

Market Design

A Linear Programming Approach to Auctions and Matching

The digital economy has led to many new services where supply is matched with demand for various types of goods and services. More and more people and organizations are now in a position to design market rules that are being implemented in software.

The design of markets is challenging as it is necessary to consider the strategic behavior of market participants, psychological factors, and computational problems in order to implement the objectives of a designer. Market models in economics have not lost their importance, but recent years have led to many new insights and principles for the design of markets which are beyond traditional economic theory. This book introduces the fundamentals of market design, an engineering field concerned with the design of real-world markets.

Martin Bichler is Professor of Informatics at the Technical University of Munich (TUM), and a faculty member at the TUM School of Management. He is known for his academic work on market design, and he has acted as a consultant for private and public organizations including regulators, telecoms, and procurement organizations. Projects in which he is involved include the design of auctions for industrial procurement, logistics, advertising, fishery access rights, and spectrum sales. His research addresses algorithmic, game-theoretical, and behavioral questions and has appeared in leading journals in computer science, economics, operations research, and management science. He is currently Editor of *Business and Information Systems Engineering* and serves on the editorial boards of several academic journals.



Market Design

A Linear Programming Approach to Auctions and Matching

MARTIN BICHLER

Technical University of Munich





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107173187

DOI: 10.1017/9781316779873

© Martin Bichler 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-17318-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my wife Claudia and my daughters Mona and Sonja



Contents

| 1 | Intro | oduction | page 1 |
|--------|---------|---|--------|
| | 1.1 | Market Design and Mechanism Design | 2 |
| | 1.2 | Market Design and Mathematical Optimization | 3 |
| | 1.3 | Outline of the Book | 4 |
| | | 1.3.1 Part I Microeconomic Fundamentals | 5 |
| | | 1.3.2 Part II Multi-Object Auction Design | 6 |
| | | 1.3.3 Part III Approximation and Matching Markets | 7 |
| | | 1.3.4 Part IV Appendices: Mathematical Optimization | 7 |
| | 1.4 | Acknowledgements | 8 |
| Part I | Microec | onomic Fundamentals | |
| 2 | Gam | ne-Theoretical Basics | 11 |
| | 2.1 | Normal-Form Games | 11 |
| | | 2.1.1 Dominant-Strategy Equilibrium | 13 |
| | | 2.1.2 Pareto Optimality | 13 |
| | | 2.1.3 Nash Equilibrium | 14 |
| | | 2.1.4 Correlated Equilibrium | 17 |
| | | 2.1.5 Further Solution Concepts | 19 |
| | 2.2 | Extensive-Form Games | 20 |
| | 2.3 | • | 22 |
| | | 2.3.1 Bayesian Nash Equilibrium | 24 |
| | | 2.3.2 Ex Post Equilibrium | 25 |
| | | Games and Human Behavior | 26 |
| | 2.5 | • | 27 |
| | 2.6 | Comprehension Questions | 28 |
| | 2.7 | Problems | 28 |
| 3 | Mec | hanism Design | 30 |
| | 3.1 | Social Choice | 31 |
| | | 3.1.1 Voting Rules | 31 |
| | | 3.1.2 Arrow's Impossibility | 33 |



