

#### **Comparative Law**

Comparative Law offers a thorough grounding in the subject for students and scholars of comparative law alike, critically debating both traditional and modern approaches to the subject and using examples from a range of legal systems gives the reader a truly global perspective.

Covering essential academic debates and comparative law methodology, its contextualised approach draws on examples from politics, economics and development studies to provide an original contribution to topics of comparative law.

New to this edition:

- fully revised and updated to reflect contemporary research;
- more examples from many areas of law;
- increased discussion of the relevance of regional, international, transnational and global laws for comparative law;
- suitable for students taking courses in comparative law and related fields, this book offers a fresh contextualised and cosmopolitan perspective on the subject.

**Mathias Siems** is a Professor of Commercial Law at Durham University. He is also a Research Associate at the Centre for Business Research, University of Cambridge, a Research Associate at the London Centre for Corporate Governance and Ethics, Birkbeck, University of London, and an Invited Fellow at the Maastricht European Law Institute. He has previously held positions as professor at the University of East Anglia, reader at the University of Edinburgh, associate professor at the Riga Graduate School of Law, Fulbright Scholar at Harvard Law School, and Jean Monnet Fellow at the European University Institute in Florence. Support for the first edition of this book was provided by the Philip Leverhulme Prize 2010.



#### The Law in Context Series

*Editors*: William Twining (University College London), Maksymilian Del Mar (Queen Mary, University of London) and Bronwen Morgan (University of Bristol).

Since 1970 the Law in Context series has been at the forefront of the movement to broaden the study of law. It has been a vehicle for the publication of innovative scholarly books that treat law and legal phenomena critically in their social, political and economic contexts from a variety of perspectives. The series particularly aims to publish scholarly legal writing that brings fresh perspectives to bear on new and existing areas of law taught in universities. A contextual approach involves treating legal subjects broadly, using materials from other social sciences, and from any other discipline that helps to explain the operation in practice of the subject under discussion. It is hoped that this orientation is at once more stimulating and more realistic than the bare exposition of legal rules. The series includes original books that have a different emphasis from traditional legal textbooks, while maintaining the same high standards of scholarship. They are written primarily for undergraduate and graduate students of law and of other disciplines, but will also appeal to a wider readership. In the past, most books in the series have focused on English law, but recent publications include books on European law, globalisation, transnational legal processes and comparative law.

#### **Books in the Series**

Ali: Modern Challenges to Islamic Law

Anderson, Schum & Twining: Analysis of Evidence

Ashworth: Sentencing and Criminal Justice Barton & Douglas: Law and Parenthood

Beecher-Monas: Evaluating Scientific Evidence: An Interdisciplinary Framework for

Intellectual Due Process
Bell: French Legal Cultures
Bercusson: European Labour Law
Birkinshaw: European Public Law

Birkinshaw: Freedom of Information: *The Law, the Practice and the Ideal* Brownsword & Goodwin: *Law and the Technologies of the Twenty-First Century* 

Cane: Atiyah's Accidents, Compensation and the Law Clarke & Kohler: Property Law: Commentary and Materials

Collins: The Law of Contract

Collins, Ewing & McColgan: Labour Law

Cowan: Housing Law and Policy

Cranston: Legal Foundations of the Welfare State

Darian-Smith: Laws and Societies in Global Contexts: Contemporary Approaches
Dauvergne: Making People Illegal: What Globalisation Means for Immigration and Law

Davies: Perspectives on Labour Law

Dembour: Who Believes in Human Rights?: The European Convention in Question



de Sousa Santos: Toward a New Legal Common Sense

Diduck: Law's Families

Fortin: Children's Rights and the Developing Law

Ghai & Woodham: Practising Self-government: A Comparative Study of Autonomous
Regions

Glover-Thomas: Reconstructing Mental Health Law and Policy

Gobert & Punch: Rethinking Corporate Crime

Goldman: Globalisation and the Western Legal Tradition: Recurring Patterns of Law and Authority

