

BUSINESS AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Beyond the End of the Beginning

The regulation of business in the global economy poses one of the main challenges for governance, as illustrated by the dynamic scholarly and policy debates about the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights and a possible international treaty on the matter. This book takes on the conceptual and legal underpinnings of global governance approaches to business and human rights, with an emphasis on the Guiding Principles (GPs) and attention to the current treaty process. Analyses of the GPs have tended to focus on their static dimension, such as the standards they include, rather than on their capacity to change, to push the development of new norms, and practices that might go beyond the initial content of the GPs and improve corporate compliance with human rights. This book engages both the static and dynamic dimensions of the GPs, and considers the issue through the eyes of scholars and practitioners from different parts of the world.

César Rodríguez-Garavito is Executive Director of the Center for Law, Justice, and Society (Dejusticia), and director of the Global Justice and Human Rights program at the University of the Andes (Colombia). He is the founding director of the Human Rights Lab and codirector of the Global School on Socioeconomic Rights. He writes a weekly op-ed for the Colombian newspaper *El Espectador*.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17529-7 — Business and Human Rights
Edited by Cesar Rodriguez-Garavito
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

GLOBALIZATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Series Editors

Malcolm Langford
César Rodríguez-Garavito

Forthcoming Books in the Series

Jeremy Perelman, *The Rights-ification of Development: Global Poverty, Human Rights, and Globalization in the Post-Washington Consensus*

Katherine G. Young, *The Future of Economic and Social Rights*

Business and Human Rights

BEYOND THE END OF THE BEGINNING

EDITED BY

CÉSAR RODRÍGUEZ-GARAVITO

Dejusticia & University of the Andes



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17529-7 — Business and Human Rights
Edited by Cesar Rodriguez-Garavito
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107175297

DOI: 10.1017/9781316797990

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-17529-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
 Introduction: A Dialogue Across Divides in the Business and Human Rights Field César Rodríguez-Garavito	 1
 PART I GLOBAL GOVERNANCE MEETS BUSINESS AND HUMAN RIGHTS: CONCEPTUAL DEBATES AND REGULATORY ALTERNATIVES	 9
 1 Business and Human Rights: Beyond the End of the Beginning César Rodríguez-Garavito	 11
 2 Hierarchy or Ecosystem? Regulating Human Rights Risks of Multinational Enterprises John Gerard Ruggie	 46
 3 Business and Human Rights: Time to Move Beyond the “Present”? Surya Deva	 62
 4 Putting “Human Rights” Back into the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights: Shifting Frames and Embedding Participation Rights Tara J. Melish	 76
 5 From Guiding Principles to Interpretive Organizations: Developing a Framework for Applying the UNGPs to Disputes That Institutionalizes the Advocacy Role of Civil Society Larry Catá Backer	 97

6	A Treaty on Business and Human Rights? A Recurring Debate in a New Governance Landscape	111
	Claret Vargas	
	PART II THE PRACTICE OF BUSINESS AND HUMAN RIGHTS: ADVOCACY AND REGULATORY STRATEGIES	127
7	Shifting Power on Business and Human Rights: States, Corporations and Civil Society in Global Governance	129
	Chris Jochnick	
8	Always in All Ways: Ensuring Business Respect for Human Rights	138
	Amol Mehra	
9	What Next for Business and Human Rights? A Social Movement Approach	150
	Louis Bickford	
10	Regulatory Environment on Business and Human Rights: Paths at the International Level and Ideas about the Roles for Civil Society Groups	160
	Juana Kweitel	
11	Committing the Crime of Poverty: The Next Phase of the Business and Human Rights Debate	173
	Bonita Meyersfeld	
	Conclusions: Whither the Business and Human Rights Field? An Ecosystemic View	186
	César Rodríguez-Garavito	
	<i>Index</i>	200

Contributors

Larry Catá Backer is the W. Richard and Mary Eshelman Faculty Scholar and professor of law and international affairs at Pennsylvania State University. His research focuses on governance-related issues of globalization and the constitutional theories of public and private governance, with a focus on institutional frameworks for public-private law governance systems. Recent work focuses on issues of corporate social responsibility, mixed regulatory systems and regulatory governance, the emerging problems of polycentricity where multiple systems might be simultaneously applied to a single issue or event, and problems of translation between Western and Marxist-Leninist (especially Chinese) constitutional systems. He teaches courses in corporate law, transnational law, and international organizations. His publications include *Lawyers Making Meaning* (2013) and *Signs in Law, A Source Book* (2014) (both with Jan M. Broekman), casebooks, *Elements of Law and the U.S. Legal System* (2017), *Law and Religion* (2015, with Frank Ravitch), *Comparative Corporate Law* (2002), *Harmonizing Law in an Era of Globalization* (editor, 2007), and a number of articles and contributions to published collections of essays. His work, especially on Chinese constitutional law and corporate social responsibility, has been translated into Chinese.

