

### **Abortion Rights**

This book features opening arguments followed by two rounds of reply between two moral philosophers on opposing sides of the abortion debate. In the opening essays, Kate Greasley and Christopher Kaczor lay out what they take to be the best case for and against abortion rights. In the ensuing dialogue, they engage with each other's arguments and each responds to criticisms fielded by the other. Their conversational argument explores such fundamental questions as: What gives a person the right to life? Is abortion bad for women? What is the difference between abortion and infanticide? Underpinned by philosophical reasoning and methodology, this book provides opposing and clearly structured perspectives on a highly emotive and controversial issue. The result gives readers a window into how moral philosophers argue about the contentious issue of abortion rights, and an in-depth analysis of the compelling arguments on both sides.

KATE GREASLEY is a Lecturer in Law at University College London. She is the author of *Arguments about Abortion: Personhood, Morality, and Law* (2017).

CHRISTOPHER KACZOR is Professor of Philosophy at Loyola Marymount University. His publications include *A Defense of Dignity* (2013) and *The Ethics of Abortion* (2nd ed., 2015).



**Abortion Rights** 

For and Against

Kate Greasley
University College London

Christopher Kaczor
Loyola Marymount University, California





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107170933 DOI: 10.1017/9781316758441

© Kate Greasley and Christopher Kaczor 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Greasley, Kate, author. | Kaczor, Christopher Robert, 1969- author.

Title: Abortion rights: for and against / Kate Greasley, University College London;

Christopher Kaczor, Loyola Marymount University, California.

Description: Cambridge [UK] ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017027447 | ISBN 9781107170933 (hardback : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9781316621851 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Abortion–Law and legislation. | Fetus–Legal status, laws, etc. |

Human rights.

Classification: LCC K5181 .G725 2017 | DDC 342.08/78-dc23 LC record

available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017027447

ISBN 978-1-107-17093-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-62185-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### **Contents**

Prejace and Acknowleagments		page VII
1	In Defense of Abortion Rights  Kate Greasley	1
2	Abortion as Human Rights Violation  Christopher Kaczor	86
3	A Reply to Kaczor  Kate Greasley	165
4	A Reply to "In Defense of Abortion Rights"  Christopher Kaczor	191
5	A Short Reply to the Reply  Kate Greasley	219
6	A Short Reply to Greasley Christopher Kaczor	233
Bibliography Index		248 256

V



## Preface and Acknowledgments

The authors of this work passionately, vehemently, and steadfastly disagree about the moral and the legal permissibility of abortion. One of us, Kate Greasley, describes herself as strongly pro-choice. The other author, Christopher Kaczor, would call himself strongly pro-life.

But we do agree that the legal and ethical question of abortion is of signal importance. We agree that political, cultural, and social debate about this topic is enhanced by civil disagreement in which opposing views are openly aired and subject to intense criticism and rational scrutiny.

Most importantly, we value the freedom of speech that makes possible the rational pursuit of deeper insights into political, ethical, and legal issues such as abortion. We are also alike in appreciating the possibility of moral error in our own conclusions. Thus, even while we remain resolute in those conclusions, we recognize that it is worthwhile to engage in thoughtful and respectful exchanges with others and to listen and learn from one another.

Veterans of philosophical abortion argument will no doubt notice that we do not disagree with one another about every element of the traditional debate. While this may sacrifice something in the breadth of the argument, it is, we believe, more than compensated for by the ability to reach greater depth on the matters about which we do disagree. It also means that the book better emulates a real conversation between two people who are engaging with one another not in their capacity as

vii



#### viii PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

representatives of a cause but as individual thinkers who find some arguments on both sides more intriguing and potentially convincing than others. What we find to be the most compelling arguments weighing down on our own or our interlocutor's side, other people may not. Again, this makes the book more of a unique dialogue than a textbook of arguments for and against abortion rights. But it is in this respect in particular that we hope it will contribute something of value to the existing discussion. The hope is that readers whose sympathies lie on either side of the debate (or indeed, are as yet undecided), will find within this one conversation some arguments and objections upon which it is worth reflecting, and will perhaps at least deepen their understanding of the other side's point of view.

Christopher Kaczor would like to thank the James Madison Program at Princeton University for providing the initial support for this project. He would also like to thank *First Things, The Public Discourse.com,* and the *NCBQ* for permission to reprint materials that appear in this book.

Kate Greasley would like to thank the many friends and colleagues whose wisdom has influenced her thinking about abortion and related issues over the past few years, and Chris Kaczor for his kind patience with her many delays.