Haack: Evidence Matters: Science, Proof, and Truth in the Law

Harlow & Rawlings: Law and Administration

Harris: An Introduction to Law

Harris, Campbell & Halson: Remedies in Contract and Tort Harvey: Seeking Asylum in the UK: Problems and Prospects

Hervey & McHale: European Union Health Law

Hervey & McHale: *Health Law and the European Union* Holder and Lee: *Environmental Protection, Law and Policy* 

Jackson and Summers: The Internationalisation of Criminal Evidence

Kostakopoulou: The Future Governance of Citizenship Lewis: Choice and the Legal Order: Rising above Politics

Likosky: Transnational Legal Processes

Likosky: Law, Infrastructure and Human Rights

Maughan & Webb: Lawyering Skills and the Legal Process

McGlynn: Families and the European Union: Law, Politics and Pluralism

Moffat: Trusts Law: Text and Materials

Monti: EC Competition Law Morgan: Contract Law Minimalism

Morgan & Yeung: An Introduction to Law and Regulation: Text and Materials

Nicola and Davies: EU Law Stories: Contextual and Critical Histories of European

Jurisprudence

Norrie: Crime, Reason and History

O'Dair: Legal Ethics

Oliver: Common Values and the Public-Private Divide

Oliver & Drewry: The Law and Parliament Picciotto: International Business Taxation

Probert: The Changing Legal Regulation of Cohabitation, 1600-2010

Reed: Internet Law: *Text and Materials* Richardson: *Law, Process and Custody* 

Roberts & Palmer: Dispute Processes: ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-Making

Rowbottom: Democracy Distorted: Wealth, Influence and Democratic Politics

Sauter: Public Services in EU Law

Scott & Black: Cranston's Consumers and the Law

Seneviratne: Ombudsmen: Public Services and Administrative Justice Seppänen: Ideological Conflict and the Rule of Law in Contemporary China

Stapleton: Product Liability

Stewart: Gender, Law and Justice in a Global Market

Tamanaha: Law as a Means to an End: Threat to the Rule of Law



Turpin and Tomkins: British Government and the Constitution: Text and Materials

Twining: Globalisation and Legal Theory

Twining: Rethinking Evidence

Twining: General Jurisprudence: Understanding Law from a Global Perspective

Twining: Human Rights, Southern Voices: Francis Deng, Abdullahi An-Na'im, Yash

Ghai and Upendra Baxi

Twining & Miers: How to Do Things with Rules Ward: A Critical Introduction to European Law

Ward: Law, Text, Terror

Ward: Shakespeare and Legal Imagination

Wells and Quick: Lacey, Wells and Quick: Reconstructing Criminal Law

Zander: Cases and Materials on the English Legal System

Zander: The Law-Making Process

# International Journal of Law in Context: A Global Forum for Interdisciplinary Legal Studies

The International Journal of Law in Context is the companion journal to the Law in Context book series and provides a forum for interdisciplinary legal studies and offers intellectual space for ground-breaking critical research. It publishes contextual work about law and its relationship with other disciplines including but not limited to science, literature, humanities, philosophy, sociology, psychology, ethics, history and geography. More information about the journal and how to submit an article can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org/ijc



# **Comparative Law**

**Second Edition** 

MATHIAS SIEMS Durham University





# CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107182417

DOI: 10.1017/9781316856505

© Mathias Siems 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014 Second editon published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Siems, Mathias M., 1974- author.

Title: Comparative law / Mathias Siems, University of Durham.

Description: Second edition. | Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, [2018] | Series: The law in context series | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2017043869 | ISBN 9781107182417 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316633557 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Comparative law.

