Global Norms with a Local Face

To what extent are global rule-of-law norms, which external actors promote in post-conflict states, localized? Who decides whether global standards or local particularities prevail? This book offers a new approach to the debate about how the dilemma between the diffusion of global norms and their localization is dealt with in global politics. Studying the promotion of children’s rights, access to public information and an international commission against impunity in Guatemala, Lisbeth Zimmermann demonstrates that rule-of-law promotion triggers domestic contestation, and thereby changes the approach taken by external actors and ultimately the manner in which global norms are translated. However, the leeway in local translation is determined by the precision of global norms. Based on an innovative theoretical approach and in-depth study of rule-of-law translation, she argues for a shift in norm promotion from context sensitivity to democratic appropriation, speaking to international relations, peacebuilding, democratization studies, international law and political theory.

Lisbeth Zimmermann is a senior researcher at the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt. She is an external lecturer at Goethe University Frankfurt and affiliated with the university’s Cluster of Excellence ‘Formation of Normative Orders’.
Cambridge Studies in International Relations: 143

Global Norms with a Local Face

EDITORS
Evelyn Goh
Christian Reus-Smit
Nicholas J. Wheeler

EDITORIAL BOARD
Jacqueline Best, Karin Fierke, William Grimes, Yuen Foong Khong, Andrew Kydd, Lily Ling, Andrew Linklater, Nicola Phillips, Elizabeth Shakman Hurd, Jacquie True, Leslie Vinjamuri, Alexander Wendt

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series aims to publish the best new scholarship in international studies, irrespective of subject matter, methodological approach or theoretical perspective. The series seeks to bring the latest theoretical work in International Relations to bear on the most important problems and issues in global politics.
Cambridge Studies in International Relations

143 Lisbeth Zimmermann
Global Norms with a Local Face
Rule-of-Law Promotion and Norm Translation

142 Alexandre Debs and Nuno P. Monteiro
Nuclear Politics
The Strategic Causes of Proliferation

141 Mathias Albert
A theory of world politics

140 Emma Hutchison
Affective communities in world politics
Collective emotions after trauma

139 Patricia Owens
Economy of force
Counterinsurgency and the historical rise of the social

138 Ronald R. Krebs
Narrative and the making of US national security

137 Andrew Phillips and J.C. Sharman
International order in diversity
War, trade and rule in the Indian Ocean

136 Ole Jacob Sending, Vincent Pouliot and Iver B. Neumann (eds.)
Diplomacy and the making of world politics

135 Barry Buzan and George Lawson
The global transformation
History, modernity and the making of international relations

134 Heather Elko McKibben
State strategies in international bargaining
Play by the rules or change them?

133 Janina Dill
Legitimate targets?
Social construction, international law, and US bombing

Series list continues after index
Global Norms with a Local Face

Rule-of-Law Promotion and Norm Translation

LISBETH ZIMMERMANN
Peace Research Institute Frankfurt
Contents

List of Figures page ix
List of Tables x
List of Abbreviations xi
Acknowledgements xiv

1 Introduction: Between Global Norms and Local Translation 1
  1.1 Shortcomings of the State of the Art 3
  1.2 The Argument: Interactive Norm Translation 5
  1.3 Design 6
  1.4 Making Translation More Democratic? 16
  1.5 Data Collection and Analysis 17
  1.6 Outline of the Book 21

2 To Socialize or to Localize? 23
  2.1 Norm Socialization: Asymmetric Interaction 24
  2.2 Norm Localization: Local Agency Only 38
  2.3 Beyond Existing Norm-Diffusion Research 51
  2.4 Acknowledging the Interactive Element 61

3 Guatemala and the International Community 63
  3.1 External Actors in War-Torn Guatemala 64
  3.2 Guatemala Today: Engulfed by Violence? 78
  3.3 A Difficult Relationship: Domestic Contestation of Rule-of-Law Promotion 81

4 Translating Children’s Rights 83
  4.1 The Convention on the Rights of the Child: The Shift to a Rights-Based Approach 84
  4.2 Interactive Translation of the CRC in Guatemala: In Search of a Family-Based Approach 89
  4.3 Reshaping Children’s Rights 112

