

### DEMOCRATISING BEAUTY IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY BRITAIN

Could the self-interested pursuit of beauty actually help to establish the moral and political norms that enable democratic society to flourish? In this book, Lucy Hartley identifies a new language for speaking about beauty, which begins to be articulated from the 1830s in a climate of political reform and becomes linked to emerging ideals of equality, liberty, and individuality. Examining British art and art writing by Charles Lock Eastlake, John Ruskin, Walter Pater, Edward Poynter, William Morris, and John Addington Symonds, Hartley traces a debate about what it means to be interested in beauty and whether this preoccupation is necessary to public political life. Drawing together political history, art history, and theories of society and supplemented by numerous illustrations, *Democratising Beauty in Nineteenth-Century Britain* offers a fresh interdisciplinary understanding of the relation of art to its publics.

LUCY HARTLEY is Professor of English at the University of Michigan. She is the author of *Physiognomy and the Meaning of Expression in Nineteenth-Century Culture* (2001), and she has written essays on a wide range of subjects including intellectual history and art history, John Stuart Mill and Alexis de Tocqueville, and nineteenth-century aesthetic theories. She is the editor of *The History of British Women's Writing, 1830–1880* (forthcoming).



# CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY LITERATURE AND CULTURE

General editor
Gillian Beer, University of Cambridge

#### Editorial board

Isobel Armstrong, Birkbeck, University of London
Kate Flint, University of Southern California
Catherine Gallagher, University of California, Berkeley
D. A. Miller, University of California, Berkeley
J. Hillis Miller, University of California, Irvine
Daniel Pick, Birkbeck, University of London
Mary Poovey, New York University
Sally Shuttleworth, University of Oxford
Herbert Tucker, University of Virginia

Nineteenth-century British literature and culture have been rich fields for interdisciplinary studies. Since the turn of the twentieth century, scholars and critics have tracked the intersections and tensions between Victorian literature and the visual arts, politics, social organization, economic life, technical innovations, scientific thought — in short, culture in its broadest sense. In recent years, theoretical challenges and historiographical shifts have unsettled the assumptions of previous scholarly synthesis and called into question the terms of older debates. Whereas the tendency in much past literary critical interpretation was to use the metaphor of culture as 'background,' feminist, Foucauldian, and other analyses have employed more dynamic models that raise questions of power and of circulation. Such developments have reanimated the field. This series aims to accommodate and promote the most interesting work being undertaken on the frontiers of the field of nineteenth-century literary studies: work which intersects fruitfully with other fields of study such as history, or literary theory, or the history of science. Comparative as well as interdisciplinary approaches are welcomed.

A complete list of titles published will be found at the end of the book.



# DEMOCRATISING BEAUTY IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY BRITAIN

Art and the Politics of Public Life

LUCY HARTLEY





## **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge. It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

> www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107184084 DOI: 10.1017/9781316875131

> > © Lucy Hartley 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017 Reprinted 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Print on Demand, World Wide A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Hartley, Lucy, author.

TITLE: Democratising beauty in nineteenth-century Britain: art and the politics of public life / Lucy Hartley, University of Michigan.

DESCRIPTION: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Series: Cambridge studies in nineteenth-century literature and culture; 106 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017026023 | ISBN 9781107184084 (hardback)
SUBJECTS: LCSH: Art — Historiography. | Historiography — Great Britain — History — 19th
century. | Art and society — Great Britain — History — 19th century. | Civil society — Great
Britain — History — 19th century. | Great Britain — Intellectual life — 19th century. | BISAC:
LITERARY CRITICISM / European / English, Irish, Scottish, Welsh.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC N7485.G7 H37 2017 | DDC 701/.03—DC23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017026023

ISBN 978-1-107-18408-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To David Glover and Cora Kaplan



## Contents

List of Illustrations		<i>page</i> viii
Αι	cknowledgements	xi
	Introduction: Being Interested in Beauty	I
Ι	'Of Universal or National Interest': Charles Eastlake, the Fine Arts Commission, and the Reform of Taste	18
2	Reconstituting Publics for Art: John Ruskin and the Appeal to Enlightened Interest	64
3	The Pleasures and Perils of Self-Interest: Calculating the Passions in Walter Pater's Essays	109
4	Figuring the Individual in the Collective: The 'Art-politics' of Edward Poynter and William Morris	148
5	The Humanist Interest Old and New: John Addington Symonds and the Nature of Liberty	191
	Conclusion	227
Notes		234
Вi	Bibliography	
Index		2.87