Classification: LCC K583 .S587 2018 | DDC 340/.2-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017043869

ISBN 978-1-107-18241-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-63355-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### **Contents**

	List of Figures	page xv		
	List of Tables	xvi		
	Preface to the Second Edition	xvii		
	Preface to the First Edition			
	List of Abbreviations	xxi		
1	Introduction	1		
	A Why Compare Laws?	1		
	1 How to Slide into Comparative-Law Thinking	1		
	2 Purposes of Comparative Law	2		
	(a) Knowledge and Understanding	2		
	(b) Practical Use at Domestic Level	4		
	(c) Practical Use at International Level	5		
	B What Belongs to Comparative Law?	6		
	1 Status Quo: No Fixed Canon	6		
	2 Substantive Scope of This Book	7		
	3 Three Dimensions of 'Comparative Law in Context'	10		
	4 Conclusion: Structure of This Book	11		
Part I	Traditional Comparative Law	13		
2	The Comparative Legal Method	15		
	A Typical Structure of a Comparative Paper	15		
	1 Preliminary Considerations	15		
	(a) Possible Research Questions	15		
	(b) Countries to be Examined	17		
	2 Description of Laws	19		
	(a) Finding the Right Perspective	19		
	(b) To Translate or Not to Translate?	20		
	(c) Positive Law and Beyond	22		



viii Contents

3 Comparative Analysis	23
(a) Identifying Variation	23
(b) Explaining Variation	24
4 Critical Policy Evaluation	27
(a) Should This be Part of Comparative Analysis?	27
(b) Possible Recommendations	28
5 An Example from Comparative Tort Law	29
B Functionalism and Universalism in Particular	31
1 Functionalism: Origins, Use and Consequences	31
(a) Attractiveness of Functionalism Elsewhere	31
(b) Popularity of Functionalism in Comparative La	
(c) Limitations Set by Functionalism	33
2 Comparative Law's Interest in Finding Commonalit	
(a) Parallels in Philosophy and Other Fields	35
(b) Universalism and Comparative Law	36
3 Example of the Common Core Project	38
C Critical Analysis	39
1 Simplistic Approach	40
2 Focus on Western Countries	42
3 Critics of Functionalism	45
4 Policy Evaluation	47
D Conclusion	48
Common Law and Civil Law	50
A Terminology and Origins	50
B Juxtaposing Civil and Common Law	52
Legal Methods and Sources of Law	53
(a) Role of Statute Law and its Interpretation	53
(b) Role of Courts	55
(c) Role of Legal Scholarship	56
2 Courts and Civil Procedure	58
(a) Which Types of Courts Exist?	58
(b) Who Exactly is 'the Court'?	59
(c) What is the Main Form of Civil Proceedings?	61
(d) What are the Roles of Judge, Parties and Lawyer	
in Civil Trials?	62
(e) How are Judgments Written?	64
(f) What Effects Do Judgments Have?	66
(g) Conclusion	68
3 Comparative Contract Law	68
(a) Introduction (b) Contract Formation	68 69
OF COHLIACE FORMATION	0.9

3



ix	Contents	
	<ul><li>(c) Good Faith and Precontractual Duties</li><li>(d) Contractual Remedies</li></ul>	70 72
	(e) Conclusion	73
	C Critical Analysis	74
	1 Diversity in Continental Europe	74
	2 Differences Between England and the United States	75
	<ul><li>3 Western Law Instead of Civil versus Common Law?</li><li>D Conclusion</li></ul>	78 81
4	Mapping the World's Legal Systems	84
7	A Setting the Scene	84
		84
	<ul><li>1 Background of Classifications</li><li>2 Purposes for Legal Classification</li></ul>	85
	B Classifying Countries	87
	1 Bases for Classification	87
	2 Review of Main Classifications	88
	3 Main Commonalities and Differences	92
	C Critical Analysis	94
	1 Over-emphasis of Differences	94
	2 Over-emphasis of Similarities	96
	(a) Asian and African Legal Systems	97
	(b) Latin America	99
	<ul><li>3 Disregard of Hybrids</li><li>(a) Mixed Legal Systems</li></ul>	101 101
	(b) Horizontally Divided Legal Systems	104
	(c) Vertically Divided Legal Systems	106
	(d) Parallel Legal Systems	108
	D Conclusion	109
Part II	Extending the Methods of Comparative Law	113
5	Postmodern Comparative Law	115
	A Challenging the Orthodoxy	115
	B Deep-level Analysis of Law	117
	1 Law as Requiring Immersion	117
	2 Law as Legal Pluralism	119
	3 General Legal Scholarship as Comparative Law	12]
	C Deep-level Comparisons	123
	1 Jurisprudential and Structural Approaches	123