5 Translating a Right to Access Information 117
  5.1 The Development of a Global Right to Information 118
viii  Contents

5.2 Interactive ATI Translation in Guatemala: Securing Justice or Fighting Corruption?  124
5.3 Reshaping Access to Information  149

6 Translating Scripts for Rule-of-Law Commissions  154
6.1 Emerging Scripts for Rule-of-Law Commissions  155
6.2 Interactive Translation of the Scripts: Human Rights or the Fight against Crime?  157
6.3 Reshaping a Rule-of-Law Commission in Guatemala  187

7 Towards an Interactive Perspective on Norm Translation  192
7.1 Moving Norm Translation Research Forward  193
7.2 A Research Agenda for Norm Translation  205
7.3 Shifting Coordinates  207

8 Balancing Global Norms and Local Faces  209
8.1 Global Norms with a Local Face: Is Translation ‘a Good Thing’?  210
8.2 Making Appropriation (More) Democratic  221

Annex 1 List of Interview Partners  223
Annex 2 Presidential Administrations since Democratization in Guatemala  227
Annex 3 Data Selection Media Discourses  228
Discourse on Children’s Rights  228
Discourse on Right to Access Information  229
Discourse on Scripts for Rule-of-Law Commission  229

References  231
Index  284
Figures

1.1 Feedback loops in norm-diffusion processes.  page 6
Tables

2.1 Categorization of norm translation outcomes  page 55
2.2 Operationalization of interaction modes  61
3.1 Peace accords between the URNG and the Guatemalan government  71
4.1 Main rule-of-law areas covered by the Convention on the Rights of the Child  85
4.2 Children and Youth Code additions to the Convention on the Rights of the Child  92
4.3 The transition from the Convention on the Rights of the Child to the Ley PINA  103
4.4 Stages in the translation of children’s rights in Guatemala  115
5.1 Global support for access to information  120
5.2 Inter-American support for access to information  120
5.3 Most commonly adopted standards in regard to access to information  121
5.4 Progression of ATI legislation in Guatemala  134
5.5 Incorporation of international standards into Guatemalan legislation  137
5.6 Stages in the translation of access to information in Guatemala  152
6.1 The evolution of UN rule-of-law commissions  157
6.2 CICIACS 1.0: A 1990s-style commission  161
6.3 CICIACS 2.0: A 2000s-style commission  164
6.4 The CICIG: reshaping the standards of the 2000s  173
6.5 Stages in the translation of rule-of-law commissions in Guatemala  190
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANAM</td>
<td>Asociación Nacional de Municipalidades de la República de Guatemala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATI</td>
<td>access to information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CACIF</td>
<td>Comité Coordinador de Asociaciones Agrícolas, Comerciales, Industriales y Financieras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALDH</td>
<td>Centro para la Acción Legal en Derechos Humanos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCOIPINGUA</td>
<td>Comité Consultivo de Organismos Internacionales para la Protección Integral de la Niñez Guatemalteca</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEH</td>
<td>Comisión para el Esclarecimiento Histórico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIA</td>
<td>Central Intelligence Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIACS</td>
<td>Cuerpos Ilegales y Aparatos Clandestinos de Seguridad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CICIACS</td>
<td>Comisión de Investigación de Cuerpos Ilegales y Aparatos Clandestinos de Seguridad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CICIG</td>
<td>Comisión Internacional contra la Impunidad en Guatemala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLAI</td>
<td>Conferencia Latinoamericana de Iglesias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNJ</td>
<td>Código de la Niñez y la Juventud</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### List of Abbreviations (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CRC</td>
<td>Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOSES</td>
<td>Asociación desarrollo, organización, servicios y estudios socioculturales Association for Development, Organization, Services and Socio-cultural Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DR-CAFTA</td>
<td>Dominican Republic–Central America–United States Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNG</td>
<td>Frente Democrático Nueva Guatemala New Guatemalan Democratic Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMLN</td>
<td>Frente Farabundo Martí para la Liberación Nacional Farabundo Martí National Liberation Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOSS</td>
<td>Proyecto de Fortalecimiento de Organizaciones Sociales en Temas de Seguridad Project to Strengthen Social Organizations in the Area of Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRG</td>
<td>Frente Republicano Guatemalteco Guatemalan Republican Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSLN</td>
<td>Frente Sandinista de Liberación Nacional Sandinista National Liberation Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAM</td>
<td>Grupo de Apoyo Mutuo Mutual Support Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GANA</td>
<td>Gran Alianza Nacional Grand National Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit German government development agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IACHR</td>
<td>Inter-American Commission on Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFAI</td>
<td>Instituto Federal de Acceso a la Información Federal Institute for Access to Public Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IR</td>
<td>International Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ley PINA</td>
<td>Ley de Protección Integral de la Niñez y Adolescencia Comprehensive Child and Adolescent Protection Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MINUGUA</td>
<td>United Nations Verification Mission in Guatemala</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### List of Abbreviations

(Cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>non-governmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAS</td>
<td>Organization of American States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODHAG</td>
<td>Oficina de Derechos Humanos del Arzobispado de Guatemala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAN</td>
<td>Partido de Avanzada Nacional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PP</td>
<td>Partido Patriota</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRODEN</td>
<td>Comisión Pro-Convención sobre los Derechos del Niño</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEDEM</td>
<td>Seguridad en Democracia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEGEPLAN</td>
<td>Secretaría de Planificación y Programación de la Presidencia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAN</td>
<td>transnational advocacy network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNE</td>
<td>Unidad Nacional de la Esperanza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIICC</td>
<td>United Nations International Independent Investigation Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URNG</td>
<td>Unidad Revolucionaria Nacional Guatemala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOLA</td>
<td>Washington Office on Latin America</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
www.cambridge.org
Acknowledgements

A book’s journey to production is a long one. However often this observation may crop up in acknowledgements, I have not ceased to be surprised by the twists and turns the present project has taken and the number of people who have influenced the book’s final form. To all who lent a collaborative hand, I offer heartfelt thanks.

The book is based on a doctoral dissertation presented at the Technische Universität (TU) Darmstadt in 2012. My first intellectual ‘home base’ was the ‘Formation of Normative Orders’ Cluster of Excellence, a rather rare interdisciplinary commingling of international relations (IR) researchers and political theorists working out of Goethe University Frankfurt and TU Darmstadt. The discussions I took part in here helped shape my thinking on the normative implications of tensions between global norms and local translations. At the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt (PRIF), which became my second base, I benefitted enormously from the dual focus on global governance and the dynamics of local conflict. Terms like ‘localization’, ‘contestation’ and ‘translation’ may seem very much en vogue in IR research today, but eight years ago scholarly interest in them was minimal and the diverse expertise of PRIF colleagues was therefore key in helping me to shape my approach to these topics.

Before acknowledging the input of individual academic and editorial colleagues, I must remind the reader that what lies at the core of this study is the time I spent conducting research in Guatemala City and Washington, D.C., between 2009 and 2011. Countless individuals not specifically named in the study provided me with invaluable help during these visits, taking time to share their knowledge and opinions and helping me establish further contacts.

The situation of many politically active individuals in Guatemala is a frustrating one. The constant scrutiny to which they are subjected by researchers (and foreign donors) appears to them to bring few direct results in terms of their overall political aim – making Guatemala
a more just and democratic country. I hope that this book, besides being of academic value, may help bring about further change in the practices employed to promote democracy and the rule of law. I hope also that it conveys, and acknowledges, the everyday conflicts of Guatemalan politics.

I owe special thanks to the local office of the German development agency GIZ – and in particular to Bernhard Dohle and Natascha Solis – and to Tjark Eggenhof of the Adenauer Foundation for helping me to establish my first contacts in Guatemala City. Although he may not realize it, my conversation with Oscar Chavarría flagged up many of the key routes along which the book’s main argument eventually developed. Besides generously giving of their expertise, Leonardo Castilho, Sergio Pivaral and Claudia Reyes provided me with a number of interesting contacts. Special thanks must also go to the staff of the Biblioteca Nacional de Guatemala for their friendliness and the interest they showed during the many days I spent in the library’s newspaper archive.

