



Global Norms with a Local Face

To what extent are global rule-of-law norms, which external actors promote in post-conflict states, localized? Who decides whether global standards or local particularities prevail? This book offers a new approach to the debate about how the dilemma between the diffusion of global norms and their localization is dealt with in global politics. Studying the promotion of children's rights, access to public information and an international commission against impunity in Guatemala, Lisbeth Zimmermann demonstrates that rule-of-law promotion triggers domestic contestation, and thereby changes the approach taken by external actors and ultimately the manner in which global norms are translated. However, the leeway in local translation is determined by the precision of global norms. Based on an innovative theoretical approach and in-depth study of rule-of-law translation, she argues for a shift in norm promotion from context sensitivity to democratic appropriation, speaking to international relations, peacebuilding, democratization studies, international law and political theory.

LISBETH ZIMMERMANN is a senior researcher at the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt. She is an external lecturer at Goethe University Frankfurt and affiliated with the university's Cluster of Excellence 'Formation of Normative Orders'.

*Cambridge Studies in International
Relations: 143*

Global Norms with a Local Face

EDITORS

Evelyn Goh
Christian Reus-Smit
Nicholas J. Wheeler

EDITORIAL BOARD

Jacqueline Best, Karin Fierke, William Grimes, Yuen Foong
Khong, Andrew Kydd, Lily Ling, Andrew Linklater, Nicola
Phillips, Elizabeth Shakman Hurd, Jacquie True, Leslie
Vinjamuri, Alexander Wendt

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series aims to publish the best new scholarship in international studies, irrespective of subject matter, methodological approach or theoretical perspective. The series seeks to bring the latest theoretical work in International Relations to bear on the most important problems and issues in global politics.

Cambridge Studies in International Relations

- 143 *Lisbeth Zimmermann*
Global Norms with a Local Face
 Rule-of-Law Promotion and Norm Translation
- 142 *Alexandre Debs and Nuno P. Monteiro*
Nuclear Politics
 The Strategic Causes of Proliferation
- 141 *Mathias Albert*
A theory of world politics
- 140 *Emma Hutchison*
Affective communities in world politics
 Collective emotions after trauma
- 139 *Patricia Owens*
Economy of force
 Counterinsurgency and the historical rise of the social
- 138 *Ronald R. Krebs*
Narrative and the making of US national security
- 137 *Andrew Phillips and J.C. Sharman*
International order in diversity
 War, trade and rule in the Indian Ocean
- 136 *Ole Jacob Sending, Vincent Pouliot and Iver B. Neumann (eds.)*
Diplomacy and the making of world politics
- 135 *Barry Buzan and George Lawson*
The global transformation
 History, modernity and the making of international relations
- 134 *Heather Elko McKibben*
State strategies in international bargaining
 Play by the rules or change them?
- 133 *Janina Dill*
Legitimate targets?
 Social construction, international law, and US bombing

Series list continues after index

Global Norms with a Local Face

Rule-of-Law Promotion and
Norm Translation

LISBETH ZIMMERMANN
Peace Research Institute Frankfurt



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-17204-3 — Global Norms with a Local Face
Lisbeth Zimmermann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107172043

DOI: 10.1017/9781316771341

© Lisbeth Zimmermann 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Zimmermann, Lisbeth, author.

Title: Global norms with a local face : rule-of-law promotion and norm translation / Lisbeth Zimmermann.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Series: Cambridge studies in international relations

Identifiers: LCCN 2016056472 | ISBN 9781107172043 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Rule of law. | International law. | Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989 November 20) | Children's rights. | Freedom of information. | Rule of law – Guatemala. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / International Relations / General.

Classification: LCC K3171 .Z56 2017 | DDC 340/.11–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016056472>

ISBN 978-1-107-17204-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiv
1 Introduction: Between Global Norms and Local Translation	1
1.1 Shortcomings of the State of the Art	3
1.2 The Argument: Interactive Norm Translation	5
1.3 Design	6
1.4 Making Translation More Democratic?	16
1.5 Data Collection and Analysis	17
1.6 Outline of the Book	21
2 To Socialize or to Localize?	23
2.1 Norm Socialization: Asymmetric Interaction	24
2.2 Norm Localization: Local Agency Only	38
2.3 Beyond Existing Norm-Diffusion Research	51
2.4 Acknowledging the Interactive Element	61
3 Guatemala and the International Community	63
3.1 External Actors in War-Torn Guatemala	64
3.2 Guatemala Today: Engulfed by Violence?	78
3.3 A Difficult Relationship: Domestic Contestation of Rule-of-Law Promotion	81
4 Translating Children’s Rights	83
4.1 The Convention on the Rights of the Child: The Shift to a Rights-Based Approach	84
4.2 Interactive Translation of the CRC in Guatemala: In Search of a Family-Based Approach	89
4.3 Reshaping Children’s Rights	112
5 Translating a Right to Access Information	117
5.1 The Development of a Global Right to Information	118
	vii