Louis Bickford is the CEO of MEMRIA, a social enterprise which develops partnerships with organizations to collect, analyze, and circulate narrative accounts of past violence with the aim of strengthening human rights. From 2012–2017, he managed the Global Human Rights program at the Ford Foundation. Before that, he worked at the International Centre for Transitional Justice (ICTJ), where he was among the founding staff members and where he developed work on memory and accountability in countries as diverse as Bosnia, Cambodia, Canada, Ghana, Morocco, and Peru, among others. He later worked at RFK Human Rights as a member of the executive leadership team, and as the director of the European office. He has consulted with various national and international institutions including the United Nations and various philanthropic foundations in every world region. Bickford is also an adjunct professor at Columbia University and NYU, where he teaches regular graduate seminars on human rights. He has a

PhD from McGill University and an MA from the New School, both in Political Science.

Surya Deva is an associate professor at the School of Law of the City University of Hong Kong, and a member of the UN Working Group on Business and Human Rights. Deva's primary research interests lie in business and human rights, India-China constitutional law, and sustainable development. He has published extensively in these areas, and has advised UN bodies, states, multinational corporations, and civil society organizations on issues concerning business and human rights. His books include *Socio-Economic Rights in Emerging Free Markets: Comparative Insights from India and China* (editor) (Routledge, 2015); *Human Rights Obligations of Business: Beyond the Corporate Responsibility to Respect?* (coeditor with David Bilchitz) (CUP, 2013); *Confronting Capital Punishment in Asia: Human Rights, Politics, Public Opinion and Practices* (coeditor with Roger Hood) (OUP, 2013); and *Regulating Corporate Human Rights Violations: Humanizing Business* (Routledge, 2012). He is one of the founding editors-in-chief of the *Business and Human Rights Journal* (CUP), and sits on the editorial/advisory board of the *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights*, and the *Vienna Journal on International Constitutional Law*. In 2014, Deva was elected a member of the executive committee of the International Association of Constitutional Law.

Chris Jochnick is president and CEO of Landesa, a global organization dedicated to strengthening land rights for the rural poor. He has worked for three decades on issues of human rights, development, and corporate responsibility, including seven years in Latin America. Prior to Landesa, Jochnick led and built Oxfam America's private sector team, managing both partnerships with, and adversarial campaigns targeting, Fortune 500 companies. He cofounded and led two human rights organizations, the Center for Economic and Social Rights (NY) and the Centro de Derechos Economicos y Sociales (Ecuador). He also worked as an attorney with the Wall Street law firm of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton, and Garrison. Jochnick is a former fellow of the MacArthur Foundation and the Echoing Green Foundation. He is a graduate of Harvard Law School, where he teaches a course on business and human rights.

Juana Kweitel is executive director of Conectas Human Rights. She has a master's in international human rights law from the University of Essex, United Kingdom, and in political science from the University of Sao Paulo. She holds a postgraduate degree in human rights and democratic transition from the University of Chile, and a JD from the University of Buenos Aires (UBA). She serves on the board of trustees of Global Witness, the Brazil Human Rights Fund, and the advisory board of Open Global Rights. She is a member of the Assembly of Partners of the Center for Legal and Social Studies (CELS, Argentina) and of the Developments in the Field Panel of the *Business and Human Rights Journal*, published by the Cambridge University Press.

Bonita Meyersfeld is a human rights lawyer and academic. She is the director of the Centre for Applied Legal Studies and an associate professor at Wits Law School. She is an editor and chair of the board of the South African Journal on Human Rights and the founding member and chair of the board of Lawyers against Abuse. Meyersfeld obtained her LLB (cum laude) from Wits and her masters and doctorate in law from Yale Law School. She teaches and publishes in the areas of international law, business and human rights, women's rights and international criminal law. She is the author of the book, *Domestic Violence and International Law*. Prior to Wits, she worked in human rights law in the House of Lords. She has presented expert statements to various UN fora and was appointed by the Government of Ecuador as part of a five-member expert panel to provide guidance to the Inter-Governmental Working Group on a binding instrument for business and human rights.

Amol Mehra, Esq. is the executive director of the International Corporate Accountability Roundtable, a coalition of leading human rights, development, labor, and environmental organizations working to ensure businesses respect human rights in their global operations.

Tara J. Melish is professor of law at the University of Buffalo School of Law, SUNY, and director of the Buffalo Human Rights Center. A graduate of Brown University and Yale Law School, she has worked in the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, as United Nations representative of Disability Rights International, staff attorney at the Center for Justice and International Law, and legal advisor or consultant to a range of national and international human rights organizations. Specializing in strategic rights-based advocacy and litigation, she teaches in the Global School on Socio-Economic Rights, works locally on incorporating human rights principles and methodologies into city policymaking, and writes broadly in the areas of economic, social and cultural rights, human rights enforcement strategies, disability rights, transitional justice, the inter-American human rights system, and participatory approaches to bridging the governance gaps in the business and human rights context. Following graduation, she clerked on the US Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit and received professional fellowships from the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation, the Fulbright Foundation, and the Orville H. Schell, Jr. Center for International Human Rights.