Guatemala City is not the easiest of locations in which to do research. My warmest thanks go to Luis Eric Gudiel and Maria Georgina Quiñones, and to Natascha Solis, for making me feel so welcome, comfortable and safe during my visits to Guatemala. I would also like to thank my friend Kezia McKeague in Washington, D.C., particularly for introducing me to her network of first-rate contacts in the field of Latin American politics.

A great many people have been involved in the actual writing of this book, particularly the drafting of the original dissertation and its translation into book form. I would like to thank in particular my dissertation supervisors Klaus Dieter Wolf, whose talent for breaking down seemingly intractable problems into practical research steps proved invaluable, and Nicole Deitelhoff, who helped hone the various versions of the text with countless helpful suggestions. I am grateful to them both for the time they devoted to the project at each of its many stages.

Thanks are also due to all those who, at different stages and in different contexts, commented on the manuscript itself or on the key arguments presented in it. This includes Amitav Acharya, Tanja Börzel, Lothar Brock, David Chandler, Stephan Engelkamp, Katharina Glaab, Amichai Magen, Harald Müller, Kathryn Sikkink, Richard Price, Thomas Risse, Susan Sell, Chris Reus-Smit and Antje
Wiener. Amongst my colleagues at PRIF, Jonas Wolff was unstinting in his advice and Melanie Coni-Zimmer, Anne Flohr, Svenja Gertheiss, Steffi Herr and Eva Ortendörfer were a source of great support, as were the members of PRIF’s colloquium of doctoral students. I also drew considerable inspiration from my discussions with Friedrich Arndt, Angela Marciniak and Peter Niesen at TU Darmstadt, and numerous excellent ideas for improving the text were provided by members of our research colloquium at Goethe University, including, amongst many others, Christopher Daase, Thorsten Thiel, Ben Kamis and Julian Junk.

I was fortunate to be offered scholarly sanctuary in a number of exceptional academic locations. Thanks to Susan Sell, during spring 2011 I had the opportunity to work as a research fellow at the Institute for Global and International Studies, located within the Elliott School of International Affairs at George Washington University. Likewise, in autumn 2010, Tanja Börzel and Thomas Risse provided me with a desk and an inspiring research setting in their group on ‘The Transformative Power of Europe’ at the Freie Universität Berlin.

Transforming a dissertation into a readable book is always a challenge, involving as it does a lengthy process of rethinking, rewriting and synthesizing. I am grateful to Anne Reiff, Anna Ferl, Michael Pollok and Lydia Both for helping me to update the manuscript and get to grips with citation managers. Invaluable native-speaker input was provided by Margaret Clarke, who helped polish and perfect the text in a calm and supportive way. Thanks also go to John Haslam and his team at Cambridge University Press for their expeditious handling of the publication process and to the Cambridge readers for their helpful comments. Any errors that remain in the book are, of course, my own.

I am pleased also to have the opportunity to thank the three bodies who funded the research presented in this book: the German Research Foundation’s Cluster of Excellence on ‘The Formation of Normative Orders’; the German Academic Exchange Service; and the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt. I gratefully acknowledge permission by Oxford University Press to reproduce sections of ‘Same Same or Different? Norm Diffusion Between Resistance, Compliance, and Localization in Post-conflict States’ (International Studies Perspective 17(1): 98–115).

Last, but not least, I would like to thank my family and friends. They played a crucial part as the book took shape—sometimes with hands-on help, sometimes just by virtue of their enduring interest. Thank you,
then, to Ellen Ehmke, Dorothea Gädeke, Lisa Groß, Angela Marciniak, Heather Renwick, Julia Strutz and, of course, my parents. Thanks also to my partner, Jannik Pfister, without whose help I can say, without exaggeration, this book would not have been written. The final coda belongs to baby Lukas, whose exemplary sleeping habits in the first few months of life enabled me to complete the bulk of revisions to the manuscript.