(a) Jurisprudential Approaches

123



x Contents

	(b) Structural Approaches	126
	(c) Further Discussion	127
	2 Cultural and Linguistic Approaches	127
	(a) Cultural Approaches	127
	(b) Linguistic Approaches	130
	<ul><li>(c) Further Discussion</li><li>3 Normative Cultural Comparison</li></ul>	132 133
D	•	134
D	Critical Comparative Law	
	1 Law as Politics	135
	2 Law as Discourse	137
_	3 Negative Comparative Law	140
Е	Conclusion	144
So	cio-legal Comparative Law	147
A	Setting the Scene	147
	1 Legal Culture and Comparative Law	147
	(a) Meanings of Legal Culture	147
	(b) Spatial Levels of Legal Cultures	149
	2 Causality Problem in Socio-legal Research	150
	(a) Mirror View and its Critics	150
	(b) Illustrating Possible Causalities	153
	3 Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Approaches	156
В	Civil Litigation, Courts and Lawyers	157
	1 Civil Litigation and Other Forms of Dispute Resolution	157
	2 Litigation Rates in Five Countries	159
	(a) United States, England, Germany and the Netherlands	159
	(b) Japan: 'Harmony Culture' or a 'Normal Country'?	161
	(c) Conclusion	163
	3 Research on Judges, Lawyers and the Public	164
	(a) Challenges and Choices	164
	(b) Selected Comparative Information about Lawyers and Judg	
0	(c) Comparisons of 'Access to Justice'	166
C	Substantive Law 'in Action' and Society	167
	1 Comparative Commercial Law	168
	(a) How the Law is Applied	168
	(b) How the Law Shapes Society – and Vice Versa	170
	2 Comparative Criminal Law	173
	(a) How the Law Shapes Society, and Vice Verse	173 174
Б	(b) How the Law Shapes Society – and Vice Versa	
D	Conclusion	178



xi Contents

7	Numerical Comparative Law	180
	A Types of Quantitative Legal Information	180
	B Measuring the Impact of Foreign Legal Ideas	182
	1 Cross-Citations Between Courts	182
	2 Measuring Foreign Influence Related to Academic Research	187
	3 Measuring the Influence of Foreign Statute Law	189
	C Measuring Similarities and Differences	193
	1 Formal Features of the Legal System	194
	2 Research Methods of Legal Scholars	199
	3 Substance of Legal Rules	201
	4 Combined Measures	204
	D Measuring the Quality of Legal Rules and Institutions	207
	1 Measuring Legal Rules	208
	2 Measuring Courts and Other Legal and Political Institutions	212
	3 Surveying Perceptions about Law and its Enforcement	217
	4 Combined Measures	220
	E Conclusion	227
Part III	Global Comparative Law	229
8	Legal Transplants	231
	A Conceptual Research on Legal Transplants	232
	1 Relevant Actors and Objects	232
	2 Rationales and Transplant Process	233
	(a) Aspired Benefits for Transplant Country	233
	(b) Aspired Benefits for Origin Country	235
	(c) Transplants Beyond Direct Benefits	235
	3 Outcomes in the Transplant Country	236
	- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country	236
	<ul><li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li><li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li></ul>	236 237
	<ul><li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li><li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li><li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li></ul>	236 237 238
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> <li>(a) Legislative Transplants and 'Americanisation'</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241 241
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> <li>(a) Legislative Transplants and 'Americanisation'</li> <li>(b) Recent Use of Judicial Legal Transplants</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241 241 244
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> <li>(a) Legislative Transplants and 'Americanisation'</li> <li>(b) Recent Use of Judicial Legal Transplants</li> <li>2 Colonialism and Post-Colonialism</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241 241 244 246
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> <li>(a) Legislative Transplants and 'Americanisation'</li> <li>(b) Recent Use of Judicial Legal Transplants</li> <li>2 Colonialism and Post-Colonialism</li> <li>(a) Colonial World: Only Common and Civil Law?</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241 241 244 246 246
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> <li>(a) Legislative Transplants and 'Americanisation'</li> <li>(b) Recent Use of Judicial Legal Transplants</li> <li>2 Colonialism and Post-Colonialism</li> <li>(a) Colonial World: Only Common and Civil Law?</li> <li>(b) Post-Colonial Development: Everything New?</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241 241 244 246 246 248
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> <li>(a) Legislative Transplants and 'Americanisation'</li> <li>(b) Recent Use of Judicial Legal Transplants</li> <li>2 Colonialism and Post-Colonialism</li> <li>(a) Colonial World: Only Common and Civil Law?</li> <li>(b) Post-Colonial Development: Everything New?</li> <li>3 Transplants in Non-Colonial Countries: All that Different?</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241 241 244 246 246 248 252
	<ul> <li>(a) Positive View: They Work as in Origin Country</li> <li>(b) Sceptical View: They are Largely Irrelevant</li> <li>(c) Differentiated View: They Function in a Modified Way</li> <li>B Legal Transplants Throughout History</li> <li>1 Legal Transplants in the West</li> <li>(a) Legislative Transplants and 'Americanisation'</li> <li>(b) Recent Use of Judicial Legal Transplants</li> <li>2 Colonialism and Post-Colonialism</li> <li>(a) Colonial World: Only Common and Civil Law?</li> <li>(b) Post-Colonial Development: Everything New?</li> </ul>	236 237 238 241 241 241 244 246 246 248



