

## CALVIN'S POLITICAL THEOLOGY AND THE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT OF THE CHURCH

This book explores a little-appreciated dimension of John Calvin's political thought, his two kingdoms theology, as a model for constructive, Christian participation in liberal society. Widely misunderstood as a proto-political culture warrior, due in part to his often misinterpreted role in controversies over predestination and the heretic Servetus, Calvin articulated a thoughtful approach to public life rooted in his understanding of the gospel and its teaching concerning the kingdom of God. He staked his ministry in Geneva on his commitment to keeping the church distinct from the state, abandoning simplistic approaches that placed one above the other, and rejecting the temptations of sectarianism or separatism. This revealing analysis of Calvin's vision offers timely guidance for Christians seeking a mode of faithful, respectful public engagement in democratic, pluralistic communities today.

Matthew J. Tuininga holds a Ph.D. in Religion, Ethics and Society from Emory University and is Assistant Professor of Moral Theology at Calvin Theological Seminary. He formerly taught politics and core studies at Oglethorpe University in Atlanta, Georgia, and he has also taught at Emory University and at Sewanee, the University of the South. He previously worked as a congressional aide in Washington D.C. and as a counterterrorism intelligence analyst for the Federal Bureau of Investigation.



#### LAW AND CHRISTIANITY

Series Editor

John Witte, Jr., Emory University

### Editorial Board

Nigel Biggar, University of Oxford Marta Cartabia, Italian Constitutional Court / University of Milan Sarah Coakley, University of Cambridge Norman Doe, Cardiff University Brian Ferme, Marcianum, Venice Richard W. Garnett, University of Notre Dame Robert P. George, Princeton University Mary Ann Glendon, Harvard University Kent Greenawalt, Columbia University Robin Griffith-Jones, the Temple, the Inns of Court R.H. Helmholz, University of Chicago Mark Hill, the Inns of Court / Cardiff University Wolfgang Huber, Bishop Emeritus, United Protestant Church of Germany / Universities of Heidelberg, Berlin, and Stellenbosch Michael W. McConnell, Stanford University John McGuckin, Columbia University Mark A. Noll, University of Notre Dame Michael Welker, University of Heidelberg

The Law and Christianity series publishes cutting-edge work on Catholic, Protestant, and Orthodox Christian contributions to public, private, penal, and procedural law and legal theory. The series aims to promote deep Christian reflection by leading scholars on the fundamentals of law and politics, to build further ecumenical legal understanding across Christian denominations, and to link and amplify the diverse and sometimes isolated Christian legal voices and visions at work in the academy. Works collected by the series include groundbreaking monographs, historical and thematic anthologies, and translations by leading scholars around the globe.

### Books in the series

God and the Secular Legal System Rafael Domingo
How Marriage Became One of the Sacraments Philip Reynolds
Christianity and Freedom Edited by Timothy Samuel Shah and Allen D. Hertzke
The Distinctiveness of Religion in American Law Kathleen A. Brady
Pope Benedict XVI's Legal Thought Marta Cartabia and Andrea Simoncini
The Western Case for Monogamy Over Polygamy John Witte



# Calvin's Political Theology and the Public Engagement of the Church

CHRIST'S TWO KINGDOMS

MATTHEW J. TUININGA

Calvin Theological Seminary





## **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107171435 DOI: 10.1017/9781316760000

© Matthew J. Tuininga 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-17143-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my parents, Cal and Ellen Tuininga, to whom I owe so much.



## Contents

Acknowledgments		page viii	
Not	te on Citations of Calvin's Works	xi	
List	t of Abbreviations	xiv	
	Introduction	1	
1	Two Swords, Two Powers, or Two Kingdoms: Spiritual and Politi Authority in Early Modern Europe	ical	
2	Calvin, Geneva, and the French Reformed Churches	61	
3	The Kingdom of Christ	92	
4	Two Kingdoms	140	
5	Christ's Spiritual Government	182	
6	Christ's Political Government: Early Formulations	228	
7	Covenant and Law	255	
8	The Magistrate's Care of Religion	280	
9	Law, Democracy, and Resistance to Tyranny	321	
	Conclusion: Calvin's Two Kingdoms and Liberal Democracy	355	
Index		379	



## Acknowledgments

This book arose from a dissertation I wrote while studying at Emory University in Atlanta, Georgia. It is the culmination of five years of doctoral work and many more years of research and conversation with teachers, colleagues, students, family members, and friends. I have accumulated more debts than I can possibly acknowledge here: library staff at the Robert W. Woodruff and Pitts Theology libraries at Emory University; staff at Emory Law School's Center for the Study of Law and Religion (especially Amy Wheeler); colleagues and friends who attended presentations of the work and offered their critical feedback; students and other conversation partners in seminars, classes, online forums, and other informal settings; and teachers who challenged and encouraged early attempts to work out my thoughts in various assignments or papers. I am grateful for opportunities to present summaries of the work at the Third Refo500 Conference in Berlin in May 2013 and at the Second Annual Convivium Calvinisticum, sponsored by the Davenant Trust, in South Carolina in June 2014. I am thankful for funding I received through the Faculty Heritage Fund at Calvin Theological Seminary during the final stages of putting this book together.

