

## Beyond US Hegemony in International Development

China's initiative to establish the Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank (AIIB), attracting membership from G7 countries against the vocal opposition of the United States, has been recognised as a significant moment in an ongoing hegemonic transition.

This book examines how power transitions have played out in the World Bank over the last five decades, offering the first authentic account of the international diplomacy behind donor financing of the World Bank's International Development Association (IDA). Jiajun Xu decodes how the United States amplified its influence at the World Bank despite its flagging financial contributions to IDA. She further demonstrates that the widening influence-to-contribution disparity provoked other donors into taking 'exit/voice' measures, contesting the hegemon's legitimacy.

A rising China initially decided to become an IDA donor, seeking influence from within. But the entrenched hegemonic position of the United States in World Bank governance drove China to initiate the AIIB and New Development Bank, putting competitive pressures on the UScentred multilateral institutions to adapt.

DR JIAJUN XU is the co-founder (together with Professor Justin Yifu Lin) and Executive Deputy Director of the Centre for New Structural Economics at Peking University. Xu worked as a Junior Research Specialist at the United Nations' High Level Panel Secretariat on the Post-2015 Development Agenda responsible for the research on development financing and South–South Cooperation. She also worked as an international consultant on debt sustainability in the World Bank and productive capacity building for least-developed countries at the UNDESA Committee for Development Policy Secretariat. Xu holds a DPhil (PhD) from the University of Oxford.



# Beyond US Hegemony in International Development

The Contest for Influence at the World Bank

JIAJUN XU Peking University, Beijing





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107172845
10.1017/9781316779385

© Jiajun Xu 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-17284-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### **Contents**

List of Figures and Tables pag			page viii
Fo	rewo	rd	ix
Ac	knoi	vledgments	xi
Lis	st of	Abbreviations	xiv
	Intr I.1 I.2 I.3 I.4 I.5	oduction Hegemonic Transition inside Multilateral Institutions The World Bank-IDA: A Cornerstone of the US World Ord International Politics of Burden-Sharing Hegemonic Transition in Action The Roadmap of the Book	1 2 der 3 5 7 15
1		A Burden-Sharing: The Unresolved Puzzle The Central Puzzles of IDA Burden-Sharing The Mainstream Literature on Burden-Sharing: Insights and Gaps Financing and Governing the World Bank's Aid Window Conclusion	17 17 22 27 39
2	IDA 2.1 2.2 2.3 2.4	ee Power Plays behind the Politics of Burden-Sharing Structural Causes: External Threats from the East and the South Challenger Power Play: Quid Pro Quo between Burden Shares and Voting Rights Controlling IOs: Fairness and Legitimacy Complementary Analytical Perspectives Conclusion	40 40 42 46 52 52
3		a in the 1960s: Hegemonic Leadership amid olar Geopolitics Hegemonic Lag: The Soviet Threat Fosters US	55
		Leadership in IDA	56

V



vi		Со	ntents	
	3.2 3.3 3.4	Challenger Inertia Who Runs the World Bank? The Role of Bank Management Conclusion	67 76 82	
4	IDA in the 1970s: A Turbulent Era with Accelerated Burden-Shifting 4.1 IDA-4 (FY1975–77): Accelerated Burden-Shifting		84	
	4.1	for the First Time IDA-5 (FY1978–80): Resurgent Geopolitical Threat	85	
	4.3 4.4	Renews the <i>Hegemonic Lag</i> IDA-6 (FY1981–83): <i>Accelerated Burden-Shifting</i> Resumes Conclusion	96 105 120	
5	IDA	in the 1980s: The Rise and Retreat of the		
	'Rea 5.1 5.2	agan Revolution' Empirical Puzzles IDA-7 (FY1985–87): The Rise of the 'Reagan Revolution'	124 124 125	
	5.3 5.4	IDA-8 (FY1988–90): The Retreat of the 'Reagan Revolution' A UK–Japan Quid Pro Quo Enables 'Accelerated	140	
	5.5 5.6	Burden-Shifting' The 'Hidden' US-Japan Quid Pro Quo Conclusion	150 153 156	
6		in the 1990s: The Struggle for Power and Fairness in nipolar World	160	
	6.1 6.2	Empirical Puzzles IDA-9 (FY1991–93): North–South Struggles Suspend the Fairness Concern	160 162	
	6.3	IDA-10 (FY1994–96): A Delicate Balancing Act between Contribution and Influence	169	
	6.4	IDA-11(FY1998–99)/IDA-12(FY2000–02): The Fairness Concern Renews ' <i>Hegemonic Lags</i> ' Conclusion	176	
7		in the New Millennium: Leadership in Transition?	193 197	
/	7.1		198	
	7.2 7.3	Explaining the Watershed in IDA Burden-Sharing Leadership in Transition? An Assessment of US	199	
	7.4	and UK Influence Conclusion	219 225	
8	China's Ascendancy: Influence from Within and			
	-	act from Outside An Empirical Puzzle	228 229	



