

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17358-3 — Judicial Dialogue and Human Rights  
Edited by Amrei Müller, In collaboration with Hege Elisabeth Kjos  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## JUDICIAL DIALOGUE AND HUMAN RIGHTS

This book offers a comprehensive analysis of the extent, method, purpose and effects of domestic and international courts' judicial dialogue on human rights. The analysis covers national courts' judicial dialogue from different regions of the world, including Eastern Europe, Latin America, Canada, Nigeria and Malaysia. The text is complemented by studies on specific subject matters, such as LGBTI people's and asylum seekers' rights that further contribute to a better understanding of factors that stimulate or hold back judicial dialogue, as well as by first-hand insights of domestic and European Court of Human Rights judges into their courts' involvement in judicial dialogue. The volume contains contributions from leading scholars and judges, whose combined perspectives provide an interesting and timely study.

AMREI MÜLLER is currently a post-doctoral fellow at the Centre of Excellence 'PluriCourts' for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order, at the University of Oslo.

HEGE ELISABETH KJOS is Assistant Professor at the Amsterdam Center for International Law, University of Amsterdam.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17358-3 — Judicial Dialogue and Human Rights  
Edited by Amrei Müller, In collaboration with Hege Elisabeth Kjos  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

STUDIES ON INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

*General Editors*

Andreas Føllesdal, University of Oslo  
Geir Ulfstein, University of Oslo

Studies on International Courts and Tribunals contains theoretical and interdisciplinary scholarship on legal aspects as well as the legitimacy and effectiveness of international courts and tribunals.

OTHER BOOKS IN THE SERIES

Mads Andenas and Eirik Bjorge (eds.) *A Farewell to Fragmentation: Reassertion and Convergence in International Law*  
Cecilia M. Bailliet and Nobuo Hayashi (eds.) *The Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals*

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17358-3 — Judicial Dialogue and Human Rights  
Edited by Amrei Müller, In collaboration with Hege Elisabeth Kjos  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# JUDICIAL DIALOGUE AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Edited by  
AMREI MÜLLER  
*(in collaboration with Hege Elisabeth Kjos)*



Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17358-3 — Judicial Dialogue and Human Rights  
Edited by Amrei Müller, In collaboration with Hege Elisabeth Kjos  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India  
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107173583](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107173583)  
10.1017/9781316780237

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

Names: Müller, Amrei, editor. | Kjos, Hege Elisabeth, editor.

Title: Judicial dialogue and human rights / edited by Amrei Müller ;  
(in collaboration with Hege Elisabeth Kjos).

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016047833 | ISBN 9781107173583 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: International human rights courts. | Human rights. |  
Communication in law. | Judicial process.

Classification: LCC K3240.5 .J83 2017 | DDC 342.08/5–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2016047833>

ISBN 978-1-107-17358-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>Contributors</i>	xi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of Conventions and Statutes</i>	xlix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	li
<i>Abbreviations</i>	liii
1 Introduction	1
AMREI MÜLLER AND HEGE ELISABETH KJOS	
<b>PART I Judicial Dialogue in Domestic Courts</b>	
2 Judicial Dialogue on International Human Rights Law in Poland and Eastern Europe	27
IZABELA SKOMERSKA-MUCHOWSKA	
3 Horizontal Judicial Dialogue on Human Rights: The Practice of Constitutional Courts in South America	67
MICHAEL FREITAS MOHALLEM	
4 The Supreme Court of Canada’s Transnational Judicial Communication on Human Rights (1982–2014): An Empirical Assessment	114
GIANLUCA GENTILI AND ELAINE MAK	
5 Ideological Barriers to Judicial Dialogue: A Study of the Laws Establishing <i>Shari’ah</i> Courts in Malaysia and Nigeria	153
AZIZAT O. AMOLOYE-ADEBAYO	
6 Complementary Protection and Domestic Courts: The Extent, Method, Purpose and Effects of Judicial Dialogue	173
NAOMI HART	

- 7 The Construction of Same-Sex Families in Western Europe through Legislative and Judicial Dialogues: The Role of National Legislatures and Supranational Courts 216  
 DANIELE GALLO AND MATTEO M. WINKLER  
**Reports on Practice: Domestic Judges**
- 8 Engaging in Judicial Dialogue: Some Reflections from the United Kingdom Supreme Court 253  
 THE RIGHT HONOURABLE LORD CARNWATH OF NOTTING HILL
- 9 Engaging in Judicial Dialogue: The Practice of the German Federal Constitutional Court 258  
 ANDREAS PAULUS
- 10 Judicial Dialogue: The Experience of Italy 267  
 RAFFAELE SABATO  
**PART II Judicial Dialogue in the European Court of Human Rights**
- 11 The ECtHR's Engagement with German and Russian Courts' Decisions: Encouraging Effective Cooperation to Secure ECHR Rights 287  
 AMREI MÜLLER
- 12 Encouraging Judicial Dialogue: The Contribution of Human Rights NGOs' Briefs to the European Court of Human Rights 339  
 LAURA VAN DEN EYNDE  
**Reports on Practice: ECtHR Judges**
- 13 Dialogues between the Strasbourg Court and National Courts 401  
 LUIS LÓPEZ GUERRA
- 14 The ECtHR's Use of Decisions of Domestic Courts from States Not Involved in the Case and of Other Council of Europe Bodies 410  
 ERIK MØSE
- 15 The ECtHR' Use of Decisions of International Courts and Quasi-Judicial Bodies 419  
 ANGELIKA NUßBERGER

PART III Normative and Theoretical Appraisals

16	From Judicial Dialogue to Cosmopolitan Norms: Enhancing Democracy in Globalised States	435
	CLARA MARSAN-RAVENTÓS	
17	Dialogue or Interaction? A Non-Cosmopolitan Reading of Transjudicial Communication	467
	LUCA PASQUET	
18	Conclusion	504
	AMREI MÜLLER	
	<i>Annex 1: Transnational Judicial Dialogue: Concept, Method, Extent and Effects (Guiding Questions to National Judges)</i>	529
	<i>Annex 2: Transnational Judicial Dialogue: Concept, Method, Extent and Effects (Guiding Questions to ECtHR Judges)</i>	535
	<i>Select Bibliography</i>	543
	<i>Index</i>	555

## CONTRIBUTORS

**AZIZAT O. AMOLOYE-ADEBAYO** holds a PhD in *Shari'ah* and international human rights law from the University of Nottingham. She currently lectures in the Islamic Law department, Faculty of Law, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria. She is a barrister and solicitor of the Supreme Court of Nigeria and an associate of the Chartered Institute of Arbitrators, Nigeria and United Kingdom.

**THE RIGHT HONOURABLE LORD CARNWATH OF NOTTING HILL** is Justice of the United Kingdom Supreme Court.

**DANIELE GALLO** (PhD, Sapienza University) is a senior lecturer at Luiss University (Rome, Italy) and holds the qualification of associate professor of international law and EU law.

**GIANLUCA GENTILI** (PhD) is a lecturer in law at the University of Sussex, School of Law. His research and teaching focus on Canadian, US and UK public law, in a comparative perspective.