## Illustrations

1	J. M. W. Turner. The Burning of the Houses of Partiament. ca.	page 20
	1834–1835. © Tate, London.	
2	John Partridge. The Fine Arts Commissioners. ca. 1846. © National	24
	Portrait Gallery, London.	
3	'Cartoon No. 1. Substance and Shadow.' Punch, or the London	28
	Charivari V (15 July 1843: 22). Reproduced by kind permission of the	
	University of Michigan Library, Ann Arbor.	
4	Charles Lock Eastlake. Napoleon Bonaparte on Board the	32
	'Bellerophon' in Plymouth Sound. 1815. © National Maritime	
	Museum, Greenwich, London.	
5	The Laocoön Group. First century CE. Vatican Museums. Photo	40
	credit: Alinari/Vatican Museums/Art Resource, NY.	
6	'Punch's Fine Art Exhibition.' Punch, or the London Charivari VII	55
	(13 July 1844: 28). Reproduced by kind permission of the University	
	of Michigan Library, Ann Arbor.	
7	William Dyce. The Baptism of Ethelbert. 1845. © Parliamentary Art	58
	Collection, London.	
8	Daniel Maclise. The Spirit of Chivalry. 1845. © Parliamentary Art	59
	Collection, London.	
9	'Punch's Cartoons. The Spirit of Chivalry of the House of	60
	Commons.' Punch, or the London Charivari IX (23 August 1845: 88).	
	Reproduced by kind permission of the University of Michigan	
	Library, Ann Arbor.	
Ю	J.M.W. Turner. Slave Ship (Slavers Throwing Overboard the Dead	65
	and Dying, Typhoon Coming On). 1840. © Museum of Fine Arts,	
	Boston.	
II	J. M. W. Turner. St. Mark's Place, Venice: Juliet and her Nurse,	68
	engraved by George Hollis. 1842. © Tate, London.	
	Ruskin's System of Beauty.	77
13	Jacopo Robusti Tintoretto. The Crucifixion. 1565. Scuola Grande di	80
	S. Rocco, Venice. Photo credit: Scala/Art Resource, NY.	
14	John Ruskin. 'The Vine: Free and in Service.' <i>The Stones of Venice II</i>	85
	(X.115). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of	
	Cambridge University Library.	

viii



	List of Illustrations	ix
15	'Good Civic Government, from the Fresco by Ambrogio Lorenzetti in the Palazzo Pubblico in Siena.' <i>The Political Economy of Art</i> (XVI.54). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of	97
16	Cambridge University Library.  J. M. W. Turner. <i>The Goddess of Discord Choosing the Apple of Contention in the Garden of the Hesperides</i> . 1806. © Tate, London.	103
17	Control of the second of the s	105
18	Aphrodite, called the Venus de Milo. ca. 100 BCE. © RMN-Grand Palais/Art Resource, NY.	118
19	The Parthenon Sculptures. 438 BCE-432 BCE. © Trustees of the British Museum, London.	120
20	Lysippos (school of). <i>Bronze Statue of a Young Man, so-called 'Praying Youth.' ca.</i> 315–286 BCE. Photo credit: bpk, Berlin/Staaliche Museen zu Berlin/Art Resource, NY.	121
21	Copy after Sandro Botticelli's <i>Birth of Venus</i> , by Cesare Mariannecci for the Arundel Society. 1868. © Victoria and Albert Museum, London.	130
22	Adolphe Braun. 'God Created Man.' (detail). <i>Rome Vatican Palace, Sistine Chapel Fresco by Michelangelo</i> . 1869. © RMN-Grand Palais/Art Resource, NY.	132
23	Simeon Solomon. <i>Bacchus. ca.</i> 1867. © Birmingham Museums and Art Gallery. Bridgeman Images, NY.	141
24	Alphonse Legros. <i>Le Coup de Vent</i> . 1875. Digital image courtesy of the Yale University Art Gallery, Open Content Program.	143
25	Edward J. Poynter. <i>Israel in Egypt.</i> 1867. © Guildhall Art Gallery, City of London. Bridgeman Images, NY.	151
26	John Tenniel. 'D'Israel-i in Triumph; or, the Modern Sphynx.' <i>Punch, or the London Charivari</i> 52 (15 June 1867: 246–247). Reproduced by kind permission of the University of Michigan Library, Ann Arbor.	154
27	Edward J. Poynter. <i>The Catapult ca.</i> 1868–1872. © Laing Art Gallery/ Tyne and Wear Archives & Museums. Bridgeman Images, NY.	155
28	(a) Edward J. Poynter. <i>The Festival</i> . 1875. © The Art Institute of Chicago. (b) Edward J. Poynter. <i>The Golden Age</i> . 1875. © The Art	163
29	Institute of Chicago. Adolphe Braun. Michelangelo's <i>Medici Tomb</i> . Florence. Digital image courtesy of the J. Paul Getty Art Museum, Open Content Program.	167
30	George du Maurier. 'À Fortiori.' <i>Punch, or the London Charivari</i> 76 (31 May 1879: 249). Reproduced by kind permission of the	179
31	University of Michigan Library, Ann Arbor.  Battle of the Nude Men, attributed to Antonio Pollaiuolo. ca.  1470–1500. © Victoria and Albert Museum, London.	206