Contents		
8.2	Explaining Why China Became a New IDA Donor	
	in IDA-15 (FY2009–11)	230
8.3	Explaining China's Increased Financial Contribution	
	to IDA-16 (FY2012-14): Bank Management as Policy	
	Entrepreneurs	249
8.4	China's Influence as Both an Insider and an Outsider	251
8.5	Conclusion	257
Con	clusion	260
C.1	A Synthesis of Power Dynamics in IDA Replenishment	
	History	261
C.2	An Entrepreneurial China as a Reform-Minded	
	Stakeholder	266
C.3	IDA as History and Looking Ahead	271
Bibliography		275
Index		



## Figures and Tables

Figu	ires	
1.1	Changes in Major Donors' Burden Shares in IDA	page 19
Tab	les	
1.1	Summary of the Three Subtype Empirical Puzzles	page 21
1.2	A Typology of Burden-Sharing Arrangements	25
1.3	IDA Replenishments in Dates	32
2.1	Salient Historical Patterns of the Three Power Plays	53
5.1	Possible Alternative Financing Scenarios for IDA-7	136
5.2	Linkage between IDA Contributions and IBRD Voting	
	Power Adjustments in 1986–87	157

viii



#### Foreword

The rise of China is changing global economic governance. China's accession to the World Trade Organization in 2001 heralded a rapid growth in trade and investment flows with each region of the world. Its participation in the Group of Twenty Finance Ministers after the East Asian financial crisis in 1997 signalled an increased engagement in governance. This was followed by a closer engagement in the International Monetary Fund and an increased attention to international cooperation in development finance. Most recently, China led the way in creating the Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank in Beijing and the New Development Bank in Shanghai. However, alongside these developments, China's role in established institutions such as the World Bank is changing. This book offers an explanation of these changes, by dissecting how previous rising powers have sought influence in the World Bank and with what implications for the organization.

Jiajun Xu's research unpacks the negotiations which establish how much major donors give to the World Bank's concessional funding arm – the International Development Association (IDA). This is a crucial window into change in the organization. Although the World Bank's formal voting structure is virtually immutable, regular IDA 'replenishment rounds' offer a unique forum for countries to translate changes in economic power into shifts in influence in the World Bank. Every three years, countries engage in a long process of negotiations, vying for power and influence.

The World Bank's own public explanation is that IDA burden shares change to reflect the changing relative weight of the contributing countries in the world economy. But Xu's historical research offers a new analytical framework for understanding who ends up contributing what amount and what share of the total. First, she highlights the hegemonic interest of the United States, fluctuating in line with the intensity of the Cold War and with an ongoing persistence in exercising

ix



x Foreword

influence in the governance of IDA even as its burden share fell sharply, especially after the Cold War. Second, she decodes the competition for status and influence among secondary powers in the developed world. Finally, she weighs in the exercise of exit and voice options as counterweights to US influence by other contributors to IDA.