**LUIS LÓPEZ GUERRA** holds a licenciado en derecho from Universidad Complutense (School of Law), a master's in political science from Michigan State University and a doctorate in law from Universidad Complutense. He is a professor of constitutional law, Universidad de Extremadura (1979–1995) and Universidad Carlos III de Madrid (1996–today). He has been a Judge at the Spanish Constitutional Court (1986–1995), Secretary of State of Justice (2004–2007) and is currently (since 2008) a Judge at the European Court of Human Rights.

**NAOMI HART** is a PhD candidate in law at St John's College, University of Cambridge. She is also currently in training to become a barrister of England and Wales.

**HEGE ELISABETH KJOS** is assistant professor at the Amsterdam Center for International Law, University of Amsterdam. She holds a doctorate, a JD, a Cand. Mag. degree and a Bachelor's degree following studies in



the United States, the Netherlands, France and Norway. Her courses and research at the University of Amsterdam focus on international law and international dispute settlement in general, and specialise in international investment law and arbitration.

**ELAINE MAK** is an endowed professor of empirical study of public law, in particular of rule-of-law institutions, at Erasmus University Rotterdam, Erasmus School of Law. Her research interests include legal theory, (comparative) constitutional law and socio-legal analysis, focusing on the functioning of public institutions in liberal-democratic systems. She has published a monograph on *Judicial Decision-Making in a Globalised World* (Hart Publishing, 2013).

**CLARA MARSAN-RAVENTÓS** is a public law lecturer at Universitat Oberta de Catalunya, associate professor at Universitat Pompeu Fabra and visiting professor at Universitat de Girona. She holds a PhD from the European University Institute and has devoted her research to constitutional theory and practice from comparative and multilevel perspectives.

**MICHAEL FREITAS MOHALLEM** is a lecturer in human rights law and head of the Center for Justice and Society at Fundação Getúlio Vargas (FGV) Law School, Rio de Janeiro (Brazil). He is a PhD candidate at the University College London (UCL, School of Law). He holds an LLM degree in public law and human rights from UCL, a postgraduate degree in political science from the University of Brasília and an LLB from the Catholic University of São Paulo (Brazil).

**ERIK MØSE** is a Judge at the European Court of Human Rights. He has been a judge in the Supreme Court of Norway and was previously President of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda.

**AMREI MÜLLER** is a post-doctoral fellow at the department of public and international law of the University of Oslo (*PluriCourts*). She has obtained her PhD degree from the University of Nottingham, School of Law, United Kingdom. Her research interests lie in the area of public international law and human rights, in particular economic, social and cultural rights, the law of the European Convention on Human Rights and international humanitarian law.

**ANGELIKA NUSBERGER** has been a Judge at the European Court of Human Rights since January 2011 and the President of the 5th Section since November 2015. She is also a professor of public international law and comparative constitutional law at Cologne University since 2002.

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-107-17358-3 — Judicial Dialogue and Human Rights  
 Edited by Amrei Müller, In collaboration with Hege Elisabeth Kjos  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

**LUCA PASQUET** holds a PhD in international law from the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Geneva and a law degree from the University of Torino. His research interests are the relation between human rights and other branches of international law (in particular the law of immunities), legal pluralism and legal theory.

**ANDREAS PAULUS** (Dr. juris) is Justice at the Federal Constitutional Court (Germany), professor of international and public law at the University of Göttingen and co-director of the Institute of International and European Law of the Georg-August-University Göttingen.

**RAFFAELE SABATO** is a doctor of law (Naples, Italy), a doctor of political sciences (Macerata, Italy) and holds a master's degree of comparative jurisprudence (University of Texas at Austin, USA). He is a Justice at the Supreme Court of Cassation (Rome, Italy); a member of the board of directors, coordinator for the international department, School for the Judiciary (Rome, Italy); a member, and past chair, Consultative Council of European Judges, Council of Europe (Strasbourg, France); and a fellow and member of the Council, European Law Institute (Vienna, Austria).

**IZABELA SKOMERSKA-MUCHOWSKA** (PhD) is assistant professor at the Jaen Monet Chair of European Constitutional Law at the faculty of law and administration of the University of Łódź. Her research interests lie in the area of European institutional law and public international law.

**LAURA VAN DEN EYNDE** is a research fellow (F.R.S.-F.N.R.S.) at the Université libre de Bruxelles (Belgium). She holds a master of laws from ULB, a European master's degree in human rights and democratisation (EUIC – Venice) and a master of the science of the law from Stanford University.

**MATTEO M. WINKLER** (PhD, Bocconi University; LLM, Yale Law School) is assistant professor at HEC Paris, which he joined in 2014 after a long experience as a litigator in Italy. He has published extensively in the fields of transnational litigation, international commercial law, international commercial arbitration and human rights, in particular lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) rights. In 2014 he was a visiting professor at Humboldt University in Berlin.

## TABLE OF CASES

## International

*International Court of Justice*

*Jurisdictional Immunities of the State (Germany v. Italy: Greece intervening)*, ICJ Reports (2012) 99.

*Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Georgia v. Russian Federation)* ICJ Reports (2011), 70.

*Certain Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany)* ICJ Reports (2005), 6.

*LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America)* ICJ Reports (2001), 466.

*Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America)* ICJ Reports (2004) 12.

*International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia Cases*

*Prosecutor v. Limaj, Bala and Musliu*, Judgment (Trial Chamber II), Case No. IT-03-66-T, 30 November 2005.

*Prosecutor v. Tadić*, Decision on the Defence Motion for Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction (Trial Chamber), Case No. IT-94-1-AR72, 2 October 1995.

*UN Committee against Torture*

*Chahin v. Sweden*, Communication No. 310/2007, 8 July 2011, UN Doc. CAT/C/46/D/310/2007.

*EA v. Switzerland*, Communication No. 28/1995, 10 November 1997, UN Doc. CAT/C/19/D/28/1995.

*Mutombo v. Switzerland*, Communication No. 13/1993, 27 April 1994, UN Doc. CAT/C/12/D/013/1993.

*Tapia Paez v. Sweden*, Communication No. 39/1996, 28 April 1997, UN Doc. CAT/C/18/D/39/1996.

### *UN Human Rights Committee*

*A v. Australia*, Communication No. 560/1993, 30 April 1997, UN Doc. CCPR/C/59/D/560/1993.

*Fedotova v. Russia*, Communication No.1932/2010, 30 November 2012, UN Doc. CCPR/C/106/D/1932/2010.

*Haraldson and Sveinsson v. Iceland*, Communication No. 1306/2004, 24 October 2007, UN Doc. CCPR/C/91/D/1306/2004.

*Irene Bleier Lewenhoff and Rosa Valino de Bleier v. Uruguay*, Communication No. 30/1978, 29 March 1982, UN Doc. CCPR/C/OP/1.

*Jongenburger-Veerman v. the Netherlands*, Communication No. 1238/2004, 1 November 2005, UN Doc. CCPR/C/85/D/1238/2004.

*Love et. al v. Australia*, Communication No. 983/2001, 25 March 2003, U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/77/D/983/2001.

*Ranjit Singh v. France*, Communication No. 1876/2009, 27 September 2011, UN Doc. CCPR/C/102/1876/2009.

