

MIND AND RIGHTS

Mind and Rights combines historical, philosophical, and legal perspectives with research from psychology and the cognitive sciences to probe the justification of human rights in ethics, politics and law. Chapters critically examine the growth of the human rights culture, its roots in history and current human rights theories. They engage with the so-called cognitive revolution and investigate the relationship between human cognition and human rights to determine how insights gained from modern theories of the mind can deepen our understanding of the foundations of human rights. *Mind and Rights* argues that the pursuit of the human rights idea, with its achievements and tragic failures, is key to understand what kind of beings humans are. Amidst ongoing debate on the universality and legitimacy of human rights, this book provides a uniquely comprehensive analysis of great practical and political importance for a culture of legal justice undergirded by rights. This title is also available as open access on Cambridge Core.

Matthias Mahlmann is University Professor, Chair of Philosophy and Theory of Law, Legal Sociology and International Public Law at the University of Zurich.

Mind and Rights

THE HISTORY, ETHICS, LAW AND PSYCHOLOGY
OF HUMAN RIGHTS

MATTHIAS MAHLMANN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-18422-0 — Mind and Rights
Matthias Mahlmann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107184220

DOI: 10.1017/9781316875520

© Matthias Mahlmann 2023

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781316875520 under a Creative Commons Open Access licence CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this licence, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly. When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781316875520

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-107-18422-0 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-316-63540-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
Introduction: Navigating Deep Waters: The Problems of Human Rights and New Perspectives of Inquiry	1
I.1 Critique and Defense	1
I.2 Reason, Conscience and Rights	4
I.3 The Problem of Rights	7
I.4 Human Rights Instruments and Heuristics of Law	11
I.5 The Law: In Splendid Isolation from the Troubles of Theory?	12
I.6 Human Rights and the Emancipation of Human Thought	14
I.7 The Spheres of Rights	19
I.8 The Inquiry into Mind and Rights	22
I.9 Why It Is Worth the Effort	30
I.10 The Line of Argument	33
I.11 Problems of Inquiry	36
I.12 Theory of Human Rights and the Ethics of a Way of Life	38
PART I THE CONCEPT OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE GLOBAL HISTORY OF AN IDEA	
1 The Concept of Human Rights	43
1.1 Parameters of Analysis	43
1.2 Moral and Legal Rights	44
1.3 The Complex Makeup of Subjective Rights	46
1.4 The Holders and Addressees of Rights	50
1.5 The Basic Content of Human Rights	53
1.6 Co-possibility and Limitations of Rights	54
1.7 Rights and the Nature of Obligations	58

1.8	The Peremptory Nature of Rights	61
1.9	Group Rights	63
1.10	Ethics, Legal Hermeneutics and Justification	64
1.11	What Are We Talking About?	66
2	The Truth of Human Rights: A Mortal Daughter of Time?	68
2.1	Apologizing for Genocide	68
2.2	How to Decipher the History of Human Rights?	75
2.2.1	History and Human Rights Revisionism	75
2.2.2	Concepts and Methods of Inquiry	78
2.2.3	Conceptions of History	85
2.3	Rights on the Barricades	92
2.3.1	Where to Begin?	92
2.3.2	From Politics to Law	93
2.3.3	Civil Rights and Human Rights	95
2.4	The Growth of the Multilayered Protection of Human Rights	98
2.4.1	Contours of the Project	98
2.4.2	Constructing the Postwar World	103
2.4.3	Pushing the Agenda from the Periphery of Power	108
2.4.4	From the <i>Universal Declaration</i> to the Differentiated International Bill of Human Rights	112
2.5	The Parameters of Change	116
2.5.1	Policy and Politics	116
2.5.2	Regime Change and the Creation of New Political Bodies	118
2.5.3	Political Ideologies	119
2.6	The Myth of the Western Origins of International Human Rights	121
2.7	Lessons to Be Drawn	128
2.7.1	A First Lesson: The Rediscovery of the Political Roots of Human Rights	128
2.7.2	A Second Lesson: The Rediscovery of Autonomous Critical Thought	130
2.8	Politics, Ethics and a Preliminary Conclusion	132
3	Down the Deeper Wells of Time	133
3.1	Back to the Roots or Trapped in Anachronism?	134
3.2	A Standard Thesis	134
3.3	Not a Moral Blank Slate: The Perspective of Indigenous People	136
3.4	The Many Forms of Normative Thought in Ancient Times	143
3.4.1	The Imagery of Epics	143
3.4.2	Democracy and Rights	146
3.4.3	Equality	148

