

INDEX

'Abu Qatada' affair, 285-286 religious discrimination under, ACHR. See American Convention on Human Rights activism. See judicial activism African Union (AU), 145 age discrimination, in UK, 119-122, ECJ rulings on, 119-122 under Equal Treatment Directive, 119-122 LPC and, 119-121 under NMW Act, 119-120 American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR), 77, 145, 250-251. See also Inter-American Court of Human Rights American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man, 250-251 Animal Defenders International v UK, 9, 41, 137, 349-350 anti-discrimination law, in EU, 118-128 for age discrimination, in UK, 119-122, 129 ECJ rulings on, 119-122 under Equal Treatment in Employment Directive, 119–122 LPC and, 119-121 under NMW Act, 119-120 CoE guidelines for, 118–119 under EC Treaty, 118-119 in ECtHR, 118-119, 123-125, 127-128 **Equal Treatment in Employment** Directive, 118-119 age discrimination under, 119-122

123-125 for ethnic discrimination against Roma people, in France, 125-128, 129 under Besson laws, 126 ECtHR judgments on, 127–128 under Racial Equality Directive, under EU Charter of Fundamental Rights, 118-119 under European Convention, 118 Racial Equality Directive, 118–119 for ethnic discrimination against Roma people, 126, 127 for religious discrimination, in France, 362 for religious discrimination, in Germany, 122-125, 129 BVerfG rulings on, 122-123 civil society organizations' support of, 124 CoE guidelines on, 123-125 ECtHR rulings on, 123–125 under Equal Treatment in Employment Directive, 123–125 Anti-Terrorism Crime and Security Act 2001, 217, 220 appreciation. See margin of appreciation AU. See African Union authority exceeding authority scenarios, 279, 281, 288 of IHRCs, 305-306, 308-320 amelioration as response to, 315-316



INDEX 389

democratic restraint as response
to, 318–320
ecological legitimacy of, 326
limits of, 312–313
reliance upon consent as response
to, 316–317
states' disobeying of, 320–321,
322–327
normal justification thesis of, 320
autonomy, of law, 172
Azerbaijan, parliamentary compliance
with human rights norms, 80

balancing of power, as parliamentary function, 32-33 Bates, Ed. 307-308, 332 Besson, Samantha, 319, 344 Besson laws, 126 Blair, Tony, 214 Bosnia-Herzegovina deliberative model of democracy in, 62 human rights violations in, 66-68 Bradley, Karen, 100 Bratza, Nicolas, 89-90, 99 Brazil deliberative model of democracy in, 62-63human rights violations in, 68-70 Bundesverfassungsgericht (BVerfG) non-compliance with ECtHR judgments, 332-333 religious discrimination rulings, 122-123

Cal, Danila, 63
Cameron, David, 278
capital. See political capital
CEDAW. See Convention on the
Elimination of All Forms of
Discrimination against Women
censorship laws, 266
CERD. See Committee on the
Elimination of Racial
Discrimination
Chamberlain, Joseph, 201
citizens, referenda on human rights by
deliberations of, 59–61, 66–67, 72

in Italy, 71 in Switzerland, 72 citizenship rights, in Dominican Republic, 250, 261 registry of foreigners, 262 Civil Contingencies Act 2004, 203 civil disobedience, 336-351 avoidance of injury to innocents during, 347-348 defining characteristics of, 338–339 by domestic parliaments, 350-351 ECHR and, 337 against ICs, 337-338, 340-344 acceptance of remedies, 344 by domestic parliaments, 350-351 international norms influenced bv, 343 non-violence in, 343 public acknowledgment of, 343 IHRJ responses to, 383-385 justifications for, 336-337, 339-340, 344 - 348after failure of normal appeals, after violation of normative principles, 345-346 limits of, destabilization of society as factor in, 346-347 scope of conditions for, 338-339 as theory, development of, 338-340 civil law systems, IHRCs and, 310 civil society actors compliance with human rights law by, 83 international human rights law influenced by, 116 religious discrimination laws and, in Germany, 124 CoE. See Council of Europe coercive techniques, 211-212 Colombia deliberative model of democracy in, 61 - 62human rights violations in, 63-66 Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), 365-366

