

CHINA AS A POLAR GREAT POWER

China has emerged as a member of the elite club of nations that are powerful at both global poles. Polar states are global giants, strong in military, scientific, and economic terms. The concept of a polar great power is relatively unknown in international relations studies; yet China, a rising power globally, is now widely using this term to categorize its aspirations and emphasize the significance of the polar regions to its national interests. China's focus on becoming a polar great power represents a fundamental reorientation. It is a completely new way of imagining the world. China's push into these regions encompasses maritime and nuclear security, the frontlines of climate change research, and the possibility of a resources bonanza. As shown in this book, China's growing strength at the poles will be a game-changer for a number of strategic vulnerabilities that could shift the global balance of power in significant and unexpected ways.

Anne-Marie Brady is a professor of politics and international relations at the University of Canterbury, New Zealand, and a global fellow at the Woodrow Wilson Center in Washington. In 2014 she was appointed to a two-year term on the World Economic Forum's Global Action Council on the Arctic. She is editor-inchief of *The Polar Journal*, and has published ten books and more than forty scholarly papers on a range of issues, including China's modernized propaganda system, China's activities in the South Pacific, and competing foreign policy interests in Antarctica.



China as a Polar Great Power ANNE-MARIE BRADY

Woodrow Wilson Center Press Washington, D.C. and





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107179271
DOI: 10.1017/9781316832004

Woodrow Wilson Center Press Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars, One Woodrow Wilson Plaza, 1300 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20004–3027 www.wilsoncenter.org

© Anne-Marie Brady 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-17927-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-63125-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.





The Wilson Center, chartered by Congress as the official memorial to President Woodrow Wilson, is the nation's key nonpartisan policy forum for tackling global issues through independent research and open dialogue to inform actionable ideas for Congress, the Administration, and the broader policy community.

Conclusions or opinions expressed in Center publications and programs are those of the authors and speakers and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Center staff, fellows, trustees, advisory groups, or any individuals or organizations that provide financial support to the Center.

Please visit us online at www.wilsoncenter.org.

Jane Harman, Director, President, and CEO

Board of Trustees

Thomas R. Nides, Chair

Public members: William D. Adams, Chairman of the National Endowment for the Humanities; Elisabeth DeVos, Secretary of Education; David Ferriero, Archivist of the United States; Carla D. Hayden, Librarian of Congress; Thomas E. Price, Secretary of Health and Human Services; David J. Skorton, Secretary of the Smithsonian Institution; Rex W. Tillerson, Secretary of State. Designated appointee of the president from within the federal government: Vacant

Private citizen members: Peter J. Beshar, Thelma Duggin, Barry S. Jackson, David Jacobson, Nathalie Rayes, Earl W. Stafford, Jane Watson Stetson, Louis Susman

Wilson National Cabinet

Ambassador Joseph Gildenhorn and Alma Gildenhorn, Co-chairs

Eddie and Sylvia Brown, Ambassador Sue and Ambassador Chuck Cobb, Thelma Duggin, Judi Sorensen Flom, Sander R. Gerber, Harman Family Foundation, Frank F. Islam, Willem Kooyker, Ambassador Robert A. and Julie Mandell, Thomas R. Nides, Adam H. Offenhartz, Nathalie Rayes, Wayne Rogers, B. Francis Saul II, Diana Davis Spencer, Earl W. Stafford, Bobby and Mary Stein, Jane Watson Stetson, Leo Zickler



Contents

Fig	gures	page viii
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations		ix
Acknowledgments		xi
Gle	ossary	xiv
Int	roduction	1
1	Polar Governance	16
2	The Polar Regions in China's National Narrative	33
3	China's Geostrategic Interests in the Polar Regions	60
4	The Party-State-Military-Market Nexus in China's Polar	
	Policymaking	114
5	Evaluating China as a Polar Power	137
6	Cooperation or Conflict? China's Position on Points of	
	Contention in the Polar Regions	187
7	From Polar Great Power to Global Power? Global	
	Governance Implications of China's Polar Interests	220
8	The Rise of a New Great Power	254
Index		268