### Regional

#### *Court of Justice of the European Union*

Case C-104/09, *Roca-Álvarez v. Sesa Start España ETT SA* [2010] ECR I-8661; ECLI:EU:C:2010:561.

Case C-106/77, *Amministrazione delle Finanze dello Stato v. Simmenthal S.p.A* [1978] ECR 629; ECLI:EU:C:1978:49.

Case C-108/10, *Ivana Scattolon v. Ministero dell'Università e della Ricerca* [2011] ECR I-7491; ECLI:EU:C:2011:542.

Case C-122/99 and C-125/99 P, *D. v. Council* [2001] ECR I-4319; ECLI:EU:C:2001:304.

Case C-131/12, *Google Spain SL, Google Inc. v. Agencia Española de Protección de Datos, Mario Costeja González* [2014], ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2014:317.

Case C-147/08, *Jurgen Römer v. Freie und Hansestadt Hamburg* [2011] ECR I-3591; ECLI:EU:C:2011:286.

Case C-208/09, *Ilonka Sayn-Wittgenstein v. Landeshauptmann von Wien*, [2010] ECR I-13693, ECLI:EU:C:2010:608.

## TABLE OF CASES

xvii

- Case C-249/96, *Grant v. South-West Trains Ltd* [1998] ECR I-6211; ECLI:EU:C:1998:63.
- Case C-267/06, *Tadao Maruko v. Versorgungsanstalt der Deutschen Bühnen* [2008] ECR I-1757; ECLI:EU:C:2008:179.
- Case C-277/11, *MM v. Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform and Attorney General of Ireland* [2014], ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2012:744.
- Case C-285/12, *Diakité v. Commissaire Général aux Réfugiés et aux Apatrides* [2014], ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2014:39.
- Case C-293/12 and C-594/12 (joined Cases), *Digital Rights Ireland and Seitlinger and Others v. Minister for Communications, Marine and Natural Resources and others* [2014] ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2014:238.
- Case C-36/02, *Omega Spielhallen- und Automatenaufstellungs-GmbH v. Oberbürgermeisterin der Bundesstadt Bonn*, [2004] ECR I-9609, ECLI:EU:C:2004:614.
- Case C-402/05 P and C-415/05 P (joined cases), *Kadi and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council et al.* [2008] ECR I-6351; ECLI:EU:C:2008:461.
- Case C-41/74, *Van Duyn v. Home Office* [1974] ECR 1337; ECLI:EU:C:1974:133.
- Case C-411/10 and C-493/10 (joined cases), *NS and Others v. Secretary of State for the Home Department and Others* [2011] ECR I-13905; ECLI:EU:C:2011:865.
- Case C-465/07, *Elgafaji v. Staatssecretaris van Justitie* [2009] ECR I-921; ECLI:EU:C:2009:94.
- Case C-542/13, *M'Bodj v. État Belge* [2014], ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2014:2452.
- Case C-571/10, *Servet Kamberaj v. Istituto per l'Edilizia sociale della Provincia autonoma di Bolzano (IPES) and Others* [2012] ECR I-233; ECLI:EU:C:2012:233.
- Case C-604/12, *HN v. Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform and Attorney General of Ireland* [2014], ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2014:302.
- Case C-617/10, *Åklagaren v. Åkerberg Fransson* [2014] ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2013:105.
- Case C-28/14, *Ryszard Pańczyk v. Dyrektor Zakładu Emerytalno-Rentowego Ministerstwa Spraw Wewnętrznych i Administracji w Warszawie* [2014] ECR I-0000; ECLI:EU:C:2014:2003.
- Case F-122/06, *Anton Peter Roodhuijzen v. Commission* [2007] ECR SC I-A-1-00387 and II-A-1-02167; ECLI:EU:F:2007:208.
- Case F-86/09, *W. v. Commission* [2010] ECR -0000; ECLI:EU:F:2010:125.

Case T-58/08 P, *Commission v. Anton Peter Roodhuijzen* [2009] ECR II-3797; ECLI:EU:T:2009:385.

*European Court of Human Rights*

- A. and Others v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 3455/05), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 19 February 2009, ECHR 2009-II.
- A. B. and C. v. Ireland* (Appl. No. 25579/05), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 16 December 2010, ECHR 2010-IV.
- Abramyan and Yakubovskiye v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 38951/13 and 59611/13), Decision (Chamber), 12 May 2015, not reported.
- Ageyevy v. Russia* (Appl. No. 7075/10), Judgment (Chamber), 18 April 2013, not reported.
- Agrati and Others v. Italy* (Appl. Nos. 43549/08, 6107/09 and 5087/09), Judgment (Chamber), 7 June 2011, not reported.
- Ahmed and Others v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 22954/93), Judgment (Chamber), 2 September 1998, ECHR 1998-VI.
- Ahrens v. Germany* (Appl. No. 45071/09), Judgment (Chamber), 22 March 2012, not reported.
- Akkum and Others v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 21894/93), Judgment (Chamber), 24 March 2005, ECHR 2005-II.
- Aksu v. Turkey* (Appl. Nos. 4149/04 and 41029/04), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 15 March 2012, ECHR 2012-1.
- Al-Adsani v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 35763/97), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 21 November 2001, ECHR 2001-XI.
- Aleksey Ovchinnikov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 24061/04), Judgment (Chamber), 16 December 2010, not reported.
- Al-Khawaja and Tahery v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. Nos. 26766/05 and 22228/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 15 December 2011, ECHR 2011-VI.
- Al-Khawaja and Tahery v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. Nos. 26766/05 and 22228/06), Judgment (Chamber), 20 January 2009, not reported.
- Allan v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 48539/99), Judgment (Chamber), 5 November 2002, ECHR 2002-IX.
- Al-Skeini and Other v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 55721/07), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 7 July 2011, ECHR 2011-IV.
- Amirov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 51857/13), Judgment (Chamber), 27 November 2014, not reported.
- Amirov v. Russia* (Appl. no. 51857/13), Judgment (Chamber), 27 Nov 2014, not reported.