xii	Contents
-----	----------

C N	formative Views and Discussion	255
1	Views of Optimists and Pessimists	250
2	Mapping the Argumentative Field	25
3	Designing and Preventing Transplants	259
D C	onclusion	26
Conv	vergence, Regionalisation and Internationalisation	26
A C	onvergence of Laws	26
1	Motivation and Terminology	26
2		26.
	(a) Convergence Through Congruence and Pressure	26
	(b) Conflict of Laws and Extra-territoriality	26
	(c) Choice of Law and Regulatory Competition	268
3	Examples: Company and Constitutional Law	27
	(a) Arguments Showing Convergence	27
	(b) Limitations of Convergence	27
	(c) Normative Positions	27
B R	egionalisation	28
1	Reasons for Regionalisation	28
2	Topics of Comparative Regionalisation	28
	(a) Forms of Regional Cooperation Today	28
	(b) Models, Diffusion and Design	28
3	The EU as an Example of Regional Integration	284
	(a) Scope of Europeanisation	28
	(b) Towards a European Legal Culture	280
	(c) Critics and Design Choices	28
C I	nternationalisation	289
1	General Impact of International Law	289
2	Forms of Comparative International Law	29
	(a) Vertical Comparative International Law	29
	(b) Horizontal Comparative International Law	29.
3	Example: Human Rights Law	29
	(a) Protection of Human Rights in the West	29
	(b) Is the 'Western Model' a Suitable Global One?	29
	(c) Internationalisation of Human Rights	298
D C	onclusion	30
From	n Transnational Law to Global Law	30:
A G	eneral Trends and Analysis	30:
1	Challenges to State Law and National Boundaries	30-
2	Rise of Transnational and Global Law	30.