common law systems, IHRCs and, 310



390 INDEX

compliance, parliamentary role in. See processes for, 79-82 also non-compliance purpose and functions of, 75-76 under American Convention on rationalism and, 75-76 Human Rights, 77 status of international bodies as Animal Defenders International factor in, 79 v UK, 9, 41, 137, 349-350 structures for, 79-82 in Ukraine, 80 in Azerbaijan, 80 constitutional theory, 358 capacity for, 79-89 executive role in, 84-85 constitutionalism independent advice provisions in, cosmopolitan paradigm of, 325 in Dominican Republic, 263 82 - 84through civil society actors, 83 political constitutionalist CoE bodies and, 82-83, 89-95 principles, 312 Commissioner for Human Constitutive Act of African Union, 145 Rights, 89 constructivism, 75-76 Committee of Ministers, 93–95 consultation, 71, 72, 163 ECHR, 75, 82-83 Convention on the Elimination of All ECtHR and, 82-83, 87, 136-137 Forms of Discrimination PACE, 77, 90-93 against Women (CEDAW), constructivism and, 75-76 136-137 ECtHR and, 82-83, 87, 136-137 IHRJ and, 9-10, 162-164, 365-366 contextual factors for, 103–106 Convention on the Rights of the Child incidental factors for, 103-104 (CRC), 162–164, 366 inherent factors for, 98-103 cosmopolitanism constitutionalism and, 325 judgments by, 99-103 salient factors for, 97-106 legal, 305 effectiveness of, assessments of, Council of Europe (CoE), 40–41, 322. 85-89 See also anti-discrimination in France, 80 law; Parliamentary Assembly of IACtHR and, 77 the Council of Europe IACtHR cases and, 252-253 IHRJ and, 148-149, 358-363 implementation of, 75 parliamentary compliance and, with through cross-cutting approaches, human rights norms, 82-83, 89-95 domestic systems of, 85 Commissioner for Human institutional models for, 80-81 Rights, 89 IPU obligations, 77 Committee of Ministers, 93–95 in Italy, 79 ECHR, 75, 82-83 through JCHR, 79-80, 86 ECtHR and, 82-83, 87, 136-137 NGOs and, 76-77 PACE, 77, 90-93 NHRIs and, 76-77 separation of powers and, 358-363 in oversight approaches to human courts. See domestic courts; national rights, 51 courts CRC. See Convention on the Rights of in goal-based models, 45-46 partial, 75 the Child in Poland, 79 Cruz, Márcia, 63 through political will, 95-106 Cyprus, ECHR in, 206-207



INDEX 391

Davis, David, 287–288, 289	as expanded power, 283-285
declaratory approach, in ECtHR	from 1960s to present, 282–283
judgments, 226–228	in UK, 285–286
Defence of the Realms Act, 202–203	IHRCs and, 313
deference	international law and, 278-279
ECtHR case law on, 11	prisoner voting and, international
IACtHR practice of, 16	law and, 278-279
in IHRJ evaluative practices, 372–376	derogation provisions under ECHR,
margin of appreciation and, 114-115	UK and, 199–200
by state governments, 137	adaptation to, 204–209
subsidiarity principle and, 114–115	colonial authorities during,
deliberation, of human rights	205–207
protections, 59-61, 66-67, 72	under Anti-Terrorism Crime and
deliberative model of democracy,	Security Act 2001, 217
59-60	decline of, 216-220
in Bosnia-Herzegovina, 62	emergency powers, during wartime
in Brazil, 62–63	200-204
in Colombia, 61–62	historical development of,
in Italy, 71	201–202
methodology for, random walk	legalisation of, 209–216
method, 62	right to life limitations under,
in Switzerland, 72	209–210
democracy	for terrorist violence, 210,
deliberative model of, 59-60	211–212
in Bosnia-Herzegovina, 62	future of, 221–222
in Brazil, 62–63	under Human Rights Act, 217
in Colombia, 61–62	martial law, 200-204
in Italy, 71	historical development of,
in Switzerland, 72	201–203
effective political, 170–171, 173	in Northern Ireland, 210–213
human rights protections and,	as political decisions, 207–208
oversight approaches to, 42-43	Al-Qaeda threat and, 216–218
democratic constitutionalist claims,	Dickson, Brice, 210
310–315, 320–321	discrimination. See anti-discrimination
in Europe, 313–314	law
in Latin America, 313–314	disobedience. See civil disobedience
political constitutionalist principles	domestic courts, 179–182
in conflict with, 312	control of parliaments by, 191–192
potency of, 314–315	enabling and complementing
rule of law and, 327	behaviours towards
in Russia, 313–314	parliaments, 187–189
states' disobeying of, 320–321,	IHRJ and, 371–372
322–327	interactions with parliaments,
in UK, 311–312	182–196
democratic override	complementing actions in,
ECHR and, 277–281	183–189
historical development of, 281–286	controlling actions in, 189–192
early years of, 281-282	enabling actions in, 183–189



