www.oxfordmusiconline.com</a> )                                                                                                                                     |
| JRP          | “Josquin Research Project” ( <a href="http://josquin.stanford.edu">http://josquin.stanford.edu</a> or <a href="http://josqu.in">josqu.in</a> ). Searchable by a piece’s work identification number (e.g., Isa3002, cited as JRP Isa3002).  |
| NJE          | Josquin des Prez. <i>New Edition of the Collected Works (New Josquin Edition)</i> , gen. ed. Willem Elders. 30 vols. Utrecht: Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 1987–2017.                                       |
| OckBenthem   | Ockeghem, Johannes. <i>Masses and Mass Sections</i> , ed. Jaap van Benthem. 3 vols. Utrecht: Koninklijke voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 1994–2004. Vol. 2, fasc. 3 cited as OckBenthem 2/3.                                          |
| OckWexler    | Ockeghem, Johannes. <i>Collected Works</i> , ed. Dragan Plamenac and Richard Wexler. Vol. 3. American Musicological Society, 1992.                                                                                                         |
| YouTube      | <a href="http://www.youtube.com/">www.youtube.com/</a>                                                                                                                                                                                     |