Figures

1.1	Chinese Arctic Map	17
1.2	China National Petroleum Corporation Map of Arctic Mineral	,
	Resources	18
1.3	Antarctica: Territorial Claims	25
3.1	China's Arctic Missile Route	81
3.2	Chinese Government Map of Oil and Natural Gas Basins	
	in Antarctic Waters	88
3.3	Chinese-Language Map of Southern Ocean Mineral Resources	90
3.4	Chinese-Language Map Showing Manganese Node Sites in the	
	Southern Ocean	96
5.1	China's Five Antarctic Base Sites	139
5.2	Great Wall Station	140
5.3	Zhongshan Station	142
5.4	Kunlun Station	143
5.5	Taishan Station	145
5.6	Artist's Impression of China's Fifth Antarctic Base	147
5.7	Yellow River Station and Ny Ålesund, Norway	150
5.8	China-Iceland Joint Aurora Observatory	150
5.9	Map of China's Proposed Antarctic Air Route and Links to	
	Other Airfields	157
5.10	Map of China's "East Antarctic Sector"	160
5.11	Antarctic-Purposed Aircraft by Country	161
5.12	Antarctic-Purposed Ships by Country	180
5.13	Antarctic Research Stations and Personnel by Country	180
8.1	Still Image from Antarctica: We're Here! Documentary	266

viii



Acronyms and Abbreviations

AFoPS Asian Forum for Polar Science

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations ATCM Antarctic Treaty Consultative Meeting ATCPs Antarctic Treaty Consultative Parties

ATS Antarctic Treaty System

CAA China Arctic and Antarctic Administration

CCAMLR Commission for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living

Resources

CCP Chinese Communist Party

CNNC China National Nuclear Corporation
CNOOC China National Offshore Oil Company
CNPC China National Petroleum Company
COLTO Coalition of Legal Toothfish Operators

COMNAP Council of Managers of National Antarctic Programs

COSCO China Ocean Shipping (Group) Company

EU European Union

GBI Ground-Based Interceptor
GPS Global Positioning System

IASC International Arctic Science Committee

ICBM intercontinental ballistic missile
IGY International Geophysical Year
IMO International Maritime Organization

IPY International Polar Year ISA International Seabed Authority

NASA National Aeronautics and Space Administration (United

States)

NySMAC Ny-Alesund Science Managers Committee

PBSC Politburo Standing Committee
PLA People's Liberation Army
PLAN People's Liberation Army-Navy

ix



x List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

PRC People's Republic of China PRIC Polar Research Institute of China

ROC Republic of China

SCAR Scientific Committee on Antarctic Research
SIPRI Stockholm International Peace Research Institute

SLOC sea lane of communication

SOA State Oceanic Administration (China)
SSBN Nuclear powered ballistic missile submarine

UN United Nations

UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea

UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

USPACOM US Pacific Command VTS Vehicle Traffic Service



Acknowledgments

China as a Polar Great Power is an in-depth study of the place that the polar regions plays in China's emerging global strategy. My research on China's polar interests has demonstrated to me that the polar regions offer front-row seats to observe the changing global order, and early on it was clear that the perspectives and interests of both established and emerging polar players were neither well understood nor transparent. A further understanding of my early research was that China, like all other major powers, is not interested solely in either the Arctic or the Antarctic. This realization led me on a massive learning journey to not only discover the range of interests—many of them hidden from public view—that China has at the poles, but also to be able to interpret China's polar interests within the context of the interests of other major polar players. I also had to learn the complex governance structures of the Arctic and Antarctic, which both enhance and constrain the interests of those few states such as China that have the economic ability and political will to access the poles.