3.4.4	Slavery and the Search for Freedom, Equality and Equal Worth	151
3.4.5	Liberty and Tyranny	153
3.4.6	Rape, Injustice and Human Self-Determination	155
3.4.7	Justice and Rights	156
3.4.8	The Worth of Human Beings	159
3.4.9	The Human Polis	160
3.4.10	Actions and Rights in Roman Law	161
3.4.11	Varieties of Rights	163
3.5	Rights since Antiquity	164
3.5.1	Rights at the Dawn of a New (European) Era	164
3.5.2	Natural Rights and Medieval Rebellion	166
3.5.3	Natural Rights and the Conquest of America	168
3.5.4	Natural Rights and the Worldly Law of Reason	173
3.5.5	Transitions of Natural Law	175
3.5.6	Rights in the Best of All Possible Worlds	175
3.5.7	Closing the Circle: The Explicit Doctrine of Human Rights	177
3.6	The Many Roots of Human Rights	180
3.6.1	The Importance of Methods of Inquiry	181
3.6.2	Varieties of Rights and the Significance of Distinctions	181
3.6.3	Rights and Models of History	185
3.6.4	A Key Finding: The Long Way from Moral Intuitions to Explicit Rights	186
3.6.5	How to Miss the Point of Human Rights: Some Lessons from the Past	188
3.6.6	Not from Nowhere	190
3.7	The Charisma of Human Rights: Where from?	192

PART II JUSTIFICATION

4	Far from Obvious: The Quest for the Justification of Human Rights	201
4.1	How to Justify Human Rights	202
4.1.1	An Idle Question?	202
4.1.2	A Critical Theory of Human Goods	204
4.1.3	A Political Theory of Human Rights	206
4.1.4	A Theory of Fundamental Normative Principles	208
4.2	The Functions of Human Rights	211
4.2.1	Human Rights as Tools for Social Integration	211
4.2.2	Engineering Social Efficiency?	214
4.2.3	Human Rights and Maximizing of Happiness	216
4.3	Justification by Agreement	217
4.3.1	Discourse and Consensus	217
4.3.2	Justification by Contract	219

4.4	Human Rights and Human Existence	221
4.4.1	The Rights of Autonomous Agents	221
4.4.2	Needs and Interests as the Engine of Rights	237
4.4.3	The Capability Approach	244
4.5	Political Conception	252
4.5.1	Human Rights and the Veil of Ignorance in the International Sphere	252
4.5.2	The Political Conception Reframed	253
4.5.3	A Fresh Start?	256
4.6	Human Rights and the Art of Living Well	260
4.7	Summary: Affirmative Theories of Human Rights	262
5	A Castle of Sand?	264
5.1	The Sources of Human Goods	265
5.1.1	No Foothold for Rights?	265
5.1.2	The Anthropology of Human Rights and the Thresholds of Inclusion	275
5.1.3	Needs, Interests and Capabilities	278
5.1.4	Contours of a Form of Life	279
5.2	Better Off without Rights?	280
5.2.1	The Limited Reach of Rights	280
5.2.2	Politics beyond Normativity?	282
5.3	The Critique of Rights	283
5.3.1	The Benefits of Authoritarianism	283
5.3.2	Human Rights: Ineffective Ethical and Legal Balderdash?	284
5.3.3	Human Rights as Means of Economic Disempowerment	286
5.3.4	Human Rights as the Handmaidens of Power and the Prospects of Postcolonial Worldmaking	288
5.3.5	Feminist Critiques and Restatements of Human Rights	292
5.3.6	Human Rights Curtailing Democracy and Sovereignty	294
5.3.7	The Wrong Politics of Human Rights	296
5.3.8	The <i>Aporia</i> of Human Rights	296
5.4	The Political Case for Human Rights	299
5.4.1	The Political Theory of Entrenchment	299
5.4.2	Scope to Act and the Political Subjects of History	302
5.4.3	Human Rights as a Condition of Community	303
5.4.4	Human Rights as Legal Rights	304
5.5	Rights after Auschwitz	305
5.6	Normative Principles	310
5.6.1	Justice and Solidarity as the Wellsprings of Rights	310
5.6.2	Dignity and Rights	315