xiii Contents

	<ul><li>(b) Variants of Transnational and Global Law</li><li>3 Implications of Transnational and Global Law</li></ul>	307 309
	(a) Conceptual Implications	309
	(b) Normative Implications	311
	B Transnational Commercial Law	313
	1 Variations of Transnational Commercial Law	313
	2 International Commercial Arbitration in Particular	317
	3 Feasibility and Legitimacy of Private Law-making	319
	C Global Social Indicators	322
	<ol> <li>Definitions and Variations of Indicators</li> <li>Relevance of the Legitimacy of Indicators</li> </ol>	322 323
	<ul><li>2 Relevance of the Legitimacy of Indicators</li><li>3 Comparing the Legitimacy of Indicators</li></ul>	323 326
	D Conclusion	330
44		
11	Comparative Law and Development	332
	A Evolving Ideas of 'Law and Development'	332
	<ul><li>1 Towards the 'Washington Consensus'</li><li>2 'Post-Washington Consensus'</li></ul>	332 336
	<u> </u>	338
	B Development and the Rule of Law	338
	<ul><li>1 Typology and Purpose(s)</li><li>2 Rule of Law in China, Russia and Afghanistan</li></ul>	343
	3 Conceptual and Methodological Postscript	351
	C Critics of 'Law and Development'	352
	1 Law Does Not 'Work'	352
	2 Against 'Top-Down' Approaches	354
	3 Western Law Out-of-Context	357
	4 'Wrong' Legal Rules and Institutions	359
	D Conclusion	361
Part IV	Comparative Law as an Open Subject	363
12	Implicit Comparative Law	365
	A Introduction to Comparative Research in the Social Sciences	365
	1 Main Rationales for a Comparative Approach	365
	2 Main Types of Comparative Research	366
	3 Methods, Continued: History, Logic and Concepts	368
	4 Choice of Units of Comparison	369
	B Comparative Studies of States and their Components	371
	1 Determining 'the Best' Form of Government	372



xiv		Contents	
		<ul><li>2 Comparing 'the State in Action'</li><li>3 Classifying and Evaluating Policy Choices</li></ul>	374 377
		C Comparative Studies of Societies and Cultures	382
		<ol> <li>Understanding Differences and Similarities Between Legal Systems</li> <li>Showing Legal Universalities and Singularities</li> <li>Measuring Legal Mentalities and their Relevance</li> <li>Conclusion</li> </ol>	383 387 390 394
	13	Reflections and Outlook	396
		A Reflections	396
		<ol> <li>Revisiting the Topics of This Book</li> <li>Diversity of Questions and Methods</li> </ol>	396 398
		B Outlook	401
		<ol> <li>The Future of Comparative Law?</li> <li>Interdisciplinarity and Comparative Law</li> <li>Cosmopolitanism and Comparative Law</li> </ol>	401 402 404
		C Conclusion	406
		References	408
		Index	489



# **Figures**

1.1	The three dimensions: areas of law, legal regimes and	page 10
	methods	
4.1	Possible classification of BRIC countries	104
7.1	Bar chart on cross-citations between supreme courts	185
7.2	'Foreign laws' in Harvard Law Review	188
7.3	'Westernisation' of shareholder protection in Central and	193
	Eastern Europe (Czech Republic, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania,	
	Poland, Slovenia) (based on ten variables)	
7.4	How often has the BGH cited its own decisions?	198
7.5	How often has the CA cited its own decisions?	198
7.6	Preferred research methods of legal scholars in five law schoo	ls 200
7.7	Changes in preferred research methods in last ten years	201
7.8	Shareholder protection by legal origin (ten variable index)	203
7.9	Network of the world's legal systems	206
7.10	Map of legal systems (with metric MDS)	207
9.1	International law as the 'law of globalisation'	290
10.1	Overview of the functioning of the G20/OECD Principles	317
13.1	Relationship between 'comparative law', 'law' and 'other comparative disciplines'	403