As I worked on this project, some of my early findings were published in Asian Survey, China Brief, World Politics Review, two policy papers for the Wilson Center, and two chapters in edited books, and were rehearsed and refined in papers given at many international conferences and public talks. I am indebted to the editors of those journals and books for permission to republish those findings in this book and for the valuable feedback I received from scholarly audiences as I developed my research project. Every effort has been made to contact copyright holders for their permission to reprint material in this book. The publishers would be grateful to hear from any copyright holders that are not acknowledged here, and will undertake to rectify any errors or omissions in future editions of this book.

China's polar policies are an undeclared foreign policy; hence, this has been an extremely difficult topic to research. Gathering data on China's polar



xii

Acknowledgments

interests has taken assiduousness, patience, persistence, and sometimes a very thick skin. I am very grateful to Richard McGregor, Andy Nathan, Ari Overmars, Karen Scott, Michael Yahuda, and Oran Young, who read early book drafts and gave crucial support that has enabled the book to come to fruition. I am extremely grateful to the staff of the library at the University of Canterbury and the library of the Wilson Center for help in gathering many of the scholarly resources used in this project.

I began writing this book in Washington, from a spacious office in the Ronald Reagan Building overlooking the Woodrow Wilson Plaza, while on a ten-month residential fellowship at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars. In 2015, I was awarded an eight-month Gerda Henkel Stiftung Fellowship, which facilitated the final completion of this book project. I finished up the book while based in my sixth-floor eyrie overlooking the Southern Alps at the University of Canterbury in Christchurch, New Zealand. I have thus been privileged to observe how China's growing polar interests look from the angle of both an ailing polar superpower and a polar small state. I benefited enormously from the intellectual leadership and camaraderie of the Wilson Center and its extraordinary collection of resident experts and visiting fellows, as well as from the intensely political atmosphere of Washington, D.C. I would like to express my thanks to a number of people who helped and encouraged this project in D.C. and Christchurch. First, special thanks to my Wilson Center writing partner, Maria Cristina Garcia, and to my writing group members, Amal Fadlalla, Hope M. Harrison, and Donny Meertens. You helped make the Wilson Center feel like home, and it has been extremely exciting and inspiring to watch your own projects emerge. Rob Litwak, vice president for scholars and director of international security studies, was an inspiration, and I felt very lucky to have him as a next-door neighbor at the Wilson Center. Robert Daly was always encouraging and supportive and helped make me feel part of the team at the Wilson Center's Kissinger Institute on China and the United States. I am also very grateful to Arlyn Charles, Lindsay Collins, Kim Conner, Kent Hughes, and Janet Spikes for making my stay at the Center so pleasant and productive; to my intern Scott Wingo for his work in compiling the charts in the book; for the steady support and good humor of Woodrow Wilson Center Press director Joe Brinley; and for the thoroughness and fine attention to detail of Woodrow Wilson Center Press editor Shannon Granville, who helped make the book ready for publication in partnership with Cambridge University Press. I have benefited greatly from local research funds and technical support at the University of Canterbury that has facilitated the continuance of this research, and I have been able to draw on the vast pool of polar knowledge at the university over the



Acknowledgments

xiii

years. Special thanks to Neil Gilbert, Alan D. Hemmings, Daniela Liggett, Michelle Rogan-Finnemore, and Karen Scott in this regard.

I would like to especially thank my husband, Z. J., who has been a patient and loyal support person throughout this book project. I dedicate this book with love to our children, Francesca, Silas, and Matteo. I have greatly enjoyed sharing the many eureka moments on this project with you all, and have valued your support and encouragement throughout the long journey of completing the book.