## TABLE OF CASES

xix

- Ananyev and Others v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 42525/07 and 60800/08), Judgment (Chamber), 10 January 2012, not reported.
- Anayo v. Germany* (Appl. No. 20578/07), Judgment (Chamber), 21 December 2010, not reported.
- Anchugov and Gladkov v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 11157/04 and 15162/05), Judgment (Chamber), 4 July 2013, not reported.
- Animal Defenders International v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 48876/08), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 April 2013, ECHR 2013-II.
- Appel-Irrgang and Others v. Germany* (Appl. No. 45216/07), Judgment (Chamber), 6 October 2009, ECHR 2009-IV.
- Appleby and Others v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 44306/98), Judgment (Chamber), 6 May 2003, ECHR 2003-VI.
- Aslakhanova and Others v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 2944/06, 8300/07, 50184/07, 332/08 and 42509/10), Judgment (Chamber), 18 December 2012, not reported.
- Assenov and Others v. Bulgaria* (Appl. No. 24760/94), Judgment (Chamber), 28 October 1998, ECHR 1998-VIII.
- Avilkina and Others v. Russia* (Appl. No. 1585/09), Judgment (Chamber), 6 June 2013, not reported.
- Axel Springer AG v. Germany* (Appl. No. 39954/08), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 7 February 2012, not reported.
- Aydin v. Germany* (Appl. No. 16637/07), Judgment (Chamber), 27 January 2011, not reported.
- B.B. and F.B. v. Germany* (Appl. Nos. 18734/09 and 9424/11), Judgment (Chamber), 14 March 2013, not reported.
- Bajsultanov v. Austria* (Appl. No. 54131/10), Judgment (Chamber), 12 June 2012, not reported.
- Batuzov v. Germany* (Appl. No. 17603/07), Decision (Chamber), 22 May 2012, not reported.
- Bayatyan v. Armenia* (Appl. No. 23459/03), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 7 July 2011, ECHR 2011-IV.
- Bazo González v. Spain* (Appl. No. 30643/04), Judgment (Chamber), 16 December 2008, not reported.
- Bensaid v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 44599/98), Judgment (Chamber), 6 February 2001, ECHR 2001-I.
- Berdzenishvili v. Russia* (Appl. No. 31697/03), Decision (Chamber), 29 January 2004, 2004-II.
- Berrehab v. the Netherlands* (Appl. No. 10730/84), Judgment (Chamber), 21 June 1998, Series A, No. 138.



- Bordikov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 921/03), Judgment (Chamber), 8 October 2009, not reported.
- Bosphorus Hava Yollari Turizm v. Ireland* (Appl. No. 45036/98), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 30 June 2005, ECHR 2005-VI.
- Bosphorus v. Ireland* (Appl. No. 45036/98), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 30 June 2005, ECHR 2005-VI.
- Buldashev v. Russia* (Appl. No. 46793/06), Judgment (Chamber), 18 October 2011, not reported.
- Catan and Others v. Moldova and Russia* (Appl. Nos. 43370/04, 8252/05 and 18454/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 19 October 2012, ECHR 2012-V.
- Center of Legal Resources on behalf of V. Câmpeanu v. Romania* (Appl. No. 47848/08), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 17 July 2014, selected for publication 2014.
- Chahal v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 22414/93), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 15 November 1996, Reports 1996-V.
- Christine Goodwin v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 28957/95), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 11 July 2002, ECHR 2002-VI.
- Coban v. Spain* (Appl. No. 17060/02), Judgment (Chamber), 25 September 2006, not reported.
- Communist Party and Others v. Russia* (Appl. No. 29400/05), Judgment (Chamber), 19 June 2012, not reported.
- Craxi v. Italy (No.2)* (Appl. No. 25337/94), Judgment (Chamber), 17 July 2003, not reported.
- D.H. v. Czech Republic* (Appl. No. 57325/00), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 13 November 2007, ECHR 113.
- Dahlab v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 42393/98), Decision (Chamber), 15 February 2001, ECHR 2001-V.
- Davydov and Others v. Russia* (Appl. No. 75947/11), communicated on 18 March 2014.
- De Souza Ribeiro v. France* (Appl. No. 22689/07), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 13 December 2012, ECHR 2012-VI.
- Demir and Baykara v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 34503/97), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 12 November 2008, ECHR 2008-V.
- Denisov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 33408/03), Decision (Chamber), 6 May 2004, not reported.
- Dirdizov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 41461/10), Judgment (Chamber), 27 November 2012, not reported.
- Dmitriy Ryabov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 33774/08), Judgment (Chamber), 1 August 2013, not reported.



## TABLE OF CASES

xxi

- Dojan and Others v. Germany* (Appl. Nos. 319/08, 2455/08, 7908/10, 8152/10 and 8155/10), Decision (Chamber), 13 September 2011, not reported.
- Dubská and Krejzová v. Czech Republic* (Appl. Nos. 28859/11 28473/12) Judgment (Chamber), 11 December 2014, selected for publication 2014.
- Dudgeon v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 7525/76), Judgment (Plenary) 22 October 1981, Series A, No. 45.
- E.B. v. France* (Appl. No. 43546/02), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 January 2008, not reported.
- Ekbatani v. Sweden* (Appl. No. 10563/83), Judgment (Plenary), 26 May 1988, Series A, No. 134.
- El-Masri v. the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia* (Appl. No. 39630/09), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 13 December 2012, ECHR 2012-VI.
- Elsholz v. Germany* (Appl. No. 25735/94), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 13 July 2000, ECHR 2000-VIII.
- Enke v. Germany* (Appl. No. 545/08), Judgment (Chamber), 9 October 2009, not reported.
- Fabris v. France* (Appl. No. 16574108), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 7 February 2013, ECHR 2013-I.
- Finci v. Bosnia and Herzegovina* (Appl. Nos. 27996/06 and 34836/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 December 2009, not reported.
- Finogenov and Others v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 18299/03 and 27311/03), Judgment (Chamber), 20 December 2011, ECHR 2011-VI.
- G. v. Germany* (Appl. No. 65210/09), Judgment (Chamber), 7 June 2012, not reported.
- Gäffen v. Germany* (Appl. No. 22978/05), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 1 June 2010, ECHR 2010 IV.
- Gaforov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 25404/09), Judgment (Chamber), 21 October 2010, not reported.
- Gandaloyeva v. Russia* (Appl. No. 14800/04), Judgment (Chamber), 4 December 2008, not reported.
- Gas and Dubois v. France* (Appl. No. 25911/07), Judgment (Chamber), 15 March 2012, ECHR 2012-II.
- Georgia v. Russia (II)* (Appl. No. 38263/08), Decision (Chamber), 13 December 2011, not reported.
- Giuliani and Gaggio v. Italy* (Appl. No. 23458/02), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 24 March 2011, ECHR 2011-II.
- Glien v. Germany* (Appl. No. 7345/12), Judgment (Chamber), 28 November 2013, not reported.

- Göbel v. Germany* (Appl. No. 35023/04), Judgment (Chamber), 8 December 2011, not reported.
- Görgülü v. Germany* (Appl. No. 74969/01), Judgment (Chamber), 26 February 2004, not reported.
- Gracia Cancio v. Germany* (Appl. No. 19488/09), Decision (Chamber), 29 May 2012, not reported.
- Gross v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 67810/10), Judgment (Chamber), 30 September 2014, selected for publication 2014.
- Guja v. Moldova* (Appl. No. 14277/04), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 12 February 2008, ECHR 2008 II.
- Guzzardi v. Italy* (Appl. No. 7367/76), Judgment (Plenary), 6 November 1980, Series A, No. 39.
- H.W. v. Germany* (Appl. No. 17167/11), Judgment (Chamber), 19 September 2013, not reported.
- Hämäläinen v. Finland* (Appl. No. 37359/09), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 16 July 2014, selected for publication 2014.
- Heinisch v. Germany* (Appl. No. 28274/08), Judgment (Chamber), 21 July 2011, ECHR 2011-V.
- Hermann v. Germany* (Appl. No. 9300/07), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 26 June 2012, not reported.
- Hirsi Jamaa v. Italy* (Appl. No. 27765/09), Judgment (Grand Chamber) 23 February 2012, ECHR 2012-II.
- Hirst v. the United Kingdom (No.2)* (Appl. No. 74025/01), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 6 October 2005, ECHR 2005-XI.
- Hirst v. the United Kingdom (No.2)* (Appl. No. 74025/01), Judgment (Chamber), 30 March 2004, not reported.
- HLR v. France* (Appl. No. 24573/94), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 29 April 1997, Reports 1997-III.
- Hoffer and Annen v. Germany* (Appl. Nos. 397/07 and 2322/07), Judgment (Chamber), 13 January 2011, ECHR 2011.
- Hromadka and Hromadkova v. Russia* (Appl. No. 22909/10), Judgment (Chamber), 11 December 2014, not reported.
- Hümmer v. Germany* (Appl. No. 26171/07), Judgment (Chamber), 9 July 2012, not reported.
- Idalov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 5826/03), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 May 2012, not reported.
- Igual Coll v. Spain* (Appl. No. 37496/04), Judgment (Chamber), 10 March 2009, not reported.
- Imbrioscia v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 13972/88) Judgment (Chamber) 24 November 1993, Series A, No. 275.