viii	<i>Contents</i>
5.2 Interactive ATI Translation in Guatemala: Securing Justice or Fighting Corruption?	124
5.3 Reshaping Access to Information	149
6 Translating Scripts for Rule-of-Law Commissions	154
6.1 Emerging Scripts for Rule-of-Law Commissions	155
6.2 Interactive Translation of the Scripts: Human Rights or the Fight against Crime?	157
6.3 Reshaping a Rule-of-Law Commission in Guatemala	187
7 Towards an Interactive Perspective on Norm Translation	192
7.1 Moving Norm Translation Research Forward	193
7.2 A Research Agenda for Norm Translation	205
7.3 Shifting Coordinates	207
8 Balancing Global Norms and Local Faces	209
8.1 Global Norms with a Local Face: Is Translation ‘a Good Thing’?	210
8.2 Making Appropriation (More) Democratic	221
<i>Annex 1 List of Interview Partners</i>	223
<i>Annex 2 Presidential Administrations since Democratization in Guatemala</i>	227
<i>Annex 3 Data Selection Media Discourses</i>	228
Discourse on Children’s Rights	228
Discourse on Right to Access Information	229
Discourse on Scripts for Rule-of-Law Commission	229
<i>References</i>	231
<i>Index</i>	284

Figures

1.1 Feedback loops in norm-diffusion processes. *page 6*

Tables

2.1	Categorization of norm translation outcomes	<i>page</i> 55
2.2	Operationalization of interaction modes	61
3.1	Peace accords between the URNG and the Guatemalan government	71
4.1	Main rule-of-law areas covered by the Convention on the Rights of the Child	85
4.2	Children and Youth Code additions to the Convention on the Rights of the Child	92
4.3	The transition from the Convention on the Rights of the Child to the Ley PINA	103
4.4	Stages in the translation of children's rights in Guatemala	115
5.1	Global support for access to information	120
5.2	Inter-American support for access to information	120
5.3	Most commonly adopted standards in regard to access to information	121
5.4	Progression of ATI legislation in Guatemala	134
5.5	Incorporation of international standards into Guatemalan legislation	137
5.6	Stages in the translation of access to information in Guatemala	152
6.1	The evolution of UN rule-of-law commissions	157
6.2	CICIACS 1.0: A 1990s-style commission	161
6.3	CICIACS 2.0: A 2000s-style commission	164
6.4	The CICIG: reshaping the standards of the 2000s	173
6.5	Stages in the translation of rule-of-law commissions in Guatemala	190

Abbreviations

ANAM	Asociación Nacional de Municipalidades de la República de Guatemala	National Association of Guatemalan Municipalities
ATI	access to information	
CACIF	Comité Coordinador de Asociaciones Agrícolas, Comerciales, Industriales y Financieras	Committee of Agricultural, Commercial, Industrial and Financial Associations
CALDH	Centro para la Acción Legal en Derechos Humanos	Centre for Legal Action on Human Rights
CCOIPINGUA	Comité Consultivo de Organismos Internacionales para la Protección Integral de la Niñez Guatemalteca	Guatemalan Consultative Committee of International Organizations for Child Protection
CEH	Comisión para el Esclarecimiento Histórico	Commission for Historical Clarification
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency	
CIACS	Cuerpos Ilegales y Aparatos Clandestinos de Seguridad	Illegal Groups and Clandestine Security Structures
CICIACS	Comisión de Investigación de Cuerpos Ilegales y Aparatos Clandestinos de Seguridad	Commission for the Investigation of Illegal Groups and Clandestine Security Structures
CICIG	Comisión Internacional contra la Impunidad en Guatemala	International Commission against Impunity in Guatemala
CLAI	Conferencia Latinoamericana de Iglesias	Latin American Conference of Churches
CNJ	Código de la Niñez y la Juventud	Children and Youth Code

(cont.)

CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child	
DOSES	Asociación desarrollo, organización, servicios y estudios socioculturales	Association for Development, Organization, Services and Socio-cultural Studies
DR-CAFTA	Dominican Republic–Central America–United States Free Trade Agreement	
EU	European Union	
FDNG	Frente Democrático Nueva Guatemala	New Guatemalan Democratic Front
FMLN	Frente Farabundo Martí para la Liberación Nacional	Farabundo Martí National Liberation Front
FOSS	Proyecto de Fortalecimiento de Organizaciones Sociales en Temas de Seguridad	Project to Strengthen Social Organizations in the Area of Security
FRG	Frente Republicano Guatemalteco	Guatemalan Republican Front
FSLN	Frente Sandinista de Liberación Nacional	Sandinista National Liberation Front
GAM	Grupo de Apoyo Mutuo	Mutual Support Group
GANAN	Gran Alianza Nacional	Grand National Alliance
GDP	Gross Domestic Product	
GIZ	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit	German government development agency
IACHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights	
IFAI	Instituto Federal de Acceso a la Información	Federal Institute for Access to Public Information
IR	International Relations	
Ley PINA	Ley de Protección Integral de la Niñez y Adolescencia	Comprehensive Child and Adolescent Protection Code
MINUGUA	United Nations Verification Mission in Guatemala	

List of Abbreviations

xiii

(cont.)

NGO	non-governmental organization	
OAS	Organization of American States	
ODHAG	Oficina de Derechos Humanos del Arzobispado de Guatemala	Human Rights Office of the Archbishop of Guatemala
PAN	Partido de Avanzada Nacional	National Advancement Party
PP	Partido Patriota	Patriotic Party
PRODEN	Comisión Pro-Convención sobre los Derechos del Niño	Commission in Favour of the Convention on the Rights of the Child
SEDEM	Seguridad en Democracia	Security in Democracy Association
SEGEPLAN	Secretaría de Planificación y Programación de la Presidencia	Secretariat of Planning and Programming of the Presidency
TAN	transnational advocacy network	
UN	United Nations	
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme	
UNE	Unidad Nacional de la Esperanza	National Union for Hope
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund	
UNIIC	United Nations International Independent Investigation Commission	
URNG	Unidad Revolucionaria Nacional Guatemala	Guatemalan National Revolutionary Unity
USAID	United States Agency for International Development	
WOLA	Washington Office on Latin America	

Acknowledgements

A book's journey to production is a long one. However often this observation may crop up in acknowledgements, I have not ceased to be surprised by the twists and turns the present project has taken and the number of people who have influenced the book's final form. To all who lent a collaborative hand, I offer heartfelt thanks.

The book is based on a doctoral dissertation presented at the Technische Universität (TU) Darmstadt in 2012. My first intellectual 'home base' was the 'Formation of Normative Orders' Cluster of Excellence, a rather rare interdisciplinary commingling of international relations (IR) researchers and political theorists working out of Goethe University Frankfurt and TU Darmstadt. The discussions I took part in here helped shape my thinking on the normative implications of tensions between global norms and local translations. At the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt (PRIF), which became my second base, I benefited enormously from the dual focus on global governance and the dynamics of local conflict. Terms like 'localization', 'contestation' and 'translation' may seem very much *en vogue* in IR research today, but eight years ago scholarly interest in them was minimal and the diverse expertise of PRIF colleagues was therefore key in helping me to shape my approach to these topics.

Before acknowledging the input of individual academic and editorial colleagues, I must remind the reader that what lies at the core of this study is the time I spent conducting research in Guatemala City and Washington, D.C., between 2009 and 2011. Countless individuals not specifically named in the study provided me with invaluable help during these visits, taking time to share their knowledge and opinions and helping me establish further contacts.

The situation of many politically active individuals in Guatemala is a frustrating one. The constant scrutiny to which they are subjected by researchers (and foreign donors) appears to them to bring few direct results in terms of their overall political aim – making Guatemala

Acknowledgements

xv

a more just and democratic country. I hope that this book, besides being of academic value, may help bring about further change in the practices employed to promote democracy and the rule of law. I hope also that it conveys, and acknowledges, the everyday conflicts of Guatemalan politics.