5.7	Making Human Rights Concrete	323
5.8	Some More Results	324
PART III RIGHTS AND MORAL COGNITION		
6	Which Kind of Mind, Which Kind of Morals, Which Kind of Rights?	329
6.1	Ethics and the Theory of the Human Mind	329
6.2	The Epistemology of Moral Cognition	333
6.3	The Neuroscientific Attack on Human Rights: Human Rights and the Mental Gizmo Thesis	336
6.4	The Mental Gizmo Thesis Reconsidered	339
6.5	Rights and Behavioral Science	347
6.6	Justice and Benevolence	351
7	Where Did It All Come From? Morality and the Evolution of the Mind	356
7.1	Morality and Evolution	356
7.2	Puzzling Altruism	358
7.3	Various Forms of Cooperation and the Problem of What Morality Is	358
7.4	Animal Morality?	361
7.5	Evolutionary Psychology	363
7.5.1	The Morality of Selfish Genes	363
7.5.2	Reciprocal Altruism	364
7.5.3	The Morality of Tribes	365
7.5.4	Explanatory Problems	366
7.6	The Power of Joint Intentionality: Interdependence and Cooperation	369
7.6.1	Some Specifics of Human Cooperation	369
7.6.2	Sympathy and Fairness Develop in Small Steps	371
7.6.3	The Path to Objective Group Morality	373
7.6.4	Self–Other Equivalence as a Spandrel	377
7.6.5	Paradigmatic Incrementalism	377
7.6.6	The Analysis of Morality and the Evidence for Evolutionary Incrementalism	378
7.6.7	Stumbling Blocks on the Way to Second- Personal Morality	379
7.6.8	The Objective Morality of Cogs in the Machine	382
7.6.9	Is There an Alternative to Incrementalism?	384
7.7	Evolutionary Pluralism	387
7.7.1	The Contested Scope of Evolutionary Theory	387
7.7.2	Nature Does Not Make Leaps, Does It?	392
7.8	The Evolutionary Possibility of Human Goodness	400

8	The Mentalist Theory of Ethics and Law	402
8.1	A Fresh Look at Frameworks of Morality	402
8.2	Some Properties of Moral Cognition	405
8.2.1	The Cognitive Space of Morality	405
8.2.2	Principles of Morality	406
8.2.3	Basic Harms, Human Rights and the “Seeds of a Collective Conscience”	412
8.2.4	Volitional Consequences of Moral Judgment	413
8.2.5	Questions of Metaethics and the World of Moral Emotions	415
8.3	Explanatory Limits of Emotivism	418
8.3.1	Ruled by Moral Taste Buds?	418
8.3.2	A Testing Case: Corporal Punishment – A Question of Taste?	421
8.3.3	Sentimental Rules	425
8.4	Explaining Moral Disagreement	426
8.5	The Development of Moral Cognition	430
8.5.1	How Do We Learn to Be Moral?	430
8.5.2	The Moral World of Infants and Toddlers	431
8.6	Poverty of Stimulus and the Development of a Moral Point of View	433
8.7	Sentimental Rules, Rational Rules?	437
8.7.1	The Power of Statistical Learning	437
8.7.2	The Limits of Statistical Learning	439
8.8	Theories of Mind and Human Moral Progress	443
8.9	Critique and Construction: Explanatory Theory and Normative Arguments	444
8.10	The Epistemology of Human Rights Universalism	446
8.11	The Epistemology and Ontology of Morals	449
8.12	Epistemological Resilience	452
8.13	Universalism without Dogmatism and Human Rights Pluralism	453
8.14	A New Case for Universalism?	457
	Epilogue: The Tilted Scales of Justice	462
	<i>Bibliography</i>	469
	<i>Index</i>	495

Acknowledgments

The cover image is a reproduction of striking Paleolithic rock art in northern Africa, Gilf Kebir, painted by Elisabeth Pauli in 1933 during an anthropological expedition to that region. It was exhibited together with other such documents of prehistoric rock art at the MoMA in New York in 1937. The picture documents the common universal heritage of human beings, here displayed in a cave in northern Africa by people whose descendants were regarded as primitive brutes by European colonizers. It shows the rich, equal creative endowment of human beings that has been the basis for the cultural achievements of our species throughout the ages and across the globe, achievements that ultimately also include – which is the point of this book – the ethics and law of human rights.

Many people have helped to develop the argument of the book. I would like to thank John Mikhail for his comments on the manuscript and for the privilege of decades of intense discussions about the foundations of ethical thinking and the law. As doctoral students, we were both inspired by Noam Chomsky's work on the theory of the human mind and its deep implications for our understanding of what kind of creatures we are. I am very grateful for the input Noam Chomsky has provided about the topic this book now addresses. I owe a substantial debt to András Sajó for his critical input on the final manuscript and many (increasingly alarmed) discussions about rights and constitutionalism and the enemies both are facing. I also thank Christopher McCrudden and Mordechai Kremnitzer for very helpful critical feedback on the manuscript and the ongoing dialogue about a liberating and egalitarian project of human rights. I have profited very much from Eyal Zamir's criticism and suggestions on an initial paper and the final manuscript.

