We all know, or think we know, what it means to say that something is “reasonable” or “fair,” but what exactly are these concepts and how have they evolved and changed over the course of history? In this book, Christopher McMahon explores reasonableness, fairness, and justice as central concepts of the morality of reciprocal concern. He argues that the basis of this morality evolves as history unfolds, so that forms of interaction that might have been morally acceptable in the past are judged unacceptable today. The first part of his study examines the notions of reasonableness and fairness as they are employed in ordinary practical thought, and the second part develops a constructivist theory to explain why and how this part of morality can undergo historical development without arriving at any final form. His book will interest scholars of ethics, political theory, and the history of ideas.

Christopher McMahon is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Santa Barbara. His previous books include Reasonable Disagreement: A Theory of Political Morality (Cambridge University Press, 2009) and Collective Rationality and Collective Reasoning (Cambridge University Press, 2001).
Reasonableness and Fairness

A Historical Theory

CHRISTOPHER MCMAHON

University of California
For J. L. S.
## Contents

**Acknowledgments**  
page ix

| Introduction | 1 |
| Reciprocal Concern | 3 |
| Direct Concern | 8 |
| Fairness and Reasonableness | 11 |
| The Plan of the Book | 14 |

**Part I The Substance of Reciprocal Concern**  
19

1  
**Fairness**  
21  
Mutual Benefit  
23  
The Concept of Fairness  
24  
Disparities of Concession  
29  
The Sense of Fairness  
33  
Judgments and Reasons  
37  
Secondary Reasons  
42  
Desert  
48  
Justice and Fairness  
54  

2  
**Reasonableness**  
61  
The Competence Sense  
61  
The Concession Sense  
66  
Concession in Deliberative Contexts  
73  
Adverbial Reasonableness  
78  
Second-Order Concession  
80  
Rawls  
84  
Scanlon on Reasonableness  
94  

3  
**Political Morality**  
101  
Elements of the Public Good  
104  
Conceptions of the Public Good  
110  
Rights  
113  
Broad Fairness  
118
viii Contents

Political Cooperation 120
Authority in a Modern Liberal Democracy 124

Part II The History of Reciprocal Concern 133

4 Proper Functioning and Practical Judgment 135
   Proper Functioning 136
   Practical Judgment 142

5 A Historical Theory of Reasons 151
   Updating 153
   Shared Deliberation 159
   Perspectives on Reasons 162
   Internal or External? 166
   The Conceptual-cum-Social Process 168
   Scanlon on Reasons 174
   Dworkin on Interpretation 181

6 Naturalism and Moral History 186
   Kitcher 188
   Boyd and Richerson 195
   Levels of Moral Change 201

7 The History of Political Morality 205
   Proper Functioning and the Past 207
   Skinner’s Method 217
   Sovereignty and the State 223
   The Glorious Revolution 230
   Moral Progress 235

References 242
Index 247
I have received helpful comments on a preliminary version of this book from two anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press, and I have benefited from the advice of Hilary Gaskin, the Cambridge philosophy editor. Work on the book was supported by a sabbatical leave from the University of California, Santa Barbara, spring term 2014.