392 INDEX

domestic courts (cont.) ECommHR. See European respect in, 192-196 Commission of Human Rights national legal framework for, 179-181 ECtHR. See European Court of Human non-compliance of, 182 parliamentary control of, 189-191 Ecuador, censorship laws in, 266 parliamentary respect of, 193-194 effective political democracy, 170-171, 173 parliaments enabling and effectiveness of organizations, for complementing of, 183-187 parliaments respected by, 194-196 human rights protections, 35-36 principle of non-retroactivity for, 180 for compliance proportionality analysis by, 181 goal-based approach to, 45-46 remedies for, effectiveness of, 181-182 by parliamentary bodies, 85-89 respect for parliaments, 194-196 defined, 35 domestic governments. See also ECtHR, 23-25 parliaments goal-based approach to, 35, 44-47 compliance with human rights advantages of, 44-45 norms, 85 compliance in, 45-46 ECtHR judgments and, role in, functions of, 44 227-228 IHRJ, 353 subsidiarity principle and, 239 legitimacy approach, 35 human rights protection definitions of, 47-48 interventions by, 3 through peer-review international human rights norms procedures, 48 and, 76 through stakeholders, 48 domestic laws. See also domestic courts multiple-constituencies approach, 35 ECtHR legality and, in conformity of organizations, 35 with, 184-186 stakeholders and, 49-50 goals of, 49-50 obligations to 'secure' rights of ECHR under, 171-172 legitimacy approach through, 48 domestic parliaments. See parliaments embeddedness, principle of, Dominican Republic 146-147, 357 citizenship rights in, 250, 261 emergency powers, during wartime, registry of foreigners, 262 200 - 204constitutionalism in, 263 historical development of, 201-202 IACtHR jurisdiction in, 249-250, legalisation of, 209-216 261-263 right to life limitations under, 209-210 parliamentary lessons learned for terrorist violence, 210, 211-212 from, 263-267 Emergency Powers Act 1920, 203 for violations of human rights, emerging democracies, ECHR system 261-263 in, 326 Migration Law in, 262 **Equal Treatment in Employment** Dyzenhaus, David, 221 Directive, 118-119 age discrimination under, 119-122 EC Treaty. See European Community religious discrimination under, Treaty 123-125 ECHR. See European Convention on ethnic discrimination, in France, against

Human Rights

ECJ. See European Court of Justice

Roma people, 125-128, 129

under Besson laws, 126



INDEX 393

ECtHR judgments on, 127–128 under Racial Equality Directive, 126, 127 EU. See European Union EU Charter of Fundamental Rights, 118 - 119European Commission of Human Rights (ECommHR), 94 European Community (EC) Treaty, 118-119 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), 118. See also derogation provisions under ECHR; obligations to 'secure' rights of ECHR civil disobedience and, 337 in Cyprus, 206-207 dangers to authority of, 297-301 democracy protections under, 23-25 democratic rejection of, 297-301 derogation provisions, 221-222 domestic laws and, 171-172 early scepticism towards, 198 in emerging democracies, 326 enforcement of judgments, 297-301 exceeding authority scenarios and, 279, 281, 288 functions of, 21-23, 136 human rights protections under, 23 - 25IHRCs, 308 IHRJ and, 2, 154-156 incorporation into legal systems, 319 in Kenya, 205-207 as law-making treaty, 279 national laws incompatible with, 29 - 30as pan-European constitutional court, 305 parliamentary compliance with human rights norms under, 75, 82 - 83preamble of, 23 proportionality test for, 27 separation of powers through, 30-31 SIHRL frameworks, 304-308 state ratification of, 319

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR). See also obligations to 'secure' rights of ECHR anti-discrimination laws in, 118-119 for ethnic discrimination, in France, 127-128 for religious discrimination, in Germany, 123-125 autonomous notion of law in, 172 binding judgments of, 24-25 declaratory approach of, 226-228 domestic laws and, conformity with, 184-186 effectiveness of, 23-25 Execution of Punishments and Pre-Trial Detention Act of 2009 and, 228 functions of, 21-23, 136 human rights protections and, 39-41 challenges for, 144-145 parliamentary role in, 33 identification of features of, 354-355 IHRJ and, 2, 154-156, 157-158 implementation of judgments, 223-225 assessment of, categories in, 223-224 declaratory approach to, 226-228 domestic actors' role in, 227-228 prescriptive approach to, 224-225, 226-228 judicial review by, 30-31 jurisprudence approaches of, 29, 30 legislation, in judicial guidance, 228-236 content of, 232-235 demands for, 229-231 as solution to problem, 229-235 as source of problem, 228-229 timing of, 235-236 margin of appreciation of, 114-115 national constitutional organs reviewed by, 25-26 national courts and, 28-30 national legislatures reviewed by, 26-28



394

(ECtHR) (cont.)

