Constitutional Change Through Euro-Crisis Law contains a comparative constitutional analysis of the impact of a very broad range of euro-crisis law instruments on the EU and national constitutions. It covers (i) contrasting assessments of the impact of euro-crisis law on national parliaments; (ii) various types of criticism on the EU economic governance framework; (iii) different views on what is needed to improve the multi-level system of economic governance and (iv) valuable insights into the nature of emergency discourse in the legislative arena and of the spillover from the political to the judicial sphere. In addition, it deals with how bailout countries, even if part of the same group of euro-area Member States subject to a programme, have reacted differently to the crisis.

Thomas Beukers is Jean Monnet Fellow at the European University Institute and Senior Legal Advisor for the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs. His research interests include the relationship between law and politics, as well as the constitutional law of the European Union. Since he joined the EUI in 2012, his research focuses on the constitutional development of EMU. He is editor of the European Constitutional Law Review.

Bruno de Witte was Professor of European Law at Maastricht University from 1989 to 2000 and at the European University Institute in Florence from 2000 to 2010. He currently combines part-time positions at both these institutions. His main areas of research include constitutional reform and treaty revision in the European Union, protection of fundamental rights in Europe, and decision-making and legal instruments of EU law.

Claire Kilpatrick is Professor of International European and Social Law at the European University Institute, Florence, and Co-Director of the Academy of European Law. Her interests lie mainly in the law and policy construction of Social Europe. A focus of her recent work is EMU and Social Europe with a particular focus on sovereign debt loan arrangements and legal challenges to those arrangements from those within debtor EU states.
CONSTITUTIONAL CHANGE THROUGH EURO-CRISIS LAW

Edited by

THOMAS BEUKERS
European University Institute, Florence

BRUNO DE WITTE
European University Institute, Florence

CLAIRE KILPATRICK
European University Institute, Florence
CONTENTS

List of Tables vii
List of Contributors viii
Preface x

1 Constitutional Change through Euro-Crisis Law: Taking Stock, New Perspectives and Looking Ahead 1
THOMAS BEUKERS, BRUNO DE WITTE AND CLAIRE KILPATRICK

PART I Reconstructing the European Space for Economic Governance 25

2 The European Fiscal Consolidation Legal Framework: Its Impact on National Fiscal Constitutions and Parliamentary Democracy 27
VIOLETA RUIZ ALMENDRAL

PÄIVI LEINO-SANDBERG AND JANNE SALMINEN

4 Creation and Reform of Independent Fiscal Institutions in EU Member States: Incomplete and Insufficient Work in Progress? 108
DIANE FROMAGE

5 Differentiated Integration from the Perspective of Non-Euro Area Member States 143
THOMAS BEUKERS AND MARIJN VAN DER SLUIS

PART II National Constitutional Manifestations of Economic Emergency 177

6 Greece: Constitutional Deconstruction and the Loss of National Sovereignty 179
AFRODITI MARKETOU
## Table of Contents

7 Spain: Dealing with the Economic Emergency through Constitutional Reform and Limited Parliamentary Intervention  199  
Leticia Díez Sánchez

8 Constitutional Change through Emergency Decrees: The Abolition of Provinces in Italy  217  
Leonardo Pierdominici

9 Ireland: Traditional Procedures Adapted for Economic Emergency  230  
Stephen Coutts

PART III Constitutional Judicial Challenges to Euro-Crisis Law  241

10 Legitimacy through Adjudication: The ESM Treaty and the Fiscal Compact before the National Courts  243  
Jan-Herman Reestman

11 Constitutions, Social Rights and Sovereign Debt States in Europe: A Challenging New Area of Constitutional Inquiry  279  
Claire Kilpatrick

Index  327
TABLES

2.1 Fiscal Rules Index (FRI) 41
2.2 Euro Area Excessive Deficit Procedures and Deficit Indicators 46
2.3 Budgetary Cycle 54
2.4 Involvement of National Parliaments in the Preparation of 'Medium-Term Budgetary Frameworks' (MTBF) 57
2.5 Expenditure on Social Protection, 2002–2012 (per cent of GDP) 62
2.6 Total Tax Revenue by Country, 2000–2014 (per cent of GDP) 63
CONTRIBUTORS

THOMAS BEUKERS is Senior Legal Advisor at the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs and a Jean Monnet Fellow at the European University Institute.

STEPHEN COUTTS is a lecturer at the School of Law and Government, Dublin City University.

BRUNO DE WITTE is Professor of European Law at Maastricht University, The Netherlands, and part-time Professor of Law at the European University Institute.

LETICIA DÍEZ-SANCHEZ is a PhD researcher at the European University Institute Law Department.

DIANE FROMAGE is Assistant Professor in EU Law at Utrecht University’s Law Faculty.

CLAIRE KILPATRICK is Professor of International and European Labour and Social Law in the European University Institute Law Department.

PÄIVI LEINO-SANDBERG is Adjunct Professor of EU Law at the University of Helsinki.

