

KANT AND HIS GERMAN CONTEMPORARIES

Volume II

Aesthetics, History, Politics, and Religion

Kant's philosophical achievements have long overshadowed those of his German contemporaries, often to the point of concealing his contemporaries' influence upon him. This volume of new essays draws on recent research into the rich complexity of eighteenth-century German thought, examining key figures in the development of aesthetics and art history, the philosophy of history and education, political philosophy, and the philosophy of religion. The essays range over numerous thinkers, including Baumgarten, Mendelssohn, Meier, Winckelmann, Herder, Schiller, Hamann, and Fichte, showing how they variously influenced, challenged, and revised Kant's philosophy, at times moving it in novel directions unacceptable to the *magister* himself. The volume will be valuable for all who are interested in this distinctive period of German philosophy.

DANIEL O. DAHLSTROM is John R. Silber Professor of Philosophy at Boston University. His previous publications include *The Emergence of German Idealism* (1999); *Philosophical Legacies: Essays on the Thought of Kant, Hegel, and Their Contemporaries* (2008); and *Identity, Authenticity, and Humility* (2017).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17816-8 — Kant and his German Contemporaries
Edited by Daniel O. Dahlstrom
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17816-8 — Kant and his German Contemporaries
Edited by Daniel O. Dahlstrom
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

KANT AND HIS GERMAN CONTEMPORARIES

Volume II

Aesthetics, History, Politics, and Religion

Edited by
DANIEL O. DAHLSTROM
Boston University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-17816-8 — Kant and his German Contemporaries
 Edited by Daniel O. Dahlstrom
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge. It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107178168
 DOI: 10.1017/9781316823415

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Dyck, Corey, editor.

TITLE: Kant and his German contemporaries / edited by Corey Dyck, University of Western Ontario, Falk Wunderlich, Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg.

DESCRIPTION: First [edition]. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017– | Includes bibliographical references and index. Contents: Volume 1. Logic, Mind, Epistemology, Science and Ethics – Volume 2. Aesthetics, history, politics, and religion.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017029300 | ISBN 9781107140899 (v. 1 : hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781107178168 (v. 2 : hardback : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804. | Philosophy, German – 18th century. | Philosophy, German – 19th century.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B2798 .K36 2017 | DDC 193–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017029300>

ISBN 978-1-107-17816-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	x
Introduction	I
<i>Daniel O. Dahlstrom</i>	
PART I AESTHETIC PERSPECTIVES	
1 Baumgarten, Meier, and Kant on Aesthetic Perfection	13
<i>J. Colin McQuillan</i>	
2 Mendelssohn, Kant, and the Aims of Art	28
<i>Paul Guyer</i>	
3 Winckelmann's Greek Ideal and Kant's Critical Philosophy	50
<i>Michael Baur</i>	
PART II HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES	
4 Eighteenth-Century Anthropological and Ethnological Studies of Ancient Greece: Winckelmann, Herder, Caylus, and Kant	71
<i>Elisabeth Décultot</i>	
5 Conjectural Truths: Kant and Schiller on Educating Humanity	91
<i>Lydia L. Moland</i>	
6 Herder's Theory of Organic Forces and Its Kantian Origins	109
<i>Nigel DeSouza</i>	

PART III POLITICAL PERSPECTIVES

- 7 Kant and Mendelssohn: Enlightenment, History,
 and the Authority of Reason 131
Kristi Sweet
- 8 Johann Jakob Moser and Immanuel Kant on
 Public Law and the German Religious Constitution 150
Ian Hunter
- 9 A Family Quarrel: Fichte's Deduction of Right and Recognition 170
Gabriel Gottlieb

PART IV RELIGIOUS PERSPECTIVES

- 10 Rational Faith and the Pantheism Controversy:
 Kant's "Orientation Essay" and the Evolution of
 His Moral Argument 195
Brian A. Chance and Lawrence Pasternack
- 11 Reason and Immortality: Herder versus Kant 215
Marion Heinz
- 12 Reason within the Limits of Religion Alone:
 Hamann's Onto-Christology 238
Daniel O. Dahlstrom
- Bibliography* 257
Index 276

Contributors

MICHAEL BAUR is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University and Adjunct Professor of Law at Fordham Law School, Bronx, NY, USA. He is the editor (with Stephen Houlgate) of *The Blackwell Companion to Hegel* (2011) and the translator of J. G. Fichte's *Foundations of Natural Right* (Cambridge University Press, 2000).

