

After the Enlightenment

After the Enlightenment is the first attempt at understanding modern political realism as a historical phenomenon. Realism is not an eternal wisdom inherited from Thucydides, Machiavelli, or Hobbes, but a twentieth-century phenomenon rooted in the interwar years, the collapse of the Weimar republic, and the transfer of ideas between continental Europe and the United States. This book provides the first intellectual history of the rise of realism in America, as it informed policy and academic circles after 1945. It breaks through the narrow confines of the discipline of International Relations and resituates realism within the crisis of American liberalism. Realism provided a new framework for foreign policy thinking and transformed the nature of American democracy. This book sheds light on the emergence of "rational choice" as a new paradigm for political decision-making and speaks to the current revival in realism in international affairs.

Nicolas Guilhot is research professor at the CNRS (Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique) and visiting scholar at NYU. His work sits at the intersection of political theory, the history of political thought, and international relations. His publications include *The Democracy Makers: Human Rights and the Politics of Global Order* (2005) and *The Invention of International Relations Theory: Realism, the Rockefeller Foundation, and the* 1954 Conference on Theory (2011).



After the Enlightenment

Political Realism and International Relations in the Mid-Twentieth Century

NICOLAS GUILHOT





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryagani, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107169739 DOI: 10.1017/9781316755181

© Nicolas Guilhot 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-16973-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-62111-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgments		page vi
	Introduction	I
Ι	The Realist Gambit – or the End of Political Science	28
2	American <i>Katechon</i> : Christian Realism and the Theological Foundations of International Relations Theory	69
3	The Making of the Realist Tradition: Felix Gilbert and the Reclaiming of Machiavelli	115
4	The Kuhning of Reason: Political Realism and Decision-Making after Thomas Kuhn	152
5	Cyborg Pantocrator: At the Origins of Neorealism	184
6	The Americanization of Realism: Kenneth Waltz, the Security Dilemma, and the Problem of Decision-Making	220
Index		249



Acknowledgments

I have benefited over the years from discussions with many colleagues. The list is long and I am sure I have forgotten a few – I hope they can pardon me: Sonja Amadae, Jenny Andersson, Andrew Arato, Lucian Ashworth, Volker Berghahn, Didier Bigo, Nehal Bhuta, Craig Calhoun, Carlo Invernizzi Accetti, Nomi Claire Lazar, Philippe Fontaine, Stefanos Geroulanos, Hunter Heyck, Daniel Steinmetz Jenkins, Patrick Thaddeus Jackson, Robert Jervis, Tjorborn Knutsen, David Long, Mark Mazower, Alison McQueen, Thomas Meaney, Philip Mirowski, Anthony Molho, Samuel Moyn, Nate Mull, Olivier Nay, Inderjeet Parmar, Benoît Pelopidas, Jacques Revel, Or Rosenboim, Daniel Sabbagh, William Scheuerman, Brian Schmidt, Jack Snyder, Mark Solovey, Anders Stephanson, Yanis Varoufakis, Srdjan Vucetic, Patrick Weil, Stephen Wertheim, Colin Wight, Michael Williams, Olivier Zajec, and Michael Zank.

Robert Jervis and Ronald Rogowski kindly accepted my request to discuss their use of Kuhn when I was working on Chapter 4. The late Kenneth Waltz generously reminisced about the 1956–57 seminar on theory at Columbia. Daniel Bessner has been an invaluable accomplice in thinking through the emergence of neorealism described in Chapter 6. I am very much indebted to him for allowing me to reproduce a large chunk of the essay we originally wrote together, and the ideas expressed in it owe very much to him. I cannot express enough my gratitude to John Mearsheimer, who has commented on many of the original papers, and whose intellectual generosity and conversation have influenced my thinking in more ways than I can acknowledge here. He single-handedly makes realism respectable. I have a special debt toward Robert Vitalis, whose



Acknowledgments

vii

superb work on IR theory has set a benchmark that I cannot emulate and who has on many occasions offered his brilliant wit and criticism.

At the Rockefeller Archive Center, James Allen Smith and his outstanding team of archivists have demonstrated an uncanny capacity for blurring the distinction between work and leisure. I owe special thanks to Tom Rosenbaum and Erwin Levold. At the archives of Harvard University, Timothy Driscoll was instrumental in securing my access to the papers of the Bureaucratic Politics Group. I also want to thank the archivists of the Mudd Manuscript Library Princeton and Jodi Boyle at the M.E. Grenander Department of Special Collections & Archives at SUNY Albany for their invaluable help.

At Cambridge University Press, my editor Robert Dreesen and his assistants made the publication of this book a most pleasant process. I am also indebted to Peter Dimock, my first editor, who has helped me many times find my voice, even when I could no longer stand the sound of it.

A Rockefeller Archive Center Grant-In-Aid made it possible for me to get a first glimpse of the actual history of postwar realism back in 2005.

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Research Council under the European Community's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007–2013) Grant Agreement no. [284231].