AFRODITI MARKETOUL is a PhD researcher at the European University Institute.

LEONARDO PIERDOMINICI is a postdoctoral researcher at the Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna School of Law, and a Research Associate at the Robert Schuman Center for Advanced Studies at the European University Institute.
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

JAN-HERMAN REESTMAN is Associate Professor of Public Law in the Department of Constitutional and Administrative Law at the University of Amsterdam.

VIOLETA RUIZ ALMENDRAL is Associate Professor of Tax and Finance Law at Universidad Carlos III de Madrid.

JANNE SALMINEN is Senior Lecturer in the Faculty of Law, University of Turku.

MARIJN VAN DER SLUIS is Assistant Professor in EU Law at Erasmus University, Rotterdam.
This book is one of the fruits of a larger research project of the European University Institute (EUI) Law Department and funded by the EUI Research Council from January 2013 to December 2015. As such, it has benefited from the work of a large number of people, most of whom are researchers, Max Weber Fellows or professors in the law department of the EUI. We are extremely grateful to the EUI Research Council for their support, which has helped create not just the project but also a new generation of European Monetary Union (EMU) law scholars at the EUI.

The funded project entailed a study of the impact of euro-crisis law (by which we mean the legal instruments adopted at European or international level in reaction to the Eurozone crisis) on the national legal and constitutional structures of the 28 Member States of the European Union. Scholarly debate on euro-crisis law has mainly focused on the European legal dimension, and on normative issues of democratic legitimacy, legality and the balance between austerity and growth policies. Contributions also exist on the impact of euro-crisis law on specific national constitutional orders, but a comprehensive study is so far lacking. The project set out to fill this gap. Its goal was to provide an open-access research tool, based on a set of reports for each Member State that would constitute an excellent basis for further, especially comparative, studies of the legal status and implementation of euro-crisis law at the national level, the interactions between national legal systems and euro-crisis law and the constitutional challenges that have been faced. That open-access tool is available at http://eurocrisislaw.eui.eu/. This edited volume draws on the project’s findings to develop further, especially comparative studies, of euro-crisis law.

Key to the project’s success were its three co-ordinators: Thomas Beukers (2013–present), Cristina Fasone (2014–15) and Marijn van der Sluis (2013–14). The reports were based on a detailed questionnaire and on a wider range of sources, including minutes of parliamentary debates, national laws ratifying and implementing euro-crisis law and case law of
national constitutional or supreme courts. Thomas Beukers and Marijn van der Sluis were the main authors of the original questionnaire and played an important role in co-ordinating the large team of researchers, many based at the EUI, who authored the country reports. Those reports were then subject to editing and updating. Cristina Fasone, alongside Thomas Beukers, played a central role in editing the reports. Central to the project is the quality of the country reports. We wish to thank, in order of country: Daniela Jaros (Austria); Werner Vandenbruwaene (Belgium); Mihail Vatsov (Bulgaria); Mateja Džurović (Croatia); Ekaterina Pantazatou (Cyprus); Tomas Dumbrovsky (Czech Republic); Marja-Liisa Laatsit (Estonia); Päivi Leino-Sandberg and Janne Salminen (Finland); Robin Gadbled and Diane Fromage (France); Sabine Mair and Malte Koeger (Germany); Afroditi Marketou and Michail Dekastros (Greece); Dalma Dojcsák (Hungary); Stephen Coutts (Ireland); Leonardo Pierdominici (Italy); Zane Rasnača (Latvia); Loreta Šaltinytė (Lithuania); Malte Kroeger (Luxembourg); Malte Kroeger (Malta); Jotte Mulder (Netherlands); Katarzyna Granat (Poland); Rita Gião Hanek and Daniele Gallo (Portugal); Viorica Viţă (Romania); Tomas Dumbrovsky (Slovakia); Urska Petrovcic (Slovenia); Mireia Estrada Cañamares, Germán Gomez Ventura and Leticia Díez Sánchez (Spain); Anna Södersten (Sweden) and Emily Hancox (UK).

The website design involved displaying a map of Europe in which each report was coded according to a traffic light system so that users could search by country which euro-crisis instruments had been controversial. We wish to thank Lorenzo Giuntini for his help with website design and maintenance. Project dissemination and updates via newsletters and the news section of the project’s website were in the capable and proactive hands of Viorica Viţă and Thomas Beukers.

Cristina Fasone helped Marise Cremona and Claire Kilpatrick to organize a conference at the EUI in October 2014 out of which many of the contributions to this volume developed. Nick Lee played an invaluable role in meticulous editing of both the language and the substance of submitted chapters. His comments and suggestions significantly improved the quality of the volume.

Giorgio Monti, currently Head of Department at the EUI, played a central role throughout the entire life of the project. Loïc Azoulai, Marise Cremona, Stefan Grundmann and Hans Micklitz, professors in the EUI Law Department, all played important roles at various stages.