

Thomas Aquinas on Moral Wrongdoing

Medieval thinkers were both puzzled and fascinated by the capacity of human beings to do what is morally wrong. In this book, Colleen McCluskey offers the first comprehensive examination of Thomas Aquinas's explanation for moral wrongdoing. Her discussion takes in Aquinas's theory of human nature and action and his explanation of wrong action in terms of defects in human capacities, including the intellect, the will, and the passions of the sensory appetite. She also looks at the notion of privation, which underlies Aquinas's account of wrongdoing, as well as his theory of the vices, which intersects with his basic account. The result is a thorough exploration of Aquinas's psychology that is both accessible and illuminating and will be of interest to a wide range of readers in Aquinas studies, medieval philosophy, the history of theology, and the history of ideas.

Colleen McCluskey is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Saint Louis University. She is the coauthor, with Rebecca Konyndyk De Young and Christina Van Dyke, of *Aquinas's Ethics: Metaphysical Foundations, Moral Theory, and Theological Context* (2009).

Thomas Aquinas on Moral Wrongdoing

Colleen McCluskey
Saint Louis University



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17527-3 — Thomas Aquinas on Moral Wrongdoing
Colleen McCluskey
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107175273

© Colleen McCluskey 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-17527-3 Hardback

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/delange

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-17527-3 — Thomas Aquinas on Moral Wrongdoing
Colleen McCluskey
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

In memoriam

John F. Kavanaugh, S.J. (1941–2012)

Contents

	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page ix
	<i>A Note on the Texts</i>	xii
	Introduction	1
1	Metaphysical Foundations	13
	Account of Human Nature	13
	The Process of Human Action	21
	Necessitation and Freedom	29
2	Evil as Privation	36
	The Ontological Status of Evil	36
	Objections to the Privation Theory	45
	Moral Goodness and Moral Appraisal	52
	Return to Privation	65
3	Aquinas's Account of Moral Wrongdoing: General Points and Defects in the Intellect	74
	Some General Distinctions	75
	The Roles of Will and Intellect in Wrong Actions	81
	Account of Voluntariness	87
	Wrongdoing That Originates in the Intellect	91
4	Aquinas's Account of Moral Wrongdoing: Defects in the Sensory Appetite	100
	Wrongdoing That Originates in the Sensory Appetite	101
	Practical Reasoning in Wrongdoing Originating in the Passions	107
	Weakness of Will	111
5	Aquinas's Account of Moral Wrongdoing: Defects in the Will	116
	Wrongdoing That Originates in the Will	117
	The Underlying Mechanism of Deliberate Wrongdoing	123
	Distinguishing between Evil and Ordinary Wrongdoing	128
	Is Aquinas's Account of Deliberate Wrongdoing Too Broad?	135
	Can Human Beings Perform Evil Simply for the Sake of Evil?	140
		vii

viii	Contents	
6	The Vices in Aquinas's Moral Psychology	148
	The Nature and Acquisition of Habits	148
	The Vices in <i>Summa theologiae</i>	155
	The Tradition of the Capital Vices	160
	The Capital Vices and Deliberate Wrongdoing	167
	Conclusion	174
	<i>Bibliography</i>	179
	<i>Index</i>	195

Acknowledgments

Without the support and assistance of a great many individuals, this book would have never come to fruition. I am indebted to my home institution, Saint Louis University, for a sabbatical leave in 2010 and a Faculty Research Leave in 2012. This release time greatly facilitated my work on this project.

In 2010, I participated in a two-week Summer Seminar in Christian Scholarship on the Seven Deadly Sins (Capital Vices) in the Christian Tradition led by Rebecca Konyndyk DeYoung and Robert Kruschwitz at Calvin College in Grand Rapids, Michigan. The stimulating presentations and conversations in which I took part were instrumental in my coming to see the connections between Aquinas's moral psychology and his account of the vices. Without this seminar, I doubt that I would have written the chapter on the vices.

I presented papers on the subject matter of the book at a number of conferences, which provided me with invaluable feedback on my work. These conferences included the Cornell Colloquium in Medieval Philosophy organized by Scott MacDonald at Cornell University in Ithaca, New York (2002, 2003, 2007, 2010, and 2011), the Central Division Meeting of the American Philosophical Association (2003), and Acting and Science: The Epistemology of the Practical Sciences in the 13th and 14th Centuries, held at Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität, Frankfurt am Main, Germany (2007). I am grateful to the audiences at these conferences for their insightful comments and questions.

I had the good fortune to teach two graduate seminars on the subject matter of this book, one here at SLU and the other at Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität in Frankfurt am Main, Germany. I wish to thank the students in those seminars for their lively interest and stimulating conversation on the topic.

For many years, I was privileged to be a member of an informal interdisciplinary research group whose members met regularly to discuss each other's work. I wish to thank Toby Benis, Georgia Johnston, Sherry Lindquist, Hal Parker, and Annie Smart for their discerning perspectives

x Acknowledgments

and helpful advice. The foundation for this book was laid initially while I was working on an earlier book, *Aquinas's Ethics*, coauthored with Rebecca Konyndyk DeYoung and Christina Van Dyke. I am grateful for their insights and feedback on my work in that earlier project. I also wish to thank my graduate research assistant, Donald Bungum, for his invaluable assistance with the manuscript and James McCollum for his expert technical assistance, as well as Susan L'Engle, Assistant Director, Vatican Film Library at Saint Louis University, for her expertise and assistance in identifying and obtaining the image for the book cover.