The book contributes the first ever detailed history of the IDA replenishment process. As a doctoral student under my supervision at Oxford University, Jiajun analysed the dynamics of sixteen replenishment rounds from 1960 to 2013. In this book she details the political processes at work. We read about how the UK and Germany each tried to resist the first attempts by the United States to reduce its contributions whilst retaining its influence. We learn about Japan's bid for voting power as it rose to become the second largest economy in the world. Uncovered are the standoffs over US arrears and the ensuing birth of a special facility for Africa, as well as struggles with Bank management over independence, accountability, and incentives. The account is pieced together from the archives at the World Bank, in the United States and in the UK, as well as through countless interviews.

The role of China is examined in the latter part of the book, based on a set of interviews Xu conducted in Beijing during 2011–2013. She writes up the debate among Chinese policy makers that led to the decision to put its major multilateral funding through new institutions rather than lifting its contribution to IDA and other established multilateral financing facilities. That said, in January 2016 the US Congress finally stopped holding out support of a package of reforms in the IMF and World Bank which will increase China's voting power in each organization. This may encourage greater participation in the World Bank. But Xu's work highlights that China has exercised an exit and voice option vis-a-vis the World Bank that has already made its mark.

Ngaire Woods Oxford, April 2016.



## Acknowledgments

My supervisor at Oxford, Professor Ngaire Woods, then Director of the Global Economic Governance Programme and subsequently Dean of the Blavatnik School of Government, played a central role in guiding me through the DPhil project that is the basis of this book. As a leading international scholar on global economic governance, and the Bretton Woods Institutions in particular, Ngaire inspired the focus on the donor financing of the World Bank's soft-loan window to anchor my ambitious inquiry into how a US-led hegemonic international development financing system adapts to power transitions. To search for a solid empirical ground, I focus on resolving the central puzzle of why shifts in burden shares in the International Development Association (IDA) were not always driven by rise and fall in economic fortunes. This required developing an analytical framework for disentangling the complex relationship between material capability, financial contributions, and policy influence of donor countries at the World Bank. I am immensely grateful for her active interest in my work and the speed of her feedback to my detailed drafts of empirical chapters and my evolving hypotheses.

During the course of this research, my work has been greatly improved thanks to the constructive feedback from Professors Walter Mattli, Kalypso Nicolaïdis, Duncan Snidal, and from Dr. Karolina Milewicz in the milestones of my DPhil studies. I am also grateful for vibrant discussions with Professors Rosemary Foot, Edward Keene, and Yuen Foong Khong. I am particularly thankful for the deep knowledge and wide perspectives brought to bear on my thesis by my examiners, Professors Andrew Hurrell and Robert Wade, during and following my viva. Professor Wade kindly provided detailed editing suggestions to clarify the material and render it more easily readable.

I owe deep gratitude for two long-term mentorships, from Richard Carey (the former Director of the OECD's Development Co-operation

xi



xii

Acknowledgments

Directorate) and Percy Mistry (the former Director & Senior Adviser, Finance Complex from 1981–87 in the World Bank). Their wisdom as both practitioners and thinkers guided me in grasping the essential dynamics of the international diplomacy behind the donor financing of IDA. They helped to put me in touch with key players, opening up doors for further interviews. They read several drafts of each chapter with keen interest. For their help, advice, and friendship, I owe deep gratitude. I recognise particularly my mentorship with Richard, which has evolved into a productive intellectual partnership enabling us to coauthor several frontier articles on development finance.

I also want to give special thanks to Richard Manning and Alex Shakow, who held senior positions in the UK development agency and the World Bank, respectively. Without their support in contacting key decision-makers, my fieldwork would not have been possible.

More than one hundred former and current actors in the IDA governance and financing system (they were fused in the replenishment processes) gave their time to recall and explain events and behind-the-scenes debates and dramas in the IDA history. They made this history come alive for me, and I hope for readers of this book too. And through these fascinating encounters I have been able to position the IDA story in the wider Cold War context and the ongoing geopolitical developments of our current times. Too many to identify, I do offer here my deep thanks to them all.