## TABLE OF CASES

xxiii

- Incal v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 22678/93), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 9 June 1998, ECHR 1998-IV.
- Ireland v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 5310/71), Judgment (Plenary), 18 January 1978, Series A, No. 25.
- Isayeva and Others v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 57947/00, 57948/00 and 57949/00), Judgment (Chamber), 24 February 2005, not reported.
- Iskandarov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 17185/05), Judgment (Chamber), 23 September 2010, not reported.
- James and Others v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 8793/79), Judgment (Plenary), 21 February 1986, Series A, No. 98.
- John Murray v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 18731/91), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 8 February 1996, Reports 1996-I.
- K.A. v. Finland* (Appl. No. 27751/95), Judgment (Chamber), 14 January 2003, not reported.
- Kamaliyevy v. Russia* (Appl. No. 52812/07), Judgment (Chamber), 3 June 2010, not reported.
- Karner v. Austria* (Appl. No. 40016/98), Judgment (Chamber), 24 July 2003, ECHR 2003-IX.
- Kasparov and Others v. Russia* (Appl. No. 21613/07), Judgment (Chamber), 3 October 2013, not reported.
- Kaya v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 22729/93), Judgment (Chamber), 19 February 1998, not reported.
- Keegan v. Ireland* (Appl. No. 16969/90), Judgment (Chamber), 26 May 1994, Series A, No. 290.
- Khamidov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 72118/01), Judgment (Chamber), 15 November 2007, not reported.
- Khashiyev and Akayeva v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 57942/00 and 57945/00), Judgment (Chamber), 24 February 2005, not reported.
- Khaydarov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 21055/09), Judgment (Chamber), 20 May 2010, not reported.
- Khlyustov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 28975/05), Judgment (Chamber), 11 July 2013, not reported.
- Rhodorkovskiy v. Russia* (Appl. No. 5829/04), Judgment (Chamber), 31 May 2011, not reported.
- Rhodzhayev v. Russia* (Appl. No. 52466/08), Judgment (Chamber), 12 May 2010, not reported.
- Rhudoyorov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 6847/02), Judgment (Chamber), 8 November 2005, ECHR 2005-X.
- Kiyutin v. Russia* (Appl. No. 2700/10), Judgment (Chamber), 10 March 2011, ECHR 2011-II.

- Klaas v. Germany* (Appl. No. 15473/89), Judgment (Chamber), 22 September 1993, Series A, No 269.
- Kononov v. Latvia* (Appl. No. 36376/04), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 17 May 2010, ECHR 2010-IV.
- Konstantin Markin v. Russia* (Appl. No. 30078/06) Judgment (Chamber), 7 October 2010, not reported.
- Konstantin Markin v. Russia* (Appl. No. 30078/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 March 2012, ECHR 2012-III.
- Korchuganova v. Russia* (Appl. No. 75039/01), Judgment (Chamber), 8 June 2006, not reported.
- Kotov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 54522/00), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 3 April 2012, not reported.
- Kozak v. Poland* (Appl. No. 13102/02), Judgment (Chamber), 2 March 2010, not reported.
- Kronfeldner v. Germany* (Appl. No. 21906/09), Judgment (Chamber), 19 January 2012, not reported.
- Kulevskiy v. Russia* (Appl. No. 20696/12), Decision (Chamber), 20 November 2012, not reported.
- Kuppinger v. Germany* (Appl. No. 62198/11), Judgment (Chamber), 15 January 2015, not reported.
- Kurić and Others v. Slovenia* (Appl. No. 26828/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 26 June 2012, ECHR 2012-IV.
- Lautsi and Others v. Italy* (Appl. No. 30814/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 18 March 2011, ECHR 2011-III.
- Leyla Şahin v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 44774/98), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 10 November 2005, ECHR 2005-XI.
- Lingens v. Austria* (Appl. No. 9815/82), Judgment (Court), 8 July 1986, Series A, No. 103.
- Litwin v. Germany* (Appl. No. 29090/06), Judgment (Chamber), 3 November 2011, not reported.
- Loizidou v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 15318/89), Judgment (Grand Chamber, preliminary objections), 23 March 1995, Vol. A, No. 310.
- M and Co. v. Federal Republic of Germany* (Appl. No. 13258/87), Decision (Commission), 9 February 1990, D. R. 64.
- M. v. Germany* (Appl. No. 19359/04), Judgment (Chamber), 17 December 2009, ECHR 2009-VI.
- Makarenko v. Russia* (Appl. No. 5962/03), Judgment (Chamber), 22 December 2009, not reported.
- Makhauri v. Russia* (Appl. No. 58701/00), Judgment (Chamber), 4 October 2007, not reported.

## TABLE OF CASES

XXV

- Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey* (Appl. Nos. 46827/99 and 46951/99), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 4 February 2005, ECHR 2005-I.
- Mamazhonov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 17239/13), Judgment (Chamber), 23 October 2014, not reported.
- Marchenko v. Ukraine* (Appl. No. 4063/04), Judgment (Chamber), 19 February 2009, not reported.
- Marckx v. Belgium* (Appl. No. 6833/74), Judgment (Plenary), 13 June 1979, ECHR, Series A, No. 31.
- Markin v. Russia* (Appl. No. 30078/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 March 2012, ECHR 2012-III.
- Maslova and Nalbandov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 839/02), Judgment (Chamber), 24 January 2008, not reported.
- Matthews v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 24833/94), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 18 February 1999, ECHR 1999-I.
- Mazurek v. France* (Appl. No. 34406/97) Judgment (Chamber), 1 February 2000, ECHR 2000-II.
- McCann and Others v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 18984/91), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 27 September 1995, Series A, No. 324.
- MGN Limited v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 39401/04), Judgment (Chamber), 18 January 2011, not reported.
- Mork v. Germany* (Appl. Nos. 31047/04 and 43386/08), Judgment (Chamber), 9 June 2011, not reported.
- Morris v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 38784/97), Judgment (Chamber), 26 February 2002, ECHR 2002-I.
- Mouvement raëlien suisse v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 16354/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 13 July 2012, ECHR 2012-IV.
- MSS v. Belgium and Greece* (Appl. No. 30696/09), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 21 January 2011, ECHR 2011-I.
- Musayev and Others v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 57941/00, 58699/00 and 60403/00), Judgment (Chamber), 26 July 2007, not reported.
- Nachova and Others v. Bulgaria* (Appl. Nos. 43577/98, 43579/98, 43577/98 and 43579/98), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 6 July 2005, ECHR 2005-VII.
- Nada v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 10593/08), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 12 September 2012, ECHR 2012-V.
- Nakhmanovich v. Russia* (Appl. No. 55669/00), Judgment (Chamber), 2 March 2006, not reported.
- National Union of Rail, Maritime and Transport Workers (RTM) v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 31045/10), Judgment (Chamber), 8 April 2014, not reported.