I was fortunate to profit from comments on talks and publications and from discussions on the topic, the theses of this inquiry and its wider background in ethics and law at various stages of the project. I thank Tilmann Altwicker, Shreya Atrey, Susanne Baer, Samantha Besson, Giovanni Biaggini, Andrea Büchler, Oliver Diggelmann, Catarina Donati, Marcus Düwell, Christoph Engel, Rivka Feldhay,

Thomas Gächter, Alain Griffel, Klaus Günther, Michael Hagner, Lutz Jäncke, Nadja El Kassar, Helen Keller, Tarunabh Khaitan, Anne Kühler, Philip Kunig, Christos Kypraios, George Letsas, Stefan Magen, Frank Meyer, Daniel Moeckli, Stephen Morse, Jörg-Paul Müller, Catherine O'Regan, Anne Peters, Orin Percus, Hubert Rottleuthner, Peter Schaber, M. N. S. Sellers, John Tasioulas, Ian Tattersall, Arun Thiruvengadam, Renata Uitz and Lutz Wingert for critically engaging with me on these questions in different forms. I am particularly grateful for the thoughts about the human rights project that Regina Kiener and the late Andreas Auer generously shared with me.

I have had the privilege to learn much about interdisciplinary perspectives on the foundations of law from my colleagues in the *Fachgruppe Grundlagen* at the Faculty of Law: José Louis Alonso, Ulrike Babusiaux, Wolfgang Ernst, Christoph Graber, Johannes Liebrecht, Elisabetta Fiocchi Malaspina, Marcel Senn and Andreas Thier.

I profited significantly from the detailed comments of the anonymous reviewers of the project.

I am particularly thankful to Margaret Hiley, who not only shouldered the task of language editing most professionally and with outstanding skill but also engaged substantially with the content of the text, which helped to considerably improve the clarity of the argument.

The members of my research group and affiliates of the law and philosophy discussion group in Zurich have contributed in many ways to the work on and arguments in the book. I am therefore indebted to Corina Diem, Peter Gailhofer, Levin Güver, Matthias Hächler, Frederik von Harbou, Jón Laxdal, Nicole Nickerson, Pascal Meier, Nebojsa Mijatovic, Angela Müller, Ilona Paulke, Lena Portmann, Nils Reimann, Stefano Statunato, Julia Stern, Hanna Stoll, Youlo Wujohksang and Nadja Zink.

Corina Diem, Levin Güver, Jón Laxdal, Angelina Manhart, Nebojsa Mijatovic, Nicole Nickerson, and Stefano Statunato patiently assisted me during the final editorial phase of the project.

I had the opportunity to present and discuss the theses of the book during a research stay at the Bonavero Institute of Human Rights, University of Oxford, as a fellow at Mansfield College in 2021/22. I would like to thank Catherine O'Regan for her hospitality and Christos Kypraios and Sarah Norman for their support. I am grateful for the substantial input I received.

I was invited to teach a course on “Mind and Rights” at the University of Pennsylvania School of Law as a Bok Visiting International Professor. I am thankful for this invitation and the opportunity for scientific exchange it offered, in particular to Stephen Morse, who for several years has been teaching a law and neuroscience seminar with me in Zurich.

Special thanks to Matt Gallaway for his interest in the project and persistent, patient support throughout the writing process. Jadyne Fauconier-Herry and Joshua

Acknowledgments

xiii

Penney offered much-appreciated help. John Stewart Marr made copy editing a smooth and sometimes funny exercise.

Georgia Strati had a profound impact on the genesis of the book. Moreover, her philological expertise was of great importance for the work on ancient sources.

The book incorporates some materials from Matthias Mahlmann, “Mind and Rights: Neuroscience, Philosophy, and the Foundations of Justice,” in *Law, Reason, and Emotion*, edited by M. N. S. Sellers, 80–137 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017), included by kind permission.

I would like to thank the Frobenius-Institut für Kulturanthropologische Forschung, the Goethe-Universität Frankfurt and Dr. Richard Kuba for the permission to use the cover image.

Parts of the poem *Santorini* by Giorgos Seferis are reproduced with Anna Lontou’s kind permission.

The open access publication of this book has been published with the generous support of the Swiss National Science Foundation.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-18422-0 — Mind and Rights
Matthias Mahlmann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