| viii | Contents |
|------|------------|
| VIII | GUIILGIILG |

| | 3.2 | Utility Functions | 35 |
|---------|----------|---|----|
| | 3.3 | Mechanism Design Theory | 39 |
| | 3.4 | Quasi-Linear Mechanism Design | 42 |
| | | 3.4.1 Quasi-Linear Utility Functions | 42 |
| | | 3.4.2 The Vickrey–Clarke–Groves Mechanism | 44 |
| | | 3.4.3 The Myerson–Satterthwaite Theorem | 46 |
| | 3.5 | Summary | 48 |
| | | 3.5.1 Robust Mechanism Design | 48 |
| | | 3.5.2 Algorithmic Mechanism Design | 49 |
| | | 3.5.3 Dynamic Mechanism Design | 49 |
| | | 3.5.4 Non-Quasi-Linear Mechanism Design | 50 |
| | 3.6 | Comprehension Questions | 51 |
| | 3.7 | Problems | 51 |
| 4 | Single | e-Object Auctions | 53 |
| | 4.1 | Single-Object Auction Formats | 53 |
| | 4.2 | Model Assumptions | 54 |
| | 4.3 | Equilibrium Bidding Strategies in the IPV Model | 55 |
| | | 4.3.1 Ascending Auctions | 56 |
| | | 4.3.2 Second-Price Sealed-Bid Auctions | 56 |
| | | 4.3.3 First-Price Sealed-Bid Auctions | 57 |
| | | 4.3.4 Descending Auctions | 60 |
| | 4.4 | Comparing Equilibrium Outcomes | 60 |
| | 4.5 | Robustness of the Revenue Equivalence Theorem | 62 |
| | | 4.5.1 Risk-Averse Bidders | 62 |
| | | 4.5.2 Interdependent Values | 64 |
| | | 4.5.3 Asymmetry of Bidders | 65 |
| | 4.6 | 4.5.4 Uncertainty about the Number of Bidders | 65 |
| | 4.6 | Bidder Collusion | 65 |
| | 4.7 | Optimal Auction Design | 66 |
| | 4.8 | Selected Experimental Results | 68 |
| | 4.9 | Summary | 70 |
| | 4.10 | Comprehension Questions | 71 |
| | 4.11 | Problems | 71 |
| Part II | Multi-Ob | ject Auction Design | |
| 5 | An Ov | verview of Multi-Object Auctions | 75 |
| | 5.1 | General Equilibrium Models | 75 |
| | 5.2 | Multi-Unit Auction Formats | 77 |
| | | 5.2.1 Sealed-Bid Multi-Unit Auction Formats | 77 |
| | | 5.2.2 Open Multi-Unit Auction Formats | 78 |
| | | 5.2.3 Sequential Sales | 80 |



| | | С | ontents | ix |
|---|---|---|---------|-----|
| | | | | |
| | 5.3 | Multi-Item Auction Formats | | 81 |
| | | 5.3.1 Simultaneous Auctions | | 81 |
| | | 5.3.2 Combinatorial Auctions | | 81 |
| | 5.4 | Online and Dynamic Auction Design | | 83 |
| | 5.5 | Summary | | 83 |
| | 5.6 | Comprehension Questions | | 84 |
| 6 | The Simultaneous Multi-Round Auction Format | | | 85 |
| | 6.1 | SMRA Rules | | 85 |
| | 6.2 | Tactics in the SMRA | | 86 |
| | 6.3 | Strategic Situations in SMRA | | 88 |
| | | 6.3.1 War of Attrition | | 89 |
| | | 6.3.2 English Auction vs. War of Attrition | | 93 |
| | 6.4 | Summary | | 95 |
| | 6.5 | Comprehension Questions | | 95 |
| 7 | Seale | ed-Bid Multi-Object Auctions | | 96 |
| | 7.1 | Generic Bid Languages | | 96 |
| | 7.2 | The Winner Determination Problem | | 98 |
| | 7.3 | Payment Rules | | 101 |
| | | 7.3.1 Pay-as-Bid Payment Rules | | 101 |
| | | 7.3.2 Vickrey–Clarke–Groves Payment Rules | | 101 |
| | | 7.3.3 Bidder-Optimal Core Payment Rules | | 105 |
| | 7.4 | Equilibrium Bidding Strategies | | 107 |
| | | 7.4.1 First-Price Sealed-Bid Auctions | | 107 |
| | | 7.4.2 Bidder-Optimal Core-Selecting Auctions | | 111 |
| | 7.5 | Domain-Specific Compact Bid Languages | | 111 |
| | | 7.5.1 Procurement Markets with Economies of Scale | | |
| | | and Scope | | 112 |
| | | 7.5.2 Distributed Scheduling in TV Ad Markets | | 117 |
| | 7.6 | Combinatorial Double Auctions | | 120 |
| | 7.7 | Empirical Results | | 121 |
| | 7.8 | Summary | | 122 |
| | 7.9 | Comprehension Questions | | 123 |
| | 7.10 | Problems | | 124 |
| 8 | Open | Multi-Object Auctions | | 126 |
| | 8.1 | Primal-Dual Auctions for Assignment Markets | | 127 |
| | | 8.1.1 Dual Prices and VCG Payments | | 128 |
| | | 8.1.2 An Ascending Auction for the Assignment Problem | | 131 |
| | 8.2 | Greedy Auctions and Matroids | | 139 |



