

## Newcomb's Problem

Newcomb's Problem is a controversial paradox of decision theory. It is easily explained and easily understood, and there is a strong chance that most of us have actually faced it in some form or other. And yet it has proven as thorny and intractable a puzzle as much older and better-known philosophical problems of consciousness, skepticism and fatalism. It brings into very sharp and focused disagreement several long-standing philosophical theories concerning practical rationality, the nature of free will and the direction and analysis of causation. This volume introduces readers to the nature of Newcomb's Problem, and ten chapters by leading scholars present the most recent debates around the Problem and analyze its ramifications for decision theory, metaphysics, philosophical psychology and political science. Their chapters highlight the status of Newcomb's Problem as a live and continuing issue in modern philosophy.

**Arif Ahmed** is Reader in Philosophy at the University of Cambridge. He is the author of *Saul Kripke* (2007), *Wittgenstein's 'Philosophical Investigations': A Reader's Guide* (2010), and *Evidence, Decision and Causality* (2014), and is the editor of *Wittgenstein's 'Philosophical Investigations': A Critical Guide* (2010).

## Classic Philosophical Arguments

Over the centuries, a number of individual arguments have formed a crucial part of philosophical enquiry. The volumes in this series examine these arguments, looking at the ramifications and applications which they have come to have, the challenges which they have encountered, and the ways in which they have stood the test of time.

### Titles in the Series

The Prisoner's Dilemma

Edited by Martin Peterson

The Original Position

Edited by Timothy Hinton

The Brain in a Vat

Edited by Sanford C. Goldberg

Pascal's Wager

Edited by Paul Bartha and Lawrence Pasternack

Ontological Arguments

Edited by Graham Oppy

Newcomb's Problem

Edited by Arif Ahmed

# Newcomb's Problem

---

Edited by  
**Arif Ahmed**  
University of Cambridge



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107180277](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107180277)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316847893

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2018

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

Names: Ahmed, Arif, editor.

Title: Newcomb's problem / edited by Arif Ahmed (University of Cambridge).

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018. |

Series: Classic philosophical arguments | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018029219 | ISBN 9781107180277 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316632161 (pbk.)

Subjects: LCSH: Game theory. | Choice (Psychology) | Decision making.

Classification: LCC QA269 .N487 2018 | DDC 519.5/42–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018029219>

ISBN 978-1-107-18027-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-63216-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Contributors	<i>page</i> vi
Acknowledgments	vii
Introduction	1
Arif Ahmed	
1 Does Newcomb's Problem Actually Exist?	19
José Luis Bermúdez	
2 Newcomb's Problem, Rationality, and Restraint	42
Chrisoula Andreou	
3 The "Why Ain'cha Rich?" Argument	55
Arif Ahmed	
4 Epistemic Time Bias in Newcomb's Problem	73
Melissa Fusco	
5 Newcomb's Problem is Everyone's Problem: Making Political and Economic Decisions when Behavior is Interdependent	96
Robert Grafstein	
6 Success-First Decision Theories	115
Preston Greene	
7 Deliberation and Stability in Newcomb Problems and Pseudo-Newcomb Problems	138
James M. Joyce	
8 "Click!" Bait for Causalists	160
Huw Price and Yang Liu	
9 Game Theory and Decision Theory (Causal and Evidential)	180
Robert Stalnaker	
10 Diagnosing Newcomb's Problem with Causal Graphs	201
Reuben Stern	
References	221
Index	232

## Contributors

**Arif Ahmed** is Reader in Philosophy at the University of Cambridge.

**Chrisoula Andreou** is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Utah.

**José Luis Bermúdez** is Professor of Philosophy and Samuel Rhea Gammon Professor in Liberal Arts at Texas A&M University.

**Melissa Fusco** is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Columbia University.

**Robert Grafstein** is the Georgia Athletic Association Professor of Political Science at the University of Georgia.

**Preston Greene** is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at NTU Singapore.

**James M. Joyce** is the C. H. Langford Collegiate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Michigan.

**Yang Liu** is Research Fellow in the Faculty of Philosophy at the University of Cambridge.

**Huw Price** is the Bertrand Russell Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cambridge.

**Robert Stalnaker** is Professor of Philosophy at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

**Reuben Stern** is a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Munich Centre for Mathematical Philosophy.

## Acknowledgments

I wish to thank all of the contributors to this volume for the care that they took over their contributions and for the patience with which they all dealt with my queries and comments. I am grateful to John Jacobs for his meticulous copy-editing work and to Stephen Duxbury for preparing the index. I am once again grateful to my editor at CUP, Hilary Gaskin, for her own patience and for her continued support. I prepared this volume in part during a period of sabbatical leave, and I am grateful to the Faculty of Philosophy at the University of Cambridge, and to Gonville and Caius College, Cambridge, for granting me this time. Some of the preparation took place whilst I held a visiting position at the Department of Linguistics and Philosophy at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, and I am grateful to that institution, and especially to Jack Spencer and Christine Graham for their support and hospitality.