I owe a special debt of gratitude to Michael S. Horton and David VanDrunen of Westminster Seminary California, who first guided me into the field of political theology and drew my attention to the Reformed two kingdoms tradition. Both Mike and Dave helped me begin to explore the field through directed studies, while Dave gave me the opportunity to serve as his research assistant and work with him on multiple projects on Reformed political theology and ethics.

I am very thankful to the four individuals who graciously served as my doctoral committee: Timothy P. Jackson, John Witte, Jr., Elsie Anne McKee, and Steven M. Tipton. Steve gave me the opportunity to teach the sociology of religion with him while helping me to take a sociological perspective on religion and politics into proper account. Elsie offered her excellent historical theological expertise to the project from Princeton Seminary, despite having never met me personally



## Acknowledgments

ix

beforehand. Tim guided me through my doctoral program as a teacher, advisor, and friend, beginning with the day he went above and beyond the call of duty by allowing me, my wife, and our one-month-old son to stay indefinitely at his home in Atlanta until we could find our own place to live. He has always challenged me to wrestle with the implications of Christian *agape* in social, political, and ecclesiastical contexts. Even where we have our disagreements, he has cheered me on as a friend and colleague.

To John I owe an enormous debt; he was the one who first believed in me as a graduate student and made me excited about the prospect of coming to study at Emory. John and I hit it off as soon as we realized that we both grew up in the same Dutch Reformed immigrant community in southern Ontario and attended the same school (at different times of course!). He made me his research assistant and introduced me to the immense field of Calvin studies, driving me to Calvin's commentaries, sermons, and letters to scour everything he wrote relating to law, an effort that proved to be an invaluable foundation for my own research. He likewise introduced me to the nexus between religion and contemporary law by graciously including me in Emory Law School's Religion and Law group, which is affiliated with the Center for the Study of Law and Religion. John has the gift of encouragement, and where I faltered, even when his own plate was piled high with challenges, he always helped me see the big picture of what I was doing and how it was thoroughly worth pursuing. Needless to say, without John, this project never would have happened.

I am also grateful for a number of individuals who graciously read the whole of the manuscript and offered their encouragement and advice: Nicholas Wolterstorff, John L. Thompson, David Little, Barbara Pitkin, William R. Stevenson, David VanDrunen, Brad Littlejohn, John Bolt, and Herman Selderhuis. These impressive scholars saved me from numerous mistakes, helped me to clarify key arguments where necessary, and offered invaluable encouragement. It should go without saying – but I must say it anyway – that I alone am responsible for the mistakes and weaknesses that remain.

In addition, I have benefited tremendously from conversations with teachers, colleagues, family members, and friends who've helped me to work out the arguments and perspectives found in this book. They include Jay Green, Richard Follett, Ellen Marshall, Elizabeth Bounds, Stefan Losel, Dianne Stewart, Jimmy McCarty, Justin Latterell, Iwan Baamann (who also helped check some of my translations), David Alenskis, Davey Henreckson, Mika Edmondson, Ron Prins, Jeremy and Janine Huntington, Mark and Carla Van Essendelft, Eric Tuininga, Calvin and Ellen Tuininga, and many others.

I am grateful to my children, Joel, Katherine, and Sarah, who were faithful in prayer and encouraging in spirit while I worked on this book. They always make sure



X

### Acknowledgments

I keep the bigger picture in perspective, and not infrequently, they have been the inspiration that kept me going.

My greatest debt, without question, is to my wife Elizabeth, who has been my primary conversation partner and best friend from the beginning to the end of this project. She has been gracious, patient, and encouraging far beyond my deserving. As my first and most supportive critic, she faithfully read the early drafts of my work before anyone else and almost always anticipated their best criticism and suggestions. She has kept our family running remarkably smoothly even amid the most stressful of times. Her commitment to me is the bedrock of my life. My gratitude for her love is far beyond what words can express.