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-18374-2 — The International Human Rights Judiciary and National Parliaments: Europe and Beyond Edited by Matthew Saul , Andreas Follesdal , Geir Ulfstein Index More Information

INDEX

deference, 372-376

BVerfG in, religious discrimination

rulings by, 122-123

122-125, 129

of, 124

religious discrimination laws in,

BVerfG rulings on, 122-123

CoE guidelines on, 123-125

ECtHR rulings on, 123-125

under Equal Treatment in

civil society organizations' support

Employment Directive, 123–125

non-compliance with judgments, in domestic court contexts, 371-372 329-338, 348-350. See also civil interpretation, 369-372 disobedience specification of remedies, 376-378 by ICs, 330-335 exceeding authority scenarios, 279, in prisoner voting cases, 348-349 281, 288 Execution of Punishments and Pretypes of cases as factor in, 335-338 varieties of, 331-335 Trial Detention Act of 2009, 228 non-prescriptive approach of, executives benefits and risks of, 239-246 as IHRJ interlocutor, 368-369 critical backlash, 242-243 in parliaments for legislative guidance, 240-244 compliance with human rights norms by, 84-85 non-specificity of violations and, 241 role in human rights for time limits, 244-246 protections, 142 overlegislation in, 229 Fenwick, Helen, 219 parliamentary compliance with human rights norms and, Follesdal, Andreas, 358 82-83, 87, 136-137 France contextual factors for, 103-106 ECHR derogation provisions in, incidental factors for, 103-104 221-222 inherent factors for, 98-103 ethnic discrimination in, against judgments for, 99-103 Roma people, 125–128, 129 salient factors for, 97–106 under Besson laws, 126 prescriptive approach of, 224-225, ECtHR judgments on, 127–128 226-228, 246-247 under Racial Equality Directive, proportionality test for, 27, 184-186 126, 127 quasi-pilot judgments, 101 parliamentary compliance with human rights norms, 80 on Russian law, non-compliance of, 192 religious discrimination in, 362 separation of powers through, 30-31 Franck, Thomas, 333 subsidiarity principle and, freedom of expression, 155 compatibility with, 236-239, Fribergh, Erik, 89-90 356-358 Frowein, Jochem, 281 domestic bodies and, 239 intervention level of, 239 Gardbaum, Stephen, 325 operationalization of, 238-239 Germany

European Court of Justice (ECJ), anti-

anti-discrimination law

emerging democracies in, ECHR

democratic constitutionalist claims

international human rights law in, 114

evaluative practices, for IHRJ, 369-378

European Union (EU). See also

in, 313-314

system in, 326

discrimination rulings, for age

discrimination, in UK, 119-122



> INDEX 395

goal-based approach, to organizational effectiveness, 35, 44-47 advantages of, 44-45 compliance in, 45-46 functions of, 44 Habermas, Jürgen, 60 Hirst, John, 293, 294. See also prisoner voting Hirst v UK. See also prisoner disenfranchisement criticism of, 295-297 legal foundations for, 290-295 legitimacy of, 289-290 long-term impact of, 298 MPs on, 286-289, 299-301 overview of, 275-277 HRA. See Human Rights Act HRC. See UN Human Rights Committee Human Rights Act (HRA) (UK), 29, 217, 278 human rights protections. See also compliance; effectiveness of organizations; international human rights; oversight approaches, for human rights committees for, tools of, 37 deliberation of, by citizens, 59-61, 66-67, 72 domestic government interventions in, 3 domestic parliaments and, role of, 8-11, 32-37, 139-140, 141-143. See also effectiveness, of organizations constitutional theory and, 358 ECtHR and, 33 iceberg phenomenon and, 36 implementation strategies of, 33 oversight mechanisms of, 34 scope of work on, 36-37 in Dominican Republic, 261-263 under ECHR, 23-25 under international standards, 40 ECtHR and, 39-41

executive role in, within parliaments, 142 IACtHR and, in Dominican Republic, 261-263 IHRJ and, role of parliaments for, 2-8, 139-151 challenges for, 144-147 embeddedness principle and, 146-147 incentives for, 143-144 modes of operation for, 151-164 subsidiarity principle and, 146-147 independent oversight bodies for, 33 international legal machinery for, 2-8 international standards for, 37-41 ECHR, 40 ECtHR, 39-41 HRC and, 38-39 OHCHR, 38-39 PACE and, 39–40 IPU and, 1, 37 legitimacy of, 140 NHRIs and, 33, 36-37 rapporteur and, 37 human rights violations. See also human rights protections in Bosnia-Herzegovina, 66-68 in Brazil, 68-70 in Colombia, 63-66 Hunt, Murray, 6, 81, 369 Hurd, Douglas, 213-214 IACtHR. See Inter-American Court of