x Contents

| | 0.2 | | |
|----------|---------|--|------------|
| | 8.3 | Models of Open Combinatorial Auctions 8.3.1 Limits of Linear Prices | 144 |
| | | 8.3.1 Limits of Linear Prices8.3.2 Algorithmic Models of Ascending Auctions | 144 150 |
| | | 8.3.3 Perfect Bayesian Equilibria with General Valuations | 150 |
| | | 8.3.4 Large Markets with Non-Convexities | 154 |
| | 8.4 | Overview of Open Combinatorial Auction Formats | 155 |
| | 0 | 8.4.1 Auction Formats with Non-Linear Prices | 155 |
| | | 8.4.2 Auction Formats with Linear Ask Prices | 158 |
| | 8.5 | Empirical Results | 162 |
| | | 8.5.1 Experiments with Small Markets | 162 |
| | | 8.5.2 Experiments with Larger Markets | 163 |
| | 8.6 | Summary | 164 |
| | 8.7 | Comprehension Questions | 164 |
| | 8.8 | Problems | 165 |
| 9 | The C | Combinatorial Clock Auction Formats | 167 |
| | 9.1 | The Single-Stage Combinatorial Clock Auction | 167 |
| | | 9.1.1 Auction Process | 167 |
| | | 9.1.2 Efficiency of the SCCA | 168 |
| | 9.2 | The Two-Stage Combinatorial Clock Auction Format | 172 |
| | | 9.2.1 Auction Process | 172 |
| | | 9.2.2 Activity Rules | 173 |
| | | 9.2.3 A Note on Revealed Preference Theory | 175 |
| | | 9.2.4 Strategies in the Two-Stage CCA | 178 |
| | 9.3 | Experiments on the Two-Stage CCA | 183 |
| | 9.4 | Summary | 185 |
| | 9.5 | Comprehension Questions | 185 |
| | 9.6 | Problems | 185 |
| Part III | Approxi | mation and Matching Markets | |
| 10 | Appro | oximation Mechanisms | 189 |
| | 10.1 | Approximation and Truthfulness | 190 |
| | | 10.1.1 Deterministic Approximation Mechanisms | 191 |
| | | 10.1.2 Randomized Approximation Mechanisms | 191 |
| | 10.2 | Deterministic Mechanisms for Single-Minded Bidders | 193 |
| | | 10.2.1 Greedy-Acceptance Auctions | 194 |
| | | 10.2.2 Deferred-Acceptance Auctions | 196 |
| | 10.3 | Randomized Mechanisms | 198 |
| | | 10.3.1 The Relax-and-Round Framework | 199 |
| | | 10.3.2 Combinatorial Auctions via Relax-and-Round | 201 |
| | 10.4 | · | 204 |
| | 10.5 | Comprehension Questions | 204 |



| | | Contents | Х |
|---------|------------------|--|------------|
| | | | |
| 11 | Matching Markets | | 206 |
| | 11.1 | Overview of Matching Problems | 206 |
| | 11.2 | Two-Sided Matching | 208 |
| | | 11.2.1 Definitions and Notation | 209 |
| | | 11.2.2 The Gale–Shapley Student-Optimal Stable Mechanism | 213 |
| | | 11.2.3 The Efficiency-Adjusted Deferred-Acceptance Mechanism | 217 |
| | 11.3 | One-Sided Matching | 219 |
| | | 11.3.1 The Top Trading Cycle Mechanism | 220 |
| | 11.4 | 11.3.2 The Probabilistic Serial Mechanism | 223 |
| | 11.4 | | 225 |
| | | 11.4.1 Multi-Unit and Combinatorial Assignments | 225 |
| | 11.5 | 11.4.2 Cardinal Assignment Problems with Complementarities | 226 |
| | 11.5 11.6 | 11 | 231 233 |
| | 11.0 | Summary 11.6.1 Two-Sided Matching Mechanisms | 233 |
| | | 11.6.2 One-Sided Matching Mechanisms | 235 |
| | 11 7 | Comprehension Questions | 236 |
| | 11.8 | Problems | 236 |
| | 11.0 | Trotoms | 250 |
| 12 | Outlo | ok | 238 |
| | 12.1 | Challenges in Market Design | 239 |
| | 12.2 | Going Forward | 240 |
| Part IV | Append | ices: Mathematical Optimization | |
| | A L | inear Optimization | 245 |
| | A.1 | Geometry of Linear Programs | 245 |
| | A.2 | Feasibility | 249 |
| | A.3 | Duality Theory | 250 |
| | A.4 | Integrality of Linear Programs | 254 |
| | ВА | lgorithms and Complexity | 256 |
| | B.1 | Computational Complexity | 256 |
| | B.2 | Algorithms for Linear Programs | 258 |
| | B.3 | Algorithms for Integer Linear Programs | 258 |
| | B.4 | Approximation Algorithms | 262 |
| | | B.4.1 Complexity Classes | 263 |
| | | B.4.2 LP-Based Approximation Algorithms | 264 |
| | Refer | rences | 268 |
| | Index | C | 281 |