## Note on Citations of Calvin's Works

Calvin wrote his scholarly works in Latin, but he ordinarily published a French translation as well. He gave his academic lectures in Latin, while he preached his sermons in French. The majority of these primary sources can be found in the *Ioannis Calvini Opera Quae Supersunt Omnia*, *Corpus Reformatorum* (volumes 29–87; eds. Johann Wilhelm Baum, August Eduard Cunitz, and Eduard Reuss; 1863–1900), hereafter *Calvini Opera* or CO, while the rest of the sources I used can be found in the *Supplementa Calviniana*: *Sermons Inédits* (eds. Hanns Rückert et al.; Neukirchen: 1936–2006), hereafter SC, or at the Post-Reformation Digital Library (www.prdl.org/). Nearly all of Calvin's works, including most of his sermons, have been translated and published in English. In such cases I have used the English translations while checking key terminology and wording against the original Latin or French. Occasionally I have altered the translation or wording, either for stylistic or substantive clarity. Thus when referring to Calvin's writings, I have used the following method:

- When citing Calvin's Institutes of the Christian Religion, I usually cite parenthetically according to book, chapter, and paragraph from the 1559 edition, a form of citation that works for both English translations and the original Latin. When I cite the 1536 edition, however, I cite according to chapter, subchapter, and paragraph. Both these forms of citation work for both the English translations and the original Latin. The English translations I have used are:
  - Institutes of the Christian Religion. 1559 Edition. Edited by John T. McNeill et al. Translated by Ford Lewis Battles. Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 1960.
  - Institutes of the Christian Religion. 1536 Edition. Translated by Ford Lewis Battles. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1975.
- When citing Calvin's occasional writings, I directly cite the English translation, along with the Latin or French original.



xii

### Note on Citations of Calvin's Works

- When citing Calvin's letters, I provide the receiver and date of the letter, along with the original source. The English translations I have used come from:
  - Selected Works of John Calvin: Tracts and Letters. 7 Volumes. Edited by Henry Beveridge and Jules Bonnet. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1983.
- When citing Calvin's commentaries and sermons, I provide the passage on which Calvin is commenting, along with the date and the original source. With the commentaries, this is always a citation from the *Calvini Opera*, except in the case of the 1540 commentary on Romans, in which case I have used T. H. L. Parker's *Iohannis Calvini Commentarius in Epistolam Pauli ad Romanos* (Leiden: Brill, 1981), which shows the variants between the 1540 and 1557 editions. The English translations I have used are as follows:
  - Calvin's Commentaries. 22 volumes. Translated by John King et al. Grand Rapids: Baker, 2003.
  - *John Calvin's Sermons on 2 Samuel: Chapter 1–13.* Translated by Douglas Kelly. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 1992.
  - *John Calvin's Sermons on Ephesians*. Revision of the translation by Arthur Golding. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 1973.
  - *John Calvin's Sermons on Galatians*. Translated by Arthur Golding. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 1997.
  - John Calvin's Sermons on Genesis: Chapters 1:1-11:4. Translated by Rob Roy McGregor. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 2009.
  - John Calvin's Sermons on the Acts of the Apostles: Chapters 1–7. Translated by Rob Roy McGregor. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 2008.
  - John Calvin's Sermons on the Beatitudes. Taken from the Gospel Harmony. Delivered in Geneva in 1560. Translated by Robert White. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 2006.
  - John Calvin's Sermons on the Ten Commandments. Translated by Benjamin W. Farley. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1980.
  - Men, Women, and Order in the Church: Three Sermons (Sermons on 1 Corinthians). Translated by Seth Skolnitsky. Dallas, TX: Presbyterian Heritage Publications.
  - Sermons from Job. Translated by Leroy Nixon. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1952.
  - Sermons on Deuteronomy. Translated by Arthur Golding. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1987.
  - Sermons on Jeremiah. Translated by Blair Reynolds. Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 1990.
  - Sermons on the Book of Micah. Translated by Benjamin Wirt Farley. Phillipsburg, NJ: Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing, 2003.
  - Sermons on the Epistles to Timothy and Titus. Translated by Arthur Golding. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1983.



Note on Citations of Calvin's Works

xiii

- Sermons on the Saving Work of Christ. Translated by Leroy Nixon. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1950.
- Songs of the Nativity: Selected Sermons on Luke 1 and 2. Translated by Robert White. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 2008.
- The Gospel According to Isaiah: Severn Sermons on Isaiah 53 Concerning the Passion and Death of Christ. Translated by Leroy Nixon. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1953.

An excellent and thorough guide to Calvin's works is Wulfert De Greef's *The Writings of John Calvin, Expanded Edition: An Introductory Guide* (trans. Lyle D. Bierma; Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2008).



## Abbreviations

- CO Ioannis Calvini Opera Quae Supersunt Omnia, Corpus Reformatorum (volumes 29–87; ed. Johann Wilhelm Baum, August Eduard Cunitz, and Eduard Reuss; 1863–1900).
- LW *Luther's Works* (55 volumes; eds. Jaroslav Pelikan, et al.; St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1955–).
- SC Supplementa Calviniana: Sermons Inédits (ed. Hanns Rückert et al.; Neukirchen: 1936–2006).