- Neulinger and Shuruk v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 41615/07), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 6 July 2010, ECHR 2010-V.
- Oliari and Others v. Italy* (Appl. Nos. 18766/11 and 36030/11), Judgment (Chamber), 21 July 2015, selected for publication 2015.
- Orsus and Others v. Croatia* (Appl. No. 15766/1037), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 16 March 2010, ECHR 2010-II.
- Ostermünchner v. Germany* (Appl. No. 36035/04), Judgment (Chamber), 22 March 2012, not reported.
- Otegi Mondragon v. Spain* (Appl. No. 11662/85), Judgment (Chamber), 15 March 2011, ECHR 2011-I.
- Othman (Abu Qatada) v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 8139/09), Judgment (Chamber), 19 May 2012, ECHR 2012-I.
- Özgür Gündem v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 23144/93), Judgment (Chamber), 16 March 2000, ECHR 2000-III.
- Pakdemirli v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 5839/97), Judgment (Chamber), 22 February 2005, not reported.
- Paksas v. Lithuania* (Appl. No. 34932/04), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 6 January 2011, ECHR 2011-I.
- Palomo Sánchez and Others v. Spain* (Appl. Nos. 28955/06, 28957/06, 28959/06 and 28964/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 12 September 2011, ECHR 2011-V.
- Pellegrin v. France* (Appl. No. 28541/95), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 8 December 1999, ECHR 1999 VIII.
- Peta Deutschland v. Germany* (Appl. No. 43481/09), Judgment (Chamber), 8 November 2012, not reported.
- Petrovic v. Austria* (Appl. No. 20458/92), Judgment (Chamber), 27 March 1998, Reports 1998-II.
- Pretty v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 2346/02), Judgment (Chamber), 29 April 2002, ECHR 2002-III.
- Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany* (Appl. No. 42527/98), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 12 July 2001, ECHR 2011-VIII.
- Pyatkov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 61767/08), Judgment (Chamber), 13 November 2012, not reported.
- Quaranta v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 12744/87), Judgment (Chamber), 24 May 1991, Series A, No. 205
- Radu v. Germany* (Appl. No. 20084/07), Judgment (Chamber), 16 May 2013, not reported.
- Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia* (Appl. No. 25965/04), Judgment (Chamber), 7 January 2010, ECHR 2010-I.
- Reiner v. Germany* (Appl. No. 28527/08), Judgment (Chamber), 19 January 2012, not reported.



## TABLE OF CASES

xxvii

- Rubins v. Latvia* (Appl. No. 79040/12), Judgment (Chamber), 13 January 2015, not reported.
- Rumpf v. Germany* (Appl. No. 46344/06), Judgment (Chamber), 2 September 2010, not reported.
- Rytchenko v. Russia* (Appl. No. 22266/04), Judgment (Chamber), 20 January 2011, not reported.
- S. v. Germany* (Appl. No. 3300/10), Judgment (Chamber), 28 June 2012, not reported.
- S.A.S. v. France* (Appl. No. 43835/11), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 1 July 2014, selected for publication 2014.
- S.L. v. Austria* (Appl. No. 45330/99), Judgment (Chamber), 9 January 2003, ECHR 2003-I.
- Sabanchiyeva and Others v. Russia* (Appl. No. 38450/05), Judgment (Chamber), 6 June 2013, ECHR 2013-III.
- Sabeh El Leil v. France* (Appl. No. 34869/05), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 29 June 2011, not reported.
- Sahin v. Germany* (Appl. No. 30943/96), Judgment (Chamber), 11 October 2001, not reported.
- Sahin v. Germany* (Appl. No. 30943/96), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 8 July 2003, ECHR 2003-VIII.
- Salgueiro da Silva Mouta v. Portugal* (Appl. No. 33290/96), Judgment (Chamber), 21 December 1999, ECHR 1999-IX.
- Samsam Mohammed Hussein and Others v. The Netherlands and Italy* (Appl. No. 27725/10), Judgment (Chamber), 2 April 2013, not reported.
- Savridin Dzhurayev v. Russia* (Appl. No. 71386/10), Judgment (Chamber), 25 April 2013, ECHR 2013-III.
- Schalk and Kopf v. Austria* (Appl. No. 30141/04), Judgment (Chamber), 24 June 2010, ECHR 2010-IV.
- Schmautzer v. Austria* (Appl. No. 15523/89), Judgment (Chamber), 10 May 1993, Series A, No. 328-A.
- Schneider v. Germany* (Appl. No. 17080/07), Judgment (Chamber), 15 September 2011, not reported.
- Schwabe and M.G. v. Germany* (Appl. Nos. 8080/08 and 8577/08), Judgment (Chamber), 1 December 2011, ECHR 2011-VI.
- Scoppola v. Italy (No.3)* (Appl. No. 126/05), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 May 2012, not reported.
- Sejdic and Finci v. Bosnia Herzegovina* (Appl. Nos. 27996/106 and 34836/06), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 December 2009, ECHR 2009-VI.
- Sergey Zolothukin v. Russia* (Appl. No. 14939/03), 10 February 2009, ECHR 2009, not reported.

- Sfountouris and Others v. Germany* (Appl. No. 24120/06), Decision (Chamber), 31 May 2011, not reported.
- Shakurov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 55822/10), Judgment (Chamber), 6 June 2012, not reported.
- Sheffield and Horsham v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. Nos. 22985/9 and 23390/94), 30 July 1998, ECHR 1998-V.
- Sherstobitov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 16266/03), Judgment (Chamber), 10 June 2010, not reported.
- Shikuta v. Russia* (Appl. No. 45373/05), Judgment (Chamber), 11 April 2013, not reported.
- Shingara Mann Singh v. France* (Appl. No. 24479/07), Decision (Chamber) 13 November 2008, not reported.
- Shtukaturv v. Russia* (Appl. No. 44009/05), Judgment (Chamber), 27 March 2008, ECHR 2008-II.
- Shukhardin v. Russia* (Appl. No. 65734/01), Judgment (Chamber), 28 June 2007, not reported.
- Sievert v. Germany* (Appl. No. 29881/07), Judgment (Chamber), 19 July 2012, not reported.
- Sigarev v. Russia* (Appl. No. 53812/10), Judgment (Chamber), 30 October 2014, not reported.
- Siliadin v. France* (Appl. No. 73316/01), Judgment (Chamber), 26 July 2005, ECHR 2005-VII.
- Sitaropoulos and Giakoumopoulos v. Greece* (Appl. No. 42202/07), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 15 March 2012, ECHR 2012-II.
- Smith and Grady v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. Nos. 33985/96 and 33986/96), Judgment (Chamber), 27 September 1999, ECHR 1999-VI.
- Soering v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 14038/88), Judgment (Plenary), 7 July 1989, Series A, No. 161.
- Soltysyak v. Russia* (Appl. No. 4663/05), Judgment (Chamber), 10 February 2011, not reported.
- Sommerfeld v. Germany* (Appl. No. 31871/96), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 8 July 2003, ECHR 2003-VIII.
- Sramek v. Austria* (Appl. No. 8790/79), Decision (Plenum), 22 October 1989, Series A, No. 84.
- SSH v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 60367/10), Judgment (Chamber), 29 January 2013, not reported.
- Stichting Mothers of Srebrenica and Others v. the Netherlands* (Appl. No. 65542/12), Judgment (Chamber), 11 June 2013, ECHR 2013-III.
- Stübing v. Germany* (Appl. No. 43547/08), Judgment (Chamber), 12 April 2012, not reported.