Glossary

Beiji (北极): literally, "the Northern Extreme"; the North Pole, and more broadly also used to described the Arctic as a whole

Beiji diqu (北极地区): the Arctic region

Beiji Huanghe zhan (北极黄河站): Arctic Yellow River Station (China)

Beiji shiwu xietiao xiaozu (北极事物协调小组): Arctic Affairs Coordination Group (China)

bingjie (冰结): frozen

bingzhan (冰站): Arctic iceberg stations

bu zhan er qu ren zhi bing, shanzhi shan zhe ye (不战而屈人之兵, 善之善者也): "the ultimate technique is to get the enemy to submit without actually going to war"

Caizhengbu (财政部): Ministry of Finance (China)

Changcheng zhan (长城站): Great Wall Station, Antarctica (China)

changxiang zhuxuanlü (唱响主旋律): "sing with one voice"

Daguo jueqi (大国崛起): The Rise of Great Powers (documentary)

dang de houshe (党的喉舌): "[the Chinese media as] the tongue and throat of the Chinese Communist Party"

dang de jilü (党的纪律): CCP instructions or disciplinary measures for party members

disanji (第三极): "the third pole"; the Tibetan Plateau

Donghua dajie (中华大街): "China Boulevard"; the dedicated Antarctic traverse route from Zhongshan Station to Dome A via Taishan Station

Dong Nanji da duanmian yanjiu zhanlüe gouxiang (东南极大断面研究战略构想): East Antarctic Sector Strategic Research Vision

duinei xuanchuan (对内宣传): information or activities aimed at Chinese citizens

duiwai xuanchuan (对外宣传): information or activities aimed at foreigners erdeng gongmin (二等公民): second-class citizen

xiv



Glossary

fen fa youwei (奋发有为): "proactive"

fu guo qiang bing (富國強兵): "rich country with a strong army"

furen julebu (富人俱乐部): rich man's club

fu zeren de daguo (负责任的大国): "responsible great power"

fu zeren de liyi xiangguan zhe (负责任的利益相关者): "responsible stakeholder"

gonghai (公海): high seas

Gongye he xinxihuabu (工业和信息化部): Ministry of Industry and Information Technology (China)

guoji gonggong haiyu (国际公共海域): international waters

guoji xingxiang (国际形象): international image

Guojia anquan weiyuanhui (国家安全委员会): National Security Council (China)

guojia anquan xitong (国家安全系统): China's national security xitong

Guojia cehui dili xinxi ju (国家测绘地理信息局): National Administration of Surveying, Mapping and Geoinformation (China)

Guojia haiyangju (国家海洋局): State Oceanic Administration (China)

Guojia haiyangju weiyuanhui (国家海洋局委员会): National Antarctic Expedition Committee (China)

Guojia haiyangju jidi kaocha bangongshi (国家海洋局极地考察办公室): China Arctic and Antarctic Administration (CAA)

Guojia Nanji kaocha weiyuanhui bangongshi (国家南极考察委员会办公室): Office of the National Antarctic Expedition Committee (China)

Guojia weisheng yu jihua shengyu weiyuanhui (国家卫生和计划生育委员会):
National Health and Family Planning Commission (China)

Guojia ziran kexue jijin weiyuanhui (国家自然科学基金委员会): Natural Science Foundation of China

Guotu ziyuanbu (国土资源部): Ministry of Land and Natural Resources (China)

Guowai jidi kaocha xinxi huibian (国外极地考察信息汇编): Foreign Polar Expedition News Report

haiyang qiangguo (海洋强国): maritime great power

haiyang quanli (海洋权利): sea power

haiyang xitong (海洋系统): maritime xitong

haiyang zhengce (海洋政策): maritime strategy

huayu quan (话语权): "right to speak"

huoban (伙伴): partnership

Jiaotongbu (交通部): Ministry of Transport (China)

Jiaoyubu (教育部): Ministry of Education (China)

jidi (极地): polar



xvi

Jidi ban (极地办): CAA (abbreviation of the China Arctic and Antarctic Administration)