Archivists from the UK National Archives, the US National Archives, and others helped me to access to official documents. I am particularly grateful to the World Bank archivists: they worked strenuously to declassify more than 180 folders. Given the limited materials available on IDA replenishments, my research would not have been feasible without their professional support. I gained enormous encouragement when an archivist in the Bank smiled at me in front of a pile of newly declassified documents and said, 'You are a pioneer breaking new ground.'

My fellow classmates at Oxford made this journey a stimulating and enriching one. I appreciate the feedback from many, including Eliza Gheorghe, Julian Gruin, Nina Hall, Ivo Iaydjiev, Seth Johnston, Helen Campbell Pickford, Suwita Hani Randhawa, Ruben Reike, Michael Sampson, Jack Seddon, Nora Stappert, Vinícius Rodrigues Vieira, Jeffrey Wright, and Makio Yamada.



Acknowledgments

xiii

Turning my dissertation into an academic book has been a rewarding journey. Feedback from two anonymous external reviewers has greatly helped me to get the core insights across and speak to a large audience. I am particularly grateful for professional support from the editorial team at Cambridge University Press, including Chris Harrison, Phil Good, Joshua Penney, and James Gregory.

This book is dedicated to my family – my parents, Xu Chengwei and Dong Xiaoyu, and my husband, Song Fangtao. It is their enduring love that enables me to find the essential energy to pursue my academic aspirations.



### Abbreviations

AfDB African Development Bank AfDF African Development Fund

AIIB Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank

AsDB Asian Development Bank
AsDF Asian Development Fund
CASs Country Assistance Strategies
CIA Central Intelligence Agency

CIEC Conference on International Economic Co-operation

CPIA Country Policy and Institutional Assessment

CRS Congressional Research Service
CRW Crisis Response Window

DAC Development Assistance Committee
DAG Development Assistance Group

DFID Department for International Development

EDF European Development Fund
EEC European Economic Community
EMS European Monetary System

FCO Foreign and Commonwealth Office

FSOs Fund for Special Operations

FY fiscal year
G-5 Group of Five
G-7 Group of Seven

G-24 The Group of Twenty-Four GAO General Accounting Office GCI General Capital Increase **GEF** Global Environment Facility Gross National Income **GNI GNP** Gross National Product **GPG** global public good General Quota Review **GQR HICs** high-income countries

xiv



**More Information** 

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-17284-5 — Beyond US Hegemony in International Development Jiajun Xu Frontmatter

List of Abbreviations

XV

HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Countries Initiative
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and
	Development
IDA	International Development Association
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IEG	Independent Evaluation Group
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IFC	International Finance Cooperation
IFIs	international financial institutions
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IO	international organisation
IR	international relations
ITF	Interim Trust Fund
LDCs	less-developed countries
LICs	low-income countries
MCC	Millennium Challenge Corporation
MDB	Multilateral Development Bank
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MDRI	Multilateral Debt Relief Initiative
MICs	middle-income countries
MIGA	Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MOFCOM	Ministry of Commerce
MOV	Maintenance of Value
NAC	National Advisory Council on International Monetary
	and Financial Policies
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NCBP	Non-Concessional Borrowing Policy
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
NIEO	New International Economic Order
ODA	official development assistance
ODI	Overseas Development Institute
ODM	Ministry of Overseas Development
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and
	Development
OED	Operation Evaluation Department
OPEC	Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries
DD A	6 1 1 11 2

performance-based allocation

PBA



xvi

PBOC The People's Bank of China

PEPFAR President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief

List of Abbreviations

PRC People's Republic of China
RDB Regional Development Bank
RMS Results Management System
SAL Structural Adjustment Lending

SCI Selective Capital Increase

SCO Shanghai Cooperation Organisation SDR Special Drawing Rights

SFA Special Facility for Africa SSA Sub-Saharan Africa

SUNFED Special United Nations Fund for Economic

Development

UAE United Arab Emirates
UN United Nations

UNECAFE United Nations' Economic Commission for Asia and

the Far East

UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UK United Kingdom US United States

USAID US Agency for International Development

WTO World Trade Organization