



Reasonableness and Fairness

We all know, or think we know, what it means to say that something is “reasonable” or “fair,” but what exactly are these concepts and how have they evolved and changed over the course of history? In this book, Christopher McMahon explores reasonableness, fairness, and justice as central concepts of the morality of reciprocal concern. He argues that the basis of this morality evolves as history unfolds, so that forms of interaction that might have been morally acceptable in the past are judged unacceptable today. The first part of his study examines the notions of reasonableness and fairness as they are employed in ordinary practical thought, and the second part develops a constructivist theory to explain why and how this part of morality can undergo historical development without arriving at any final form. His book will interest scholars of ethics, political theory, and the history of ideas.

CHRISTOPHER MCMAHON is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Santa Barbara. His previous books include *Reasonable Disagreement: A Theory of Political Morality* (Cambridge University Press, 2009) and *Collective Rationality and Collective Reasoning* (Cambridge University Press, 2001).

Reasonableness and Fairness

A Historical Theory

CHRISTOPHER MCMAHON
University of California



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17717-8 — Reasonableness and Fairness
Christopher McMahon
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107177178

© Christopher McMahon 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

McMahon, Christopher, 1945– author.

Reasonableness and fairness : a historical theory / Christopher McMahon.

Cambridge, United Kingdom : University Printing House, Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge, [2016]

LCCN 2016025923 | ISBN 9781107177178

LCSH: Reasoning. | Political ethics.

LCC BC177 .M3895 2016 | DDC 172–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016025923>

ISBN 978-1-107-17717-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17717-8 — Reasonableness and Fairness
Christopher McMahon
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For J. L. S.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
Introduction	1
Reciprocal Concern	3
Direct Concern	8
Fairness and Reasonableness	11
The Plan of the Book	14
 Part I The Substance of Reciprocal Concern	 19
1 Fairness	21
Mutual Benefit	23
The Concept of Fairness	24
Disparities of Concession	29
The Sense of Fairness	33
Judgments and Reasons	37
Secondary Reasons	42
Desert	48
Justice and Fairness	54
2 Reasonableness	61
The Competence Sense	61
The Concession Sense	66
Concession in Deliberative Contexts	73
Adverbial Reasonableness	78
Second-Order Concession	80
Rawls	84
Scanlon on Reasonableness	94
3 Political Morality	101
Elements of the Public Good	104
Conceptions of the Public Good	110
Rights	113
Broad Fairness	118

Political Cooperation	120
Authority in a Modern Liberal Democracy	124
Part II The History of Reciprocal Concern	133
4 Proper Functioning and Practical Judgment	135
Proper Functioning	136
Practical Judgment	142
5 A Historical Theory of Reasons	151
Updating	153
Shared Deliberation	159
Perspectives on Reasons	162
Internal or External?	166
The Conceptual-cum-Social Process	168
Scanlon on Reasons	174
Dworkin on Interpretation	181
6 Naturalism and Moral History	186
Kitcher	188
Boyd and Richerson	195
Levels of Moral Change	201
7 The History of Political Morality	205
Proper Functioning and the Past	207
Skinner's Method	217
Sovereignty and the State	223
The Glorious Revolution	230
Moral Progress	235
<i>References</i>	242
<i>Index</i>	247

Acknowledgments

I have received helpful comments on a preliminary version of this book from two anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press, and I have benefited from the advice of Hilary Gaskin, the Cambridge philosophy editor. Work on the book was supported by a sabbatical leave from the University of California, Santa Barbara, spring term 2014.