Glossary

jidi fazhan zhanlüe (极地发展战略): polar strategy

jidi guihua (极地规划): polar plan

Jidi guojia zhengce yanjiu baogao (极地国家政策研究报告): Polar National Policy Research Report

jidi kaocha (极地考察): polar expeditions

Jidi keji dongtai (极地科技动态): Polar Scientific Trends

jidi qiangguo (极地强国): polar great power

jidi sheshi (极地设施): polar facilities

Jidi xinxi (极地信息): Polar Information

jidi yanjiu (极地研究): polar research

Jidi yanjiu jianbao (极地研究简报): Polar Bulletin

jidi zhanlüe (极地战略): polar strategy

Jidi zhanlüe yanjiuzu (极地战略研究组): Polar Strategic Research Group Jidizhanlüe yanjiu tongxun (极地战略研究通讯): Polar Strategy Research

Bulletin

jidi zhengce (极地政策): polar policies

jin'an (近岸): coastal waters

jin'an fangyu (近岸防御): coastal defense

jin hai (近海): near seas

jinhai fangyu (近海防御): offshore defense

jiti baquan (集体霸权): collective hegemony

Kexueyuan jidi kexue weiyuanhui (科学院极地科学委员会): Polar Science Committee

Kexue jishubu (科学技术部): Ministry of Science and Technology (China) kongcheng ji (空城计): empty fort

kou (□): CCP policy suprabureaucracies that link policy areas; usually, but not always, on smaller policy areas than the *xitong*

Kunlun zhan (昆仑站): Kunlun Station, Antarctica (China)

laoshi zuoren, zhashi zuoshi; bu shi zhangyang, zhi qiu shiji; wu wang renmin, gan zuo fengxian; jugong jincui, fenfa you wei (老实做人, 扎实做事; 不事张扬, 只求实绩; 勿忘人民, 甘作奉献; 鞠躬尽瘁, 奋发有为):"be honest, do solid work; be unassuming, get on with things; do not forget the people, be willing to make sacrifices; spare no effort; and be proactive" (Xi Jinping's motto)

lengjing guancha, wenzhu zhenjiao chenzhuo yingfu, taoguang yanghui, shanyu shouzhuo, jue bu dangtou, you suo zuowei (冷静观察; 稳住阵脚; 沉着应付; 韬光养晦; 善于守拙; 决不当头, 有所作为): "be calm and observe the situation; hold our ground; hide our strengths and bide our



Glossary xvii

time; be good at keeping a low profile; don't take the lead, do what you can" (Deng Xiaoping foreign policy strategy)

liangge zhan yige chuan (两个站, 一个船): "two stations, one boat"

liyong (利用): to exploit, to utilize, to use

minjian waijiao (民间外交): people-to-people diplomacy

Nanji (南极): literally, "Southern Extreme"; the South Pole, also used to describe the Antarctic as a whole

Nanji 2049 (南极2049): *Antarctica* 2049 (movie title)

Nanji, women lai le! (南极, 我们来了!): Antarctica: We're Here! (1985 documentary)

neiwai you bie (内外有别): insiders and outsiders are different

Nongyebu (农业部): Ministry of Agriculture

qiu tong cunyi (求同存异): look for points in common, put aside differences *quanmian waijiao* (全面外交): total diplomacy

quanyi (权益): rights and interests

quan renlei de Beiji (全人类的北极): the North Pole belongs to all humanity quan shijie de gonggong lingtu (全世界的公共领土): global commons

Renmin ribao (人民日报): People's Daily (CCP official newspaper)

ruan cunzai (软存在): soft presence

Sanshiliu ji (三十六計): Thirty-Six Stratagems

sha ji jing hou (条鸡儆猴): "kill the chicken to scare the monkeys"

Shekeyuan (社科院): Chinese Academy of Social Sciences

shengmingxian (生命线): "lifeblood [of the CCP]"; the CCP's perspective on the role of propaganda

Shijie Nanji kuanwu ziyuan guanli tiaoyue (世界南极矿物资源管理条约): the (nonexistent) World Treaty on Managing Antarctic Minerals

suzao guoji yulun (塑造国际舆论): mold global public opinion

Taishan zhan (泰山站): Taishan Station

tici (题词): political slogan

tifa (提法): politically correct language

tongzhan (统战): United Front

tuanjie da duoshu, daji yi xiaocuo (团结大多数, 打击一小撮): "uniting with the majority, while attacking a minority"