Human Rights IASHR. See Inter-American system of human rights ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights iceberg phenomenon, 36 ICs. See international courts IHRCs. See international human rights courts IHRJ. See international human rights judiciary ILO. See International Labour

challenges for, 144-145

parliamentary role in, 33



396 INDEX

Inter-American system of human rights immigration legislation, in UK, 283 implementation (IASHR), 250-261 of compliance, 75 backlog of cases for, 248 domestic systems of, 85 development of, 251 under domestic parliaments, human domestic resistance to, 248-250, rights protections by, 33 IHRJ and, 248-249 of ECtHR judgments, 223-225 judicial activism of, 249-250 assessment of, categories in, 223-224 in Latin America, 251 declaratory approach to, 226-228 OAS and, 250-251 domestic actors' role in, 227-228 international courts (ICs) prescriptive approach to, 224-225, civil disobedience against, 337-338, 226-228 340-344 of supportive subsidiarity, 358 acceptance of remedies and, 344 incompatibility costs, of international by domestic parliaments, 350-351 international norms influenced human rights law, 116 Inter-American Court of Human by, 343 Rights (IACtHR), 77 non-violence in, 343 advisory opinions in, 253-254, public acknowledgment of, 343 258-261, 265-267 non-compliance with ECtHR compliance levels in, 252-253 judgments, 330-335 contentious cases in, 251-253 International Covenant on Civil and domestic parliaments and, Political Rights (ICCPR), 2 255-258 international economic bodies, IHRJ domestic resistance to, 267 and, 149-151 international human rights courts in Dominican Republic jurisdiction of, 249-250, 261-263 (IHRCs). See also European parliamentary lessons learned Court of Human Rights; Interfrom, 263-267 American Court of Human for violations of human rights, Rights 261-263 authority of, 305-306, 308-320 IHRJ and, 367-368 amelioration as response to, judicial activism of, 249-250 315-316 jurisdiction of, 252 democratic restraint as response in Latin America, 251 to, 318-320 margins doctrine and, 253 ecological legitimacy of, 326 parliaments in, challenges and limits of, 312-313 opportunities for, 255–261, reliance upon consent as response 268-269 to, 316-317 states' disobeying of, 320-321, advisory opinions and, 258-261, 265-267 322 - 327contentious litigation and, 255-258 binding judgments of, 307-308 specificity of demands for, 257-258 in civil law systems, 310 state procedures for, quality of, in common law systems, 310 256-257 democratic constitutionalist ratification of, 252 objections, 310-315 reforms for, 252 global context for, 311-312, withdrawal of, 249 313-314



INDEX 397

political constitutionalist principles in conflict with, 312 potency of, 314-315 rule of law and, 327 states' disobeying of, 320-321, 322 - 327democratic override and, 313 ECHR and, 308 functions of, 325 heterarchical nature of, 306 mandate abuse claims, 309-310 national authorities and, tensions between, 306-307 national constitutional systems influenced by, 324 SIHRL frameworks and, 305-308, 314, 315-316, 318-319 states' acceptance of, 310 international human rights judiciary (IHRJ), 1. See also European Court of Human Rights advisory opinions and, 367–368 breakdown in relationships and, response strategies for, 379-385 causes of, 379-381 challenges with, 383-385 with civil disobedience, 383-385 justification of, 381-383 CEDAW and, 9-10, 162-164, 365-366 CoE and, 148-149 ECHR and, 2, 154-156 ECtHR and, 2, 154-156, 157-158 effectiveness of, 353 evaluative practices for, 369-378 deference, 372-376 in domestic court contexts, 371 - 372interpretation, 369-372 specification of remedies, 376-378 executives as interlocutors with, 368-369 human rights promotion by, 2-8, 139 - 151challenges in, 144-147 embeddedness principle and, 146-147 incentives for, 143-144

modes of operation for, 151-164 subsidiarity principle and, 146-147 IACtHR and, 367-368 IASHR and, 248-249 ICCPR and, 2 international economic bodies and, 149-151 international human rights law and, 115 international parliamentary bodies and, 148-149 interpretative practices of, 152-156 for freedom of expression, 155 for political communication, 155-156 for structural arrangements, 153-154 for working conditions, 154-156 IPU and, 148, 387 judicial bodies in, 10-11 legitimacy of, 353 margin of appreciation and, 155, 159 modes of reasoning for, 156-160 ECtHR and, 157-158 empowerment through, 163-164 margin of appreciation in, 159 practices in, 157-158 scope for development, 158-160 PACE and, 148-149, 387 parliamentary relationships with, organisation of, 385-387 contextual sensitivity in, 387 coordination of connections, 386-387 through supportive subsidiarity, 386 prisoner voting and, 381–382 procedural practices of, for human rights protections, 363-365 in contentious cases, 364-365 quasi-judicial bodies in, 10-11 reporting processes for, 160-164, 365 - 367CEDAW and, 162-163 CRC and, 162-164 parliamentary role in, 161-163 research issues for, 8-11