César Rodríguez-Garavito is executive director and cofounder of the Center for Law, Justice, and Society (Dejusticia), an international action-research human rights center based in Colombia. He is the founding director of the Human Rights Lab and the program on global justice at the University of the Andes. He has been a visiting professor at Stanford University, Brown University, the University of Pretoria (South Africa), American University in Cairo, Central European University, and the Getulio Vargas Foundation (Brazil). He is a board member of WITNESS, the Business and Human Rights Resource Center, *OpenGlobalRights* and the

Business & Human Rights Journal. He has been an adjunct judge of the Constitutional Court of Colombia, and writes a weekly op-ed for *El Espectador*. He holds a PhD and an MS (sociology) from University of Wisconsin-Madison, an MA from NYU's Institute for Law and Society, an MA (Philosophy) from the National University of Colombia, and a JD from University of the Andes. His recent publications include *Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South* (CUP, coauthor), *Compliance with Socioeconomic Rights Judgments* (CUP, coed.), and "The Future of Human Rights: From Gatekeeping to Symbiosis" (*Sur Journal*).

John Gerard Ruggie is the Berthold Beitz Professor in Human Rights and International Affairs at Harvard's Kennedy School of Government and affiliated professor in international legal studies at Harvard Law School. He has received numerous awards for his scholarship, including a Guggenheim Fellowship, and is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts & Sciences. From 1997–2001 he served in the UN Administration of Kofi Annan as assistant secretary-general for strategic planning. His responsibilities included overseeing the creation of the UN Global Compact and the Millennium Development Goals, as well as leading Annan's institutional reform efforts and liaising with the US government. From 2005–2011 he served as special representative of the secretary-general for business and human rights, in which capacity he produced the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights. His book reflecting on that experience, *Just Business: Multinational Corporations and Human Rights* (W.W. Norton), has been translated into Chinese, Japanese, Korean, Portuguese, and Spanish. A previous book, *Constructing the World Polity*, contributed to the establishment of the social constructivist approach to the study of international relations.

Claret Vargas is a researcher and director of internationalization at the Center for the Study of Law, Justice and Society (Dejusticia), an international global south NGO based in Colombia. Before joining Dejusticia she served as executive director at the Stanford Human Rights Center. Vargas's research focuses on the design of effective implementation mechanism in business and human rights and in the context of strategic litigation. Her advocacy work includes alien tort statute litigation, the inter-American system, and the intersection of corporate responsibility, environmental degradation and human rights. She is currently completing a textbook on the inter-American system, written jointly with Professor James Cavallaro and other inter-American system experts. She earned her BA in social studies, and MA and PhD in Latin American literature from Harvard University. She holds a JD from Harvard Law School. She clerked for the Honorable Mark L. Wolf, former Chief Judge of the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts. She has also worked with the Centro de Estudios Legales y Sociales (CELS) in Argentina and was a legal fellow at the Center for Justice and Accountability (CJA).

Acknowledgments

This book is the result of several years of collective work, not only of the authors of the different chapters, but also of three institutions and groups of people that made possible the research and action project that led to this volume. The Center for Law, Justice and Society (Dejusticia), a human rights research and advocacy organization based in Bogotá, Colombia, was the home base of the project and provided much of the intellectual and organizational impetus for the book. I am particularly grateful to Dejusticia members who have staffed our business and human rights area (Meghan Morris, Sean Luna, Claret Vargas, and Tatiana Andia) for their superb research assistance and key contribution to establishing Dejusticia's voice in the global discussion on business and human rights. The Watson Institute for International and Public Affairs at Brown University was the ideal partner institution in the project. As part of the South-North Dialogue Series co-sponsored by Brown and Dejusticia, Peter Evans and I organized the workshop where the draft versions of the book's chapters were presented and discussed. With his unparalleled mix of altruism, intellectual acuity, and enthusiasm, Peter has been a source of unconditional encouragement and support over the years, and participated in every aspect of the conception and execution of the workshop. At Brown, the generous support of Rick Locke (then director of the Watson Institute) and Patrick Heller also proved essential to the success of the workshop. The Ford Foundation generously sponsored Dejusticia's international program, of which this book is a result. At Ford, Martín Abregú and Louis Bickford have been thought partners through the years and provided essential encouragement to new research and advocacy on business and human rights and other emerging fields.

During the production of the manuscript, Sean Luna and Celeste Kauffman provided outstanding editorial support. At Cambridge University Press, the advice and support of John Berger, two anonymous reviewers, and Malcolm Langford as co-editor of the Globalization and Human Rights Series encouraged me to improve, expand, and update the original manuscript.

To all of them, my deepest thanks and appreciation.

César Rodríguez-Garavito