BRIAN A. CHANCE is a member of the Department of Philosophy at the University of Oklahoma, Norman, OK, USA. His work has appeared in the *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, *European Journal of Philosophy*, *Kantian Review*, *Kant-Studien*, *Kant Yearbook*, and several edited volumes.

DANIEL O. DAHLSTROM is John R. Silber Professor of Philosophy at Boston University, Boston, MA, USA. His previous publications include *The Emergence of German Idealism* (1999); *Philosophical Legacies: Essays on the Thought of Kant, Hegel, and Their Contemporaries* (2008); and *Identity, Authenticity, and Humility* (2017).

ELISABETH DÉCULTOT is the Humboldt Professor at the Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg, Halle and Wittenberg, Germany. She is the author of *Johann Joachim Winckelmann. Enquête sur la genèse de l'histoire de l'art* (2000) and (with Hans Adler) the editor of Johann Georg Sulzer's *Gesammelte Schriften* (vol. I, 2014).

NIGEL DESOUZA is Assistant Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Ottawa, Canada. He is the author of "The Soul-Body Relationship and the Foundations of Morality: Herder contra Mendelssohn" (*Herder Yearbook*, 2014) and (with Anik Waldow) the editor of *Herder: Philosophy and Anthropology* (2017).

GABRIEL GOTTLIEB is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Xavier University, Cincinnati, OH, USA. He is the editor of *Fichte's "Foundation of Natural Rights": A Critical Guide* (Cambridge University Press, 2016) and the author of "Fichte's Deduction of the External World" (*International Philosophical Quarterly*, 2015).

PAUL GUYER is the Jonathan Nelson Professor in Humanities and Philosophy at Brown University, Providence, RI, USA. He is the author of ten books on Kant, most recently *Virtues of Freedom: Selected Essays on Kant* (2016). He is also the author of *A History of Modern Aesthetics* (3 vols., 2014). He has translated numerous works by Kant and edited five volumes on Kant and one on the philosophy of Stanley Cavell.

MARION HEINZ is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Siegen, Siegen, Germany. She is the author of *Sensualistischer Idealismus. Untersuchung zur Erkenntnistheorie und Metaphysik des jungen Herder (1763–1778)* (1994) and the editor of *Herders “Metakritik”: Analysen und Interpretationen* (2013).

IAN HUNTER is Professor Emeritus in the Institute for Advanced Studies of the Humanities at the University of Queensland, Brisbane, Australia. He is the author of *Rival Enlightenments* (Cambridge University Press, 2001) and *The Secularisation of the Confessional State* (Cambridge University Press, 2007).

J. COLIN MCQUILLAN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at St. Mary's University, San Antonio, TX, USA. He is the author of *Immanuel Kant: The Very Idea of a Critique of Pure Reason* (2016) and *Early Modern Aesthetics* (2015).

LYDIA L. MOLAND is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Colby College, Waterville, ME, USA. She is the author of *Hegel's Aesthetics: The Art of Idealism* (forthcoming) and *Hegel on Political Identity: Patriotism, Nationality, Cosmopolitanism* (2011).

LAWRENCE PASTERNAK is Professor of Philosophy at Oklahoma State University, Stillwater, OK, USA. He is the author of *Kant's Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason: An Interpretation and Defense* (2014), the editor of *Immanuel Kant's Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals: In Focus* (2002), and the series editor of *Immanuel Kant's Textbooks in Translation* (2016).

KRISTI SWEET is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Texas A&M University, College Station, TX, USA. She is the author of *Kant on Practical Life: From Duty to History* (Cambridge University Press, 2013) and “What Is Philosophical about Kant's Anthropology” (*International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, 2017).

Acknowledgments

For their help and advice with the preparation of this collection, I am grateful to Fred Beiser, Andrew Butler, Corey Dyck, Manfred Kuehn, James Kinkaid, Jordan Kokot, Rebeccah Leiby, Daniel Mendez, and Daniel Solecki. I am also grateful to Hilary Gaskin for her encouragement, patience, and support for this project.

Abbreviations

Kant's works are cited according to the abbreviations given in the following list (which is derived from that provided in the forthcoming *Cambridge Kant Lexicon*, edited by Julian Wuerth). The abbreviation of the work is followed by the respective volume and page number in *Kant's gesammelte Schriften*, edited by Deutsche (formerly Königlich-Preussische) Akademie der Wissenschaften (Berlin: G. Reimer, 1900–19; De Gruyter, 1920–), abbreviated as “Ak.” unless otherwise indicated. Only the German pagination is cited, since the volume and page numbers of the Akademie edition are given in the margins of the respective English translation in the *Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant* (“CE”). When an English translation is lacking, the Akademie edition is cited as “Ak.” followed by the respective volume and page number. As is conventional, the *Critique of Pure Reason* is cited according to the page numbers in the first (“A”) and/or second (“B”) editions. Whenever available, English translations are taken from the following list. The abbreviation “tm” means that a translation has been modified by the author of the chapter.