INDEX

398 (IHRJ) (cont.) functions of, 135-136 role and function of, 136-138 IHRJ and, 148, 387 separation of powers and, 354-358 interpretation practices, of IHRJ, 152-156 CoE and, 358-363 for freedom of expression, 155 human rights protections through, for political communication, 155-156 358-363 for structural arrangements, 153-154 PACE and, 358-360 for working conditions, 154-156 IPU. See Inter-Parliamentary Union strands of inquiry for, 4 international human rights law. See also Irish War of Independence, 202 anti-discrimination law Italy civil society as influence on, 116 deliberative model of democracy clarity of, 114 parliamentary compliance with domestic government responses to, 76 human rights norms, 79 in EU, 114 IHRJ and, 115, 146-147 Jaramillo, Maria Clara, 61 incompatibility costs of, 116 Joint Committee on Human Rights IPU and, 148-149 (JCHR) (UK), 79-80, 86 legal experts on, 116 judicial activism, 249-250 MPs' embrace of, 112-113 national parliaments and, 111-113 Kahn, Paul, 327 application of human rights by, Kenya, ECHR in, 205-207 113-116 Krause, Sharon R., 67 four identifiable roles of, 111-112 Krommendijk, Jasper, 365–366 interpretation of human rights by, Kyritsis, Dimitrios, 361–362 113-116 Latin America political motivations of, 112–113 obligations of, 114-115 Colombia deference to state in, 114-115 deliberative model of democracy escape clauses as influence on, 115 in, 61-62 margin of appreciation in, 114-115 human rights violations in, 63-66 subsidiarity and, 114-115, democratic constitutionalist claims 146-147, 356-358 in, 313-314 precision of, 114-115 Ecuador, censorship laws in, 266 IACtHR in, 251 research design on, 116-118 cross-national variations and, 117 IASHR in, 251 data analysis for, 128-131 Venezuela, broadcasting licenses data resources in, 117-118 in, 256 with process-tracing method, 117 Le Borgn', Pierre-Yves, 80 International Labour Organization legal cosmopolitanism, 305 (ILO), 70 legal insiders, 96 international parliamentary bodies, legal outsiders, 96 IHRJ and, 148-149. See also legislation. See also domestic courts; Inter-Parliamentary Union domestic laws; overlegislation internment, 211-213 ECtHR, judicial guidance for, 228-236 Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), 1, 37,51-53content factors for, 232-235 compliance obligations of, 77 demands for legislation, 229-231



INDEX 399

as solution to problem, 229–235
as source of problem, 228–229
timing of legislation, 235–236
legitimacy
of domestic legislatures, 194
of human rights law, 140
of IHRJ, 353
reflective, 159
legitimacy approach, to organizational
effectiveness, 35, 47–48
definitions of, 47–48
through peer-review procedures, 48
through stakeholders, 48
Low Pay Commission (LPC), 119–121
Maia, Rousiley, 63
Mameli, Simona, 62
mandate abuse claims, 309–310

Maia, Rousilev, 63 Mameli, Simona, 62 mandate abuse claims, 309-310 margin of appreciation by acts of legislature, 27 deference and, 114-115 for ECtHR, 114-115 IHRJ and, 155, 159 in international human rights law, 114-115 prisoner voting and, 303 margins doctrine, 253 Marsteintredet, Leiv, 367 martial law, 200-204 historical development of, 201-203 members of parliament (MPs), 275 international human rights law and, 112 - 113prisoner voting and, 286-297 criticism of, 295-297 democratic rejection of, 298-301 legal foundations for, 290-295 legal impasse for, 298-299 legitimacy of, 289-290 overview of, 275-277 Migration Law, 262 MPs. See members of parliament multiple-constituencies approach, to

national constitutional systems, 324 national courts. *See also* domestic courts ECtHR review of, 28–30

organizational effectiveness, 35

National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs), 33, 36-37 compliance with human rights norms and, 76-77 national laws, ECHR incompatibility with, 29-30 National Minimum Wage (NMW) Act, 119 - 120negative subsidiarity, 358 NGOs. See non-governmental organizations NHRIs. See National Human Rights Institutions NMW Act. See National Minimum Wage Act non-compliance, with ECtHR judgments, 329-338, 348-350 by ICs, 330-335 in prisoner voting cases, 348-349 types of cases as factor in, 335-338 varieties of, 331-335 non-governmental organizations (NGOs), compliance and,

non-prescriptive approach, in ECtHR judgments, 239–246 critical backlash as result of, 242–243 for legislative guidance, 240–244 non-specificity of violations and, 241 time limits in, 244–246 non-retroactivity, principle of, 180 normal justification thesis, 320 Northern Ireland, ECHR derogations in, 210–213 coercive and torture techniques under, 211–212 for internment actions, 211–213 Norwegian Human Rights Act, 29

OAS. See Organisation of American States obligations to 'secure' rights of ECHR. See also domestic courts defined, 167–168 under domestic laws, 171–172, 173–174 domestic remedies for, effectiveness of, 174–179