X	List of Illustrations	
32	Luca Signorelli. <i>Madonna and Child with Allegorical Figures</i> . 1490–1495. © Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence. Bridgeman	207
33	Images, NY. Hippolyte Flandrin. <i>Nude Young Man Sitting at the Seashore.</i> 1836.	218
,,	Musée du Louvre, Paris. © RMN-Grand Palais, Paris/Art	
34	Resource, NY.  The Ildefonso Group. From the Museum at Madrid. Engraving.	222
	'Frontispiece.' Sketches and Studies in Italy and Greece. 1879.	
	Reproduced by kind permission of the University of Michigan Library, Ann Arbor.	
35	'Sent to Millbank.' Punch, or the London Charivari 102	231
	(17 December 1892: 267). Reproduced by kind permission of the University of Michigan Library, Ann Arbor.	



## Acknowledgements

This book has travelled many miles, literally going back and forth across the Atlantic and conceptually from its origin as a comparative study of John Ruskin and Walter Pater to its destination as a rather larger study of British art and art writing. In the process, I have been fortunate to have the support of some extraordinary friends and colleagues. Foremost among these are John Barrell, Gregg Crane, David Glover, Linda Gregerson, Cora Kaplan, and Marjorie Levinson. My debts here are immense: I thank them wholeheartedly for pushing the manuscript along in countless ways and also for their wise counsel, deep knowledge, and incredible generosity.

It is impossible to name all the friends and colleagues who have offered encouragement at different stages and different places in the life of this book. Nonetheless, I would like to express my gratitude to those who offered insights on chapter drafts and papers or who supported the book in formal and informal ways: Susanna Avery-Quash, Tim Barringer, Matthew Biro, Sara Blair, Joseph Bristow, Walter Cohen, Geoff Eley, Julie Ellison, Kate Flint, James Ford, Jonathan Freedman, Sandra Gunning, Harriet Guest, Daniel Hack, Paul Hamilton, Daniel Herwitz, Jane Johnson, John Kucich, Kerry Larson, Christina Lupton, Steven Mullaney, Anita Norich, Francis O'Gorman, Lara Perry, Adela Pinch, David Porter, Alex Potts, Yopie Prins, Michael Schoenfeldt, Jonah Siegel, Lindsay Smith, Sidonie Smith, Susan Siegfried, Martha Vicinus, and Alan Wald. I also thank students at Michigan from whom I have learnt a great deal and graduate members of the Nineteenth-Century Forum past and present including: Christie Allen, Anoff Cobblah, Pavel Godfrey, Jenny Kohn, Elizabeth McAdams, Ross Martin, Ji-Hyae Park, Sheshalatha Reddy, Michael Tondre, and Pamela Wolpert. Jenny Kohn and Anoff Cobblah are due especial thanks: Jenny for her valuable research assistance and specifically in cataloguing the Parliamentary Papers, and Anoff for his equally valuable work in preparing the index.

I could not wish for better editors than Linda Bree and Emily Hockley or a better series editor than Gillian Beer; I thank them for never faltering on their belief in this book and thank Linda, in particular, for deftly ushering the book through the review and editorial process. My deep thanks are also due to the readers of the manuscript: without their astute suggestions,



xii

#### Acknowledgements

I might still be stuck on a number of questions and problems; I hope what follows goes a little way to repay my debt to them.

This book was supported in an earlier stage by a research grant from the Arts and Humanities Research Board. At Michigan, I received research support from the Department of English Language and Literature, the College of Literature, Science, and the Arts (LSA), and the Rackham Graduate School. Furthermore, the Institute for Humanities awarded me a fellowship at a crucial point in my research, and the Office of Research and LSA awarded me a publication subvention for the illustrations. I also thank the librarians at the Bodleian Library, the House of Commons Library, the Huntington Library, the National Art Library at the Victoria and Albert Museum, and the Royal Academy of Arts Library as well as the University of Michigan Library.

Family takes on a different meaning when you move to a new country. I have been welcomed into the homes of Theresa, Phillip, and Zoe Middleton and of the late Paul Devlin; they offered solace in the cold Michigan winters and wonderful cheer for which I will always be grateful. I am also grateful to Leigh Lewis for a formidable friendship: her infectious enthusiasm, brilliant humour, and wonderful generosity find few parallels. This book would not, however, have been possible without my actual family in Britain: Winifred and Keith Hartley; Adam, Rachel, Oliver, and Imogen Hartley; and Cecilia, Martyn, Matthew, Katie, and Sophie Ellis – I could not have done it without you.

I dedicate this book to David and Cora: they were with me at the beginning of my academic life, helped smooth my transition to Michigan, and remain my most valued persons for all things academic today.