### **Tables**

1.1	The purposes of comparative law in this book	page 3
1.2	Focus of general comparative law books	7
1.3	Overview of main areas of law and legal systems covered	8
	in this book	
2.1	Similarities and differences	45
4.1	Overview of legal family classifications across time	89
6.1	Criteria which can foster legal adaptability	152
6.2	The relationship between law and religion	154
6.3	Possible relationship between shareholder protection and	171
	financial development	
6.4	Potential relationships between political economy and	177
	imprisonment	
7.1	Overview of methods and examples of numerical comparative la	w 181
7.2	Number of cross-citations in civil and criminal law (all areas	184
	of law)	
7.3	Negative binomial regression with dependent variable number	186
	of cross-citations in matters of civil and criminal law	
7.4	The top ten words of the Draft Common Frame of Reference	189
	(DCFR), compared with four domestic codes	
7.5	Countries with or without Civil Code and English as official	195
	language	
7.6	Comparison of measures of shareholder protection	212
7.7	Duration (days) of court proceedings to evict tenant (to collect	216
	cheque) (extract)	
7.8	Legal systems ranked in terms of the WJP Rule of Law Index	222
	(extract)	
7.9	Legal systems ranked in terms of ease of doing business (extract	t) 224
8.1	Patterns of argument about legal transplants	257
9.1	Convergence forces	266
10.1	Examples of global social indicators	324
11.1	Examples, variants and functions of the rule of law	343
13.1	Overview of topics and questions of comparative law	399



#### Preface to the Second Edition

The main approach and structure of the book have been retained in the second edition. However, the following key changes have been made: the previous chapter on 'Fading State Borders' has been transformed into two chapters on 'Convergence, Regionalisation and Internationalisation' (Chapter 9) and 'From Transnational Law to Global Law' (Chapter 10). Some of the chapters have been expanded and/or restructured, in particular those on 'Mapping the World's Legal Systems' (Chapter 4), 'Postmodern Comparative Law' (Chapter 5), 'Numerical Comparative Law' (Chapter 7), 'Legal Transplants' (Chapter 8) and 'Reflections and Outlook' (Chapter 13). New literature published until June 2017 has been considered as fully as possible.

I am grateful for both the positive reception of the first edition and constructive comments by friends and colleagues. I also thank the editors of the Law in Context series and Cambridge University Press, in particular Marta Walkowiak, Caitlin Lisle and Valerie Appleby, and for their ongoing support.

Mathias Siems
Durham





#### Preface to the First Edition

In a well-known Irish joke a foreigner asks a local how to get to a particular place, but only receives the advice that 'if I were you, I wouldn't start from here'. Of course, in reality (and without teleportation) one has to start from the place where one is at present. Applying this trite insight, 'traditional comparative law' is still a suitable starting point for a general book on comparative law. However, this book also aims to lead the reader somewhere else, namely, to a deeper and more interdisciplinary perspective. This is not to claim that traditional approaches have become obsolete, but, just as one cannot ignore past achievements, neither can one disregard new approaches and topics of comparative law.

It is hoped that this strategy has led to a book that fills a notable gap in the literature. This is not to deny that significant comparative legal research has been produced in recent years, though the focus and format of the present book is different from previous ones as (i) it deals with general questions of comparative legal method, in contrast to detailed micro-comparisons of particular rules and countries, (ii) it provides a comprehensive treatment of the state of art of comparative law, in contrast to monographs that discuss particular aspects or methods of comparative law and (iii) it is a single-authored coherent text, in contrast to books that comprise collections of articles on topics of comparative law.

As a consequence, this book is targeted at a wide audience. In the first instance, it may be appreciated by readers who are specifically interested in comparative law, be they students, academics or others. Secondly, however, comparative law is too important to be left to comparative lawyers! In today's world, even lawyers whose main interest lies in particular domestic legal systems frequently come across foreign sources of law, making familiarity with core topics of comparative law indispensable. Moreover, this book aims to show that comparative law is often closely related to other comparative fields, such as comparative politics, sociology, economics and development; thus, comparative scholars in these fields may also benefit from this book.

Research for this book started in autumn 2009. I want to thank the universities where I have held permanent and visiting positions in recent



xx Preface to the First Edition

years. These were, on the one hand, the University of East Anglia and Durham University in the United Kingdom, and, on the other hand, the Riga Graduate School of Law in Latvia, the Central European University in Hungary, the Interdisciplinary Center in Israel, Waseda University in Japan, Shanghai Jiao Tong University and the China University of Political Science and Law in China, the Center for the Study of Law and Society at UC Berkeley and Fordham Law School in the United States, and the British Institute of International and Comparative Law and the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies in the United Kingdom.