400 INDEX

obligations to 'secure' (cont.) access to, 176-177 content and substance of, 178-179 judicial, 175-176 legality standards for, 177-178 interactions between domestic courts and parliaments, 182-196 complementing behaviours in, 183-189 controlling behaviours in, 189-192 enabling behaviours in, 183-189 respect in, 192-196 for parliaments, 170-179. See also parliaments national legal framework for, 171 - 174scope of, 168 O'Cinneide, Colm, 332, 381 OECD. See Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), 38–39 Organisation of American States (OAS), 250–251, 322, 367 Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), 149–150 overlegislation, in ECtHR, 229 override. See democratic override oversight approaches, for human rights, 42-54 barriers to effective engagement in, 42 - 43compliance in, 51 in goal-based models, 45-46 democracy as factor in, 42-43 draft outline for, 55-58 composition of mechanisms in, 57-58 functions of mechanisms in, 56-57 methods of operation in, 57-58 responsibility and functions in, 56 - 57responsibility of mechanisms in, 56 - 57effectiveness of, determinations of, 43-44 goal-based models, 44-47

advantages of, 44-45 compliance in, 45-46 effectiveness of, 45 functions of, 44 legitimacy as, 47-48 definitions of, 47-48 through peer-review procedures, 48 through stakeholders, 48 mission statements for, 46-47 operating principles for, 50-53 by parliaments external factors for, 54 internal factors for, 53-54 stakeholders in, 49-50 goals of, 49-50 legitimacy through, 48 subsidiarity in, 42

Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE), 1, 8-9 functions of, 135-136 human rights protections and, international standards for, 39 - 40IHRJ and, 148-149, 358-360, 387 parliamentary compliance and, with human rights norms, 77, 90–93 resolutions of, 224 separation of powers and, 358-360 parliamentary sovereignty, 296-297 parliaments, domestic. See also compliance; effectiveness of organizations; oversight approaches, for human rights balance of power as function of, 32 - 33civil disobedience by, 350-351 domestic, 8-11 domestic courts controlled by, 189-191 domestic courts enabled and complemented by, 183-187 domestic courts' respect of, 194-196 domestic courts respected by, 193-194 in effective political democracies, 170 - 171



INDEX 401

human rights protections by, 8-11, 32-37, 139-140, 141-143 constitutional theory and, 358 ECtHR and, 33 effectiveness of organization in, 35 - 36iceberg phenomenon and, 36 implementation strategies of, 33 oversight mechanisms for, 34, 42 - 54scope of work on, 36-37 in IACtHR, challenges and opportunities for, 255-261, 268-269 advisory opinions and, 258-261, 265-267 contentious litigation and, 255-258 specificity of demands for, 257-258 state procedures for, quality of, 256-257 interactions with domestic courts, 182 - 196complementing actions in, 183 - 189controlling actions in, 189-192 enabling actions in, 183-189 respect in, 192-196 international human rights and, 111-113 application of, 113-116 four identifiable roles of parliament in, 111-112 interpretation of, 113-116 political motivations of parliament for, 112–113 obligations to 'secure' rights of ECHR for, 170-179 national legal framework for, 171 - 174partial compliance, 75 Phillipson, Gavin, 219 Pierre, Juliana Deguis, 262 Poland, parliamentary compliance with human rights norms, 79 political capital, 95 political communications, 155-156

executive dominance in, 142

political constitutionalist principles, 312 political expediency, 198 popular sovereignty, 319 positive subsidiarity, 146, 357 embeddedness principle and, 357 prescriptive approach, in ECtHR judgments, 224-225, 226-228, 246-247 principle of non-retroactivity. See non-retroactivity prisoner disenfranchisement, 288-289 prisoner voting democratic override and, international law and, 278-279 IHRI and, 381-382 long-term impact of, 298 margin of appreciation and, 303 non-compliance with ECtHR judgments on, 348-349 subsidiarity principle and, 303 in UK, 286-297 criticism of, 295-297 legal foundations for, 290-295 legitimacy of, 289–290 MPs on, 286-289, 299-301 overview of, 275–277 process-tracing method, 117 proportionality test for ECHR, 27 in obligations to 'secure' rights of, 181 in ECtHR legislation, 27, 184-186 Al-Qaeda, 216-218. See also terrorism quasi-pilot judgments, 101 Racial Equality Directive, 118–119 for ethnic discrimination against Roma people, 126, 127 random walk method, 62 rapporteur, 37

for ethnic discrimination against
Roma people, 126, 127
random walk method, 62
rapporteur, 37
rationalism, compliance and, 75–76
Rawls, John, 60, 336–344. See also civil
disobedience
reasoning modes, for IHRJ, 156–160
ECtHR and, 157–158
empowerment through, 163–164