Abbreviations of Kant's Works

Anth	<i>Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View</i> (CE <i>Anthropology, History, and Education</i> , pp. 227–428; Ak. 7: 117–333)
CBHH	<i>Conjectural Beginning of Human History</i> (CE <i>Anthropology, History, and Education</i> , pp. 160–75; Ak. 8:107–24)
CF	<i>The Conflict of the Faculties</i> (CE <i>Religion and Rational Theology</i> , pp. 233–328; Ak. 7:1–116)
Corr	<i>Correspondence</i> (CE <i>Correspondence</i> ; Ak. 10–13)
CPJ	<i>Critique of the Power of Judgment</i> (CE <i>Critique of the Power of Judgment</i> ; Ak. 5:165–485)

List of Abbreviations

xi

- CPR *Critique of Pure Reason* (CE *Critique of Pure Reason*; Ak. 4: 1–252)
- CPrR *Critique of Practical Reason* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 133–72; Ak. 5:1–163)
- DSS *Dreams of a Spirit-Seer Elucidated by Dreams of Metaphysics* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 301–59; Ak. 2: 315–73)
- G *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 37–108; Ak. 4:385–463)
- IUH *Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Aim* (CE *Anthropology, History, and Education*, pp. 107–20; Ak. 8:15–31)
- IC *Inquiry concerning the Distinctness of the Principles of Natural Theology and Morality* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 243–75; Ak. 2:273–301)
- JL Jäsche Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 517–640; Ak. 9:1–150)
- LB Blomberg Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 1–246; Ak. 24: 7–301)
- LDW Dohna-Wundlacken Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 425–516; Ak. 24:687–784)
- LPh Philippi Logic (Ak. 24:303–496)
- LV Vienna Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 249–377; Ak. 24: 785–940)
- MH Metaphysics Herder (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 3–16; Ak. 28:1–166, 843–931)
- ML₁ Metaphysics ML₁ (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 19–106; Ak. 28:167–350)
- MM *The Metaphysics of Morals* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 353–604; Ak. 6:203–493)
- MoC Moral Philosophy Collins (CE *Lectures on Ethics*, pp. 37–222; Ak. 27:237–471)
- NE *A New Elucidation of the First Principles of Metaphysical Cognition* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy 1755–1770*, pp. 1–45; Ak. 1:385–416)
- NF *Notes and Fragments* (CE *Notes and Fragments*, Ak. 15–19)
- OCS *On the Common Saying: That May Be Correct in Theory, but It Is of No Use in Practice* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 273–310; Ak. 8:273–313)
- OPA *The Only Possible Argument in Support of a Demonstration of the Existence of God* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 107–201; Ak. 2:63–163)

- Pro *Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics That Will Be Able to Come Forward as Science* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy after 1781*, pp. 29–170; Ak. 4:253–383)
- Rel *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason* (CE *Religion and Rational Theology*, pp. 39–216; Ak. 6:1–202)
- RGH *Review of Gottlieb Hufeland's Essay on the Principle of Natural Right* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 109–18; Ak. 8:125–30)
- RHe *Review of Johann Gottfried Herder's Ideas for the Philosophy of the History of Humanity*, Parts 1 and 2 (CE *Anthropology, History, and Education*, pp. 121–42; Ak. 8:43–66)
- RP *What Real Progress Has Metaphysics Made in Germany since the Time of Leibniz and Wolff?* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy after 1781*, pp. 337–424; Ak. 20:253–351)
- RL *Lectures on the Philosophical Doctrine of Religion* (CE *Religion and Rational Theology*, pp. 335–452; Ak. 28:988–1126)
- UNH *Universal Natural History and Theory of the Heavens, or An Essay on the Constitution and Mechanical Origin of the Entire World Edifice Treated According to Newtonian Principles* (CE *Natural Science*, pp. 182–308; Ak. 1:215–368)
- WA *An Answer to the Question: What Is Enlightenment?* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 11–22; Ak. 8:33–42)
- WDO *What Does It Mean to Orient Oneself in Thinking?* (CE *Religion and Rational Theology*, pp. 1–18; Ak. 8:131–48)