I owe special thanks to the local office of the German development agency GIZ – and in particular to Bernhard Dohle and Natascha Solis – and to Tjark Eggenhof of the Adenauer Foundation for helping me to establish my first contacts in Guatemala City. Although he may not realize it, my conversation with Oscar Chavarría flagged up many of the key routes along which the book’s main argument eventually developed. Besides generously giving of their expertise, Leonardo Castilho, Sergio Pivaral and Claudia Reyes provided me with a number of interesting contacts. Special thanks must also go to the staff of the Biblioteca Nacional de Guatemala for their friendliness and the interest they showed during the many days I spent in the library’s newspaper archive.

Guatemala City is not the easiest of locations in which to do research. My warmest thanks go to Luis Eric Gudiel and Maria Georgina Quiñones, and to Natascha Solis, for making me feel so welcome, comfortable and safe during my visits to Guatemala. I would also like to thank my friend Kezia McKeague in Washington, D.C., particularly for introducing me to her network of first-rate contacts in the field of Latin American politics.

A great many people have been involved in the actual writing of this book, particularly the drafting of the original dissertation and its translation into book form. I would like to thank in particular my dissertation supervisors Klaus Dieter Wolf, whose talent for breaking down seemingly intractable problems into practical research steps proved invaluable, and Nicole Deitelhoff, who helped hone the various versions of the text with countless helpful suggestions. I am grateful to them both for the time they devoted to the project at each of its many stages.

Thanks are also due to all those who, at different stages and in different contexts, commented on the manuscript itself or on the key arguments presented in it. This includes Amitav Acharya, Tanja Börzel, Lothar Brock, David Chandler, Stephan Engelkamp, Katharina Glaab, Amichai Magen, Harald Müller, Kathryn Sikkink, Richard Price, Thomas Risse, Susan Sell, Chris Reus-Smit and Antje

Wiener. Amongst my colleagues at PRIF, Jonas Wolff was unstinting in his advice and Melanie Coni-Zimmer, Anne Flohr, Svenja Gertheiss, Steffi Herr and Eva Ottendörfer were a source of great support, as were the members of PRIF's colloquium of doctoral students. I also drew considerable inspiration from my discussions with Friedrich Arndt, Angela Marciniak and Peter Niesen at TU Darmstadt, and numerous excellent ideas for improving the text were provided by members of our research colloquium at Goethe University, including, amongst many others, Christopher Daase, Thorsten Thiel, Ben Kamis and Julian Junk.

I was fortunate to be offered scholarly sanctuary in a number of exceptional academic locations. Thanks to Susan Sell, during spring 2011 I had the opportunity to work as a research fellow at the Institute for Global and International Studies, located within the Elliott School of International Affairs at George Washington University. Likewise, in autumn 2010, Tanja Börzel and Thomas Risse provided me with a desk and an inspiring research setting in their group on 'The Transformative Power of Europe' at the Freie Universität Berlin.

Transforming a dissertation into a readable book is always a challenge, involving as it does a lengthy process of rethinking, rewriting and synthesizing. I am grateful to Anne Reiff, Anna Ferl, Michael Pollok and Lydia Both for helping me to update the manuscript and get to grips with citation managers. Invaluable native-speaker input was provided by Margaret Clarke, who helped polish and perfect the text in a calm and supportive way. Thanks also go to John Haslam and his team at Cambridge University Press for their expeditious handling of the publication process and to the Cambridge readers for their helpful comments. Any errors that remain in the book are, of course, my own.

I am pleased also to have the opportunity to thank the three bodies who funded the research presented in this book: the German Research Foundation's Cluster of Excellence on 'The Formation of Normative Orders'; the German Academic Exchange Service; and the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt. I gratefully acknowledge permission by Oxford University Press to reproduce sections of 'Same Same or Different? Norm Diffusion Between Resistance, Compliance, and Localization in Post-conflict States' (*International Studies Perspective* 17(1): 98–115).

Last, but not least, I would like to thank my family and friends. They played a crucial part as the book took shape – sometimes with hands-on help, sometimes just by virtue of their enduring interest. Thank you,

Acknowledgements

xvii

then, to Ellen Ehmke, Dorothea Gädeke, Lisa Groß, Angela Marciniak, Heather Renwick, Julia Strutz and, of course, my parents. Thanks also to my partner, Jannik Pfister, without whose help I can say, without exaggeration, this book would not have been written. The final coda belongs to baby Lukas, whose exemplary sleeping habits in the first few months of life enabled me to complete the bulk of revisions to the manuscript.