402 INDEX

reasoning modes, for IHRJ (cont.) separation of powers margin of appreciation in, 159 central foundations of, 354 practices in, 157-158 defined, 21 scope for development, 158-160 through ECHR, 30-31 reflective legitimacy, 159 through ECtHR, 30-31 religious discrimination IHRJ as part of, 354–358 in France, 362 CoE and, 358-363 in Germany, 122-125, 129 human rights protections through, BVerfG rulings on, 122-123 358-363 civil society organizations' support PACE and, 358-360 rule of law and, 22-23 of, 124 supportive subsidiarity and, 354-358 CoE guidelines on, 123-125 ECtHR rulings on, 123-125 Shany, Yuval, 35 under Equal Treatment in SIHRL frameworks. See 'strong' Employment Directive, 123-125 international human rights law remedies frameworks iudicial, 175-176 Simpson, Brian, 202-203 in obligations to 'secure' rights of sovereignty ECHR, effectiveness of, 174-179 parliamentary, 296-297 access to, 176-177 popular, 319 content and substance of, 178-179 Special Powers Act, 210 legality standards for, 177-178 stakeholders, 49–50 specification of, IHRJ and, 376–378 goals of, 49-50 reporting processes, for IHRJ, 160-164, in legitimacy approach, 48 365-367 Steiner, Jurg, 362–363 CEDAW and, 162-163 Strasbourg Court. See democratic CRC and, 162-164 override; European Convention parliamentary role in, 161-163 on Human Rights research design, for international Strässer, Christoph, 93 Straw, Jack, 278, 287-288 human rights law, 116-118 'strong' international human rights law cross-national variations and, 117 data analysis of, 128-131 (SIHRL) frameworks, 304–308 functions of, 325 data resources in, 117-118 with process-tracing method, 117 IHRCs and, 305-308, 314, 315-316, Restoration of Order In Ireland Act, 318-319 202-203 legal cosmopolitanism and, 305 right to life limitations, 209-210 national legal systems and, 306-307 Roberts Lyer, Kirsten, 36–37, 53, 360–361 popular sovereignty and, 319 Rubenfeld, Jed, 313-314 as statist paradigm, 305-308 rule of law, 81 subsidiarity principle, 42 democratic constitutionalist claims deference and, 114-115 and, 327 defined, 236 ECtHR reforms and, compatibility separation of powers and, 22-23 strengthening of, 38, 42–43 with, 236-239, 356-358 in UK, 296-297 domestic bodies and, 239 Russia, democratic constitutionalist intervention level of, 239 claims in, 313-314 operationalization of, 238-239 Russian Constitutional Court, 303 IHRJ and, 146-147



INDEX 403

international human rights law and, 114–115, 146–147, 356–358 legal scope, 236 negative, 358 positive, 146, 357 embeddedness principle and, 357 prisoner voting and, 303 supportive, IHRJ and, 386 supportive subsidiarity, 146–147 IHRJ and, 386 implementation of, 358 separation of powers and, 354–358 Switzerland, deliberative model of democracy in, 72

terrorism, 210, 211–212 *A Theory of Justice* (Rawls), 336 torture techniques, 211–212

Ugarizza, Juan, 61
UK. See United Kingdom
Ukraine
ECHR derogation provisions in,
221–222
parliamentary compliance with
human rights norms, 80
UN High Commissioner for Human
Rights, 81
UN Human Rights Committee (HRC),

2, 136, 153–154 human rights protections by, 38–39 OHCHR, 38–39

UN Treaty Bodies, 166. See also
Convention on the Elimination of
All Forms of Discrimination
against Women; Convention on
the Rights of the Child; Vienna
Convention on the Law of
Treaties

Union for a Popular Movement, 96 United Kingdom (UK). See also derogation provisions under ECHR

'Abu Qatada' affair in, 285–286 age discrimination laws in, 119–122, 129 ECJ rulings on, 119–122

under Equal Treatment Directive, 119-122 LPC and, 119-121 under NMW Act, 119-120 Anti-Terrorism Crime and Security Act 2001, 217, 220 democratic constitutionalist claims in, 311-312 ECHR and, adaptation to, 204-209 colonial authorities under, 205-207 in Northern Ireland, 210-213 emergency powers in, during wartime, 200-204 historical development of, 201-202 legalisation of, 209-216 right to life limitations under, 209-210

for terrorist violence, 210, 211–212 HRA, 29, 217, 278 immigration legislation in, 283 JCHR in, 79–80, 86 martial law in, 200–204

historical development of, 201–203 prisoner disenfranchisement in, 288–289

prisoner voting in, 286-297

criticism of, 295–297
democratic rejection of, 298–301
legal foundations for, 290–295
legal impasse for, 298–299
legitimacy of, 289–290
MPs on, 286–289, 299–301
overview of, 275–277
rule of law in, 296–297
Westminster model for, 285

Venezuela, broadcasting licenses in, 256 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 152–153, 369–370 von Staden, Andreas, 313–314

Waldron, Jeremy, 25 Walter, Robert, 91–92 'weak' international human rights law frameworks, 304 Webb, Philippa, 360–361