## TABLE OF CASES

xxix

- Sufi and Elmi v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. Nos. 8319/07, 11449/07), Judgment (Chamber), 28 June 2011, not reported.
- Suleymanov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 32501/11), Judgment (Chamber), 22 Jan 2013, not reported.
- Sunday Times v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 6538/74), Judgment (Plenary), 26 April 1979, Series A, No. 217.
- Sunday Times v. the United Kingdom and Observer and Guardian Newspapers v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 13166/87), Judgment (Court), 26 November 1991, Series A, No. 217.
- Sürmeli v. Germany* (Appl. No. 75529/01), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 8 June 2006, ECHR 2006-VIII.
- Svinarenko and Slyadnev v. Russia* (Appl. Nos. 32541/08 and 43441/08), Judgment (Chamber), 11 December 2012.
- T.P. and K.M. v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 28945/95), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 10 May 2001, ECHR 2001-V.
- Tarakhel v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 29217/12), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 4 November 2014, selected for publication 2014.
- Taron v. Germany* (Appl. No. 53126/07), Decision (Chamber), 29 May 2012, not reported.
- Tatar v. Switzerland* (Appl. No. 65692/12), Judgment (Chamber), 14 April 2015, not reported.
- The Holy Monasteries v. Greece* (Appl. Nos. 13092/87 and 13984/88), Judgment (Chamber), 9 December 1994, Series A, No. 301-A.
- The Professional Trades Union for Prison, Correctional and Secure Psychiatric Workers and Others (POA and Others) v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 59253/11), Judgment (Chamber), 21 May 2013, not reported.
- Toğcu v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 27601/95), Judgment (Chamber), 31 May 2005, not reported.
- Trubnikov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 49790/99), Decision (Chamber), 14 October 2003, not reported.
- Tsarenko v. Russia* (Appl. No. 5235/09), Judgment (Chamber), 3 March 2011, not reported.
- Tsikakis v. Germany* (Appl. No. 1521/06), Judgment (Chamber), 10 February 2011, not reported.
- Tyrer v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 5856/72), Judgment (Chamber), 25 March 1978, Series A, No. 26.
- Vajnai v. Hungary* (Appl. No. 33629/06), Judgment (Chamber), 8 July 2008, ECHR 2008-IV.
- Valenzuela Contreras v. Spain* (Appl. No. 27671/95), Judgment (Chamber), 30 July 1998, ECHR 1998-V.

- Vallianatos and Others v. Greece* (Appl. Nos. 29381/09 and 32684/09), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 7 November 2013, ECHR 2013-V.
- Van Kück v. Germany* (Appl. No. 35968/97), Judgment (Chamber), 12 June 2003, ECHR 2003-VII.
- Varnava and Others v. Turkey* (Appl. No. 16064/90), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 18 September 2009, ECHR 2009-V.
- Varvara v. Italy* (Appl. No. 17475/09), Judgment (Chamber), 29 October 2013, not reported.
- Vesti and Ukhov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 21724/03), Judgment (Chamber), 30 May 2013, not reported.
- Vidal v. Belgium* (Appl. No. 12351/86), Judgment (Chamber), 22 April 1992, Series A, No. 235.
- Viel v. France* (Appl. No. 41781/98) Judgment (Chamber), 14 December 1999, not reported.
- Vilvirajah v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. Nos. 13163/87, 13164/87, 13165/87, 13447/87 and 13448/87), Judgment (Chamber), 30 October 1991, Series A, No. 215.
- Vinter and Others v. the United Kingdom*, (Appl. Nos. 66069/09, 130/10 and 3896/10), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 9 July 2013, ECHR 2013-III.
- Von Hannover v. Germany (No.1)* (Appl. No. 59320/00), Judgment (Chamber), 24 June 2004, ECHR 2004-VI.
- Von Hannover v. Germany (No.2)* (Appl. Nos. 40660/08 and 60641/08), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 7 February 2012, ECHR 2012-I.
- W.P. v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 8416/78), Decision (Commission), 13 May 1980, D.R. 19.
- Waite and Kennedy v. Germany, Beer and Regan v. Germany* (Appl. Nos. 26083/94 and 28938/95), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 18 February 1999, ECHR 1999-I.
- Wasmuth v. Germany* (Appl. No. 12884/03), Judgment (Chamber), 17 February 2011, not reported.
- William Goodwin v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 17488/90), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 27 March 1996, Reports 1996-II.
- Winterwerp v. the Netherlands* (Appl. No. 6301/73), Judgment (Chamber), 24 October 1979, Series A, No.33.
- X and Others v. Austria* (Appl. No. 19010/07), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 19 February 2013, ECHR-II.
- X v. Belgium* (Appl. No. 8707/79), Judgment (Chamber), 13 December 1979, D.R.18.
- X, Y and Z v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 21830/93), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 22 April 1997, ECHR 1997-II.

## TABLE OF CASES

xxx

- X. and Others v. Austria* (Appl. No. 19010/07), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 19 February 2013, ECHR 2013-II.
- X. v. Latvia* (Appl. No. 27853/09), Judgment (Grand Chamber), 26 November 2013, ECHR 2013-VI.
- Yuriy Rudakov v. Russia* (Appl. No. 48982/08), Judgment (Chamber), 15 January 2015, not reported.
- Z. and Others v. the United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 29392/95) Judgment (Grand Chamber), 10 May 2001, ECHR 2001-V.
- Zaunegger v. Germany* (Appl. No. 22028/04), Judgment (Chamber), 3 December 2009, not reported.
- Zimin v. Russia* (Appl. No. 48613/06), Judgment (Chamber), 6 February 2014, not reported.
- Związek Nauczycielstwa Polskiego v. Poland* (Appl. No. 42049/98), Judgment (Chamber), 21 September 2004, ECHR 2004-IX.

*Inter-American Court of Human Rights*

- Bámaca Velásquez v. Guatemala*, Judgment, 25 November 2000, Series C, No. 91.
- Enforceability of the Right to Reply or Correction, Advisory Opinion, 29 August 1986, Opinion OC-7/86.
- Escher v. Brazil*, Judgment, 9 July 2009, Series C, No. 200.
- Godínez-Cruz v. Honduras*, Judgment (Reparations and Costs), 21 July 1989, Series C, No. 8.
- Maritza Urrutia v. Guatemala*, Judgment, 27 November 2003, Series C, No. 103.
- Tibi v. Ecuador*, Judgment, 7 September 2004, Series C, No. 114.