Waijiaobu (外交部): Ministry of Foreign Affairs

waishi xitong (外事系统): foreign affairs xitong

waixuan (外宣): foreign propaganda; information targeted at foreign audiences

Weiduoliyadi changnian zhan (维多利亚地常年站): Victoria Land Permanent Base



xviii

Glossary

wei renlei heping liyong Nanji zuochu gongxian (为人类和平利用南极做出 贡献): peacefully exploit Antarctica on behalf of the whole of humanity weixie lun (威胁论): the "[China] threat" narrative wenhua jianshe (文化建设): cultural construction xiao kang shehui (小康社会): a comfortable standard of living as a basic minimum xitong (系统): CCP suprabureaucracies that group policy areas xuanchuan (宣传): propaganda, communications, information management xuanchuan yu sixiang gongzuo (宣传与思想工作): "propaganda and thought work"; persuasion and censorship xuanjiao xitong (宣教系统): the CCP propaganda xitong yao mianzi (要面子): face-seeking yaomohua (妖魔化): "demonization [of China]" yidai yilu (一带一路): "One Belt, One Road"; the New Silk Road yongyu (用语): politically correct language yuan yang zuozhan (远洋作战): offshore battle readiness zhanlüe xin jiangyu (战略新疆域): new strategic frontiers zhanju (占据): occupied or held zhengming (正名): the Confucian concept of the rectification of names zhidao sixiang (指导思想): guiding strategy zhidao yulun (指导舆论): "guide public opinion" **Zhongguo** (中国): China, "the Middle Kingdom" **Zhongguo dizhenju** (中国地震局): China Earthquake Administration Zhongguo duiwai xuanchuan bangongshi (中共对外宣传办公室): the CCP

Office for Foreign Propaganda **Zhongguo gongchengyuan** (中国工程院): Chinese Academy of Engineering **Zhongguo guanli qu** (中国管理区): China's Management District

Zhongguo jidi yanjiusuo (中国极地研究所): Polar Research Institute of China (PRIC)

Zhongguo jidi yanjiu zhongxin (中国极地研究中心): Polar Research Institute of China

Zhongguo jidi kaocha zixun weiyuanhui (中国极地考察咨询委员会): Chinese Advisory Committee for Polar Research

Zhongguo kexueyuan (中国科学院): Chinese Academy of Science

Zhongguo qiang (中国墙): China's Great Wall (in Antarctica)

Zhongshan zhan (中山站): Zhongshan Station

Zhongyang caijing lingdao xiaozu (中央财经领导小组): CCP Finance and Economics Leading Group

Zhongyang haiyang gongzuo lingdao xiaozu (中央海洋工作领导小组): CCP Maritime Affairs Leading Group



Glossary

xix

Zhongyang haiyang quanyi lingdao xiaozu bangongshi (中央海洋权益领导小组办公室): CCP Maritime Rights Office

Zhongguo qixiangju (中国气象局): Chinese Meteorological Administration **Zhongyang quanmian shenhua gaige lingdao xiaozu** (中央全面深化改革领导小组): Party Leading Group for Comprehensively Deepening Reform

Zhongyang waishi lingdao xiaozu (中央外事领导小组): CCP Foreign Affairs Leading Group

zhuquan meiyou guishu de dalü (主权没有归属的大陆): a continent with no attribution of sovereignty

zhuquan quanli (主权权利): sovereign rights

zhuazhu Nanji (抓住南极): "seize" Antarctica

Zongcan zuozhanbu haijun ju (总参作战部海军局): PLAN General Staff Operations Department

Zouxiang haiyang (走向海洋): To the Oceans (2011 PLAN-funded CCTV documentary)

zou xiang haiyang, jinglüe haiyang (走向海洋, 经略海洋): "going out on the oceans" policy

zuo er bu shuo (做而不说): "do, but don't say" zuzhi yu lingdao (组织与领导): organize and lead