I am greatly indebted to my colleague Eleonore Stump who has been a wonderful mentor to me throughout my career. She has always made time for me when I sought her input and advice, and I am very grateful. My department chair, Theodore Vitali, CP, has always provided me with the resources and support necessary to complete a project such as this one. I am grateful for the course release he granted me and for his frequent words of encouragement, as well as for his creating the kind of collegial environment that fosters our work in the philosophy department at SLU.

I am grateful to Hilary Gaskin for her patience, skillful guidance, and unwavering support for this project. I am thankful for the work of Christofere Fila, Amanda George, Karthik Orukaimani, and the production staff at Cambridge University Press. I would also like to thank two anonymous readers from Cambridge University Press. I was very impressed with the care they took in evaluating my manuscript; their comments and suggestions have greatly enabled me to improve the book. All remaining mistakes, of course, are my own.

I am grateful to my husband, Dean Sullivan, for all of the steadfast support and encouragement he has given me over the course of my career. He has been my faithful companion on the journey.

Finally, I wish to express my heartfelt gratitude for my late colleague and friend, John Kavanaugh, S.J., in whose memory this book is dedicated. In addition to his warm collegiality and great compassion, John was a big fan of my first (coauthored) book on Aquinas's ethical theory and was very excited to hear about this book. Although he did not live to see it in print, I would like to think that he would have heartily approved of it.

In conclusion, I would like to thank the University of Notre Dame Press for permission to reprint material from Chapters 4, 5, and 6 of my (coauthored) book, *Aquinas's Ethics: Metaphysical Foundations, Moral Theory, and Theological Context*. I am also grateful to the Dominican Fathers of the Province of St. Joseph and the Thomist Press for permission to reprint material from my paper, "Intellective Appetite and Human Freedom," published in *The Thomist* 66 (2002): 421–56. Some of the ideas found in this book appeared in reworked form in the following

Acknowledgments

xi

essays: “Thomas Aquinas and the Epistemology of Moral Wrongdoing,” in *Action and Science: The Epistemology of the Practical Sciences in the 13th and 14th Centuries*, Matthias Lutz-Bachmann and Alexander Fidora, eds. (Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 2008), 107–22; “Willful Wrongdoing: Thomas Aquinas on *certa malitia*,” *Studies in the History of Ethics* 6 (2005): 1–54; and “Happiness and Freedom in Aquinas’s Theory of Action,” *Medieval Philosophy and Theology* 9 (2000): 69–90. I am also grateful to the British Library Board for permission for the book cover image (London: BL MSS Royal 6E vi).

A Note on the Texts

For citations to *Summa theologiae*, I list the part, question, article, and the part of the article when citing anything other than the *respondeo*. For the disputed questions on truth and on evil, I cite question and article. For the disputed question on the virtues in general, I cite only the article. For the commentary on the *Nicomachean Ethics*, I cite the book, the lecture, and the line numbers as well as the Leonine volume, page, and line numbers. For the *Sentences* commentary, I cite the book, distinction, question, article, and the part of the article when citing anything other than Aquinas's response.

For the most part, I have consulted the online Corpus Thomisticum (www.corpusthomicum.org/inopera.html), produced by Enrique Alarcón at the Universidad de Navarra. Most of the texts I have consulted in the online source are drawn from the Leonine edition (*Opera Omnia*, ed. Leonine Commission [Rome: Vatican Polyglot Press, 1882–]) or from the Marietti edition (Taurini: Marietti, 1961–67), which itself reproduces the text from the Leonine edition. The one exception is the *Sentences* commentary, which is taken from the Parma (1856) edition. Because a worry has been raised over the reliability of the online source, all quotations have been confirmed with the print editions: Mandonnet's edition for the *Sentences* commentary and the Leonine for everything else. For quotations, where there was significant divergence between the two sources, the text found in the print editions has been adopted, and this has been noted in the citation. Because the divisions within the online edition of the commentary on *Nicomachean Ethics* diverged from the print Leonine edition, I chose to follow the print edition in my citations from that text. There are a few places where I cite other Latin editions of Aquinas's texts, most notably the Marietti edition. I have indicated these citations in the notes.¹ All translations from the Latin are my own unless otherwise noted.

¹ For more information on the Latin editions and modern language translations of Aquinas's text, see G. Emery, O.P., "Brief Catalogue of the Works of Saint Thomas

I have used the following abbreviations for Aquinas's texts:

<i>In Sent</i>	<i>Scriptum super libros Sententiarum</i>
<i>QDM</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de malo</i>
<i>QDV</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de veritate</i>
<i>QDVC</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de virtutibus in communi</i>
<i>SCG</i>	<i>Summa contra gentiles</i>
<i>SLE</i>	<i>Sententia libri Ethicorum</i>
<i>ST</i>	<i>Summa theologiae</i>

Aquinas," in Jean-Pierre Torrell, O.P., *Saint Thomas Aquinas: The Person and His Work*, Robert Royal, trans. (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2005), 330–61.