**National***Argentina*

- Supreme Court of Justice, *Maza, Ángel E. s/ amparo medida cautelar*, n° M. 1514. XLIII, October 6, 2009.
- Supreme Court of Justice, *S., V. c/ M., D.A. s/medidas precautorias*, n° S. 622 XXXIII, 3 April 2001.
- Supreme Court of Justice, *Ekmekdjian v. Sofovich y otros*, Recurso Extraordinario, n° E. 64. XXIII, 315 Fallos 1492, 7 July 1992.
- Supreme Court of Justice, *Petric, Domagoj, Antonio c/ diario Página 12*, n° P.534.XXXI, 16 April 1998.

*Australia*

- Administrative Appeals Tribunal, *W97/164 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs* [1998] AATA 618.  
 Federal Court of Australia, *A v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs* [1999] FCA 116.  
 Federal Court of Australia, *Arquita v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs* [2000] 106 FCR 465.  
 Federal Court of Australia, *Betkoshabeh v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs* [1998] 157 ALR 95.  
 Federal Court of Australia, *Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v. MZYYL* [2012] FCAFC 147.  
 High Court of Australia, *Kartinyeri v. Commonwealth* [1998] 195 CLR 337.  
 High Court of Australia, *Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs v. Guo* [1997] 191 CLR 559.  
 High Court of Australia, *Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Singh* [2002] 209 CLR 533.

*Austria*

- Constitutional Court of Austria, Judgments of 10 December 2013, G 16/2013, G 44/2013.  
 Constitutional Court of Austria, Judgment of 27 February 1989, B 821/88.

*Bolivia*

- Constitutional Tribunal of Bolivia, *Acción de Inconstitucionalidad, Verónica Laura Guiteras Aramayo*, Sentencia Constitucional Plurinacional, 1250/2012, Sala Plena, Expediente 00130-2012-01-AIC, 20 September 2012.  
 Constitutional Tribunal of Bolivia, *Acciones de Inconstitucionalidad, Morales, Melgar, Feraudy y Quiroga*, Sentencia Constitucional Plurinacional, 0300/2012 (TIPNIS), Sala Plena, Expedientes 00157-2012-01-AIA, 00188-2012-01-AIA (acumulado), 18 June 2012.  
 Constitutional-Tribunal-of Bolivia, *Recurso Directo de Inconstitucionalidad, Luis Eduardo Siles Pérez*, Sentencia Constitucional n° 0045/2006, Sala Plena, Expediente 2005-12440-25-RDI, 2 June 2006.  
 Constitutional Tribunal of Bolivia, *Sentencia Constitucional 0221/2011-R*, Revisión n° 0221, Expediente: 2009-19965-40-AL, 11 March 2011.

## TABLE OF CASES

xxxiii

Constitutional Tribunal of Bolivia, *Sentencia Constitucional 1321/2011-R*, Revisión nº 1321, Expediente: 2010-21993-44-AL, 26 September 2011.  
 Constitutional Tribunal of Bolivia, *Sentencia Constitucional 2334/2010-R*, Revisión nº 2334, Expediente: 2008-17607-36-RHC, 19 November 2010.

*Brazil*

Supreme Federal Court, *Arguição de Descumprimento de Preceito Fundamental (ADPF) nº132*, proposta por Estado do Rio de Janeiro, 5 May 2011.  
 Supreme Federal Court, *Ellwanger v. Superior Tribunal de Justiça*, Habeas Corpus nº 82424/RS, Tribunal Pleno, DJ 19-03-2004, 17 September 2003.  
 Supreme Federal Court, *Silvan Guedes v. Superior Tribunal Militar*, Habeas Corpus nº 79285-RJ, 31 August 1999.  
 Supreme Federal Court, *Ação Direta de Inconstitucionalidade (ADI) nº 4277-DF* proposta por Procuradoria-Geral da República, 5 May 2011.  
 Supreme Federal Court, *Arguição de descumprimento de preceito fundamental (ADPF) nº 153-DF* proposta pelo Conselho Federal da Ordem Dos Advogados do Brasil – OAB, 29 April 2010.

*Canada*

Federal Court of Appeal, *Bazargan v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* (1996) 205 NR 282.  
 Federal Court of Appeal, *Gonzalez v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration)* 1994 FC 646.  
 Federal Court of Appeal, *Li v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* 2005 FCA 1.  
 Federal Court of Appeal, *Nagamany v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* 2005 FC 1554.  
 Federal Court of Appeal, *Ramirez v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration)* (1992) 89 DLR (4th) 173.  
 Immigration and Refugee Board (Refugee Protection Division), *Re IVH* [2004] RPDD No. 57.  
 Privy Council, *Bank of Toronto v. Lambe* [1887] 12 AC 575.  
 Privy Council, *Edward v. Canada (AG)* [1930] 124 AC 136.  
 Supreme Court of British Columbia, *The Crookes v. Wikimedia Foundation* 2008 BCSC 1424.

- Supreme Court of Canada, *Alberta v. Hutterian Brethren of Wilson Colony* [2009] 2 SCR 567.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Andrews v. Law Society of British Columbia* [1989] 1 SCR 143.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *BC v. Imperial Tobacco Canada Ltd* [2005] 2 SCR 473.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Canadian Western Bank v Alberta* [2007] 2 SCR 3.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Charkaoui v. Canada (Citizenship and Immigration)* [2007] 1 SCR 350.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Charkaoui v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration* [2007] 1 SCR 350.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Committee for the Commonwealth of Canada v. Canada* [1991] 1 SCR 139.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Consolidated Fastfrate Inc v. Western Canada Council of Teamsters* [2009] 3 SCR 407.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *General Motors of Canada Ltd v. City National Leasing* [1989] 1 SCR 641.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Gosselin (Tutor of) v. Quebec (Attorney General)* [2005] 1 SCR 238.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Hunter v. Southam* [1984] 2 SCR 145.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Kindler v. Canada (Minister of Justice)* [1991] 2 SCR 779.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Lavigne v. Ontario Public Service Employees Union* [1991] 2 SCR 211.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Miron v. Trudel* [1995] 2 SCR 418.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Ontario Hydro v. Ontario (Labour Relations Board)* [1993] 3 SCR 327.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *Pushpanathan v. Canada* [1998] 1 SCR 982.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Advance Cutting & Coring Ltd* [2001] 3 SCR 209.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Butler* [1992] 1 SCR 452.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Elshaw* [1991] 3 SCR 24, 57.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Kalanj* [1989] 1 SCR 1594.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Kang-Brown* [2008] 1 SCR 456.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Morgentaler* [1988] 1 SCR 30.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Oakes* [1986] 1 SCR 103.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Rahey* [1987] 1 SCR 588.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Ruzic* [2001] 1 SCR 687.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Seaboyer* [1991] 2 SCR 577.  
 Supreme Court of Canada, *R v. Simmons* [1988] 2 SCR 495.