I also want to thank many friends and colleagues who have provided me with extremely helpful feedback on parts of this book: in alphabetical order, Uchenna Anyamele, John Bell, Jacco Bomhoff, Nick Foster, Martin Gelter, Carsten Gerner-Beuerle, Nicholas Hoggard, Jaakko Husa, Hatice Kubra Kandemir, Dionysia Katelouzou, Mariana Pargendler, Daniel Peat, Robert Schütze, Melih Sonmez and Po Jen Yap. I also thank the editors of the Law in Context series, in particular William Twining, as well as Cambridge University Press, in particular Sinead Moloney, for their patience, encouragement and support. My particular thanks go to the Leverhulme Trust as it awarded me the Philip Leverhulme Prize 2010 in order to undertake research for this book.

Of course, all remaining mistakes are my own. I would be grateful for any feedback, whether of a supportive, neutral or critical nature. This book is accompanied by a website (www.comparinglaws.blogspot.com), which provides additional information on the topics of this book.

Mathias Siems
Durham



### **Abbreviations**

ADGM Abu Dhabi Global Market AFTA ASEAN Free Trade Area

AU African Union

BCBS Basel Committee on Banking Supervision

BEEPS Business Environment and Enterprise Performance Survey

BGB German Civil Code

BGH German Federal Supreme Court
CA Court of Appeal of England and Wales

CARICOM Caribbean Community

CBR Centre for Business Research (University of Cambridge)

CDF Comprehensive Development Framework
CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of

Discrimination Against Women

CEMAC Monetary and Economic Community of Central Africa
CEPEJ European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice

CISG Convention on Contracts for the International Sale of Goods

CJEU Court of Justice of the European Union

CoE Council of Europe

CPI Corruption Perception Index

DBR Doing Business Report (World Bank)
DCFR Draft Common Frame of Reference (EU)
DIFC Dubai International Financial Centre

EBRD European Bank for Reconstruction and Development ECCAS Economic Community of Central African States

ECCU Eastern Caribbean Currency Union
ECHR European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

EFTA European Free Trade Association
EJN European Judicial Networks

EU European Union

FATF Financial Action Task Force



xxii List of Abbreviations

G20	Group of Twenty
GCC	Gulf Cooperation Council
GRI	Global Reporting Initiative
HDI	Human Development Indicators
HRAF	Human Relations Area Files
ICC	International Chamber of Commerce
ICCt	International Criminal Court
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRG	International Country Risk Guide
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IFRS	International Financial Reporting Standards
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOC	International Olympic Committee
IOSCO	International Organization of Securities Commissions
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
ISDA	International Swap and Derivatives Association
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
LDP	Liberal Democratic Party (Japan)
LL.M.	Master of Laws
MDS	metric multidimensional scaling
MERCOSUR	Mercado Común del Sur
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Association
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
OAS	Organization of American States
OECD	Organisation for Economic Development
ODIHR	Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights
OHADA	Organisation pour l'Harmonisation en Afrique du Droit des
	Affaires
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PECL	Principles of European Contract Law
QCA	qualitative comparative analysis
QFC	Qatar Financial Centre
ROSC	Report on the Observance of Standards and Codes
SII	Structural Impediment Initiative
SE	Societas Europaea (European Company)
SEZ	special economic zone
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TPP	Trans-Pacific Partnership
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
UCC	Uniform Commercial Code
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UEA	University of East Anglia
	,



xxiii List of Abbreviations

UEMOA West African Economic and Monetary Union

UN United Nations

UNASUR Union of South American Nations

UNCITRAL UN Commission on International Trade Law UNCTAD UN Conference on Trade and Development

UNDEF United Nations Democracy Fund UNDP UN Development Programme

UNIDROIT International Institute for the Unification of Private Law
USAID United States Agency for International Development
WBES World Business Environment Survey (World Bank)

WEF World Economic Forum

WGI Worldwide Governance Indicators (World Bank)

WHO World Health Organization
WJP World Justice Project
WTO World Trade Organization

ZERP Zentrum für Europäische Rechtspolitik (University of

Bremen)

